

## WIEGO / IRGLUS

### *Contested Urban Spaces: Law, Urbanisation, and Informal Work*

#### **Author's Workshop** 27 – 28 January 2022

- The Author's Workshop is the first gathering of scholars participating in the WIEGO/IRGLUS book project, *Contested Urban Spaces: Law, Urbanisation, and Informal Work*.
- Please read the summary papers prior to the workshop to ensure an informed discussion grounded in our respective arguments.
- The intention of the workshop is to strengthen your own chapter and its core ideas, and to collectively deliberate on the core themes of the broader book project.
- Please use your short 10-minute timeslot to pitch some of these ideas to the other participants, based on the assumption that everyone has already read your summary paper.
- In preparing for your pitch, please time your contribution to ensure it does not go over the 10-minute time limit.
- You are welcome to screenshare a presentation as an aide to your pitch. This presentation does not need to be shared beforehand.
- We encourage you to use the chat function to participate during the pitches. There will be an opportunity after the pitches to discuss and pose questions to the authors in the session.
- All times listed below are GMT.

27 January 2022

Introductory Session:

06:00 Mexico City 07:00 Lima & NYC <b>12:00 GMT</b> 14:00 Johannesburg 17:30 Delhi	12:00 - 12:20	<b>Welcome &amp; Introductions</b> In this session, we will share further information about the book, the workshop guidelines, and we will also request that our participants introduce themselves briefly to the online gathering.
--	---------------	--

**Session 1: Law & Informal Workers**

The three papers in this thematic explores the broad issues arising from law/regulations impacting the informal workers and their access to space. These papers provide an interesting contrast in terms of a wide span country level study to a deep examination of a single case study. At the level of governance, it also provides a breadth of study from the international to the local. It also demonstrates the replication of certain models of urbanization across new and emerging areas that marginalize workers further. Taking from the papers, we note the following broad themes may emerge for discussion:

- How urban space is regulated ensures access, use and property rights for workers. Can a specific regulatory lever be more beneficial to workers than other regulatory interventions? Are there informal norms and conventions that can be also used to secure the future of workers?
- Similarly, as identified by the papers, perhaps several regulations pertaining to use, access, zoning, property and building regulations are outside the domain of the international labour regulatory domain. What alternative international domains exist to advocate for these rights to ensure they are integrated in a cohesive fashion?
- Where should the legal obligation of access to space ideally locate itself – in planning laws, labour laws, international regulatory framework or property law? Put differently, where does the law conceptualise the rights of workers to property rights in manner that ensures security for informal workers?
- How are urban spaces conceived of and how do they replicate the issues around space in new and emerging areas (suburban areas or in new emerging economies)?

06:20 Mexico City 07:20 Lima & NYC <b>12:20 GMT</b> 14:20 Johannesburg 17:50 Delhi	12:20 - 12:30	Sally Roever & Mike Rogan <i>Urban Regulation &amp; Income Stability for Self-Employed Workers</i>
	12:30 - 12:40	Shalini Sinha, Malavika Narayan & Avi Majithia <i>Making Space for Informal Work in the Master Plan: Learning from a People's Campaign in Delhi</i>
	12:40 - 12:50	Avinash Kumar & Tanzeem Ahmed <i>Labour in the New Towns: The Informal Workforce and its Devalorisation</i>
	12:50 – 13:50	Discussion Discussant: Roopa Madhav

**Contested Urban Spaces:  
Urbanisation, law, and informal work**  
Editors: Thomas Coggin | Roopa Madhav  
Advisory Board: Marlese von Broembsen | Marius Pieterse



10-minute pause

## Session 2: Street Vendors

The collection of papers in this thematic focus on regulation and recognition of street vendors. Reading into the case studies, the following broad themes may emerge for discussion –

- a) The demand for recognition of street vendors remains primarily within the labour law discourse. However, for the recognition to be meaningful access to public space is a critical sub-component that needs to go hand in hand with the broader recognition demand. How can we integrate the demand for public space into a cohesive demand along with the issue of recognition of work.
- b) The issue of implementation of laws even when recognition is accorded is a continuous challenge. How can the dissonance between the written law and its every day implementation be bridged?
- c) The conceptual framing of most urban property law works within the binaries of public land and private property. In reality however, there are multiple other legal conceptions that need to be understood and argued for. In thinking about public space, urban planners and workers need to reconceptualize the approach to property rights – how can this be done creatively?

08:00 Mexico City		14:00 - 14:10	Roshni Yadav & Ankit Singh <i>Local Government Regulations and Urban Informal Vendors in Delhi, India</i>
09:00 Lima & NYC		14:10 - 14:20	Nabanita Islam <i>Impact of New Planning Policies on Sustenance and Inclusivity of Street Trading in Dhaka: A Critical Review of Detail Area Plan 2016-2035</i>
14:00 GMT		14:20 - 14:30	Themis Castellanos <i>Regulations without subjects for informal economy activities: The case of street vendors in Lima, Peru</i>
16:00 Johannesburg		14:30 - 14:40	Ryan Thomas Devlin <i>Formalizing Street Vending in New York</i>
19:30 Delhi		14:40 - 14:50	Tiana Bakic Hayden <i>Disambiguating Legalities: Street Vending, Law, and Boundary-Work in Mexico City</i>
		14:50 - 15:00	Teresa Marchiori & Pamhidzai Bamu <i>Law and the Distribution of Power and Entitlements in the Urban Space: Lessons from the Regulation of Street Vending in Dakar &amp; Accra</i>
		15:00 - 16:00	Discussion Discussant: Caroline Skinner

28 January 2022

**Session 3: Urban Workers**

This thematic brings together three papers that explore the interface between law (the lack thereof), civil society and the efforts to visiblize informal workers. It raises several critical issues, and the following broad themes may emerge for discussion:

- a) As the case studies of sex workers and sanitation workers demonstrate, the inherent prejudice or taboo attached to the work is further reflected in the law (or the lack thereof) and in law enforcement mechanisms. Is the role of civil society or worker collectives in visiblising invisible or marginalized workers critical to ensuring citizenship rights of workers even when formal legal recognition is elusive? Can this be a sustainable model in the absence of support from law and policy?
- b) How do sex workers, sanitation workers and waste pickers view urban space, urban streets as a place of work? Is their lived experience with urban space different from other informal workers? How can this experience be identified and incorporated into the struggles for legal recognition?
- c) As the city morphs and changes do workers also evolve, change and adapt their work strategies, finding newer modes of engagement, thus reducing or changing their interface with the physical space? Are these changes empowering or disempowering to the workers?

06:00 Mexico City 07:00 Lima & NYC <b>12:00 GMT</b> 14:00 Johannesburg 17:30 Delhi	12:00 - 12:10	Adriana Allen & the OVERDUE Team Julian Walker (Presenter) & Nelly Leblond <i>Seeing like a Sanitation Worker: Legal Arrangements Shaping Decent/Fair Work in Urban Africa</i>
	12:10 - 12:20	Neethi P & Anant Kamath <i>Turbulent Transformations and Urban Undesirables: Revanchist Urban Transition and Street-Based Sex Work in Bangalore</i>
	12:20 - 12:30	Veronica Puricelli <i>New Perspectives: the Construction of a Recycling Node in Argentina</i>
	12:30 - 13:15	Discussion Discussant: Marlese von Broembsen

15-minute pause

#### Session 4: Law, Informal Work & Mobility

Mobility is central to our access to and within the opportunities provided by the urban and spatial environment. The issue is especially pronounced for the urban poor, who may not be able to afford the cost of private transport in a world in which private transport is generally prized and prioritised by law and policy. Consequently, informal worker livelihoods are often implicated: how do informal workers access the cost and convenience of public transit? How does public transit respond to the specific needs of informal workers? How do informal workers interface with streets designed primarily for individual, private transit? How does the law protect informal workers who provide public transit and other mobility services? How does the state interface with both informal workers providing public transport, and non-state actors exercising a *de facto* control over the provision of public transport? There are two papers in this thematic: the first paper looks at how the state interfaces with informal public transport as an economy controlled formally and informally, and the second paper looks at how the state can both plan for and fail to plan for the needs of informal workers. The following broad themes may emerge for discussion:

- a) What is the role of the state when this informal logic of public transit governance and provision works? To what extent does it work? Is there a role, at all, for this informalisation of public transit?
- b) Where does the law fit in to issues of mobility and informal worker livelihoods? Is law merely a reflection of policy, or can we begin to articulate transport justice into the law?

07:30 Mexico City 08:30 Lima & NYC 13:30 GMT 15:30 Johannesburg 19:00 Delhi	13:30 - 13:40	Gaurav Mittal <i>Governing Informality: Legal Order &amp; Urban Transport in Smaller Cities in India</i>
	13:40 - 13:50	Valentina Montoya Robledo <i>Overlooked Mobility: Domestic Workers Commuting in Bogotá, Medellín and Sao Paulo</i>
	13:50 – 14:30	Discussion Discussant: Thomas Coggin

## Session 5: Law & Informal Work and the Effects of a Global Pandemic

We convene this session somewhere in the midst of the Covid-19 global pandemic. As an event of profound socio-economic and political shock, the impacts of which are likely to be assessed for years to come, we consider how Covid-19 and the law related thereto not only impacted informal workers, but how it may change the way in which law influences informal work in the urban and spatial environment. The final two papers address this nascent question through analysing how Covid-19 has exposed the limits of law in responding to informal worker livelihoods: the first paper looks how a sampled group of urban informal workers responded to Covid-19 regulatory measures in Jakarta; and the second paper looks at law's limitations through the storied lens of four different informal workers - a sex worker, a street trader, a taxi driver and uber van driver, and a domestic worker. The following broad themes may emerge for discussion:

- a) To what extent is the regulatory lacuna identified in both papers merely another instance of law invisibilising informal worker livelihoods? How has the Covid-19 pandemic exposed the law as performing poorly in protecting informal worker livelihoods?
- b) Where does the law go from here? In the precarity of the immediate future, and amidst the frenzied response to the present, is there an argument to be made that the protection of informal worker livelihoods are served best *beyond* the law?

08:30 Mexico City		14:30 - 14:40	Ying Gao <i>Does Social Capital Motivate Voluntary Compliance among Informal Workers? Evidence from Indonesia during the Covid-19 Crisis</i>
09:30 Lima & NYC			
<b>14:30 GMT</b>			
16:30 Johannesburg			
20:00 Delhi			
		14:40 - 14:50	Gabriella Razzano <i>Who Works? Exploring Law, Policy, and Reality with Covid-19 Evidence</i>
		14:50 – 15:30	Discussion Discussant: Marius Pieterse