



Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing

WIEGO Resource Document No. 1

June 2011



Literature Survey: Informality and Planning

James Duminy

WIEGO Resource Documents

WIEGO resource documents include WIEGO generated literature reviews, annotated bibliographies, and papers reflecting the findings from new empirical work. They provide detail to support advocacy, policy or research on specific issues.

This literature survey was compiled for the Urban Policies Programme of the policy-research network Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO). It was commissioned under the Inclusive Cities Project and aims to complement WIEGO's work on informality and planning curricula.

About the Author:

James Duminy is a Researcher with the African Centre for Cities.

Publication date: June 2011

ISBN number: 978-92-95106-56-7

Please cite this publication as: Duminy, James. 2011. *Literature Survey: Informality and Planning*. WIEGO Resource Document No. 1. Manchester, UK: WIEGO.

Published by Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) A Charitable Company Limited by Guarantee – Company No. 6273538, Registered Charity No. 1143510

WIEGO Limited

521 Royal Exchange
Manchester, M2 7EN
United Kingdom
www.wiego.org

Copyright © WIEGO. This report can be replicated for educational, organizing and policy purposes as long as the source is acknowledged.

Cover photograph by: Paula Bronstein/Getty Images Reportage

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1
1.1 The Realities of Informality and Informalization	3
2. Methodology	9
3. General informality Literature	10
4. Urban Informal Economies: General Trends and Issues	19
4.1 The Urban Working Poor: Global Issues and Dynamics	20
4.2 Governance and Institutional Analyses of Urban Informal Economies	20
4.3 The Politics of Urban Informal Economies.....	24
4.4 Urban Informal Sector Policy Analysis.....	26
5. Collective Organization and Unionization of Informal Labour	26
6. Analysis of Sectors in the Informal Economy	29
6.1 Street Traders/Vendors	29
6.2 Home-Based Enterprises.....	36
6.3 Waste Pickers/Informal Recyclers	43
6.4 Other Sectors	50
7. Informal Transport	50
8. Informal Service Provision	55
9. Informal Settlement	66
9.1 Informal Housing.....	66
9.2 Informal Land Management and Markets.....	73

1. Introduction

The term “informality” has attracted significant attention within recent planning literature. It is however, used in different senses and contexts. As a starting point, we can distinguish several themes of usage of “informality” in planning literature.

Firstly, we find the phrase “informal planning” used in the sense of planning that happens outside of formal regulatory procedures, involving personal contacts (social capital), the (strategic) cultivation of actor networks, and so on. It refers to “unofficial” modes and strategies of planning – a collection of processes that are not “formally” sanctioned or regulated as part of a predefined rule-based procedure (these may include quasi-legal land transfers, casual or spontaneous interactions, or informal “behind the scenes” negotiations between developmental actors).

Secondly, and perhaps most commonly, “informality” is used to describe a range of behaviours and practices unfolding within cities. Occasionally the term is used as a synonym for “illegal,” but this is increasingly rare. Generally, “informality” refers to a category of income-generating, servicing or settlement practices that are relatively unregulated or uncontrolled by the state or formal institutions. For example, Tranberg Hansen and Vaa (2004:7) “consider extra-legal housing and unregistered economic activities as constituting the informal city.” Others would extend this definition to encompass social institutions and a wider range of associational and cultural practices (see Meagher, 2007a). These activities are usually assumed to be small-scale and “survivalist,” undertaken by socio-spatially marginalized people.

Thirdly, we find “informality” used in the sense of the various modalities of urban associational life – for example, authors have recognized the capacity for social capital generated through “informal social networks” to alleviate the vulnerability of poor people. Alternatively, certain modes of political engagement (i.e. communities confronting and making demands on the state through mechanisms that blur the lines between the extra-legal and formal) can also be described as “informal.”

AbdouMaliq Simone (2001) is also interested in “informality,” primarily as it relates to urban associational life. He argues that as the productive capacities of African cities wane under conditions of globalization, trade liberalization and structural adjustment, space is created for the informalization of many domains of urban life. Despite efforts towards municipal strengthening and institutional development, city governance processes are becoming increasingly informalized, as formal institutions are reconfigured as contexts in which informal (business or other) ends are pursued. His conception of the informalization of associational life is linked to the production of “ephemeral” (i.e. transient) urban social formations.

Finally, Ananya Roy interprets informality as “a mode of production of space defined by the territorial logic of deregulation” (2009b:8). “Informal spaces” are produced as states of exception, where “the ownership, use, and purpose of land cannot be fixed and mapped according to any prescribed set of regulations or the law” (*ibid.*). Planning, as presently conceived, cannot solve the contemporary urban crisis in parts of the global South, as it is implicated in the creation of that crisis via the designation of certain activities as “authorized,” and others as “unauthorized.” Planning as a formal state activity is itself a process of exception and ambiguity.

Sometimes more than one of these uses are employed. Friedmann (2005:194) talks about “planning cultures” in various countries being characterized by a degree of “informality,” but at the same time describes informality as “a category of activity that results from the interweaving of the formal and informal and of the informal legal and the illegal and criminal.” AbdouMaliq Simone also talks about African cities undergoing an informalization of the relationships between and among states and citizens, which is linked to rapid urban growth and its attendant consequences: massive growth of the informal sector and informal settlements.

Many extant debates surround urbanization, urban theory and informality within recent planning literature. A popular theme of critical discussion surrounds the general veracity and analytical potential of the formal/informal conceptual dichotomy, broad generalized definitions of informality, as well as commonplace assumptions regarding the generation and operation of informality (i.e. why and how it exists). Some of these discursive currents are summarized below:

- Definitions of informality most often point to those activities that do not closely follow the law (for example, not paying taxes) or institutionalized planning regulations. However, in some countries such as Zimbabwe, businesses in home industries and the informal sector are supposed to pay taxes, although this may not happen for various reasons (Kamete, in Tranberg Hansen and Vaa, 2004).
- Werna (2001) criticizes the problematic tendency to equate the informal economic sector with small-scale production and informal settlements, and to treat it as homogeneous. Many small-scale enterprises follow governmental regulations precisely, and medium- to large-scale businesses may exemplify a degree of informality (e.g. the construction sector). The equation of the informal sector with informal settlements is undermined by the fact that informal activities may be conducted in “formal” urban areas (by both commuters and local residents), and that informal settlements house large numbers of formal workers. Empirical investigation shows that informal economic activities are highly varied and contingent.
- The idea that informality consists purely of survivalist activities has also suffered criticism, with authors distinguishing between “informalization for accumulation and for survival.” Engagement with the informal sector may not necessarily be a survivalist strategy of last resort, but may emanate from a conscious livelihood strategy, as informal business may offer the possibility for greater income returns than formal wage labour, as well as greater freedom and flexibility.
- Another interesting idea (associated with Roy, Yiftachel, etc.) is that planning itself is not a “formal,” strictly rule-bound process, but is characterized by exceptions, contradictions, ambiguity and arbitrary decision-making. Illegal developments in suburban areas, for example, may be deemed acceptable or exceptionable, due to a personal relationship between the developer and a local government official (for example) – in this view the way that planning “actually happens” is largely “informal,” which is obviously at odds with the idealistic interpretation of planning as a rational, prescribed, deliberative process serving the public good.
- The neat formal/informal binary is further undermined by observations that formal legal systems are open to creative interpretation and exploitation by individuals and interest groups. James Holston’s studies of “insurgent citizenship” in Brazilian cities, for example, note that people eking out fragile livelihoods in peripheral settlements (that would invariably be described as informal)

are often quick to resort to their official legal rights to legitimate their land claims ahead of those of newer migrants. Sanyal (2008) also notes that informal-sector labourers are increasingly interested in unionization in order to promote their political agency.

- Therefore, it is clear that people do not practise their urban existence in clearly distinct formal/legal or informal/illegal realms. People can weave between these different modes and strategies of urban life as it suits them. Urban activities are perhaps better understood as unfolding within a continuum of formal/informal relations (e.g. Donovan, 2008). Furthermore, particular forms and modes of urban informality are produced through a complex place-bound interaction of historical, social, political and economic forces – informality is by no means a universal constant, oblivious to context. Planning thus needs to be attuned to these complex realities and should respond appropriately – allowing or regulating informality where and how it is needed and desirable.
- Then we have a much more critical interpretation of the entire notion of planning and its relationship to the informal. This is the idea that planning inherently drives the production of the informal, states of exception and urban segregation in general. Planning as we now know it can never “solve the problem” of informality because the production of “informal spaces” (involving the reproduction of the formal/informal binary) allows states and elites a degree of “territorial flexibility” to pursue their own interests. (I would associate this view with Roy and Yiftachel especially).

Given these conceptual difficulties, some authors have recommended that urban governance and planning discourse needs to move beyond the formal/informal binary opposition if it hopes to produce a more equitable form of urban development (Simone, 2001; Fawaz, 2009). There are also implications for urban political and cultural analysis, for “decision making involves not just the formal processes, but the myriad of informal processes by which resources are allocated, access is achieved and development takes place” (Devas, 2001:395). Interestingly, James Holston’s article on “dangerous spaces of citizenship” in contemporary Brazil (*Planning Theory*, 8[1], pp. 12-31) does not include the words “informal” or “informality” at all – perhaps a sign of the willingness of some urbanists to move away from the formal/informal dichotomy.

1.1 The Realities of Informality and Informalization

A common observation in the literature is that contemporary processes of economic globalization, neoliberal urban policy responses, and associated effects on the structure of urban labour markets, are driving a rapid growth of informal sector employment/livelihood strategies. This trend has been exacerbated by the post-2008 financial crisis (Watson, 2009a).

Authors such as Ananya Roy and AbouMalique Simone argue that cities of Africa and elsewhere in the global South are undergoing wide-ranging processes of informalization, stretching across all domains of urban institutional and associational life. This wider process of informalization is inherently related to the aforementioned political-economic trends, although the precise nature of this relation is a matter of some contention in the literature. Some representative perspectives are as follows:

Al-Sayyad and Roy (2003) argue that these recent economic trends have given rise to “an exploding informality” in cities of the South, which is taking on rather different forms than it has in the past. There appear to be new processes of polarization within the informal economy, with informal entrepreneurs moving into sectors abandoned by the public and formal private sectors, but many as well swelling the ranks of “survivalist” activities. In effect, informality (in terms of forms of income generation, forms of settlement and housing, and forms of negotiating life in the city) is becoming a dominant mode of behaviour in large parts of the world—in many urban centres it is now the norm and no longer the exception” (Watson, 2009a:157).

“In the past two decades, African informal institutions have blurred formerly recognized conceptual boundaries between the formal and informal by expanding beyond peripheral sectors and cultural institutions to penetrate into the heart of modern economic and political organization. ...The informal economy accounts for 60 per cent of Africa’s urban labour force, and provides over 90 per cent of new jobs, giving Africa a higher share of informal activity than any other region. The economic activities involved have moved beyond petty services and indigenous trading systems to include complex informal manufacturing clusters, transnational trading networks, and a range of urban services such as housing, water provision and refuse collection. Even states have become informalized as public officials govern in ways that contravene formal regulations, and downsizing public sectors concede an increasing range of governance activities to community organizations. The result has been a rising importance of non-state forms of economic development and public authority, including hometown associations, patronage networks, religious organizations, vigilante groups and traditional rulers” (Meagher, 2007:405-6).

“In African cities, Simone (2000) argues, rapid growth and intensified economic competition for resources means that economic and political processes of all kinds become open for negotiation and informalization... The relationship between state and citizens, and between formal and informal actors, thus becomes under-codified and under-regulated, dependent on complex processes of alliance building and dealmaking, and particularly resistant to reconfiguring through policy instruments and external interventions” (Parnell *et al.*, 2009:234).

Therefore, we are not witnessing merely the expansion of the informal economic sector, but an ongoing, spatially contingent restructuring of the modes of associational life (in the widest possible sense – including economic, political and cultural forms of engagement) underpinning contemporary urbanization.

Some noteworthy points:

In the published literature, there are very few instances where informality is regarded as something to be ignored or actively discouraged (a conventional interpretation might connote informality with chaos, lawlessness, illegality – the word “informal” is a negative oppositional term which signifies/implies an absence of order, structure, regulation, etc.). The vast majority of authors propose that urban policy should be adjusted to better accommodate the enormous variety of livelihood practices that characterize contemporary urbanization. As put by Jenkins (2001):

The growing realization that the “informal” is here to stay has strengthened the position of those who have argued that the informal is often as legitimate as the formal in urban development. This has led to a growing interest and associated literature on the regularization of informal settlements, integration of formal and informal systems and “coping” with informality and illegality (2001:2).

In this view, modern planning policy is outdated, hence its unrealistic obsession with imposing a particular ordered and regulated vision of urban space merely results in widespread misery for those finding themselves classified on the “wrong side” of the formal/informal, legitimate/illegitimate, legal/illegal spectra. Where a degree of regularization or formalization is recommended, it is usually as a means of improving working and living conditions.

Aside from this sort of resigned acceptance of the reality of informality, an emerging view of African urbanism also sees order and efficiency in what to the untrained eye seems to be random and out of control. This perspective pays attention to the resilience and intrepid agency of Africa’s town and city dwellers as they seek to create for themselves meaningful identities, lives and livelihoods in the interstices of fast-changing and intersecting urban worlds (Beall *et al.*, 2010:188). Authors such as Pieterse¹ demand that scholars and planners recognize and grant appropriate analytical status to the actions of urban “protagonists” within everyday “cityness,” without forgetting the “overdetermining effect of violence” in Africa. AbdouMalig Simone, at the end of the recently published work *City Life from Jakarta to Dakar*, asks rhetorically:

If we pay attention only to the misery and not to the often complex forms of deliberation, calculation and engagement through which residents try to do more than simply register the factualness of a bare existence, do we not inevitably make these conditions worse? If we are not willing to find a way to live and discover within the worlds these residents have made, however insalubrious, violent, and banal they might often be, do we not undermine the very basis on which we would work to make cities more livable for all? (2010:333).

Recent planning-related research on urban informality is characterized by a great deal of diversity in terms of substantive areas of focus (i.e. units of analysis) as well as conceptual analytical approaches. An appropriate point to start a discussion of overall trends within this broad area of literature is the recent work on informal institutions, for it is representative of many analytical and conceptual

¹ See, for example, Pieterse, E. 2010. “Cityness and African urban development,” *Urban Forum*, 21(3), pp. 205-219.

shifts unfolding within the wider literature on informality. In an introduction to a special issue of the journal *Afrika Spectrum* dedicated to the topic of informal institutions and development in Africa, Kate Meagher (2007a) provides a useful overview of key analytical trends in this subdiscipline. She recognizes that Africa acted as the “crucible” for “many of the concepts used to explore informal development processes” during the 1960s and 70s. In the 1980s, the developmental strengths of African informal organization were celebrated in the context of liberalization and democratization. Yet prevailing politiceconomic trends of the 1990s (including increasing poverty, economic regression, civil and ethnic strife) led discussions of African institutional change to view informal economic and political arrangements as disadvantageous “shadow” systems, obscuring and hindering the ordered function of states and civil societies. Meagher suggests that these “shadows” were generally understood as “a product of the primordial character of African cultural institutions” (2007a:406). This perspective has recently begun to shift:

A growing literature in Africa and elsewhere is calling for a more critical analysis of informal forms of social organization and public authority, emphasizing the need to explore the actual practices embedded in informal institutions as well as the linkages between the informal and formal realm, rather than resorting to culturalist stereotypes and rational choice reconstructions of values and motives (Meagher, 2007a:407).

Authors such as Tranberg Hansen and Vaa (2004) have recognized the important role played by informal social arrangements in “holding economies and societies together despite daunting economic, political, and environmental challenges” (Meagher, 2007a:407). Analytically, the trend has been towards more empirical and institutionalist approaches to conceptualizing the relationship between informality and development.

This empirical shift within the literature has resulted in a plethora of detailed ethnographic type studies of urban informality. For example, numerous recent studies have addressed the roles of children, women and foreign immigrants in the informal sector (Williams and Balaz, 2005; Bromley and Mackie, 2008; Chant and Pedwell, 2008; Hunter and Skinner, 2003; Khotari, 2008). Highly empirical approaches are also evident in recent studies of urban associational life and social/political capital (e.g. Simone, 2001; Meagher, 2010; Lyons and Snoxell, 2005a; 2005b), and issues relating to power and resistance in urban space. Indeed, there has been significant interest in understanding the marginalization/repression of informality in terms of the interests and modes of state power (in particular the interest in creating regulated and ordered public spaces through rational planning – the work of Amin Kamete [2007, 2009] is important in this regard). Modes and strategies of citizen resistance to such impositions are also popular themes (e.g. Whitson, 2007; Crossa, 2009; Kamete, 2010).

A related theme broadly concerns the “production” of informal space (in the sense of Lefebvre). Kudva (2008) looked at the “mutually constitutive spatial and political practices of informality,” recognizing a gulf between “the abstract spaces of the planned city with its landuse, zoning, and nuisance policies, and the messy reality of informal localities” (2008:1625). As informal activities are relegated to urban peripheries in Indian cities (driving a process of spatial segregation), new political modalities take form. The everyday spatial practices (that produce the informal city’s lived space) generate “local knowledge and also establish sites of resistance and shape the politics of informal-

ity itself” (*Ibid.*). These observations place the spotlight on the production of urban space (and its structuring effects on political life) as an agenda for creating real urban improvements. Generally however, Kudva concludes that “theorizing and implementation [of urban planning and governance] must reflect the complexity of enmeshed socio-spatial networks of employment, work, real estate, and shelter, as well as the residents’ own perspectives on priorities for change” (2008:1625).

The theme of resistance (that is, those engaged in informality resisting the regulatory policies imposed by local states) is increasingly popular. Many seek to “discover” the agency of those involved in informality – in this view an overemphasis on survivalism in the informal sector has resulted in a portrayal of the poor as more-or-less powerless victims. So, there has been significant interest in contemporary forms of resistance to state regulatory practices – “street politics”; “a politics of redress not protest, where non-collective but prolonged direct action to achieve gains is interspersed with episodic moments of collective action and open protest in defence of gains” (Kudva, 2009:1617; also see Kamete, 2010). This has analytical implications – as poor people engaged in informal livelihoods have an agency of their own, it follows that conventional (state-centric) models of urban governance, which focus exclusively on the workings of the formal institutions of the state, are severely limited in their explanatory potential (see Lindell, 2008; Meagher, 2010).

Authors such as Crossa (2009), Roy (2009) and Miraftab (2009) recount “insurgent” citizen practices in a celebratory tone, and regard the will to earn a livelihood by engaging in informal urban activities as a demand for (or realization of) the “right to the city” (Lefebvre). In their view, planners must pay attention to the social-use values bound up in the city, without privileging the rights and interests of private-property owners (land-use ordering, elevating exchange values, etc.).

Anaya Roy (2005) uses the idea of informality as an epistemological device to reveal some of the limitations of conventional planning policy and practice, and to provide the conceptual starting point for a new way of understanding and intervening in urban spaces. She understands “informality” as designating something which is external to planning and its ordered spaces – beyond its purview and control (the “unplannable”). The state produces informality as a “state of exception.” So dealing with, and planning for, informality “partly means confronting how the apparatus of planning produces the unplanned and unplannable” (2005:156). She also wants to “strategically use the state of exception to frame policy.”

According to Roy (2005), the key element of today’s paradigm of “Sustainable Human Development” is the idea of enablement, helping the poor help themselves, hence the current political emphasis on upgrading. However, there are limitations to the upgrading paradigm – physical conditions may improve while other areas of life may deteriorate. There are also limitations to the ideology of space implicit in upgrading initiatives – space is the built environment and physical amenities, not people’s capacities or livelihoods. Such “aestheticization of poverty ... equates upgrading with aesthetic upgrading rather than the upgrading of livelihoods, wages, political capacities” (2005:150). Modernist planning as a general project is obsessed with the creation of cities that look ordered and regimented – but planners should not “infer functional order from purely visual order.” Roy recommends “the politics of shit” as a useful policy epistemology, which she believes can “disrupt models of expertise” and thus create room for poor urban residents to generate their own alternative forms of knowledge about infrastructure and urban upgrading.

Roy also has some issue with conventional modes of granting property rights to poor urban residents (ala De Soto and the World Bank). She points out the difference between the right to participate in property markets and actual participation in property markets. She suggests that “given the monopolistic nature of property, it is imperative for policymakers to underwrite the right to participate in the market by directly addressing inequality” (2005:153). Roy’s third policy epistemology involves using the state of exception generated through the designation of certain activities and spaces as informal in order to allow for “regulatory” and “regularity exceptions” (e.g. not evicting people who fail to make regular payments). Finally, Roy recommends “scale jumping” – being able to understand action and agency as being constituted across multiple scales and stages, rather than resorting to crude global/local differentiations. Informality, although often viewed as being localized in nature (a local issue), is embroiled in a vast complex network of policies, decisions and grassroots actions. She suggests, for example, that recent attempts by activists to leverage large supranational organizations such as the World Bank against national and regional governments holds some promise for delivering better developmental outcomes. However, this (as well as the other policy epistemologies) requires “working through rather than against institutions of power,” which raises the question of whether the tools of the master can dismantle the master’s house.

Subsequently, Roy (2009) has analyzed the practices of the Indian state as an “informalized” system (characterized by deregulation, unmapping and exceptionalism). She also considers insurgent practices by members of the urban poor, concluding that both informality and insurgence “together undermine the possibilities of rational planning.” This represents the use of the term “informality” in a wider sense than is typical, to mean “a state of deregulation, one where the ownership, use, and purpose of land cannot be fixed and mapped according to any prescribed set of regulations or the law” (2009:80). The informality of the planning system results in an “ever-shifting relationship” between the legal/legitimate and illegal/illegitimate – distinctions which are open to reinterpretation (misuse?) to suit state entities and their corporate friends through ensuring a degree of “territorialized flexibility.” People, insurgent citizens, are implicated in the “misrule of law” as they seek to use the flexibility of the law to legitimate their own land claims.

Oren Yiftachel has been more attuned than most to the arbitrariness of many planning decisions and interventions. Planning is involved in the “stratification of informalities” through the designation of certain activities as acceptable and legitimate (“whitening”), others as pernicious or criminal (“blackening”). The summative effect of these contrary processes of whitening and blackening is the production of so-called “gray cities,” where slums can be demolished for being “unauthorized” while equally illegal suburban developments are granted legal status: “Yiftachel states bluntly that the “informality of the powerful” is often whitened while other forms of informality remain indefinitely gray or are blackened” (Roy, 2009b:11).

Miraftab (2009) considers neoliberal-type urban governance (strengthening the local state, ensuring community participation and participatory development, etc.) encouraged by organizations such as the World Bank as a “hegemonic move from above” designed to “contain grassroots struggles through local formal channels for citizen participation and claims” (2009:33). She broadly regards informal urban practices as offering promise for the strengthening of counter-hegemonic and insurgent movements. Movements such as the Western Cape Anti-Eviction Campaign (AEC) combine the use of formal, legal strategies with “informal survival livelihood practices.” Miraftab (2009) also

identified the implications of widespread informality (both in a legal and procedural sense) for planning research and practice: “Insurgent planning scholarship aims at decolonizing the planning imagination by taking a fresh look at subaltern cities to understand them by their own rules of the game and values rather than by the planning prescriptions and fantasies of the West. An “upside-down” look at the world of development allows that perhaps the deep informality of Third-World cities is not their failure, but as Simone (2004) suggests, a triumphant sign of their success in resisting the Western models of planning and urban development” (2009:45).

Miraftab’s call for “radical planning practice” in the form of “insurgent planning” is a call to redefine planning as “counter-hegemonic, transgressive and imaginative” in order to directly “respond to neoliberal specifics of dominance through inclusion – that is, inclusive governance” (2009:32). The idea of creating “insurgent planners” has also been championed by Caren Levy. Others are not quite so certain of the desirability of the informalization of urban associational life (see Meagher, 2010).

The overall points emerging from the literature:

- Planning theory and praxis must recognize and respond to the dominance of “alternative” urban livelihood strategies, especially in the global South. The proliferation of livelihood strategies outside of traditional formal employment is being exacerbated by conditions of globalization, structural adjustment and the recent financial crisis.
- The formal/informal dichotomy is arguably neither useful as a basis for policy/planning action nor research. Labelling a vast range of complex and contingent activities as simply “informal” encourages their perception as homogeneous, essentialized and ahistorical (with negative implications for planning intervention).
- Shaking off the dichotomy is difficult given that state planning apparatuses are implicated in the production of informal spaces as “states of exception.” In the most extreme form, this process of defining the informal or illegitimate is perniciously used to oppress minorities (e.g. the Bedouins in Yiftachel’s analyses). Planners may have to take it upon themselves to usurp such processes through “insurgent” action. Alternatively, they can attempt to promote radical outcomes by strategically employing the state of exception in policy development (i.e. allowing for greater regulatory and regularity exceptions [Roy, 2005]).

2. Methodology

The literature was located by performing key word searches using the Google Scholar Advanced Search function. Key words and phrases used included: “informal*,” “informality,” “informal sector,” “informal economy,” “waste pickers,” “waste recyclers,” “informal recyclers,” “informal trade,” “informal housing,” “informal settlement,” “informal transport,” “informal service provision,” and so on. The searches were conducted for journals with titles containing the words “planning,” “urban,” “environment” and “development.” Searches were also conducted within the journals *Area*, *Habitat International*, *Third World Quarterly*, *Cities* and *City*. Results were limited to those articles published between 2000 and 2010.

Once downloaded, the abstracts of articles were read; those deemed relevant (to use for planning curricular development) were classified according to their theme of interest (the informal economic sector; informality as a general theme of analysis and practice; informalization of urban associational life, etc.). The themes and relevant abstracts are presented below.

3. General Informality Literature

- **Beall, J., Guha-Khasnobis, B., and Kanbur, R. 2010. “Introduction: African development in an urban-world: beyond the tipping point,” *Urban Forum*, 21, pp. 187-204.**
 - o Introduction to the Urban Forum special issue on “African Development in an Urban World.” Provides a useful overview of some of the key trends in informality (settlement and economic practices) on the continent. Also provides an overview of some of the recent arguments concerning African urbanism and informality.
- **Daniels, P.W. 2004. “Urban challenges: the formal and informal economies in mega-cities,” *Cities*, 21(6), pp. 501-511.**
 - o There is a sense in which the formal and informal economies in mega-cities are taken for granted. The bulk of the literature focuses on the characteristics and problems of the latter. It is crucial, however, that they should not be examined and analyzed as separate entities. Rather, it should be acknowledged at the outset that the activities that are normally considered part of the informal economy are often in one way or another linked to the activities in the formal economy. Other reasons for stressing the interconnectedness of the informal and formal sectors in cities are outlined. Perhaps the key to policy development is to recognize that both sectors incorporate creativity, entrepreneurial flair, and a general desire to harness human capital in ways that maximize its potential.
- **Devas, N. 2001. “Does city governance matter for the urban poor?,” *International Planning Studies*, 6(4), pp. 393-408.**
 - o Decentralization has focused attention on city government but, at the same time, the growth of civil society means that urban governance is not limited to city government. Little attention has been paid, either in the literature or in practice, to the institutional and political processes that determine whether and how the poor benefit, or how the poor can influence the agenda of city governance. Drawing on studies of nine cities in Africa, Asia and Latin America, this paper identifies three broad areas of importance: a political system in which the votes of the poor count; a city government system with some capacity to deliver; and a dynamic civil society that can press the case of the poor. After reviewing what is involved in each of these areas, the paper identifies a number of specific policies and practices that impact on the urban poor.
 - o Drawing upon several case studies, Devas notes the general tendency for city governance systems to ignore or actively repress informal trade and settlement, and provides various recommendations for creating a more inclusive mode of urban governance to benefit the urban poor.

- **Friedmann, J. 2005. “Globalization and the emerging culture of planning,” *Progress in Planning*, 64, pp. 183-234.**
 - o Friedmann’s analysis of different “planning cultures” internationally reveals numerous instances where “a great deal of coordination occurs spontaneously through informal ways of networking, coalition building, and mutual adjustment.” His use of the term is somewhat typical of North American and European authors – “informal planning” refers to an informal way of planning, rather than an attempt to plan for illegal or unauthorized urban practices (i.e. planning in the context of urban informality).

- **Harrison, P. 2006. “On the edge of reason: Planning and urban futures in Africa,” *Urban Studies*, 43(2), pp. 319-335.**
 - o The shift in planning theory from technical-instrumental to relational conceptions of rationality is helpful in relating to urban environments in Africa that are characterized by the intersection of multiple rationalities and also by spatially extensive and shifting networks of economic and social transaction. However, the relevance of contemporary planning theory is limited by its origins within the intellectual traditions and experiences of the West. If we are to engage effectively with the multiple rationalities that are shaping the cities of the world—cities that are increasingly centred in the global South—then we must bring Western intellectual tradition into a critical relationship with the epistemologies, rationalities and value-based traditions of the non-Occidental world. This paper argues that post-colonial literature and theory may provide some of the intellectual resources needed to sustain such an engagement, as post-colonial thought directs attention to the hybrid intellectual formations and practices that emerge in the ongoing interaction between colonized and colonizer. By using Johannesburg as the prism through which to look at cities and planning, this paper provides thoughts on how to construct an “other way” of thinking, situated both within and outside dominant representations.
 - o “Given the huge difficulties of engaging meaningfully with the complex and shifting set of largely informal social and transactional networks that frame the lives of most ordinary people in the city, there is a temptation to limit engagement to the visible and formal structures and networks within the city. This approach would place large sectors of the city outside the purview of planning and policy-making. A more constructive approach would be to find ways of thinking simultaneously of influencing the decisions of big business towards urban outcomes that are more just and sustainable than at present, and of supporting and building on the practices of urban citizens that have evolved to reduce risk and provide a degree of regularity in their lives” (2006:332-333).

- **Joseph, S. 2010. “Tackling informality: Why HIV/AIDS needs to be a critical component of urban development policies,” *Urban Forum*, 21(2), pp. 85-105.**
 - o Cities in the South are faced with the double challenges of underdevelopment and poverty on the one hand and urbanization on the other. As the developing regions of the South continue to urbanize at an incredible rate, it is clear that many cities do not have the necessary capacity to respond to the increasing needs and demands of urban residents. As a result, many new city residents have no other option but to settle in informal areas. These areas have long been associated with poor and unhealthy living conditions and, more recently, the links between these conditions and HIV/AIDS have become increasingly clear. Research suggests that developmental

factors like poverty, unemployment, gender inequality and inadequate shelter, water and sanitation all play a role in increasing vulnerability to HIV/AIDS. These conditions further affect the ability of HIV-positive individuals, households and communities to cope with the consequences of the epidemic. This in turn leads to further impoverishment and reduces the likelihood that people living in informal settlements will be able to improve their livelihoods. Yet, little attention has been paid by policymakers and planners to the relationship between HIV/AIDS and informality despite the challenge it provides for cities and the implications of the epidemic for government institutions and local government in particular. This paper argues that informality is complex and that its heterogeneous nature is not effectively understood and thus not given appropriate recognition and support. It looks at the effects of the HIV/AIDS epidemic within this context of informality and the inevitable wave of urbanization. The paper suggests that the only way to deal effectively with HIV/AIDS (and informality) is through planning and building integrated and sustainable urban settlements that respond to the complexities of informality in cities of the developing world.

- **Meagher, K. 2007a. “Introduction: Special issue on informal institutions and development in Africa,” *Afrika Spectrum*, 42(3), pp. 405-418.**
 - o Meagher introduces this special journal issue with a succinct explanation of past and prevailing trends in the analysis of African informal institutions. While much literature of the 1990s understood informal organization as an obstacle to effective state organization and function, a view rooted in cultural essentialist presumptions, recently informal institutions have become the subject of much empirical interest for their capacity to alleviate shocks within economic and social systems. Two major areas of debate underpin current approaches to studying informal institutions in Africa. The first concerns the meaning of “informal institutions.” The second theme of debate is centred on the role played by informal institutions in development and democratization.
 - o Four distinct perspectives on the meaning of the term “informal institutions” have emerged recently, the most common being an evolutionist perspective associated with new institutional economics, “in which informal institutions are seen as remnants of pre-modern times” (2007a:408). In this view, informal institutions are understood as operating through “societal rules” including “routines, customs, traditions and conventions,” in contrast to formal institutions governed by state-enforced political, judicial and economic rules and conventions (*ibid.* A second perspective, broadly termed “legal pluralism,” stretches the concept of informal institutions “beyond the customary and the small-scale, but restricts it to patterns of behaviour deriving from pre-existing forms of public authority, which may compete for legitimacy with current formal institutions” (2007a:409). Structuralist approaches (the third category of perspectives described by Meagher) uphold the conclusion that complex informal institutions have deep historical roots, yet further “highlight the role of contemporary social, political and economic processes in reshaping, transforming or disrupting informal institutions” (*ibid.* Such processes may drive a degree of formal-informal institutional hybridization, occasionally generating examples of “modern informal institutions” such as hometown associations, women’s organizations and vigilante groups. The final prevailing viewpoint, generally termed “post-structuralist” by Meagher, identifies informal institutions with “all unofficial forms of ordering, including social networks, cultural values, corruption and coping strategies.” Here informal institutions are examined as mechanisms of agency rather than extra-state structural assemblages; power and public authority are seen as emergent, produced through “continuous struggle and negotiation” (2007a:410).

- o Within the second major area of debate over informal organization, that is, the role of informal institutions in democratization and development, at least three perspectives can be distinguished. The first and most popular position is “the new institutionalist view of informal institutions as sources of path dependence and mechanisms for filling gaps in formal provision in the context of underdevelopment or state incapacity” (p. 411). This can be contrasted with a more positive understanding of informal institutions as “mechanisms for improving the performance of formal institutions” through synergistic formal-informal interactions and the co-production of novel institutional processes. A final perspective tends to denigrate informal institutions as impediments to development due to their perceived tendency to “undermine the cohesion necessary for the creation of meaningful institutions” (2007a:411).
- **MirafTAB, F., and Wills, S. 2005. “Insurgency and spaces of active citizenship: The story of Western Cape Anti-eviction Campaign in South Africa” *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 25, pp. 200-217.**
 - o This article concerns the struggle waged by the poor in Cape Town, South Africa, to assert their constitutional rights to shelter and basic services and protect their life spaces against neo-liberal policies. Using insurgent urbanism and active citizenship as its conceptual guide, this article attempts to enhance understanding of grassroots spaces for practising inclusive citizenship, stretching beyond a limited interpretation of formal citizen participation. Through the example of the Western Cape Anti-eviction Campaign in South Africa, the article aims to contribute to a recent opening in the planning inquiry by overcoming the selective definition of what constitutes civil society and public participation and underlining the significance of invited and invented spaces of citizen participation in the formation of inclusive citizenship and just cities.
- **MirafTAB, F. 2009. “Insurgent planning: Situating radical planning in the Global South,” *Planning Theory*, 8(1), pp. 32-50.**
 - o This article revisits the notion of radical planning from the standpoint of the Global South. Emerging struggles for citizenship in the Global South, seasoned by the complexities of state-citizen relations within colonial and post-colonial regimes, offer an historicized view indispensable to counter-hegemonic planning practices. The article articulates the notion of insurgent planning as radical planning practices that respond to neo-liberal specifics of dominance through inclusion – that is, inclusive governance. It characterizes the guiding principles for insurgent planning practices as counter-hegemonic, transgressive and imaginative. The article contributes to two current conversations within planning scholarship: on the implication of grassroots insurgent citizenship for planning, and on (de)colonization of planning theory).
- **Nunan, F., and Satterthwaite, D. 2001. “The influence of governance on the provision of urban environmental infrastructure and services for low-income groups,” *International Planning Studies*, 6(4), pp. 409-426.**
 - o This paper describes the inadequacies in the provision for water, sanitation and solid-waste collection in nine cities in Africa, Asia and Latin America, and discusses the main explanatory factors. These include the quality and capacity of each city’s local government, and the nature of its relationship with citizen groups and non-governmental organizations within the city and with governments at provincial/state or national level. The paper highlights the many political constraints on ensuring healthier living and working environments for lower-income groups,

including those rooted in local government structures and perceptions, as well as those related to low per-capita incomes and poor economic performance.

- **Owusu, F. 2007. “Conceptualizing livelihood strategies in African cities: Planning and development implications of multiple livelihood strategies,” *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 26, pp. 450-465.**
 - o The usefulness of the informal sector and survival-strategies approaches for understanding African urban economies has been undermined by the transformations in urban livelihood strategies brought about by the continent’s economic crises and neo-liberal economic reform policies. Contemporary livelihood strategies in many African cities involve participation in multiple economic activities, usually in both the formal and informal sectors. This paper proposes the “multiple modes of livelihood” (MML) approach as a framework for capturing this emerging livelihood strategy and presents evidence to show the magnitude of the strategy and the kind of activities undertaken. Development and planning implications of this strategy include: i) planning theories must reflect the changing livelihood in African cities; ii) the different geographies of such activities within and between urban areas, the proliferation of home-based enterprises in middle- and professional-class neighborhoods, the emergence of non-traditional household arrangements, and the importance of urban agriculture suggest the need to indigenize urban planning in Africa; and iii) the proliferation of multiple livelihood strategies, especially among public-sector employees, has significant implications for national development, especially as it relates to the performance of the public sector.
- **Parnell, S., Pieterse, E., and Watson, V. 2009. Chapter 5: “Planning for cities in the global South: An African research agenda for sustainable human settlements,” *Progress in Planning*, 72, pp. 233-241.**
 - o “Parnell, Pieterse and Watson begin with staggering trends: the projection of the trebling of the urban population in Africa by 2050, under conditions of weak urban economies, with the bulk of the population surviving under conditions of informality. Currently, UN-Habitat estimates that 72 per cent of the urban population lives without acceptable housing or services. The authors highlight the lack of environmental professionals, and of planning education, and point out that the standing institutions are often outdated and remnants of colonial days. The authors argue that this urban context, so different from the context of First World cities that have been the focus of most urban planning theory and practice, requires new planning theories, practices and research to address the reality of African cities, and they set out the emerging research approach and agenda of the African Centre for Cities at the University of Cape Town, South Africa...”
- **Potts, D. 2008. “The urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa: From bad to good (and back again?),” *Development Southern Africa*, 25(2), pp. 151-167.**
 - o Conceptualizations of the informal sector in terms of economic dualism have a long history, as have effective challenges to those conceptualizations. These are discussed in this paper, which then examines shifts in attitudes towards the role of the urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa over recent decades, with reference to these theoretical conceptualizations and other approaches. The paper then discusses the dynamics of the sector and the changing role of the African state in promoting or discouraging it and identifies an increasingly negative trend in this respect. Finally, the paper offers a comparative perspective, from north of the Limpopo, on current debates and policy pronouncements about the “second economy” in South Africa.

- **Roy, A. 2005. “Urban informality: Toward an epistemology of planning,” *Journal of the American Planning Association*, 71(2), pp. 147-158.**
 - o Many of the significant urban transformations of the new century are taking place in the developing world. In particular, informality, once associated with poor squatter settlements, is now seen as a generalized mode of metropolitan urbanization. This article focuses on urban informality to highlight the challenges of dealing with the “unplannable” — exceptions to the order of formal urbanization. It argues that planners must learn to work with this state of exception. Such policy epistemologies are useful not only for “Third World” cities but also more generally for urban planning concerned with distributive justice.

- **Roy, A. 2009a. “Strangely familiar: Planning and the worlds of insurgence and informality,” *Planning Theory*, 8(1), pp. 7-11.**
 - o This is the introduction to *Planning Theory’s* special issue on insurgence and informality.
 - o “...One of the most important contributions of these articles to planning theory is that they serve to defamiliarize planning. I borrow the term ‘defamiliarization’ from Holston’s account of insurgence to suggest that these articles act as an insurgent counterpoint to dominant regimes of theory. In my article, I attempt such defamiliarization by arguing that good or better planning cannot solve the crisis that is Indian urbanization, for planning itself is implicated in the very production of this crisis... Informality then is not a set of unregulated activities that lies beyond the reach of planning; rather it is planning that inscribes the informal by designating some activities as authorized and others as unauthorized, by demolishing slums while granting legal status to equally illegal suburban developments. Such processes are brilliantly explained in Yiftachel’s article, which puts forward the powerful concept of ‘gray cities.’ Central to this conceptualization is the “stratification of informalities” – the processes of ‘whitening’ (condoning, approving) and ‘blackening’ (criminalizing, destroying) different types of informality. Yiftachel states bluntly that the ‘informality of the powerful’ is often whitened while other forms of informality remain indefinitely gray or are blackened. Planning is fully implicated in such processes... While Yiftachel (1995) has argued in earlier work that such stratifications represent the ‘dark side’ of planning, his recent work indicates how such planning practices are not anomalous but rather an integral part of systems of ‘urban apartheid’ and ‘centripetal colonialism.’ I could not agree more...” (pp. 10-11).

- **Roy, A. 2009b. “Why India cannot plan its cities: Informality, insurgence and the idiom of urbanization,” *Planning Theory*, 8(1), pp. 76-87.**
 - o The fast-paced growth of the Indian economy and particularly its cities has produced an urban crisis, one that is marked by the lack of adequate infrastructure and growth management as well as by sharp social divisions that are starkly etched in a landscape of bourgeois enclaves and slums. In this context, there are numerous calls for a more decisive and vigorous type of planning that can “future-proof” Indian cities. Yet, such efforts are often unsuccessful and many are fiercely challenged by social movements and forms of insurgence. This article explains this urban crisis by analyzing the structure of urban informality in India. While informality is often seen to be synonymous with poverty, this article makes the case that India’s planning regime is itself an informalized entity, one that is a state of deregulation, ambiguity, and exception. This idiom of urbanization makes possible new frontiers of development but also creates the territorial impossibility of governance, justice, and development.

- **Roy, A. 2011. “Slumdog cities: Rethinking subaltern urbanism,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 35(2), pp. 223-238.**
 - o This article is an intervention in the epistemologies and methodologies of urban studies. It seeks to understand and transform the ways in which the cities of the Global South are studied and represented in urban research, and to some extent in popular discourse. As such, the article is primarily concerned with a formation of ideas —‘subaltern urbanism’— which undertakes the theorization of the megacity and its subaltern spaces and subaltern classes. Of these, the ubiquitous “slum” is the most prominent. Writing against apocalyptic and dystopian narratives of the slum, subaltern urbanism provides accounts of the slum as a terrain of habitation, livelihood, self-organization and politics. This is a vital and even radical challenge to dominant narratives of the megacity. However, this article is concerned with the limits of and alternatives to subaltern urbanism. It thus highlights emergent analytical strategies, using theoretical categories that transcend the familiar metonyms of underdevelopment such as the megacity, the slum, mass politics and the habitus of the dispossessed. Instead, four categories are discussed – peripheries, urban informality, zones of exception and gray spaces. Informed by the urbanism of the Global South, these categories break with ontological and topological understandings of subaltern subjects and subaltern spaces.

- **Simone, A. 2001. “Straddling the divides: Remaking associational life in the informal African city,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 25(1), pp. 102-117.**
 - o Available free online at <http://abahlali.org/files/informality.pdf>
 - o “The past decade has witnessed marked changes in the nature of African urban economies. There have been substantial changes in the role and operation of public sectors, a redeployment of resources and priorities, and an intensification of labour-intensive strategies for securing livelihood. With these changes have come significant shifts in the configuration of urban associational life. New, formalized vehicles of association, most often in the form of community-based and non-governmental organizations, have proliferated... These associations have taken advantage of a generally more open climate of expression and for self-initiated organization in the context of increasing democratization. On the other hand, the attrition of public sectors from service provision under the regimes of economic restructuring is also seen as responsible for the growth of new associations. Urban neighbourhoods in many instances must now practise a kind of self-management if improvements in living conditions are to take place. The exigencies of such self-management have given rise to a variety of more loose-knit, ephemeral social formations. In this article, I wish to highlight how such social formations in three African urban settings serve as important sites for rehearsing capacities related to such self-management. Here, I emphasize capacities related to balancing divergent trajectories of what is entailed in ‘making do’ in urban Africa today.” (p. 102).

- **Tranberg Hansen, K.T., and Vaa, M. 2004. *Reconsidering informality: Perspectives from urban Africa*. Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.**
 - o The entire e-book is available free online at nai.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:240550/FULLTEXT02
 - o “Reconsidering Informality consists primarily of case studies taken from a variety of African cities including Bissau, Lusaka, Harare, Dar es Salaam, Nairobi, Maputo, Maseru (Lesotho), and

Pointe-Noire (Congo-Brazzaville... The editors define the informal city as consisting of extralegal housing and unregistered economic activities, while the formal city is defined as the city government and its agents and institutions along with rules and regulations developed to control urban space... Reconsidering Informality is divided into three sections. The first, "Locality, Space and Place," includes a compelling article by Karen Tranberg Hansen that examines struggles over vending space in Lusaka and, significantly, relates these to government efforts to aid investors and to opposing definitions of a "free market." The section also includes Gabriel Tati's analysis of conflicts over access and the use of space between migrant fishermen in the artisanal fisheries off the coast of Pointe-Noire and the multinational Elf Oil Company. The section entitled "Economy, Work and Livelihoods" includes Amin Y. Kamete's article on home industries and the formal city in Harare... The book's longest section is called "Land, Housing and Planning" and includes Paul Jenkins's attempt to problematize formal/informal dichotomies in his analysis of land access in Maputo. Jenkins makes the crucial point that alternatives must be found to the dominant state hegemony that has defined the formal to date. His conclusion that direct reciprocity and non-state redistribution are perhaps the most productive means of assisting the urban poor, in contexts where the state and market are increasingly unable or unwilling to do so, poses a key challenge for other urban analysts who approach governments and markets less critically. Overall, Reconsidering Informality successfully achieves its goal of bringing together in one volume two primary streams of research that have generally been studied independently: studies of urban land use and housing, and studies of work and economic sustenance. The book's authors also offer insightful analyses of the local interplay of forces of globalization, including struggles over human migration and multinational corporatization."

- o The extract above was taken from the book review by Shantz, J. 2006. Review of "Karen Tranberg Hansen and Mariken Vaa, eds. Reconsidering Informality: Perspectives from Urban Africa," *African Studies Review*, 49(1), (pp. 130-132).
- **Watson, V. 2009a. "The planned city sweeps the poor away...': Urban planning and 21st Century urbanisation," *Progress in Planning*, 72, pp. 151-193.**
 - o In recent years, attention has been drawn to the fact that more than half of the world's population is urbanized, and the bulk of these urban dwellers are living in the Global South. Many of these Southern towns and cities are dealing with crises compounded by rapid population growth, particularly in peri-urban areas; lack of access to shelter, infrastructure and services by predominantly poor populations; weak local governments and serious environmental issues. Newer issues of climate change, resource and energy depletion, food insecurity and the current financial crisis will exacerbate present difficult conditions. As ideas that either "the market" or "communities" could solve these urban issues appear increasingly unrealistic, there have been suggestions for a stronger role for governments through reformed instruments of urban planning. However, agencies (such as UN-Habitat) promoting this make the point that in many parts of the world current urban planning systems are actually part of the problem: They serve to promote social and spatial exclusion, are anti-poor, and are doing little to secure environmental sustainability. Urban planning, it is argued, therefore needs fundamental review if it is to play any meaningful role in current urban issues...
 - o This paper explores the idea that urban planning has served to exclude the poor, but that it might be possible to develop new planning approaches and systems that address urban growth

and the major environment and resource issues, and are pro-poor. What is clearly evident is that over the last two to three decades, urban places in both the Global North and South have changed significantly: in terms of their economy, society, spatial structure and environments. Yet it appears that planning systems, particularly in the global South, have changed very slowly and some hardly at all, with many approaches and systems reflecting planning ideas from the global North simplistically transferred to Southern contexts through complex processes of colonialism and globalisation. The persistence of older forms of planning in itself requires explanation. The paper briefly reviews newer approaches to urban planning which have emerged in both the global North and South to see the extent to which they might, at the level of principle, offer ideas for pro-poor and sustainable planning. The dangers of further inappropriate “borrowing” of ideas across contexts are stressed. It concludes that there are some important shifts and new ideas, but no ready-made solutions for Southern urban contexts.

- **Watson, V. 2009b. “Seeing from the South: Refocusing urban planning on the globe’s central issues,” *Urban Studies*, 46(11), pp. 2259-2275.**
 - o Urban planning in many parts of the world reflects an increasing gap between current approaches and growing problems of poverty, inequality, informality, rapid urbanization and spatial fragmentation, particularly (but not only) in cities of the global South. Given past dominance of the global North in shaping planning theory and practice, this article argues that a perspective from the global South can be useful in unsettling taken-for-granted assumptions about how planning addresses these issues. The article takes a first step in this direction by proposing a “clash of rationalities,” between techno-managerial and marketized systems of government administration, service provision and planning (in those parts of the world where these apply) and increasingly marginalized urban populations surviving largely under conditions of informality. It draws together theoretical resources beyond the boundaries of conventional planning theory to understand the nature of this conflict, and the nature of the “interface” between those involved, where unpredictable encounter and contestation also open the possibility for exploring alternative approaches to planning.
- **Werna, E. 2001. “Shelter, employment and the informal city in the context of the present economic scene: Implications for participatory governance,” *Habitat International*, 25, pp. 209-227.**
 - o This paper analyzes the scope of policies related to both shelter and employment for reducing urban poverty. It puts forward suggestions on how to strengthen such policies through local governance processes. Yet, the paper states that such local processes and associated shelter-employment policies are constrained by the broad economic context: Although valuable local actions to combat poverty have indeed succeeded to some extent (e.g. support to small-scale, labour intensive, informal production), counteracting global trends have in many circumstances strengthened conditions such as capital-intensive production, unstable employment, unemployment and/or intra-urban differentials. The paper challenges the possibility of a comprehensive and sustainable development without significant changes in the current global context. It elaborates on the links between shelter-employment policies at the local level and overall economic trends, and makes recommendations for action.

- **Yiftachel, O. 2009a. “Critical theory and “gray space”: Mobilization of the colonized,”** *City*, 13(2/3), pp. 240-256.
 - o The paper draws on critical urban theories (CUT) to trace the working of oppressive power and the emergence of new subjectivities through the production of space. Within such settings, it analyzes the struggle of Bedouin Arabs in the Beersheba metropolitan region, Israel/Palestine. The paper invokes the concept of “gray spacing” as the practice of indefinitely positioning populations between the “lightness” of legality, safety and full membership, and the “darkness” of eviction, destruction and death. The amplification of gray space illuminates the emergence of urban colonial relations in a vast number of contemporary city regions. In the Israeli context, the ethnocratic state has forced the indigenous Bedouins into impoverished and criminalized gray space, in an attempt to hasten their forced urbanization and Israelization. This created a process of “creeping apartheid,” causing the transformation of Bedouin struggle from agonistic to antagonistic; and their mobilization from democratic to radical. The process is illustrated by highlighting three key dimensions of political articulation: sumood (hanging on), memory-building and autonomous politics. These dynamics underscore the need for a new CUT, which extends the scope of spatial–social critique and integrates better to conditions of urban colonialism, collective identity and space, for a better understanding of both oppression and resistance.
- **Yiftachel, O. 2009b. “Theoretical notes on “gray cities”: The coming of urban apartheid?,”** *Planning Theory*, 8(1), pp. 88-100.
 - o The author analyzes the political geography of globally expanding urban informalities. These are conceptualized as “gray spaces,” positioned between the “whiteness” of legality/approval/safety, and the “blackness” of eviction/destruction/death. The vast expansion of gray spaces in contemporary cities reflects the emergence of new types of colonial relations, which are managed by urban regimes facilitating a process of “creeping apartheid.” Planning is a lynchpin of this urban order, providing tools and technologies to classify, contain and manage deeply unequal urban societies. The author uses a “South-Eastern” perspective to suggest the concept of “planning citizenship” as a possible corrective horizon for analytical, normative and insurgent theories.

4. Urban Informal Economies: General Trends and Issues

While a significant proportion of research on urban informal economies concentrates on particular “sectors” (i.e. street trader, home-based enterprise, informal service provision, transport, housing and so on), a substantial literature also deals with the general dynamics and issues surrounding urban informal economies. This section presents some of these more general studies as a precursor to the sector-specific work provided in Section 6 following. For clarity of presentation, the literature has been divided into the following subsections:

- The urban working poor: Global issues and dynamics
- Governance and institutional analyses of urban informal economies
- The politics of urban informal economies
- Urban informal sector policy analysis

4.1 The Urban Working Poor: Global Issues and Dynamics

Recent planning-related literature includes studies of the general trends affecting urban informal economies and the working poor globally. The impact of the recent global financial crisis on opportunities available to the urban working poor is the concern of Brown 2010. She notes that, in contrast to popular perceptions of the informal economy as a survivalist “outlet for local agricultural produce or manufacture,” informal actors such as street traders are “inextricably linked to global systems of exchange, making them vulnerable to economic collapse” 2010:185. In fact, “evidence suggests that the global financial crisis has served to deepen the vulnerability of the working poor through a number of mechanisms, including reduced remittances, increased competition from new entrants, and heavy-handed regulation by urban authorities” 2010:186.

- **Brown, A. 2010. “Requiem for stability: Impact of the global financial crisis on the world’s working poor,” *International Planning Studies*, 15(3), pp. 175-189.**
 - o The global financial crisis of summer 2008 rocked markets throughout the world. Evidence of its impact on the urban working poor is only just emerging but is likely to be profound. The paper challenges the accepted argument that globalization and economic growth is good for poverty reduction, arguing that the resulting increase in vulnerability of the urban poor in informal work outweighs the gains of growth. Despite early predictions that low-income economies might avoid the worst impacts of recession, emerging evidence indicates that this is not the case. Evidence from global activists suggests that the fall in price of goods and reduced employment opportunities for the very poor is acute. Urban planners need to seek new economic paradigms that recognize the contribution of informal economy to development, and adopt parallel ground-level initiatives to protect jobs and livelihoods during this crisis period.
- **Chant, S., and Pedwell, C. 2008. “Women, gender and the informal economy: An assessment of ILO research and suggested ways forward.” *International Labour Office, Geneva*.**
 - o This discussion paper provides an overview of ILO research on women, gender and the informal economy undertaken during the last two decades. It examines methodological and analytical frameworks used in various studies, identifies research gaps and proposes directions for future work. It ultimately aims to enhance ILO’s work in developing consistent, coherent and coordinated policy advice to constituents across the four pillars of the ILO Decent Work Agenda: standards and fundamental principles and rights at work, employment, social protection and social dialogue.

4.2 Governance and Institutional Analyses of Urban Informal Economies

Several authors have considered the wide-reaching implications of global political-economic trends, typically described by terms such as “neoliberalization,” “decentralization,” “democratization” and “informalization,” for the institutional forms and processes of urban governance in Africa (Lindell, 2008; Meagher, 2007b, 2009, 2010) and elsewhere (GuarnerosMeza, 2009). These structural trends, in combination with the historical-path dependencies affecting particular cities, have often resulted in the production of hybridized forms of institutional governance blurring the neat formal/informal conceptual divide posited by most institutionalist analysis. Within the “bricolage” (Meagher, 2007a) of formal and informal organizations, actors may use pre-existing networks of ethnicity, class

and religion to “forge links between dynamic informal organizational systems and formal institutions of government” (Meagher, 2010:299).

This subsection also includes several studies of the role of urban planning and planners in the governance (Muraya, 2006) and oppression of informal economies (Kamete, 2007; 2009).

- **Elyachar, J. 2003. “Mappings of power: The State, NGOs, and international organizations in the informal economy of Cairo,” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 45(3), pp. 571-605.**
 - o ...A problem like “the informal economy” begins as an unplanned dynamic outside the control of any state. The IOs that launched projects for the informal economy tried to fit those dynamics into a planned future. The informal economy took shape as a research programme, a funding agenda, and a new social field on the ground, and efforts to map it were a crucial part of these undertakings. However, this time it was IOs and not the state that initiated the mapping, even when they did so within institutions of the state. Fieldwork to explore these realities must decipher why fences move and why maps disappear, or why they are not drawn up at all. It must decipher the relations of power that shape what is on the ground, and what gets onto the maps, both graphic and statistical. The mappings of power we need to chart as ethnographers, and as theorists, are complex indeed.

- **Guarneros-Meza, V. 2009. “Mexican urban governance: How old and new institutions coexist and interact,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 33(2), pp. 463-482.**
 - o The analysis of urban governance in terms of networks, as developed in the UK by scholars including Rhodes and Stoker, can be applied to a context such as Mexico if due weight is given to macro-level processes. In this article, careful attention is paid to the institutional legacies of Mexico’s past authoritarian regime and how they are challenged by a new discourse of neoliberalization, decentralization and democratization. Corporatism, social segmentation and organizational fragmentation in the past have resulted in the continuing importance of hierarchical modes of governance alongside networks. Case studies of the public-private partnerships involved in the regeneration of the historic centres of Querétaro and San Luis Potosí show that new forms of governance entail a mix of continuity and change. Regeneration partnerships were initiated and largely funded by the local state, with the state retaining considerable power. Most of the non-state participants were drawn from the old aristocracy and business and professional organizations, while the increasingly autonomous groups of street traders and “ordinary” citizens concerned with life in the city centre were excluded. Nevertheless, new discourses challenge the institutional legacies of the past, encouraging institutional change.

- **Kamete, A.Y. 2007. “Cold-hearted, negligent and spineless? Planning, planners and the (r)ejection of “filth” in urban Zimbabwe,” *International Planning Studies*, 12(2), pp. 153-171.**
 - o The state bureaucracy played a prominent role in Zimbabwe’s “Operation Murambatsvina/Restore Order,” the world(in)famous urban “clean-up” operation. The planning system was in the forefront of the operation, conspicuously sharing the limelight with the security and law-enforcement agencies. The paper examines how planners provided the operation’s techno-legal articulation, which was liberally deployed by the state to explain, rationalize, and glorify the operation. The discussion critically analyzes some of the most scathing criticism against planning, namely that planners were cold-hearted, negligent and spineless. Based on an interrogation of

the evidence in light of the viewpoints of a cross-section of practitioners, victims and activists, the paper argues that it is difficult for the planning profession to dodge these accusations.

- **Kamete, A.Y. 2009. “In the service of tyranny: Debating the role of planning in Zimbabwe’s urban “cleanup” operation,” *Urban Studies*, 46(4), pp. 897-922.**
 - o The paper debates the role of planning in “Operation Murambatsvina/Restore Order,” Zimbabwe’s controversial 2005 urban clean-up campaign. The discussion critically assesses two perspectives regarding the purported contribution and complicity of planning in what critics perceive to be the machinations of a regime that is internationally viewed as nefarious. This is done, first, by interrogating the role and contribution of planners and planning to the instigation and design of the operation before it was launched and, secondly, by determining the extent to which planners and planning served as the handmaiden of state repression during the operation. After weighing relevant empirical evidence on the culpability of planning, the discussion concludes that, while planning may escape the first charge, it certainly has a case to answer on the second.
- **Lindell, I. 2008. “The multiple sites of urban governance: Insights from an African city,” *Urban Studies*, 45(9), pp. 1879-1901.**
 - o Contemporary modes of urban governance involve a wide variety of actors. The present paper combines insights from several debates into a framework that considers the multiple sites where practices of governance are exercised and contested, various and entangled layers of relations and a broad range of practices of governance that may involve various modes of power, as well as different scales. The paper illustrates some of these complexities with an empirical study of the governance of marketplaces in Maputo, Mozambique. It shows how urban governance in a context of extensive informalization and “democratic transition” can be highly fragmented and fluid, contesting some of the assumptions underlying Western debates on urban governance. It also questions notions of the hollowed-out state and an excessive focus on public policy.
- **Meagher, K. 2007b. “Manufacturing disorder: Liberalization, informal enterprise and economic “un-governance” in African small firm clusters,” *Development and Change*, 38(3), pp. 473-503.**
 - o Small enterprise clusters are viewed as an important means of promoting competitive small-firm development even in contexts of unstable markets and weak states. Yet the emergence of successful enterprise clusters in developing regions of Southern Europe, Asia and Latin America contrasts with their conspicuous absence in Africa. This article challenges ahistorical and culturalist explanations regarding the lack of successful enterprise clusters in Africa through a comparative analysis of three dynamic and increasingly globalized informal manufacturing clusters in two different regions of Nigeria. Focusing on a Muslim Yoruba weaving cluster in the town of Ilorin in south-western Nigeria, and two Christian Igbo shoe and garment clusters in the town of Aba in south-eastern Nigeria, this article explores the role of culture, religion and the state in shaping informal economic governance in an African context. An account of the varied and complex history of these Nigerian enterprise networks reveals both their capacity for institutional innovation and economic linkages across ethnic, religious and gender boundaries, as well as their vulnerability to fragmentation and involution in the context of liberalization, state neglect and political opportunism. Far from demonstrating the inadequacies of African cultural institutions, the slide of African entrepreneurial networks into social disorder and economic

“ungovernance” is traced to the destructive impact of neoliberal reforms in a context of poverty and formal institutional exclusion.

- **Meagher, K. 2009. “The informalization of belonging: Igbo informal enterprise and national cohesion from below,” *Africa Development*, 24(1), pp. 31-46.**
 - o The Nigerian Civil War evokes images of ethno-regional strife followed by simmering ethnic tension. However, political perspectives on the legacies of Biafra tend to gloss over the more integrative and constructive economic effects of the Civil War and its aftermath. While the Nigerian Civil War devastated Igbo business activities across Nigeria, and precipitated a mass return of Igbo migrants to their home area, it also laid the foundation for a consolidation and rapid development of Igbo informal enterprise, which has had integrative rather than divisive social and economic consequences for Nigeria as a whole. Operating below the radar of political competition, the demands of informal enterprise development have nurtured strong inter-ethnic and inter-regional links between the Igbo, Hausa, Yoruba and other Nigerian as well as non-Nigerian groups. With a particular focus on Igbo informal manufacturing, long-distance trading networks and informal money changing, this paper will consider the role of the informal economy in the development of popular structures of national unity. It will also show that these processes of economic integration from below have increasingly been strained by political struggles from above, creating a tide of violence and ethnic polarization that, even more than the Civil War, threatens to unravel the underlying social fabric of Nigerian nationhood.
- **Meagher, K. 2010. “The tangled web of associational life: Urban governance and the politics of popular livelihoods in Nigeria,” *Urban Forum*, 21, pp. 299-313.**
 - o This paper examines how decentralization and informalization are reshaping urban governance in contemporary Africa. By exploring the interface between urban institutional failures and popular organizational solutions, the paper considers how informal governance processes feed into wider structural and political outcomes. Attention paid to issues of institutional process and power relations reveals how the limited access of the poor to resources and decision-making structures may distort rather than enhance their agency within decentralized urban governance systems. Drawing on case studies of informal enterprise associations in Christian and Muslim parts of Nigeria, this paper explores the differing ways in which networks of ethnicity, class and religion are used to forge links between dynamic informal organizational systems and formal institutions of government. The varied outcomes of these efforts raise uncomfortable questions about whether the proliferation of popular networks and associations amid weak formal institutions is tipping African cities onto trajectories of popular empowerment and pro-poor growth, or instigating a downward slide into violence and urban decay.
- **Muraya, P.W.K. 2006. “Urban planning and small-scale enterprises in Nairobi, Kenya,” *Habitat International*, 30, pp. 127-143.**
 - o The important role played by the informal sector in most economies in less developed countries is now recognized by governments and international agencies. However, enterprises in the informal sector continue to encounter various legal barriers that prevent them from attaining their full potential. This paper examines the performance of small-scale enterprises in three neighbourhoods in Nairobi, Kenya. The study reveals that government intervention and donor funds are essential to enable small-scale enterprises to attain their full potential. However,

government and donor agencies provide more assistance to enterprises in neighbourhoods that have security of tenure and open space available for development. The study also demonstrates that with the installation of basic infrastructure, and the elimination of both rigid regulations and the threat of demolition, the enterprises perform more efficiently and new enterprises come up, diversifying neighbourhood economies and creating job opportunities. This highlights the need for urban planners to allocate land and provide basic infrastructure for the informal sector. Government intervention and funds from donor agencies are, therefore, crucial in enhancing the performance of small-scale enterprises and creating jobs.

4.3 The Politics of Urban Informal Economies

While some authors may interpret the urban informal economy primarily as a survivalist outlet, recently various authors have adopted postmodernist perspectives in order to understand the informal economy as a locus of political contestation and the continuous recasting of power relations between “formal” and “informal” actors. Amin Kamete (2007, 2009, 2010) is interested in how planning, as a state-directed activity, involves the (attempted) imposition of an ordered vision on the urban spatial environment. Often the imposition involves the repressive deployment of both epistemic and physical forms of violence against informal livelihood practices. Yet the hegemony of the state’s ordered spatial vision is always tenuous, for it “incites non-compliance” – “disorder only emerges out of a vision of order” (2010:56). Kamete analyzes the strategies of resistance exemplified by Harare’s youth, thereby exposing “the messy and complex realities in resistances that are both open and hidden, simple and subtle, “pure” and hybrid” (2010:71). By simply defending their (informal) illicit livelihoods, the youth carried out a form of localized “resistance at the margins,” which was “about” disrupting “institutions and normalization.” In a similar vein to Kamete, Kudva (2009) is interested in how the production of “segregated spaces” through “mutually constitutive political and spatial practices of informality” can result in political practices including “not just everyday resistance and creeping encroachments to achieve gains, but also episodic moments of open protest, collective mobilization, and violence.” Whitson (2007) also considers “how the everyday activity of informal work can be understood as a “hidden” space of power and resistance in contemporary urban Argentina.”

The politics of informality is a major theme of the recent literature on street trading (see Section 6.1).

- **Kamete, A.Y. 2010. “Defending illicit livelihoods: Youth resistance in Harare’s contested spaces,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 34(1), pp. 55-75.**
 - o In response to incessant assaults by the Zimbabwean state’s repressive apparatus, spearheaded by the urban planning system, youth in Harare have shifted their modes of resistance. The most successful forms of resistance appear to be those that are multifarious, non-confrontational and less docile. Empirical material from Harare suggests that the situation is best understood in the framework of more sophisticated conceptualizations of human agency and resistance than those proposed by modernist perspectives. It is shown that the resistance of the youth is about localized struggles that disrupt institutions and normalization. Arguing that the youth’s continued occupation of contested urban spaces is a result of abandoning full-scale confrontation in favour of “resistance at the margins,” the article concludes that a postmodernist analysis best explains the youths’ modes of resistance.

- **Kudva, N. 2009. “The everyday and the episodic: The spatial and political impacts of urban informality,” *Environment and Planning A*, 41, pp. 1614-1628.**
 - o Informality, understood either as an economic sector or as a form of shelter and service provision, dominates Southern cities, even as disciplinary divides dominate the study of informality and its impacts. The author seeks to move beyond these divides by focusing on the production of urban space under different structural conditions in two Indian cities, Delhi and Ahmedabad. Using a Lefebvrian theoretical framework, the author examines existing literature to unpack the mutually constitutive political and spatial practices of informality. The segregated spaces thus produced can be linked to a politics of informality that includes not just everyday resistance and creeping encroachments to achieve gains, but also episodic moments of open protest, collective mobilization, and violence. In highlighting these impacts, production of space theories also open up the question of generating knowledge for new sites of resistance.

- **Meth, P. 2010. “Unsettling insurgency: Reflections on women’s insurgent practices in South Africa,” *Planning Theory & Practice*, 11(2), pp. 241-263.**
 - o This paper builds on work that celebrates insurgent planning practices, and that recognizes the possibilities for repression inherent within these. Calling for more attention to the practice of so-called repressive insurgencies, it uses two case studies from Durban, South Africa to unsettle some assumptions arguably embedded in notions of “antidemocratic” or repressive insurgency. The cases tell the stories of marginalized women who participate through insurgency in shaping their city. Their contributions to resolving unmet housing and employment needs represent acts of insurgency against a state which has, in part, retreated from the provision of shelter and employment through its commitment to a neoliberal agenda. These insurgent practices parallel other celebrated insurgent contributions to cities. The women, however, also manage crime and violence in their local areas, using a range of strategies, some of which can be considered insurgent, as they directly challenge the authority and competence of the state. These crime-management practices are, however, at times very violent, as the women’s insurgent practices involve forms of vigilantism to achieve their purposes. Yet given the marginalized status of the women, and the reality of an absent state, trying to make sense of these practices (from the perspective of planning theory) proves challenging. Labelling them anti-democratic and repressive is arguably inadequate. The paper makes use of this contradiction to unsettle the concept of insurgency and develop further ideas about the difficulties of celebrating or condemning the contributions of the marginalized to diverse and unequal cities.

- **Whitson, R. 2007. “Hidden struggles: spaces of power and resistance in informal work in urban Argentina,” *Environment and Planning A*, 39, pp. 2916-2934.**
 - o Drawing on 93 in-depth interviews conducted with informal workers in Buenos Aires in 2002, this paper examines how the everyday activity of informal work can be understood as a “hidden” space of power and resistance in contemporary urban Argentina. Moving away from an economic view of informal work, I argue that, while there is no single power relationship experienced by all informal workers, informal work more generally can be understood as a space in which multiple actors struggle over meaning and control through the deployment of diverse forms of power. The results presented here suggest that, while Argentines view informal work as a place of exploitation by employers and subjugation by the state, in some circumstances it can also be understood as a space of resistance, as workers attempt, through informal work, to

create spaces hidden from control, to redefine the norms and rules that govern this space, and to transform the conditions of existence established by other actors. In focusing on the political function of informal work, this paper attempts to bring to light the complex relationships of power between the economy, the state, employers, and workers within the context of Argentina's economic and political crisis.

4.4 Urban Informal Sector Policy Analysis

- **Ligthelm, A.A. 2008. "A targeted approach to informal business development: The entrepreneurial route," *Development Southern Africa*, 25(4), pp. 367-382.**
 - o The present paper maintains that initiatives to promote and support small businesses need to focus on those with growth potential rather than on the small-business sector as a whole, and that the human factor, especially entrepreneurial intentions and behaviour, is the overwhelming force in small-business success. Empirical evidence shows that many entrepreneurs setting up businesses in the informal economy of South Africa have little business acumen. The majority of informal businesses operate as survivalist entities with limited development and growth potential. The paper suggests that only between 10 and 15 per cent of informal entrepreneurs have sufficient business skills to expand and develop their businesses. These should be the focus of policy initiatives. Separate collective support measures should be designed to make the business environment more hospitable to low-potential informal businesses.
- **Potts, D. 2008. "The urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa: From bad to good (and back again?)," *Development Southern Africa*, 25(2), pp. 151-167.**
 - o Conceptualisations of the informal sector in terms of economic dualism have a long history, as have effective challenges to those conceptualizations. These are discussed in this paper, which then examines shifts in attitudes towards the role of the urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa over recent decades, with reference to these theoretical conceptualizations and other approaches. The paper then discusses the dynamics of the sector and the changing role of the African state in promoting or discouraging it and identifies an increasingly negative trend in this respect. Finally, the paper offers a comparative perspective, from north of the Limpopo, on current debates and policy pronouncements about the "second economy" in South Africa.

5. Collective Organization and Unionization of Informal Labour

A significant thread of recent research emphasizes the limited "voice" of informal economic actors and their general inability to manifest "effective citizenship." Yet internationally, formal and informal associations of street traders and other informal groups can provide various degrees of "voice" through different institutional mechanisms, according to Brown *et al.* (2010) (see Section 6.1 below). As such, recent analytical interest has been directed at the collective organization of informal workers as well as the formation of urban, national and transnational informal labour movements. With reference to an association of informal vendors in Maputo (Mozambique), Lindell (2009) argues that "the transnational activities of the studied group assist it in challenging local power relations and dominant place projects that repress informal livelihood activities." Drawing on these findings, Lindell (2010) has subsequently argued in favour of "an analytical approach that takes account of the

diversity of organized actors, of a variety of governing powers and of the various spatial scales of social struggle involved in the politics of informal livelihoods today” (2010:207).

- **Gallin, D. 2001. “Propositions on trade unions and informal employment in times of globalization,” *Antipode*, 33(3), pp. 531-549.**
 - o The purpose of this contribution is to identify some of the issues that need to be addressed in order to advance the organization of workers, and in particular women workers, in informal employment. The organization of these workers, collectively described as the “informal sector,” represents an existential challenge to the trade-union movement: unless and until it puts itself in a position to effectively address this challenge, it cannot halt its decline, but in order to do so it has to undergo fundamental changes in its culture, its self-awareness and the way it relates to society. The issue of organizing the informal sector is at the heart of the necessary transformations the trade-union movement must undergo to recover its potential as a global social force.
- **Jason, A. 2008. “Organizing informal workers in the urban economy: The case of the construction industry in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania,” *Habitat International*, 32, pp. 192-202.**
 - o This paper draws on a recent study of informal construction workers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, to show how social dialogue was used in finding solutions to the encountered problems. The paper explains why the construction industry in general—and its informal sector in particular—is important for urban development. Following, the case study of Dar es Salaam is narrated with illustrations of practical experiences of how social dialogue was carried out. The conclusion draws together findings from the case and the literature that has been referred to. It links the findings of the case study with the theoretical framework of social dialogue.
- **Lindell, I. 2009. “Glocal movements: Place struggles and transnational organizing by informal workers,” *Geografiska Annaler Series B: Human Geography*, 91(2), pp. 123-136.**
 - o This paper investigates the scalar practices of collectively organized informal workers and the political implications of such practices. It illustrates how the studied group organizes across scales – hence, a “glocal movement” – and stresses the importance of an analysis that integrates these multiple scales of collective organizing, as they may have a bearing on each other. In so doing, it contests a common tendency to analytically privilege one or other scale of resistance and agency. In particular, I argue that networking across scales may be of significance for local struggles and thus play a role in local politics. The transnational activities of the studied group assist it in challenging local power relations and dominant place projects that repress informal livelihood activities. This paper comprises a conceptual discussion of notions of scale, of conceptions of the spatialities and scales of resistance as well as of place, followed by an empirical illustration that refers to an association of informal vendors in Maputo, Mozambique, and its international connections. The analysis is based on interviews with vendors, leaders of the association and with the international partners of the association.
- **Lindell, I. 2010. “Informality and collective organizing: Identities, alliances and transnational activism in Africa,” *Third World Quarterly*, 31(2), pp. 207-222.**
 - o This paper is a conceptual exploration of the dimensions of the contemporary politics of informal economies, from the vantage point of collective organizing by “informal workers.” It inquires into the formation of the political subjectivities and collective identities of informal actors. The

importance of the relations between their organizations and other organized actors is illustrated with a discussion of emerging alliances with trade unions. The transnational scales of collective organizing by “informal workers” are addressed. The paper suggests an analytical approach that takes account of the diversity of organized actors, of a variety of governing powers and of the various spatial scales of social struggle involved in the politics of informal livelihoods today. The reflections are informed by the considerable social and economic differentiation contained in informal economies and emphasize the importance of the great diversity of actors, positions, agendas and identities for understanding the complex and contingent politics of informality. Empirical illustrations are drawn from the African continent, but the discussions in the paper address wider trends and theoretical debates of relevance for other developing regions.

- **Motala, S. 2002. “Organizing in the informal economy: A case study of street trading in South Africa,” SEED Working Paper no. 36 (International Labour Office: Geneva).**

- o Available free online at http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@emp_ent/@ifp_seed/documents/publication/wcms_117700.pdf
- o The ability of workers in the informal economy to exercise their right to freedom of association (establish or join organizations of their own choosing without fear of reprisal or intimidation) is critical to shaping regulatory frameworks and institutional environments that ultimately help informal workers and economic units to move into the formal economy. Lack of voice at work is marginalizing informal economic actors in the labour market and in society at large. This paper analyzes organizational strategies adopted by street traders in South Africa’s informal economy. It focuses on three organizations – the Informal Trade Management Board (ITMB) in Durban, the Gauteng Hawkers Association (GHA) in Johannesburg and the Self Employed Women’s Union (SEWU), operating in various cities across the country, Durban in particular.
- o The purpose of this study is to examine how these different organizational strategies contribute to (i) reduce the vulnerability of informal economic actors by enhancing their access to resources, facilities and public institutions, (ii) empower members to channel their concerns and aspirations in policy circles and influence decisions in their favour, (iii) address women’s gender-specific needs and secure women’s voice, and (iv) build strong and sustainable organizations at the local and national level.

- **Samson, M. 2004. “Organizing in the informal economy: A case study of the municipal waste management industry in South Africa.” International Labour Office (Geneva).**

- o Available free online at http://www.ilo.org/empent/Publications/WCMS_093980/lang--en/index.htm
- o “Traditionally the municipal waste-management industry in South Africa has been firmly located within the formal economy, and typified by high levels of organization among both employers and workers, as well as well-established institutions for collective bargaining. However, policy changes which have actively encouraged municipalities to externalize the provision of waste-management services have led to a dramatic shift in the nature of the sector. Whereas in the past municipalities were the sole employers of municipal waste-management workers, a range of economic actors including private companies, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), community-based organizations (CBOs), ward councilors/committees and short-term provincial poverty alleviation projects now employ and/or control labour within the sector. Some of these employers are informal. Aside from larger private companies, they are poorly organized, and do not negotiate with labour...

- o Externalization has also led to increased job insecurity and informalization of work. As municipalities typically grant contracts for three to five years, job security for workers employed to work on these contracts is limited. Some are hired on fixed-term contracts, and others are contracted on a daily basis. Those who are appointed permanently face retrenchment if the employer is unsuccessful in renewing the contract with the municipality. With respect to informalization, in some instances there has been a rise in disguised employment relationships, such as the contracting of ‘one-person operators’ (individuals who are ‘independently’ contracted to collect domestic refuse and transport it to temporary collection sites, but whose work is managed by a supervisor) to deliver services. For many workers the shift into the informal economy is based on the denial of rights enshrined in labour laws and bargaining council agreements due to lack of enforcement.”
- **Sanyal, B. 2008. “What is new in planning?,” *International Planning Studies*, 13(2), pp. 151-160.**
 - o Organized labour, once considered to be a key component of democratically managed political systems, was dismissed as a hindrance to economic and political modernization in the neoliberal economy. As the size and influence of organized formal-sector labour diminishes, this paper examines how unionization as an institutional form of labour organization is gaining popularity among informal workers in newly industrializing nations. Counteracting the impression that this unionization is outdated; the paper looks at the return of unionization and its significance for planners, and concludes that this trend calls for more, not less, planning, albeit of a different kind than used earlier for state-led industrialization.

6. Analysis of Sectors in the Informal Economy

Sector-specific studies of informal economies have many diverse conceptual starting points and objects of analysis. Discussions of trends in the literature are provided within the subsections following.

6.1 Street Traders / Vendors

We find, for example, a wide variety of empirical analyses of demographic trends and issues in informal trade, including the role played by children (Bromley and Mackie, 2008). A popular analytical theme considers the associational and networking practices of, and challenges facing, informal actors such as foreign street traders (Khotari, 2008; Hunter and Skinner, 2003; also Williams and Balaz, 2005). Lyons and Snoxell (2005a) study the generation of social capital and networks among informal traders (In Nairobi), arguing that “whilst traders initially draw heavily on existing inherited social capital, they deliberately create and adapt their networks, opportunistically building relationships of trust in the marketplace which enable them to survive.”

Probably the most popular analytical theme in recent years (at least in the planning literature) is concerned with issues of power and resistance in urban space; that is, the effects of urban policy and formal planning interventions on informal businesses and traders, and grassroots responses (resistance/insurgency) to such interventions. Recent research has been particularly interested in, and condemnatory of, the displacement of informal traders from central urban areas, usually motivated as a means of creating clean orderly spaces to promote tourism (Middleton, 2003; also see

Bromley and Mackie's [2009] study of traders in Peru – interestingly this process led to the generation of “unplanned” “alternative city-centre locations for informal trade.” Predictably, formalization and policy-led gentrification procedures in Cusco resulted in the marginalization of the poorest, lower-class traders). Crossa (2009) also recognizes that an entrepreneurial urban regeneration policy in Mexico City effectively worked to exclude “particular forms of social interaction that are central to the well-being of a large sector of the population, particularly street vendors who rely on public spaces for their daily survival.” Setsabi and Leduka (2008) studied the eviction of street traders in Maseru (Lesotho) and argue that “behind the facade of public health and urban aesthetics as reasons for the eviction of street traders lies overt exercise of state power to protect the interests of formal sector businesses and to disguise state failure to formulate inclusive and sustainable urban policies.” Hunt (2009) has considered local state initiatives to “recover public space” in Bogota (Columbia) through the eviction of street traders (to “spatially marginalized” state-regulated markets) and other efforts to overcome the traders’ “culture of informality.” She argues that the “relocation of street vendors is a spatial technology of governance that codes structural inequalities as a question of culture while producing new forms of segregation in which citizens and street vendors have differentiated places and rights to mobility” (2009:331). Contestation over public space is also the dominant theme within Donovan’s (2008) study of public space recuperation and street vending formalization/relocation efforts in Bogota (Columbia).

- **Bromley, R.D.F., and Mackie, P.K. 2008. “Identifying the role of children in informal trade: Evidence for urban policy,” *International Development Planning Review*, 30(2), pp. 113-131.**
 - o Research on child traders in the Peruvian city of Cusco highlights the roles that children play, revealing that children work as traders, either alone or alongside an adult, in 13 per cent of all observed informal trading units in the city centre. More specifically, on the streets, children comprise an even higher proportion: 21 per cent of traders. Interviews with the child street traders reveal the children’s agency, with children setting their own prices, occupying different sites to maximize the efficiency of their trading activities, and with those of different ages and gender adopting different roles within an apparent trader hierarchy. Given their considerable resilience to a large police presence, the child traders are entrenched in the city centre, and achieving the policy goal of removing them from the central streets is likely to require consumer education against buying from children, as well as cooperation from the parents and children themselves.
- **Bromley, R.D.F., and Mackie, P.K. 2009. “Displacement and the new spaces for informal trade in the Latin American city centre,” *Urban Studies*, 46(7), pp. 1485-1506.**
 - o Using evidence from Cusco, Peru, the paper examines the effects of the planned displacement of informal traders from city-centre streets. Although more than 3500 traders were relocated to new off-centre markets, the research identifies the emergence of “unplanned” alternative city-centre locations for informal trade, especially the new courtyard markets. The municipal-led changes, influenced strongly by concerns to enhance tourism, reveal a process which displays many of the hallmarks of gentrification. Lower-class traders were displaced from city-centre streets for the benefit of middleclass tourists and local people. There was also gentrification of the trading activity itself: by manipulating stall allocation and pricing structures to exclude the poorest traders from the new higher-quality municipal markets. The changing pattern of informal trading can be viewed as an unconventional “barometer” of the progress of policy-led gentrification, applicable to other cities in the developing world.

- **Brown, A., Lyons, M., and Dankoco, I. 2010. “Street traders and the emerging spaces for urban voice and citizenship in African cities,” *Urban Studies*, 47(3), pp. 666-683.**
 - o As informal commerce has grown to become the lifeblood of African cities, street trade—among the largest sub-groups in the informal economy—has become a visible but contested domain. Yet the increase in street traders has not been accompanied by a corresponding improvement in their status as citizens or in their political influence. The paper first discusses the implications of theoretical debates on “citizenship” and “voice” for street traders and then explores characteristics of traders’ associations and influence in four case study countries: Senegal, Ghana, Tanzania and Lesotho. Drawing together the authors’ findings from research between 2001 and 2008, the paper identifies a fluidity of both formal and informal traders’ organizations that fail to achieve lasting impact. Finally, the paper discusses urban policy implications, arguing for a more flexible definition of urban citizenship based on rights and responsibilities, and an understanding of the complexity of grassroots associations of the marginalized poor.

- **Crossa, V. 2009. “Resisting the Entrepreneurial City: ‘Street vendors’ struggle in Mexico City’s historic center,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 33(1), pp. 43-63.**
 - o Recent work on entrepreneurial urban governance has focused on the new forms of exclusion produced by neoliberal entrepreneurial urban strategies, arguing that local forms of social-spatial organization are being dismantled through practices ranging from the privatization of urban public space to the emergence of gated communities. By exploring the role of agency amid these changing structures of constraints, this article interrogates processes of socio-spatial exclusion under entrepreneurial forms of urban governance. I argue that despite constraints placed upon different groups of affected citizens, excluded groups develop survival strategies that enable them to maintain a livelihood and in some cases empower them to thrive. I use the case of a recently implemented entrepreneurial policy in Mexico City called the Programa de Rescate (The Rescue Programme). The prime objective of the policy is to revitalize and beautify the streets, buildings and central plaza of the city’s Historic Center. Although this policy seeks an improvement in the quality of life for the local population, it excludes particular forms of social interaction that are central to the wellbeing of a large sector of the population, particularly street vendors who rely on public spaces for their daily survival. I use the case of the Programa to show how street vendors have struggled to remain on the streets of Mexico City’s Historic Center.

- **Dewar, D. 2005. “A conceptual framework for the formulation of an informal trader policy for South African towns and cities,” *Urban Forum*, 16(1), pp. 1-16.**
 - o ...Informal trading has long been an emotive issue: Some view it as a symptom of developmental backwardness – a “problem” which needs to be resolved; others as a positive dynamic which enables large numbers of people to gain a foothold in the urban economy. Furthermore, the impacts of informal trading frequently cut across the traditional linefunction “territory” of numerous municipal departments (for example, traffic, health, economic development, planning, law enforcement) and often their response to the phenomenon is driven by different motives. Consequently, many towns and cities are grappling with the issue of how to develop a consistent policy approach to dealing with informal trading. This paper seeks to contribute to this debate by developing a conceptual framework around which a policy can be fleshed out.

- **Dierwechter, Y. 2004. “Dreams, bricks, and bodies: Mapping ‘neglected spatialities’ in African Cape Town,” *Environment & Planning A*, 36, pp. 959-981.**
 - o This paper deploys several propositions from Amin and Thrift’s recent theoretical work to map emerging geographies of the postapartheid city. Using Cape Town as a case study, the focus is on urban planning and informal sector retailing. After a discussion of the informal food sector, three parameters of urban space that are often apprehended separately are held together: an imagined geography of planning for the efficient and postapartheid city (“dreams”); a material geography of marketplaces for the developmental transformation of informal retailing (“bricks”); and a socioeconomic geography of what local officials call “pre-entrepreneurs” (“bodies”). The author argues that these three geographical features of the postapartheid city are of an emerging and mutually dependent piece; that is to say, they are co-creating each other across scales and domains of reality. The paper concludes with a brief discussion of the broader implications for understanding the prospects of the postapartheid city.

- **Donovan, M.G. 2008. “Informal cities and the contestation of public space: The case of Bogotá’s street vendors, 1988–2003,” *Urban Studies*, 45(1), pp. 29-51.**
 - o The resurgence of informal street trading poses serious challenges for local officials responsible for the maintenance of public space. This article contextualizes the tension between public space recuperation and informality, providing a detailed case study of Bogotá, Colombia (population 7.6 million). From 1988 to 2003, Bogotá’s mayors implemented one of the most ambitious public space campaigns in Latin America. The “tipping-points” behind Bogotá’s transition are illuminated with emphasis on the introduction of free mayoral elections and the enervation of informal vendor unions. Using a cohort panel design, this research also examines the working conditions and occupational hazards faced by vendors both before and after relocation to government-built markets. It reveals how formalized vendors experienced declining income levels, but improved working conditions. The final section examines public-policy implications and the extent to which Bogotá’s experience follows traditional models of public space planning in Latin America and the Caribbean.

- **Hlela, K. 2003. “Formal policies and informal power: Johannesburg’s street traders.” *Policy Brief 26 (Centre for Policy Studies: Johannesburg)*.**
 - o Available free online at <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08d15ed915d3cfd0017da/polbrief26.pdf>
 - o Local governments who hope to rescue their residents from undemocratic, informal control need to improve their understanding of power dynamics within their cities. If they do not, they may reinforce unequal relationships they wish to change...
 - o This is an interesting policy note that discusses the difficulties implementing formal policies in Johannesburg in the context of entrenched informal power relations.

- **Hunt, S. 2009. “Citizenship’s place: The state’s creation of public space and street vendors’ culture of informality in Bogota, Colombia,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 27, pp. 331-351.**
 - o In this paper I seek to move beyond understandings of Colombia as a failed state or qualified democracy by exploring how the state continues to govern despite widespread shortcomings. I

argue that two technologies of governance are central to contemporary rule in Colombia: state fragmentation and citizen education. These technologies are exemplified by the recovery of public space from street vendors in order to preserve it as a privileged site for citizenship. This process is made possible by the proliferation of state agencies, policies, and plans that define the problem of public space as one of its invasion by ambulant vendors, and the solution to this invasion as the relocation of vendors to spatially marginalized and state-regulated markets where they are taught to overcome their “culture of informality” by participating in political and economic transactions in state-prescribed ways. I argue that the recovery of public space and relocation of street vendors is a spatial technology of governance that codes structural inequalities as a question of culture while producing new forms of segregation in which citizens and street vendors have differentiated places and rights to mobility. This study analyzes the relationship between state and citizen construction while considering the pedagogical work implicated in the resilience of both democracy and neoliberal economic policies. Khotari, U. 2008. “Global peddlers and local networks: Migrant cosmopolitanisms,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 26, pp. 500-516.

- o This paper is based on the experiences of street traders from South Asia and West Africa who currently live and work in Barcelona. I argue that in the “informal” and marginal spaces inhabited, utilized, and created by these traders, they produce forms of non-elite cosmopolitanism through which livelihoods are sustained, social bonds are strengthened, and fluid, diasporic identities are produced. These are enabled by the development and maintenance of globalized networks and allegiances that are negotiated in highly localized ways and are often based on religion, ethnicity, and nationality. Thus, mobile and abiding cultural characteristics coexist as peddlers’ experiences of travelling and their encounters in place challenge conventional notions of cosmopolitanism and parochialism, and their apparent dualism. The paper introduces the notion of a strategic cosmopolitanism that emerges out of the need for vulnerable individuals and groups to make a living in an environment characterized by insecurity, and concludes by enquiring whether there are temporal dimensions to their cosmopolitanism.
- **Lyons, M., and Msoka, C.T. 2010. “The World Bank and the street: (How) do ‘Doing-Business’ reforms affect Tanzania’s micro-traders?,” *Urban Studies*, 47(5), pp. 1079-1097.**
 - o The well-documented weaknesses of structural adjustment policies have led to a reconceptualization of the World Bank’s approach to neoliberal reforms. The “Doing Business” reforms aim to foster a better climate for business in a number of ways. The main policy documents reject interventions targeted at specific groups but, although they identify informal small and medium enterprises (SMEs) as likely to benefit disproportionately, they specifically exclude microenterprises as a target group. The general argument of this paper is that reforms may well impact non-target groups through interactions with several areas of policy and law, public attitudes and multiple economic sectors. In particular, it is argued that the exclusion of micro-traders from reforms contributes to their marginalization in political and policy arenas, increasing their vulnerability to state intervention. The paper draws on a four-month study conducted by the authors in Tanzania in 2007.

- **Lyons, M., and Snoxell, S. (2005a). “Creating urban social capital: Some evidence from informal traders in Nairobi,” *Urban Studies*, 42(7), pp. 1077-1097.**
 - o The poverty and dramatic alteration in geographical composition of African cities have been associated with rapid urbanisation, the growth of the informal economy and migration. The latter has separated individuals from long-established social and kinship networks, and from familiar livelihood strategies. The sustainable livelihoods approach views social capital as one of the poor’s most important assets in managing their lives. This paper asks four central questions. (1) Does the creation of new, urban forms of social capital, depend upon and deplete inherited forms? (2) Is social capital deliberately created or is it a by-product of sociability? (3) What are its functions in supporting the livelihoods of informal traders? (4) Is there a gender dimension to the strategies adopted? The paper draws on interviews with 124 traders in two Nairobi markets, and on key-informant interviews. Principal findings are that, while traders initially draw heavily on existing inherited social capital, they deliberately create and adapt their networks, opportunistically building relationships of trust in the marketplace which enable them to survive. The pace of change is different in different economic milieux. Women and men adopt different strategies to achieve similar ends. Conclusions are drawn for social-capital theory and policy.

- **Lyons, M., and Snoxell, S. 2005b. “Sustainable urban livelihoods and marketplace social capital: Crisis and strategy in petty trade,” *Urban Studies*, 42(8), pp. 1077-1097.**
 - o Urban growth has been accompanied by the development of bimodal labour markets and increasing inequalities in both North and South. In Southern cities, many of the poor have turned to the informal sector, in particular to street trade. This has resulted in a multiplicity of urban conflicts and has led to pressure on urban managers to undertake formalization, for which an increasingly developmental approach has been advocated. Nevertheless, for traders, the formalization of street trade has very uneven outcomes. The starting point for this article is the premise that not enough is known about the social fabric upon which trading careers depend. Adopting sustainable livelihoods as a conceptual framework and drawing on social-capital theory, four questions are addressed. How do trading careers survive over time? Are there differences in the survival strategies for which social capital is employed among traders operating in different political, cultural and socioeconomic contexts? In the new processes of urbanization, are the old relationships on which social capital is based simply lost in the new, or are traditional networks and structures adapted? Finally, what policy conclusions should be drawn to inform urban management practices as they relate to trade formalization? The primary findings are that marketplace social capital is increasingly important to traders’ economic capital. However, inherited ties, although they diminish in importance, continue to be valuable and often serve as the basis for the development of contingent ties. Implications are discussed for urban management and planning practice, for planning theory and for social-capital theory.

- **Middleton, A. 2003. “Informal traders and planners in the regeneration of historic city centres: The case of Quito, Ecuador,” *Progress in Planning*, 59, pp. 71-123.**
 - o A major reason for the regeneration of historic city centres in developing countries is the possibility of benefiting from the growing mobility of international tourists. In this competitive global marketplace, a particular perspective on history and culture is being sold. It is a perspective that celebrates buildings and ignores a history of conflictive social relations. A modern expression of these social relations is the conflict between planners and street traders, whose presence is

seen to be inimical to tourism development. This paper investigates the relations between planners and street traders in Quito, in the context of the history of the city as a contested space and where the physical and socio-economic structures are related to deeply embedded cultural conflicts. The paper argues that these conflicts can only be resolved, and international tourism can only be successfully developed, if planners recognize the role of the history of their ideas in the process. After providing a brief discussion of the historical context for modern planning in Quito, it explores the recent proposals for the revitalization of the historic centre of Quito by examining the physical structure of the city centre and the place of informal traders within it; the social, economic and organizational structure of informal trade; and the cultural relations which act as a barrier to the resolution of differences over the future of tourism and street trading. Finally, some proposals for the modernization of planner-trader relations are discussed.

- **Mitullah, W.V. 2003. “Street trade in Kenya: The contribution of research in policy dialogue and response.” Paper prepared for presentation at the Urban Research Symposium on Urban Development for Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction (World Bank: Washington, DC).**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.wiego.org/sites/default/files/publications/files/Mitullah-street-trade-kenya-contribution-research-policy-dialogue.pdf>
 - o This paper shares an experience of street traders’ engagement in policy dialogue that arose out of a collaborative research process that began in 1999. The research involved gathering information and processing it for use in local and national policy dialogues between street traders and urban authorities. The paper begins by providing an overview of Micro and Small Enterprises [MSEs] in Kenya, followed by a brief on the research process before discussing policy responses on MSEs’ development, using the case of street traders.
- **Roever, S. 2006. “Street trade in Latin America: Demographic trends, legal issues, and vending organizations in six cities.” Prepared for the WIEGO Urban Policies Programme.**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.wiego.org/sites/default/files/publications/files/Roever-Street-Trade-Latin-Amer.pdf>
 - o This paper offers a review of street-vending issues in six major Latin American cities: Bogotá, Colombia; Caracas, Venezuela; Lima, Peru; Mexico City, Mexico, Santiago, Chile; and São Paulo, Brazil. The paper examines three broad themes in each city. First, it explores demographic trends and working conditions among street traders, compiling available information on the size of the street-vending population, its growth over time, gender and age breakdowns, and working conditions such as income stability and employment security. Second, it examines legal issues related to the governance of street trade in each city, including an analysis of laws, regulations and ordinances at the national, regional, and local levels. Where information is available, it adds an assessment of the effectiveness of those laws, the legal status of vendors, and the broader attitudes of the authorities toward street traders. Third, the paper compiles information on the extent of organization among street traders, with a focus on unions and other types of associations, and their strategies and effectiveness. The paper concludes by offering an outline of best practices emerging from the region. The analysis is based on data from national and international statistical agencies and secondary sources gathered through contacts with researchers in the region.

- **Setsabi, S., and Leduka, R.C. 2008. “The politics of street trading in Maseru, Lesotho,” *Urban Forum*, 19, pp. 221-241.**
 - o Research on the urban informal sector in Lesotho is scarce and largely descriptive, focussing on the demographic characteristics of street traders and their enterprises. Extant research has, therefore, assumed that the politics of street trading and regulation by the state, especially the eviction of street traders from the streets, do not matter. Drawing from research on street trading in Maseru, the capital city of Lesotho, this paper departs from the mainstream assumptions underlying past research. As its point of departure, the paper argues that, behind the facade of public health and urban aesthetics as reasons for the eviction of street traders, lies overt exercise of state power to protect the interests of formal-sector businesses and disguise state failure to formulate inclusive and sustainable urban policies.
- **Skinner, C. 2008. “Street trade in Africa: A review.” *School of Development Studies Working Paper No. 51 (University of KwaZulu-Natal: Durban).***
 - o Available free online at <http://sds.ukzn.ac.za/files/wp%2051%20web.pdf>
- **Williams, A.M., and Balaz, V. (2005). “Winning, then losing, the battle with globalization: Vietnamese petty traders in Slovakia,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 29(3), pp. 533-549.**
 - o Vietnamese traders, either individually or in so-called “Vietnamese markets,” remain strongly evident in Central Eastern Europe (CEE – the former Czechoslovakia, Hungary and Poland) despite having declined in number in recent years. Vietnamese traders feature in many economies, such as California (Gold, 1994) or Australia (Collins, 2003), but their position in CEE is distinctive, and under-researched. The narrative about Vietnamese traders in CEE can most obviously be told through two different theoretical lenses: the immigrant entrepreneur, and the trader engaged in arbitrage in a transition economy. Both provide useful perspectives, but – as argued below – neither is adequate for understanding the scale, constitution of, and changes in Vietnamese market trading...

6.2 Home-Based Enterprises

Recent studies of home-based enterprises (HBEs) reveal a variety of analytical approaches and research objectives. Work on HBEs often interfaces with work on housing and livelihoods, as the incidence of HBEs obviously has implications for housing design and settlement upgrading (see Wigle, 2008; Kigochie, 2001; Tipple, 2004). A notable theme concerns the implications of home-based employment for the production and transformation of urban and domestic space (Mahmud, 2003; Verrest and Post, 2007). Indeed, the realization that many urban inhabitants of the global South utilize their places of living in innovative and strategic income-generating ways undermines many of the assumptions underpinning modernist urban planning (including the general desire to separate places of living and work).

A large proportion of recent research on home-based work resulted from a comparative international research project on the nature and environmental impact of HBEs in South Africa, India, Indonesia and Bolivia, funded by the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development (DFID) and operated by Graham Tipple, based at Newcastle University (UK).

Research carried out during, and in continuation of, this project has attended to a variety of HBE-related issues, including the push-and-pull factors affecting the incidence and maintenance of home-based work in South Africa (Napier and Mothwa, 2001); longitudinal analysis of economic adaptability, market flexibility and social continuity amongst HBEs in Ghana (Gough, 2010), as well as the general characteristics and “roles” of HBEs in local communities and economic systems of varying scale (Gough *et al.*, 2003). Most of these studies direct their conclusions at various planning and development policy recommendations. Appropriate policy reforms are also the primary concern of a variety of empirical studies of, for example, the housing and spatial implications of widespread home-based work (Kellett and Tipple, 2000; Tipple *et al.*, 2002; Tipple and Kellett, 2003); available financing and credit mechanisms for HBEs internationally (Tipple and Coulson, 2007), as well as the relationship between HBEs and settlement upgrading (Tipple, 2004), residential location (Wigle, 2008) and waste production (Tipple, 2005a). Case-based and policy-oriented approaches are also evident in Onyebueke’s (2001) study of official policy responses to HBEs in Nigerian cities, and Kigochie’s (2001) description of the Mathare 4A Project in Nairobi (Kenya), which supported existing HBEs and created new employment opportunities through various policy initiatives.

Gough (2010) has summarized various general conclusions emerging from this considerable body of work. It is clear that HBEs are a common feature of urban settlements in the global South, although “the number of households operating home-based enterprises ranges from a fifth to almost a half, with a slight tendency for the frequency to be highest in African cities” (2010:46). The general realization is that “the frequency of home-based enterprises is increasing over time, in line with the increasing informalization of economies in the global South” (*ibid.*). Yet the frequency of HBEs also varies substantially within cities, between various neighbourhoods, depending on local socio-economic levels, settlement age and service levels. Internationally, those operating HBEs are predominantly women and, for many, home-based enterprise is their primary source of income.

Gough describes the “overriding argument” emerging from the literature as follows; that “home-based enterprises make an important contribution to household economies, provide needed services especially in low-income settlements, and wherever possible should be supported... Policies that have been suggested to support home-based enterprises include amending regulations so that home-based enterprises are no longer illegal, supporting infrastructure development, improving access to credit and business skills training programmes” (2010:48-49).

Apart from the references listed below, see also Section 2 (Economy, Work and Livelihoods) of Tranberg Hansen and Vaa’s (2004) *Reconsidering Informality*.

- **Gough, K.V. 2010. “Continuity and adaptability of home-based enterprises: A longitudinal study from Accra, Ghana,” *International Development Planning Review*, 32(1), pp. 45-70.**
 - o It has long been recognized that many low-income households in cities in the global South use their home not only as a means of shelter but also as a source of income. There is a tendency, however, to consider home-based enterprises as providing insignificant and temporary forms of work. Evidence collected over a period of 10 years from home-based enterprise operators in Accra shows that, although the fortunes of the enterprises vary, the majority display a remarkable ability to survive. The operators demonstrate a high degree of flexibility in adapting to changing demand and opportunities, and a few manage to consolidate and expand their businesses. In the current economic climate, in which young people especially are having difficulty finding

gainful employment, some young people are taking over homebased enterprises from their ageing parents. There is clear evidence that home-based enterprises make an important contribution to urban livelihoods and should be supported, not hindered, by urban planners.

- **Gough, K.V., Tipple, A.G., and Napier, M. 2003. “Making a living in African Cities: The role of home-based enterprises in Accra and Pretoria,” *International Planning Studies*, 8(4), pp. 253-277.**
 - o Available free online at <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08cf4ed915d3cfd00170e/R71382.pdf>
 - o As formal-sector employment becomes an increasingly remote prospect for many Africans, the importance of informal income-generating activities operating from the home are being recognized. This paper compares and contrasts homebased enterprises (HBEs) in low-income settlements in Accra and Pretoria. It analyzes which types of enterprises operate, their contribution to household livelihoods, and the limits to growth they face. It is shown how in both cities HBEs are widespread, provide an important place of work especially for women, and contribute significantly to household income. Despite these similarities, the HBEs operate in differing circumstances, with the fear of violence and property crime being a prominent aspect of South African HBEs, while negligible in Ghana.

- **Kellett, P., and Tipple, G. 2000. “The home as workplace: A study of income-generating activities within the domestic setting,” *Environment and Urbanization*, 12(1), pp. 203-213.**
 - o Many studies of housing concentrate on the dwelling as a place of shelter for the household, a unit of accommodation and a key setting for social reproduction. However, in many parts of the world the dwelling is also a place of production: Some or all household members may be involved in income-generating activities, ranging from small-scale, part-time tasks with few specific spatial demands, to manufacturing activities that may dominate the dwelling environment. This paper draws on a pilot research study into the housing implications of home-based enterprises undertaken in a squatter settlement in New Delhi, India. In addition to a questionnaire survey, detailed case histories of selected households’ work and housing situations were recorded, and plans of dwellings drawn. Drawing on this data, the paper examines the spatial and social implications of income-generating activities, and discusses how an analysis of the integration of nondomestic activities can inform and broaden our understanding of the meaning of home.

- **Kigochie, P.W. 2001. “Squatter rehabilitation projects that support home-based enterprises create jobs and housing: The case of Mathare 4A, Nairobi,” *Cities*, 18(4), pp. 223-233.**
 - o This paper examines how home-based enterprises (HBEs) in squatter settlements benefit from rehabilitation. High unemployment and lack of affordable housing for the urban poor are some of the most pressing problems in less developed countries. To curb both problems, international donor agencies urge governments to employ policies that combine shelter provision with job creation. Such policies can relax building codes, making housing affordable, and remove barriers that inhibit the growth of the informal sector. Governments are also encouraged to cooperate with nongovernmental organizations, community-based organizations and residents in an effort to create jobs and provide affordable housing. Mathare 4A Housing Project is employing such policies and has managed to produce upgraded and affordable shelter by relaxing building codes and using inexpensive, local building materials. The project supports existing HBEs,

creates jobs and raises standards of living. The rehabilitated enterprises have better shelter and infrastructure, are more efficient, accessible and competitive, and have diversified the neighborhood economy.

- **Ligthelm, A.A. 2005. “Informal retailing through home-based micro-enterprises: The role of spaza shops,” *Development Southern Africa*, 22(2), pp. 199-214.**
 - o The informal trade sector constitutes an important part of the South African economy, with estimated sales of R32 billion in 2002. Its emergence is largely attributed to the divergence between the growth in population, especially the urban population, and employment growth in the formal economy. Growth of informal enterprises, especially in the retail sector, is also thriving on the demand of less affluent households, whose household needs for unsophisticated and affordable products are aptly supplied by the informal sector. The aim of this article is to focus on one of the prominent sub-sectors of informal retailing, namely spaza or tuck shops, defined as small retail businesses which operate from a residential stand or home. Particular attention is paid to the size, role and characteristics of spaza trade in South Africa, which is estimated to account for nearly three per cent of South Africa’s retail trade.

- **Mahmud, S. 2003. “Women and the transformation of domestic spaces for income generation in Dhaka bustees,” *Cities*, 20(5), pp. 321-329.**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.gov.uk/dfid-research-outputs/women-and-the-transformation-of-domestic-spaces-for-income-generation-in-dhaka-bustees>
 - o A widespread phenomenon of Third-World cities is using homes not only for shelter, but also for income generation through informal-sector activities. Today, many women from low-income settlements have the potential to self-create jobs and have shown significant results in creating working spaces in their homes, despite every limitation. Although there exists a vast literature about gender issues and home-based jobs as a survival strategy, the types of jobs and the way women create and transform domestic spaces for various economic activities have yet to be explored. One objective for today’s global market is the targeting of women as cheap labour, achieved by using their domestic spaces within the sub-contracting system, especially in the low-income settlements of Third-World cities. In Dhaka’s bustees, similar features can be observed, as a number of NGOs have introduced training programmes and micro credit, especially for women to use their domestic spaces for income generation. This study explores the potential of women and domestic spaces in the bustees, and how women are involved in such economic activities in Dhaka. Three bustee settlements, based on different housing policies, have been investigated to explore home-based jobs and physical spaces. Two factors (tenure security and location) are important in categorizing home-based jobs, and the extent of transformation in these settlements.

- **Napier, M., and Mothwa, M. 2001. “Push-and-pull factors in the initiation and maintenance of home work in two Pretoria settlements,” *Urban Forum*, 12(3/4), pp. 336-352.**
 - o One of the challenges of investigating home-based enterprises in informal settlements is that so many assumptions are related to both phenomena... What has been written in South Africa about home-based enterprises tends to characterize them as survivalist and locates them at the very lowest end of a scale of types of ventures locally referred to as... SMMEs. There have also been... many comparisons of formal- and informal-sector activities, with home-based enter-

prises firmly located in the informal sector with few, if any, linkages into the formal sector. In much of the analysis, the description of home-based enterprises by South African researchers has been that they are invariably initiated when people lose formal employment and are involuntarily “pushed” into the informal sector, rather than as intentional strategies that pull people into home working situations because of the opportunities presented by such arrangements... Push forces propel the unemployed and/or destitute into the informal sector as a way to subsist. Pull forces attract aspirant entrepreneurs and secondary-income earners from the formal sector, enticed by the prospects of achieving a higher income and self-employment. Other writers have referred to these as “strategies of maximization” and “strategies of desperation.” In their ongoing functioning, home-based enterprises (HBEs) are then somewhat illogically portrayed as marginal and vulnerable. Because of this interpretation, there has been a limited understanding of the extensive role played by home-based enterprises in the economies of the settlement, region and country. Despite the portrayal of HBEs as marginal and unintentional, there is often an underlying assumption that the informal-sector economy can absorb endless numbers of people shed by a shrinking formal job market... These are perhaps the myths of HBEs which this paper intends to examine, in light of evidence from the Pretoria case study.

- **Onyebueke, V.U. 2001. “Viewpoint: Denied reality, retarded perception or inaction? Official responses to the incidence of homebased enterprises (HBEs) and its housing corollary in Nigerian cities,” *Cities*, 18(6), pp. 419-423.**
 - o In Nigeria, the notion of the house or dwelling as a mono-functional (residential) unit is quite dominant, and forms the basis of housing policies as well as physical planning strategies. Yet, field evidence emerging from the cities presents a contrasting image of the house as a workplace. This reveals a gap between the official perception of the house and housing needs on one hand and what they are in reality. Against this background, the paper reviews the responses of government and its agencies to the incidence of home-based enterprises (HBEs) and its housing corollary, with a view to gauging their reactions to this inescapable feedback. The paper discovers that HBEs and other urban informal enterprises are still neglected in official circles. Direct planning interventions by government agencies are seldom, haphazard, and very inconsistent, due to the absence of well-defined guidelines and strategies for dealing with this peculiar physico-economic phenomenon. The recommendations put forward here reiterate the need to tackle this reality with the right attitude and appropriate actions.
- **Owusu, F. 2007. “Conceptualizing livelihood strategies in African cities: Planning and development implications of multiple livelihood strategies,” *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 26, pp. 450- 465.**
 - o The usefulness of the informal sector and the survival strategies approaches for understanding African urban economies has been undermined by the transformations in urban livelihood strategies brought about by the continent’s economic crises and neoliberal economic reform policies. Contemporary livelihood strategies in many African cities involve participation in multiple economic activities, usually in both the formal and informal sectors. This paper proposes the “multiple modes of livelihood” (MML) approach as a framework for capturing this emerging livelihood strategy, and presents evidence to show the magnitude of the strategy and the kind of activities undertaken. Development and planning implications of this strategy include: i) planning theories must reflect the changing livelihood in African cities;

- o ii) the different geographies of such activities within and between urban areas, the proliferation of home-based enterprises in middle- and professional-class neighborhoods, the emergence of nontraditional household arrangements, and the importance of urban agriculture suggest the need to indigenize urban planning in Africa; and iii) the proliferation of multiple livelihood strategies, especially among public-sector employees, has significant implications for national development, especially as it relates to the performance of the public sector.
- **Tipple, G. 2004. "Settlement upgrading and home-based enterprises: Discussions from empirical data," *Cities*, 21(5), pp. 371-379.**
 - o This paper seeks to add to the sparse literature on the relationship between home-based enterprises (HBEs) and upgrading by interrogating data in four surveys of 150 HBE operating households carried out in a DFID-sponsored study in Cochabamba, New Delhi, Surabaya and Pretoria. It finds that HBEs increase income substantially, and provide services, such as local shops, that should be regarded as essential for low-income households. The evidence on the effect of better servicing on HBEs is generally positive. The spatial implications of HBEs are complex. Their presence takes away domestic space, and this is found to be important where space is very scarce (in Delhi). The paper suggests that upgrading should introduce service levels suitable for considerable HBE activity and, in very crowded conditions, consider measures to increase dwelling size where possible.
- **Tipple, G. 2005a. "Pollution and waste production in home-based enterprises in developing countries: Perceptions and realities," *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 48(2), pp. 275-298.**
 - o Using mainly qualitative data from a four-country case study, this paper describes the nature of home-based enterprises (HBEs) and the wastes they produce. It finds that most only generate material similar to domestic wastes, but in greater quantities. While some are undoubtedly generating dangerous wastes, they are only a small proportion of all HBEs, and tend to be aware of at least some of the problem and take mitigating steps. The paper argues that the encouragement of clean processes should replace the usual negative views about HBEs held by policymakers.
- **Tipple, G. 2005. "The place of home-based enterprises in the informal sector: Evidence from Cochabamba, New Delhi, Surabaya and Pretoria," *Urban Studies*. 42(4), pp. 611-632.**
 - o Available free online at <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00420980500060178>
 - o Home-based enterprises (HBEs) are an accepted component of the informal sector in rapidly developing cities. However, they have generally received quite a bad press, especially through a concentration on the exploitation evident in piece-rate homework. From our work in low-income neighbourhoods in Cochabamba (Bolivia), New Delhi (India), Surabaya (Indonesia) and Pretoria (South Africa), we assess HBEs with respect to the characteristics of the informal sector put forward in the literature. We examine our samples of HBEs against such characteristics as small-scale, low operator incomes, informal labour relations, and non-separation of production and consumption. We find that they largely conform to expectations. Incomes are low but very significant in poverty alleviation. Though many HBEs require few skills, a few compete effectively in international markets.

- **Tipple, G., and Coulson, J. 2007. “Funding the home-based enterprise: Finance and credit in developing-country livelihoods,” *International Development Planning Review*, 29(2), pp. 125-159.**
 - o Micro-credit is centre-stage in international development circles, not least because of the UN Year of Micro-Credit in 2005. This paper examines data collected for a study of the environmental impacts of home-based enterprises (HBEs) to assess the nature of micro-credit use by their operators. Our case studies were of 150 HBE operators in each of the following locations: Surabaya, New Delhi, Pretoria and Cochabamba. Though micro-credit is available in each of our case-study cities, we found much less use of any credit source, and many more problems of accessing micro-credit than might be expected from the literature. Only in Cochabamba was routine use made of such loans, but only by a minority of HBEs. Most HBEs are financed out of earnings from elsewhere, windfall gains and savings. Only in India were other loan sources, especially money-lenders, used to any great extent. Problems in accessing microcredit included the extortion of bribes by bank officials, and a general debt-aversion by HBE operators, especially in Pretoria.

- **Tipple, G., Coulson, J., and Kellett, P. 2002. “The effects of home-based enterprises on the residential environment in developing countries,” in Romaya, S., and Rakodi, C. (eds.), *Building sustainable urban settlements: Approaches and case studies in the developing world*. ITDG Publications (London).**
 - o For many households in developing-world cities, home-based enterprises (HBEs) are essential to their livelihood. The effect of Structural Adjustment Programmes and other economic events during the last 20 years of the twentieth century have greatly increased the importance of HBEs in developing countries. However, planning and other regulatory systems are rarely hospitable to HBEs, often on grounds of the environmental damage they are perceived to cause. There is only a limited amount of literature on the effects of HBEs on home and neighbourhood environments, but negative perceptions can reduce the ability of people living in poverty to gain sustainable livelihoods. This paper will examine the effects of HBEs on the home and neighbourhood environment to see whether they create crowding, poor environments, and the harmful effects assumed by planning regulations. Through a DFID-sponsored research study involving case studies in Bolivia, India, Indonesia and South Africa, we explore what types of services and products HBEs supply, how important they are to household economies, and their spatial and quality implications in the dwellings. Thus, we can inform the debate about whether they should be encouraged by policy instead of being regarded as illegal. The paper proposes elements of a strategy to facilitate income generation in the home by poor households, as well as making recommendations to control the few dangerous and unhealthy uses and practices found.

- **Tipple, G., and Kellett, P. 2003. “Housing and work in the same space: The spatial implications of homebased enterprises in India and Indonesia.” Paper presented at the 7th Conference of the Asian Planning Schools Association (Hanoi: Hanoi Architectural University (HUA)).**
 - o Available free online at <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08d1640f0b64974001632/R71383.pdf>
 - o This paper will examine the effects of HBEs (home-based enterprises) on the home and neighbourhood environment in two Asian countries to see whether they create the spatial crowding assumed by planning regulations. Through a DFID-sponsored research study involving case studies in India and Indonesia (in 1999), we explore how important HBEs are to household

economies, and their spatial and quality implications in the dwellings in two contrasting circumstances – where space is very scarce and where it is less so. We find that, in very tight spaces, HBEs can have considerable effects on households' use of domestic space and on the neighbourhood, even though they use very small spaces. In less constrained circumstances, however, their effects can be relatively benign. Through this, we try to inform the debate about whether HBEs should be encouraged by policy instead of being classed as illegal, and consequently discouraged or controlled. The paper proposes spatial elements of a strategy to facilitate income generation in the home by poor households.

- **Verrest, H., and Post, J. 2007. "Home-based economic activities, livelihoods and space in Paramaribo, Suriname," *International Development Planning Review*, 29(2), pp. 161-184.**
 - o In this paper, home-based economic activities (HBEAs) in Paramaribo, Suriname, are investigated using a livelihoods framework. Due to its holistic outlook, the livelihoods approach offers opportunities to combine various concerns pertinent to the scholarly debate on the subject. The main focus of the paper is on the interconnectedness between HBEAs and space. Three dimensions of space are used to structure the discussion: its asset qualities, its multi-level nature, and the spatiality of social life. The paper attests, among other things, to the importance of accessibility and proximity in understanding how various assets are deployed within HBEAs.
- **Wigle, J. 2008. "Shelter, location, and livelihoods: Exploring the linkages in Mexico City," *International Planning Studies*, 13(3), pp. 197-222.**
 - o For many low-income households in cities of the developing world, "self-help" or informal housing provides not only their shelter, but also functions as a vital productive asset. The land accessible to the urban poor for informal housing, however, is often remotely located in the urban periphery. While providing access to shelter, such peripheral locations may undermine the potential of shelter to serve as a productive asset, especially for women whose mobility is constrained by their dual roles as care-givers and wage-earners. This research explores how location influences the potential of housing to serve as a productive asset in two informally settled communities in different parts of Mexico City. The paper argues that the "right to shelter" associated with informal housing needs to be "scaled-up" to include the "right to the city" through closer consideration of the linkages among shelter, location, and livelihoods. Such a policy focus necessarily situates housing in a broader socio-spatial context and would serve to complement the prevailing emphasis on community or place-specific upgrading activities in informal or low-income settlements. Finally, the paper raises questions about the role of planning in improving the livelihood opportunities of lower-income households.

6.3 Waste Pickers / Informal Recyclers

Within recent planning literature, it is generally recognized that informal recycling can contribute to economic growth (in poorer countries), driving entrepreneurship, employment and income generation, as well as effective urban environmental management. It can also aid the overall efficiency of urban solid-waste management by functioning in parallel to formal collection and disposal systems (see, for example, Moreno-Sanchez and Maldonado, 2006). Mvuma (2010) goes so far to argue that "informal-sector waste harvesting is an essential societal 'evil' for economically impoverished communities, particularly from a Least Developed Country (LCD) perspective."

However, authors are quick to point out that despite the vital functionality provided by informal recycling practices, and the apparent interdependency of formal and informal wastemanagement systems, pickers or scavengers are largely ignored by processes of policy development, and are often stigmatized as “societal outcasts” (Langenhoven and Dysse, 2007) or “dramatic symbols of urban poverty” (Rogerson, 2001). In some cases, informal recycling activities have suffered the brunt of municipal strategies directly aimed at “reducing the presence of “undesirable” informal businesses” in central urban areas (Mitchell, 2009:2646). In response, authors such as Moreno-Sanchez and Maldonado (2006) have attempted to conceptualize informal waste-management practices as an integral part of dynamic urban processes of production, consumption and recovery. The available research tends to focus on different actors involved in informal waste management – Hayami *et al.* (2003) recognize that, in the case of Delhi (India), those involved in informal recycling can be broadly divided into waste “pickers” and “collectors,” with each group fulfilling different functions and experiencing different levels of access to community services, etc. Mitchell’s (2009) case study of Hanoi is attuned to the reality that “in Vietnam a complex hierarchy exists in the informal waste-recovery industry, which includes a threetiered network of waste collectors (waste pickers, dumpsite pickers, and junk buyers), waste intermediaries (receivers, sidewalk depot operators, and dumpsite depot operators), and waste traders” (2009:2634). Mitchell’s Hanoi case focusses on the effects of urban economic and spatial restructuring on the activities and livelihoods of waste intermediaries. Generally speaking, these intermediaries are increasingly being “shut out” of the urban core due to rising land rents (“market-led gentrification”) and government policies which designate sidewalk-based activities illegal: “The lower rental fees, abundant land, and high-value construction waste in the periurban districts have drawn many waste receivers to these districts of late” (2009:2646).

- **Afon, A.O. 2007. “Informal sector initiative in the primary sub-system of urban solid-waste management in Lagos, Nigeria,” *Habitat International*, 31, pp. 193-204.**

- o The study investigates the operations of an informal initiative: the “barro boys” in the primary sub-system of urban solidwaste management. The study is focussed on two of the 20 local government councils in Lagos State, Nigeria. All the barro boys identified in Mushin and Kosofe local-government areas were purposely sampled through structured interviews. Information on the residents’ perception of the operators’ services were obtained from 392 households through systematic random-sampling technique. The study identified that the operators of the initiative are educationally low in status, single by marital status, young adults below the age of 35 years. The main activity of the initiative is collection of waste from the source of generation, and no form of sorting is practised. The equipment used is humandriven cart, which is either owned or rented. No definite method of service charge exists. Service is available throughout especially from Monday to Saturday. The operators’ minimum daily income is Naira 1000 (Naira 128 ¼ US\$1). The initiative also produced dump-site touts and several clandestine waste dump sites. The study further established that residents use environmentally unfriendly storage receptacles which aggravate the problems of effective collection. Though the residents were apprehensive of their properties’ security in the hands of the initiative’s operators, it is still the most popular means of disposal, as 71.3 per cent of the waste produced in the two council areas is disposed through them. In addition, the index of satisfaction (residents’ satisfaction index, RSI) on each attribute of “service availability,” “cost, in relation to the service provided,” “politeness of the initiative’s operators” and “reliability of the service rendered” is higher than the aggregate satisfaction of their service. The study concludes that with the popularity of the illegal, but highly

cherished service of the barro boys, integrating them into the existing system, toward evolving effective and efficient urban solid-waste management is more realistic than outlawing the initiative.

- **Del Pilar Moreno-Sanchez, R., and Maldonado, J. H. 2006. “Surviving from garbage: The role of informal waste-pickers in a dynamic model of solid-waste management in developing countries,” *Environment and Development Economics*, 11, pp. 371-391.**
 - o In developing countries, informal waste-pickers (known as scavengers) play an important role in solid-waste management systems, acting in a parallel way to formal waste collection and disposal agents. Scavengers collect, from the streets, dumpsites, or landfills, re-usable and recyclable material that can be reincorporated into the economy’s production process. Despite the benefits that they generate to society, waste-pickers are ignored when waste management policies are formulated. The purpose of this paper is to integrate the role of scavengers in a dynamic model of production, consumption, and recovery, and to show that, in an economy producing solid waste, efficiency can be reached using a set of specific and complementary policies: a tax on virgin-materials use, a tax on consumption and disposal, and a subsidy to the recovery of material. A numerical simulation is performed to evaluate the impact of these policies on landfill lifetime and natural-resource stocks. A discussion on the implementation of these instruments is also included.
- **Hayami, Y., Dikshit, A.K., and Mishra, S.N. 2003. “Waste pickers and collectors in Delhi: Poverty and environment in an urban informal sector.” *FASID Discussion paper on international development Strategies (No. 2003-04)*.**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00220380500356662>
 - o Waste pickers and collectors constitute the bottom layer of waste recycling in the metropolis of Delhi. Pickers collect waste by just picking it up from public places such as garbage dumps and streets, whereas collectors purchase waste from waste producers such as households and shops for sale to higher-level waste traders. Most pickers have incomes below the poverty line set by the Planning Commission of India, whereas the majority of collectors earn marginally higher than the poverty-line income. The poverty of pickers is not transitory but perpetual as they have no connection to enter the community of collectors and higher-level waste traders within which the community mechanism works effectively to reduce risk and transaction costs. Despite their low economic and social status, pickers and collectors are making important contributions to society. It is found that pickers and collectors are adding more value than their own income to waste producers’ income and to the saving of the city government’s expenditure for disposing waste. Increased public supports for not only social services but also production services and infrastructure can be justified not only to reduce poverty but also to further their positive contributions to society.
- **Langenhoven, B., and Dyssel, M. 2007. “The Recycling industry and subsistence waste collectors: A case study of Mitchell’s Plain,” *Urban Forum*, 18(1), pp. 114-132.**
 - o Over and above its environmental advantages as a waste-management strategy, recycling also has advantages for the creation of formal and informal employment. This paper reflects the findings of a survey undertaken in Mitchell’s Plain, and case-studied factors that impact on recycle-related employment tendencies and opportunities in this area of the Cape Flats. It also revisits the popular notion of recycling-sustainability reciprocity in impoverished and economically

marginalized areas. Mitchell's Plain, as a largely dormitory region in the bigger Cape Metropolitan Area (CMA), offers very little employment opportunities. Based on the findings of the survey, this paper argues in favour of recycling as a mechanism for the sustaining of livelihoods for impoverished micro-collectors, as well as small recycling-based entrepreneurs in the area and surrounding townships. The recycling industry in Mitchell's Plain depends largely on recyclable household waste generated in the area. Secondary waste sources include waste generated in neighbouring areas such as Khayelitsha and Philippi as well as waste generated by limited retail and light industrial activities.

- **Masocha, M. 2006. "Informal waste harvesting in Victoria Falls town, Zimbabwe: Socio-economic benefits," *Habitat International*, 30(4), pp. 838-848.**
 - o Waste harvesting, which occurs mostly but not exclusively at open waste dumps in Zimbabwe, constitutes one of the most important survival options for the urban poor. This paper analyzes and discusses socio-economic benefits of informal waste harvesters in Victoria Falls town. Victoria Falls town has an estimated population of 31,000 and is presently the fastest-growing urban centre in Zimbabwe. An estimated 8000 tonnes of solid wastes are generated in the town every month. Questionnaires were administered to informal waste harvesters who recover materials mostly from three large open waste dumps. Thirteen dumpsite harvesters, who were available at the time of the survey and willing to participate, were interviewed during the month of October, 2002. The questionnaire solicited information on the character and dynamics of recuperative activities in the town, socio-economic and demographic characteristics of waste harvesters, type of materials recovered and their uses, income derived from sale of harvested materials and how it is spent. Additional data were obtained from field observations.
 - o The study identified two categories of waste harvesters. The first group specializes in the recovery of foodstuffs mainly for household use. The second group comprises informal waste harvesters who specialize in the recovery of building materials such as bricks and river sand and scrap metal primarily for sale. Data provided by dumpsite waste harvesters interviewed show that the mean monthly income from the sale of harvested materials varied from Z\$7500 (for 23.1 per cent of the respondents) to Z\$22,500.5 (for 15.3 per cent of the respondents). Using the income they obtain from waste harvesting, most respondents (84.6 per cent) indicated that they can now afford to pay school fees for their children in time, while 61.5 per cent stated that after engaging in resource recovery, they moved from informal settlements to Chinotimba where they now have more decent accommodation with electricity, piped water and flush toilets. Prior to engaging in waste recovery, more than half of the informal waste harvesters indicated that were staying in informal settlements. The findings of this study, in particular the income and expenditure data, demonstrate that by engaging in waste harvesting, some of the urban poor are able to eke out living in an urban environment where economic opportunities are very limited. However, the contribution of informal waste harvesting to livelihoods in urban areas of Zimbabwe needs further investigation.
- **Mitchell, C.L. 2009. "Trading trash in the transition: Economic restructuring, urban spatial transformation, and the boom and bust of Hanoi's informal waste trade," *Environment and Planning A*, 41, pp. 2633- 2650.**
 - o In this paper I explore how one particular segment of the informal waste-recovery trade, waste intermediaries, is impacted by Hanoi's rapid urban economic and spatial change. Using survey

and interview data, I demonstrate: (1) waste intermediaries simultaneously gain and lose as a result of Hanoi's urban transition; and (2) the underlying forces of urban spatial change in different areas of the city are quite distinct, which will have a unique impact on the future of informal waste-recovery in Hanoi.

- **Mvuma, G. 2010. "Waste a necessary evil for economically impoverished communities in least developed countries (LDCs): A case study." Paper delivered to 20th WasteCon Conference and Exhibition, Emperor's Palace, Gauteng, South Africa, 4-8 October 2010.**
 - o Available free online at <http://researchspace.csir.co.za/dspace/handle/10204/4531>
 - o The nexus of rapid population growth and improved socio-economic status of a country have a close correlation to increasing quantities of wastes generated per capita. Various studies show that waste harvesters contribute to economic growth in certain countries through the informal sector – although this contribution is not usually recognized within current financial models. In this article, we argue that informal-sector waste harvesting is an essential societal "evil" for economically impoverished communities, particularly from a Least Developed Country (LCD) perspective. To illustrate the economic contribution of waste harvesters in terms of jobs creation and income generation, we examine the case of Lesotho as a least developed country. In our study, we examined quantities of waste generated per capita, analyzed the driving factors underlying such generation, and evaluated how efficient and effective waste management can potentially uplift the economic status of the waste harvesters. The average income derived from waste harvesting activities was compared to the average income of the lowest paid blue-collar employees in Lesotho. The results indicated a strong link between the socio-economic uplift of poor communities and waste-harvesting activities. Secondly, the average income of a waste harvester was higher than that of the lowest-income formal-sector employee. These findings suggest the urgent necessity for the governments of LCDs to consider formalizing aspects of this currently independent or completely informal economic sector. The highest priorities are to protect the health of waste harvesters, and develop the long-term sustainability of this emerging economic sector. Furthermore, findings of the more recent waste-generation projection studies, as reported in an Integrated Solid Waste Management Plan (ISWMP) document developed in 2006, commissioned by the government of Lesotho, with the financial assistance from UNEP/ UNDP, confirm an increase in quantities of waste being generated in Lesotho.
- **Nzeadibe, T.C. 2009. "Solid waste reforms and informal recycling in Enugu urban area, Nigeria," *Habitat International*, 33, pp. 93-99.**
 - o The status of solid-waste management in a city is often considered an index for assessing governance. In cities of the developing world, the informal sector plays an important role in the management of solid waste. This paper examines the position of the informal recycling sector in the planning and reform of solid-waste management in the city of Enugu, Nigeria. The paper is based on direct field observations, key-informant interviews with important stakeholders in solidwaste management in Enugu, and review of relevant legislation, policy documents and reports on solid-waste management. The paper highlights recent efforts to visibly improve governance through reform of solid-waste management in the urban area. Contribution of informal recyclers towards handling the city's solid-waste problem, job creation and poverty alleviation is also noted. The study also reveals that the import of the informal recycling sector has not been given adequate consideration within the framework of the reforms in solid-waste management.

With the focus of the Millennium Development Goals on poverty reduction, improvement of quality of life and environmental sustainability, this paper observes that the informal recycling sector in Enugu possesses unacknowledged development potential. The paper calls for official recognition and support of the activity and empowerment of people involved, within the context of this reform programme.

- **Nzeadibe, T.C. 2009. “Development drivers of waste recycling in Nsukka urban area, southeastern Nigeria,” *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*, 3(12), pp. 137-149.**
 - o Available (free) at <http://www.um.ase.ro/No12/11.pdf> (5/1/2011).
 - o This article examines drivers of waste recovery and recycling in the informal waste sector in Nsukka urban area of Enugu State, southeastern Nigeria. Data on socioeconomic and demographic characteristics of waste pickers and waste dealers in the area were obtained using a questionnaire survey, ethnographic interviews and field observations. Analyses of the data indicate that waste pickers play a crucial role in the waste recovery and recycling process. Waste dealers add value to materials through sorting, cleaning and processing, and also provide a vital link between waste pickers and industry. The article contextualizes waste-recycling activities within the development and socio-cultural framework of the region, and examines socio-economic and demographic attributes that tend to predispose individuals to making a living from the recycle trade. Contributions of the informal recycling sector in Nsukka towards the Millennium Development Goals are also examined.
 - o “This paper has shown that some socio-demographic and cultural characteristics of individuals in the waste trade influence people’s choice to make a living from waste. In particular, it was found that a third of the scavenger population are women, mostly widows, and the occupation provided widows who have low levels of education a chance to earn an independent income. In addition, waste picking provides an income opportunity for recent migrants from the rural areas or from neighbouring states. The activity therefore serves as a refuge occupation for vulnerable groups” (2009:147).
- **Rochat, D., Rodrigues, W., and Gantenbein, A. 2008. “India: Including the existing informal sector in a clean e-waste channel.” *Proceedings of the 19th Waste Management Conference of the IWMSA (WasteCon 2008)*, 6-10th October 2008. Durban, South Africa.**
 - o Available free online at http://ewasteguide.info/files/Rochat_2008_WasteCon.pdf
 - o Waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) or e-waste is increasingly generated and processed in India. The waste originates from both national consumption (330 000t) and waste imports (50 000t). In India, e-waste processing and recycling is managed almost entirely (95 per cent) by informal recycling businesses. Due to the application of inappropriate techniques, this sector bears high risks of environmental and occupational hazards and also loses valuable materials. Formal recycling industries have to compete with the informal businesses and simultaneously comply with environmental and occupational regulations... In Bangalore, the IT hub of India, the three newly-born formal recycling industries compete with scrap dealers for the big lots of e-waste from large companies, which results in material flowing into the uncontrolled informal sector. Promoting e-waste disposal policies in companies reduces the amount of e-waste flowing into the informal sector and creates incentives for formalization. The formalization of the informal sector into a transparent recycling system is crucial for better control on

environmental and human health impacts. At the same time, it allows the poor to profit from their network, allowing for a better collection system, and preserves the employment generated in the poorest strata of the population... This paper demonstrates a case study of assistance for the authorization process with an association of informal dismantlers. Alternate business models guiding the association towards authorization have been developed, where a city-wide collection system feeding the manual dismantling facility, and an export strategy towards best available technology facilities to yield higher revenue from printed circuit boards, are promoted. By replacing the traditional wet chemical leaching process for the recovery of gold with export to integrated smelters and refineries, safer practices and higher revenues-per-unit of e-waste collected are generated. Further assistance for establishing collection systems and for complying with legal requirements will be necessary, as well as monitoring of recycling processes to ensure their reputation after being authorized.

- **Rogerson, C.M. 2001. "The waste sector and informal entrepreneurship in developing world cities,"** *Urban Forum*, 12(2), pp. 247-259.
 - o The objective in this paper is to investigate aspects of the comparative experience of partnership and conflict between the local state and informal sector in the waste economy of the urban developing world. More especially, the focus is on identifying entrepreneurial opportunities in the waste economy. Three sections of material are presented. First, an examination is undertaken of the broad workings of the informal economy of waste in developing countries as a whole. Second, the experience of changing urban waste-management practices in Asian cities is examined, highlighting important opportunities for small, medium and micro-enterprises (SMMEs) in waste recycling. Third, the importance of waste recycling as a livelihood strategy for poor urban households is discussed, in the context of several African cities, pointing out the more limited nature of best practices in waste recycling in the African continent. Overall, through a comparative experience across the developing world, the paper examines the role of the informal sector in the urban waste economy and municipal urban-waste management.
- **Wilson, D.C., Velis, C., and Chesseman, C. 2006. "Role of informal sector recycling in waste management in developing countries,"** *Habitat International*, 30, pp. 797-808.
 - o Many thousands of people in developing-country cities depend on recycling materials from waste for their livelihoods. With the focus of the Millennium Development Goals on poverty reduction, and of waste strategies on improving recycling rates, one of the major challenges in solid-waste management in developing countries is how best to work with this informal sector to improve livelihoods, working conditions and efficiency in recycling.
 - o The general characteristics of informal recycling are reviewed, highlighting both positive and negative aspects. Despite the health and social problems associated with informal recycling, it provides significant economic benefits that need to be retained. Experience shows that it can be highly counterproductive to establish new formal waste-recycling systems without taking into account informal systems that already exist. The preferred option is to integrate the informal sector into waste-management planning, building on their practices and experience, while working to improve efficiency and the living and working conditions of those involved. Issues associated with integrating informal recycling into the formal waste-management sector are discussed.

- **Yousif, D.F., and Scott, S. 2007. “Governing solid waste management in Mazatenango, Guatemala: Problems and prospects,” *International Development Planning Review*, 29(4), pp. 433-450.**
 - o Many smaller cities in developing countries are only beginning to plan for appropriate solid-waste management systems. The majority of waste-management systems in developing countries fail to address residents’ sanitation needs properly. In this paper, we present the results of fieldwork in Mazatenango, Guatemala, examining the problems of governing solid waste, as linked to administration, collection, handling, and disposal. The problems identified include lack of adequate funding; no formal recycling programmes at the household level; absence of a sanitary landfill; increase of illegal dumping; limited public awareness of proper waste-management practices; and street litter causing a breakdown in the sewer systems. The results of the study are used to propose strategies for improved governance of solid waste, addressing the needs and priorities of a range of stakeholders. These strategies highlight the importance of strengthening relationships among the stakeholders involved in the governmental/administrative, social, economic, and environmental aspects of solid-waste management. The approach may be effective in other developing-country cities that are starting to plan waste-management systems.

6.4 Other Sectors

- **Mitullah, W.V., and Wachira, I.N. 2003. “Informal labour in the construction industry in Kenya: A case study of Nairobi.” Working Paper 204 (International Labour Office: Geneva).**
 - o Available free online at http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_policy/---invest/documents/publication/wcms_asist_8175.pdf
 - o This report describes a study of workers in the building subsector of the construction industry in Nairobi, the capital city of Kenya. There is both a formal and an informal system of building in Kenya. The study focusses on workers in the informal system. The subject of study is the individual worker rather than the enterprise. Such individuals work in the informal construction industry as employees, as self-employed workers or as owners of small enterprises employing other workers. The aim of the study was to gain a better understanding of the terms and conditions of informal employment for construction workers in Nairobi in order to suggest how working conditions might be improved and employment security ensured. Specific objectives were to examine employment relationships in the informal sector and assess the mobility of construction workers between formally and informally contracted construction sites. Workers were questioned on the terms of their employment, working conditions, skills and training, safety and health, work history, mobility and aspirations.

7. Informal Transport

Cities throughout the developing world are host to intensive private, small-scale transport services variably referred to as “informal transport,” “low-cost transport” and “paratransit” operations. Cervero (2000) prefers the term “informal transport,” as it “best reflects the context in which this sector operates – informally and illicitly, somewhat in the background, and outside the officially sanctioned public-transport sector.”

In the past, informal transportation has generally been viewed as a problematic reality, deserving of public intervention (and occasionally eradication). Recently however, there has been a wide-reaching shift towards the appreciation of informal transport operations as “gapfillers” (Cervero, 2000). This argument views the massive extent of such operations as a product of the spatial limitations, high costs, inflexibility and inefficiencies of formal public transport systems, especially for the urban poor. In contrast, informal activities provide a much greater degree of mobility and market responsiveness, meaning they may be more effective in generating livelihood opportunities and thereby promoting development.

Despite these benefits, authors are quick to point out the problems associated with informal operations – particularly in terms of low safety standards, as well as increased traffic congestion and environmental costs. Therefore a degree of public intervention and regulation is usually considered necessary. Hence an emerging theme of research concerns attempts to regulate paratransit operations and manage their integration into existing public-transport networks (e.g. Cervero and Golub, 2007; Schalekamp and Behrens, 2009a; 2009b; Gauthier and Weinstock, 2010).

- **Cervero, R. 2000. *Informal transport in the Developing World*. UN-Habitat.**

- o Available free online at <http://www.wiego.org/publications/informal-transport-developing-world>
- o Chapter one provides a global overview of informal transport operations, outlining the major attributes (entrepreneurialism; use of small, aging vehicles; low-performance services; competitive niche markets), roles and benefits (mobility and development; source of employment; complementarity; efficient, low-cost services; market responsiveness), as well as issues and concerns (traffic congestion; disorderly operations and unfair practices; accidents and public safety; air pollution and environmental problems; cream-skimming) relating to the informal transport sector.
- o Parts Two and Three present detailed case studies of informal transport services in different parts of the world. The cases in Part Two are drawn from Southeast Asia, long a stronghold of informal transport services: Bangkok, Thailand (Chapter Four); Manila, the Philippines (Chapter Five); and Jakarta, Indonesia (Chapter Six). Part Three extends the global perspective, drawing upon case experiences from Kingston, Jamaica (Chapter Seven), Brazil (Chapter Eight), and several countries of Africa (Chapter Nine).
- o Despite the realities of the “dark side” of informal transport, the author advises against attempts to eradicate informal transportation: “Campaigns to modernize urban transport by phasing out informal services can prove counterproductive. In some cases, pedicabs, motor–tricycles, and jitneys satisfy the needs of consumers more than modern ‘formal’ carriers. More often than not, they complement mainline services by providing feeder connections and serving areas that public carriers do not, whether out of necessity or choice.”
- o Cervero goes on to recognize a “central paradox” facing informal transport: “the need on the one hand to improve transport efficiency while at the same time championing the cause of social equity... One must be on guard that policies aimed at promoting efficiency (*mobility for the rich*) are not at the expense of equity (*mobility for the poor*).”

- **Cervero, R., and Golub, A. 2007. “Informal transport: A global perspective,” *Transport Policy*, 14, pp. 445-457.**
 - o Informal transport services – paratransit-type services provided without official sanction – can often be difficult to rationalize from a public-policy perspective. While these systems provide benefits including on-demand mobility for the transit-dependent, jobs for low-skilled workers, and service coverage in areas devoid of formal transit supply, they also have costs, such as increased traffic congestion, air and noise pollution, and traffic accidents. This article reviews the range of informal-sector experiences worldwide, discusses the costs and benefits of the sector in general and uses several case studies to illustrate different policy approaches to regulating them.

- **Gauthier, A., and Weinstock, A. 2010. “Africa: transforming paratransit into BRT,” *Built Environment*, 36(3), pp. 317-327.**
 - o Of all the regions of the world, Africa’s transformation towards bus rapid transit (BRT) would seem perhaps the greatest leap of ambition. Existing public transport conditions present difficult circumstances for both operators and customers – a situation exacerbated by high urban population growth, increased private vehicle ownership and worsening congestion. Furthermore, municipal governments in Africa often lack the necessary resources to address the formalization of public-transport services. A few cities, though, have demonstrated leadership in creating a new publictransport paradigm for the continent. In 2008, Lagos launched a “BRT Lite” corridor which, although basic in nature, proved that a form of BRT was possible in Africa. With the impetus of hosting the 2010 FIFA World Cup, three South African cities, Johannesburg, Cape Town, and Port Elizabeth, had initiated BRT starter services by 2010. Johannesburg’s launch of the Rea Vaya system in 2009 marked the first “full BRT” system in Africa. These early efforts have spawned similar efforts elsewhere, including additional systems being developed in Ghana, Kenya, South Africa, Tanzania, and Uganda. The results to date, especially from the new South African systems, show that African innovation has in many ways surpassed other wealthier parts of the world. The leap from informal paratransit systems to hightechnology BRT indeed appears to be a realizable achievement for Africa.

- **Golub, A., Balassiano, R., Araujo, A., Ferreira, E. 2009. “Regulation of the informal transport sector in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Welfare impacts and policy analysis,” *Transportation*, 36, pp. 601-616.**
 - o In Brazil, the explosion of informal transport activity during the past decade has had profound effects on formal public transport systems and is a source of great controversy in the urban transportation sector. A variety of policies have been proposed to manage the growth of the sector. This study seeks to understand how proposed policies will impact the users of these systems. A corridor in Rio de Janeiro with substantial informal activity was used as a case study. Measures of welfare changes in a discrete choice framework were used to estimate proposed policies’ impacts on users. Eleven candidate policies were evaluated, ranging from the eradication of the informal modes and investment in formal modes, to the legalization of the informal modes. Benefits were compared with costs and the distribution of benefits across income classes was explored. Net benefits from some policies were found to be substantial. Legalizing the informal sector was found to benefit users slightly but further investments in the sector are probably inefficient. Users benefited most from improvements in formal mass-transit modes, at roughly 100-200 dollars per commuter per year. Finally, policies to foster a competitive environment for the delivery of both informal and formal services were shown to benefit users by about

100 dollars per commuter per year. Together, the regulation of the informal sector and investments in the formal sector serve to reinforce the movement towards competitive concessions for services and help reduce the impacts of cartelization and costly in-road competition.

- **Gwilliam, K.M. 2002. Cities on the move: A World Bank urban transport strategy review. World Bank (Washington, DC).**
 - o Available free online at http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTSDNET/Resources/Urbantransport_strategy.pdf
 - o The report recommends that transport interventions are formulated to specifically assist the poor (poverty-targeted transport interventions). This can be done by locating transport improvements where poor people live and work, and by providing transport services as part of a social safety net (e.g. commuter subsidy systems in South Africa). Chapter 7 deals with public-road passenger transport and specifically with paratransit operations in developing and transitional economies. Paratransit characteristics, types and services are listed (p. 101). The section also outlines the problems of paratransit operations (i.e. difficulties in regulation, increased congestion and environmental impact, undermining the basic network of transport services). It makes the following recommendations, amongst others (p. 107):
 - Cities should strive to find ways to mobilize the initiative potential of the informal sector through legalizing associations and through structuring franchising arrangements in order to give the small private sector the opportunity to participate in competitive processes.
 - Cities must ensure that informal operators meet the same environmental, safety, and insurance requirements as formal operators, and that they meet their proper tax obligations.
 - Cities should plan for a dynamic regime that will allow for a transition to a more formal role for the informal sector when appropriate.
- **Lomme, R. 2008. “Should South African minibus taxis be scrapped? Formalizing informal urban transport in a developing country.” Proceedings of CODATU XIII: Sustainable Development Challenges of Transport in Cities of the Developing World: Doing what works. Ho Chi Minh City (Vietnam), 12-14 November.**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.codatu.org/wp-content/uploads/Should-south-african-minibus-taxis-be-scrapped-Formalizing-informal-urban-transport-in-a-developing-country-Roland-LOMME.pdf>
 - o In South Africa as in other developing countries, informal public transport cater to most public transport commuters” and other users” mobility needs. South African informal transport, dubbed as the “minibus taxi industry,” is notorious for its recurring bursts of deadly confrontation, commonly known as “taxi wars” or “taxi violence” which tend to be construed as its most distinctive feature. For more than the past 10 years, scrapping the whole minibus taxi fleet to replace it thoroughly by brand-new vehicles – a programme officially branded as “recapitalization” and dubbed “recap” - has been at the core of the South African government’s attempt to formalize informal transport, restore public order, enforce law and rationalize public transport as a whole through intermodal integration. But this reform strategy has failed on most accounts, not because the South African minibus taxi industry is in its essence unfit to its attempted formalization but because the formalization process has been hindered by the recap programme and should have rather rested on operational integration of informal transport, as argued in this paper.

- **Schalekamp, H., and Behrens, R. 2009a. “An international review of paratransit regulation and integration experiences: Lessons for public-transport system rationalization and improvement in South African Cities.” Paper presented at the 28th Annual Southern African Transport Conference: “Sustainable Transport,” 6-9 July, Pretoria (South Africa).**
 - o Paratransit services form an integral part of passenger public transportation networks in many developing world cities. In some instances these entrepreneurial services deliver highly demand-responsive, affordable transport in settings not conducive to scheduled or “formal” public-transport operations. In others, they present problems in the form of ruinous and violent competition between operators for higher-volume routes, “cream skimming,” and aggressive driver behaviour. As in contemporary South African Integrated Rapid Public Transport Network proposals, public authorities across a range of international contexts have responded to these problems by planning integrated public-transport networks within which paratransit operators are given the opportunity to become contracted service providers alongside existing rail and bus companies. Despite some well-publicized successes in integrating paratransit operators into “formal” public-transport systems, the available evidence suggests that processes of paratransit integration are typically protracted and at times difficult to sustain. Even in relatively successful cases, many “informal” operators have not been included in these processes, and their services have remained in parallel to the improved “formal” networks. Managing the interface between the resulting “formal” and “informal” systems has often proved a complex and difficult task. This paper reviews selected international cases in which interventions were made to either bring about greater regulation of paratransit services, or to integrate paratransit operations into “formal” transport networks. The first part of the paper outlines the rationale for selecting specific cases for detailed review. The second part illustrates the nature and extent of the interventions in the selected case cities, the manner of interaction with paratransit operators, and the respective impacts on competition, service provision and institutional arrangements. The paper concludes by drawing lessons from these experiences for processes of paratransit integration in South African cities.
- **Schalekamp, H., and Behrens, R. 2009b. “Engaging paratransit on public-transport reform initiatives in South Africa: A critique of policy and an investigation of appropriate engagement approaches.” Paper presented at the 11th Conference on Competition and Ownership in Land Passenger Transport. Delft University of Technology (The Netherlands), 20-25 September.**
 - o Available online at <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0739885910000776>
 - o A number of South African cities are planning integrated public-transport networks that rely on the introduction of Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) and incorporate existing formal bus and paratransit operations. Thousands of paratransit operators would have to formalize their businesses, or merge into new or existing operator entities in order to participate. There is, however, an absence of accessible business plans and regulatory regime proposals around which paratransit can be engaged to convince it to alter its current modus operandi. The paratransit sector has furthermore indicated its resistance to the planned networks on the grounds of insufficient consultation, an unclear future role in the system and employee redundancies. Should this deadlock not be resolved, it seems unlikely that the planned networks will be realized in the proposed timeframes, if indeed at all. This paper investigates the South African passenger transport policy framework that has contributed to the current deadlock, and explores appropriate approaches to

engaging paratransit operators on a system of contracting, competition and ownership that recognizes the sector's aspirations, yet contributes towards improved passenger-transport services.

- **Schalekamp, H., Behrens, R., and Wilkinson, P. 2010. "Regulating minibus-taxis: A critical review of progress and a possible way forward." Proceedings of the 29th Southern African Transport Conference (SATC 2010). 16-19 August, Pretoria (South Africa).**
 - o The paratransit sector in South Africa, which includes minibus-taxis and informal sedan taxis, has grown to become the largest urban public-transport service provider in the country. In response, the national government introduced countrywide initiatives to regulate, upgrade and integrate paratransit into formal road-based public transport services. These initiatives have met with significant, and sometimes violent, resistance from the sector, especially the recent programme involving the implementation of integrated public-transport networks in major urban areas. The proposed integrated networks rely to a large extent on the introduction of Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) systems that would incorporate and replace existing formal bus and paratransit operations. It has been argued that the source of the resistance has primarily been concerns in the paratransit sector around a loss of livelihoods after the transition to BRT operations, as well as the arguably flawed process through which the sector has been engaged on their incorporation into these operations. Furthermore, of the 12 cities initially targeted to construct BRT systems, only three had made some progress in this regard by early 2010: Cape Town, Johannesburg and Nelson Mandela Metropole.
 - o In this paper the authors will focus on the complex process of reform in the road-based public transport sector in Cape Town, but also reflect on developments in Johannesburg and Nelson Mandela Bay. The first part of the paper will provide a brief assessment of the progress that has been made, focussing on the approach to incorporating paratransit operators into formal public-transport operations and the reactions of these operators, and will outline critical issues that have emerged in the process to date. The second part will provide an overview of alternative regulatory approaches that provide responses to current challenges with paratransit operations and to capacity limitations in both operating and regulating agencies. The last part of the paper discusses the implications of each regulatory alternative on the stakeholder engagement process. The authors of this paper will argue that the current BRT-based policy and reform initiative may not lead to large-scale reform in the paratransit sector, and that targeted initiatives focused on improving employment conditions, efficiency of operations, public financial support and the safety and quality of paratransit vehicles may be an essential component to any strategy aimed at road-based public transport reform and service-level improvement.

8. Informal Service Provision

The limited spatial reach and inefficiency of formal, state-provided networked services (e.g. water, sanitation, electricity) in many cities of the developing world have driven the emergence of vast industries and markets for informal service provision, providers of which are variably described in the literature as "small-scale independent providers" (SSIPs), "smallscale private service providers" (SPSPs), "small-scale service providers," and so on. Following Biesinger and Richter (2007:vii), the following categories of informal service agencies can be distinguished (with particular reference to water and sanitation services):

- **Households as small self-service providers**, including households that employ private (or natural) water sources, on-site latrines, and so on.
- **Private small service providers** (PSSPs), which “are found mainly in urban and periurban areas for both water and sanitation-related services (e.g. water kiosk operators, water carters, latrine cleaners) where the utility – for various reasons – is not operating. In addition to these, other PSSPs provide services to support the delivery of water and sanitation services.”
- **Community-based small service providers** (CSSPs) are “found mainly in water supply schemes in rural areas... For most CSSPs, communities are involved in the design and implementation of new schemes; they contribute to the capital investments, and have complete management and financial responsibility for operation and maintenance. In most developing countries, the investment costs are at least partially covered by subsidies” (Biesinger and Richter, 2007:vii).

Generally, when authors refer to “informal service providers,” they mean actors falling within the second category described above – small enterprises or individuals offering water, sanitation or electricity services to urban residents who are without access to formal utility networks.

Recent literature has tended towards an accommodating view of the informal provision of urban water, sanitation and electricity services (the latter have received by far the least analytical attention). Informal service providers are seen as vital for promoting general access to essential utilities, particularly water, in contexts where the spatial reach of formal network services is limited. They are further laudable for their capacity to provide differentiated forms of utility access in a flexible, market-responsive yet personalized manner:

“More flexible than the concessionaires, independent operators can respond more easily to rapid changes in demand linked to the growth of unplanned urban areas. They offer a wide variety of services close to where people live, allowing them to select the most convenient. They adapt to the limitations of their clients’ needs and income, and communicate face-to-face with their clients about problems, for example, with water quality, rather than at a distance and through the time-consuming bureaucratic procedures of the concessionaires...”
(Collignon and Vezina, 2000:59-60).

Informal urban service industries also provide extensive livelihood opportunities in low-income communities (in some cases rivalling the employment potential and economic productivity of formal service systems, Collignon and Vezina, 2000). However, such industries and informal modes of provision in general should not be unquestioningly accepted as desirable and hence encouraged. The poor, forced to purchase their vital services from entrepreneurial agents, often pay more for these utilities than those connected to formally provided, publically-subsidized networks. That said, there is no doubt that informal service access is a pervading reality of urbanization in Africa, and that the livelihoods (and indeed lives) of millions currently depend upon the functions of household, community and smallscale private servicing initiatives. In this light, conventional urban policy approaches, which continue to exemplify an anti-informality bias and a general (financially unrealistic) desire to universalize networked utility access, appear singularly unhelpful in promoting goals of social and spatial justice in African cities. Biesinger and Richter (2007) and others therefore recommend policy

efforts to accommodate informal service initiatives where and when appropriate, and to improve the operability of small private enterprises by promoting their access to affordable local financial resources. As succinctly put by Kjellen and McGranahan, with reference to urban water vendors:

“The challenge is not to promote or suppress water vending, any more than it is to promote or suppress private-sector participation in utility operations. The challenge is to improve currently inadequate water and sanitation services, through the most effective means available, including water vending where appropriate” (2006:1).

Some key themes and issues that have emerged in recent literature include:

- **Empirical analysis of urban utility access.** We can observe a general movement away from “top-down” perspectives (centred on debates surrounding the merits of public or private modes of service provision) towards empirical analyses of the actual modes by which poor urbanites gain access to essential services (e.g. Allen *et al.*, 2008; Kjellen and McGranahan, 2006). Empirical approaches have also been applied to the analysis of community-public sector partnership initiatives, as in the case of awami tanks in Karachi (Ahmed and Sohail, 2003).
- **Informal service provision, access and urban governance.** Moretto (2007) is interested in different approaches to the governance of informal water access by multilateral aid organizations. Allen *et al.* (2004, 2006, 2008) also position governance as a central theme of their discussions of water and sanitation access by the urban (and peri-urban) poor.
- **The interdependence of formal and informal urban service systems.** Despite the common usage of the formal/informal conceptual binary, in reality urban service systems function as a complex mix of arrangements that blur such a neat distinction. Nunan and Satterthwaite illustrate this point with reference to urban water provision: “Some of the gaps left by the formal private sector and by the public sector are filled by the informal sector... [T]he informal sector role is mostly seen in the provision of water supplies, through vendors and people selling water from taps. The supply of water depends, therefore, on a range of delivery mechanisms that include informal enterprises, resulting in different levels of access to, and quality of, water” (Nunan and Satterthwaite, 2001:423). Another interesting aspect of the link between formal and informal systems is the observed tendency for the neoliberalization (externalization, outsourcing, etc.) of public sector services to drive the casualization of labour in these sectors, as has been observed in South Africa (Miraftab, 2004; Samson, 2004).
- **Ahmed, N., and Sohail, M. 2003. “Alternate water supply arrangements in peri-urban localities: Awami (people’s) tanks in Orangi township, Karachi,” *Environment and Urbanization*, 15(2), pp. 33-42.**
 - o This paper describes the serious water shortages that have been a feature of life in Karachi in recent years, and how community-managed public tanks (awami tanks) have been used in Orangi, Karachi’s largest informal settlement, to cope with the situation. These tanks are an example of a water supply service developed as a cooperative arrangement between informally developed community organizations and public-sector agencies. The paper explores the partnerships between service providers, recipients of the service and other related stakeholders.

- **Allen, A., Davila, J., and Hofmann, P. 2004. “Governance and access to water and sanitation in the metropolitan fringe: An overview of five case studies.” Paper presented at N-Aerus Annual Conference: “Urban governance, diversity and social action in cities of the South,” 15-16 September, Barcelona (Spain).**
 - o The peri-urban interface (PUI) is the location, on the one hand, of a mixed population which often disproportionately comprises poor households and producers, and on the other of important environmental services and natural resources consumed in towns and cities. Many of the localities in the PUI of metropolitan areas can be described as in transition from being predominantly rural to acquiring urban features. This process is often accompanied by substantial pressures over natural resources (such as land and water) due to their increased marketability and greater volumes of pollution generated by higher concentrations of population and enterprises.
 - o This paper presents preliminary results from a research project on the governance of water and sanitation services in the PUI of five metropolitan areas (Chennai, Dar es Salaam, Cairo, Mexico City and Caracas). It explores differences and similarities in the formal and informal practices in the delivery and consumption of these services. It deals with issues of access to decision-making, equity, cultural and political practices in delivering, sharing or competing for services, and perceptions of local “ownership” of natural resources, while highlighting the role that different actors, including state institutions, play in these processes.

- **Allen, A., Davila, J., and Hofmann, P. 2006. “Governance of water and sanitation services for the periurban poor: A framework for understanding and action in metropolitan regions.” Development Planning Unit (London).**
 - o Available free online at <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08c4040f0b652dd0011f0/R8137-book.pdf>
 - o This document offers a conceptual and practical tool for those involved directly or indirectly in the long-term planning and daily management of basic service provision in the metropolitan regions of developing countries. Its long-term aim is to contribute to more reliable, affordable and sustainable access to water and sanitation services for the diverse and often-growing poor peri-urban populations in metropolitan regions. The focus of this document is not on the technical aspects of designing and building infrastructure. Rather, it seeks to provide guidance to better comprehend the institutional and governance challenges of improving access to these basic services for poor peri-urban households and small-scale enterprises. Without denying the crucial role played by municipal engineers and other technical water and sanitation staff, improved and reliable access to peri-urban water and sanitation services will not result from their isolated – and sometimes heroic – actions. Similarly, experience shows that access by poor residents and producers is unlikely to expand if left in the hands of private suppliers alone. Implementation of policies and plans that respond more effectively to peri-urban realities requires a better understanding of issues such as the inadequate peri-urban coverage of these services and the high presence of diverse formal and informal suppliers of basic services found in many cities. This challenge is all the more urgent in the context of the rapid pace that is a feature of peri-urban change, of the obvious fragmentation of government responsibilities for planning and supplying basic services to peri-urban areas and of the crucial environmental functions played by these areas.

- **Allen, A., Hofmann, P., and Griffiths, H. 2008. “Moving down the ladder: Governance and sanitation that works for the urban poor.” Paper delivered to IRC Symposium: Sanitation for the Urban Poor, 19-21 November.**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.ircwash.org/resources/moving-down-ladder-governance-and-sanitation-works-urban-poor-paper-presented-irc>
 - o The paper argues that the widespread privatization of basic services in the 1990s has in turn led to a redefinition of the role of an “instrumentalized state,” in which the traditional functions of legislation, regulation, direct provision and investment have been significantly redefined, in many cases bringing the role of the state closely aligned with the creation of “new business opportunities for transnational corporations” (Finger, 2005:275). However, neither the public nor the international private sector is filling the gap of meeting the WATSAN needs of the urban and peri-urban poor. The essay contrasts a so-called “rationalist perspective” dominated by the public-private controversy with an empirical perspective concerned with gaining a better grasp of the multiple – and often neglected – practices and arrangements by which the urban poor effectively access sanitation on the ground. The concept of service co-production is presented in this context as a means to draw lessons from the ground of sanitation provision to and by the urban poor, and to devise meaningful ways to empower the poor to fully exercise their rights and to become agents of change, fostering a type of governance that is people-centred rather than producer-centred. The discussion then examines how to move down the sanitation ladder (depicted on page 16) in order to acknowledge and support the actual options by which the urban poor effectively access sanitation, looking in particular at the roles and responsibilities of the different actors involved. Last but not least, the links between sanitation, land, housing, health and livelihoods are briefly examined, calling for the need to go beyond a sectoral approach to sanitation.

- **Bakker, K. 2008. “The ambiguity of community: debating alternatives to private-sector provision of urban water supply,” *Water Alternatives*, 1(2), pp. 236-252.**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.ircwash.org/sites/default/files/Bakker-2008-Ambiguity.pdf>
 - o The concept of community has become increasingly important in debates over alternatives to privatisation, and is invoked by both proponents and opponents of private sector provision of water supply. This paper presents a critique of the concept of community water supply when it is invoked as an alternative to privatisation. The analysis presents a typology of proposals for community ownership and governance of water supply, and proceeds to critique some of the flawed assumptions in the concepts of community deployed in these proposals, together with references to more general debates about the viability of the “commons” as enacted through community-controlled water supply systems. The paper closes with a brief discussion of the future evolution of the debate over “community” alternatives to privatization, focussing on water supply.

- **Biesinger, B., and Richter, M. 2007. “Financial services for the promotion of poverty-oriented water supply and sanitation in Sub-Saharan Africa.” Report produced by GTZ.**
 - o “The financing of infrastructure and services in water supply and sanitation (WS&S) is one of the major challenges for achieving the MDGs. Up to now, investments have been primarily funded by governments (public sector) and development partners. As these funds are decreasing for various reasons and the share of commercial financing is still very low, the key question

is whether the financial gap for WS&S in developing countries can be reduced by mobilizing additional local financial resources... The literature review clearly shows that in many developing countries so-called small-scale service providers play an important role in the provision of water supply and sanitation services, especially in rural and peri-urban areas. This also applies to SSA countries. According to their type, area and level of intervention, three market segments are suggested: (i) households as self-service providers (HSSP), (ii) private small service providers (PSSP) and (iii) community-based small service providers (CSSP)."

- **Birkenholtz, T. 2010. "“Full-cost recovery”: Producing differentiated water collection practices and responses to centralized water networks in Jaipur, India,” *Environment and Planning A*, 42(9), pp. 2238- 2253.**

- o This paper examines the political ecological effects of the expansion of an urban centralized water-supply network and the transformation of it into a full-cost-recovery system in Jaipur, Rajasthan, India. It draws on data collected through a 2007 household survey of six Jaipur neighborhoods stratified by class; follow-up household interviews in 2007 and 2009; and interviews with public water supply managers and private water tanker vendors in both 2007 and 2009. The investigation concludes that the spatially uneven integration of network expansion, and the intermittent flow of water circulating through it, combined with historical axes of political economic difference, produces uneven adaptive responses to maintain access to water, such as waiting on water, private tubewell construction, and private water-tanker operations, while transforming social power relations. It is concluded, first, that these uneven flows and cost-recovery initiatives are exacerbating current disparities in access to drinking water and, second, that the current public watersupply system has only been partially reformed and that these policy changes have rendered the public supplier unable to recover costs. This makes the need for a private-sector rescue of an incapacitated and inefficient public institution seem obvious to planners, yet the public utility’s inability to set costs or infrastructure priorities draws into question the need for the private sector and full-cost-recovery reforms.

- **Collignon, B., and Vezina, M. 2000. “Independent water and sanitation providers in African cities: Full report of a 10-country study.” UNDP-World Bank Water and Sanitation Programme.**

- o Available free online at https://www.pseau.org/smc_formation/smk/documents_source/ssip/e_04_ssip_collignon%20vezina%202000.pdf
- o “In the context of the burgeoning growth of Africa’s cities, neither state monopolies, their privatized successors, the concessionaires, nor non-profit or community-based organizations has been able to keep up with the pace of rising demand for water and sanitation services in low-income urban areas. Fewer than 30 per cent of households in Bamako, Cotonou and Dar es Salaam have access to piped drinking water. Piped sewerage is but a far-distant dream for 90 percent of urban Africans. Yet governments have generally continued to give priority to the tried and true, standard issue solution: a city-wide piped network run by a single, monopolistic operator... Independent providers respond to the needs and preferences of a clientele composed primarily of low-income families... [Their] services are demand-driven and they deliver them the way their clientele needs them: reliably, and in small quantities which remain affordable when family funds are tight and income irregular... Independent providers serve many functions in the provision of water and sanitation services. Some manage one or more water points or sell individual buckets of water door to door. Others are hired to clean out latrines and pump

out septic tanks. Still others operate small piped water systems and even, in Cotonou (Benin), a sewage treatment plant. These activities provide jobs for several thousand people in each capital city (one to two per cent of the labour force), from 70 to 90 per cent of those employed in the water sector (compared to 10 to 30 per cent who work for the concessionaires). They provide a main source of income for dozens of thousands of low-income families and generate a volume of business comparable to that of the city water companies, despite the fact they must survive in a difficult environment, are perceived as operating outside the mainstream, and are often subject to the hostility of government authorities.”

- **Hossain, S. 2011. “Informal dynamics of a public utility: Rationality of the scene behind a screen,” *Habitat International*, 35, pp. 275-285.**
 - o This paper contributes to the conceptual discourse of urban informality with empirical findings taken from a rapidly growing informal settlement in the periphery of Dhaka, Bangladesh. It considers the case of a public water utility dealing with the rationality of the decision-making process, the working culture of the public authority, and the consequent local practices embedded in water supply. It explains how the informal behaviour of the public utility and the practices of the study community are constructed, legitimated and negotiated and thus become everyday reality. The findings characterize the public utility as an informalized entity whose decisions lack any prescribed set of statutory institutions and are, instead, rationalized politically, based on the location and individual interests of actors in a power matrix. This mode of water governance produces discriminatory practices of differential treatment and tolerance, thus informing questions of difference and urban division.
- **Kanin, Y.O. 2006. “Partnership between Ghana water company limited and tanker associations for water service delivery in Accra.” Unpublished Masters thesis submitted to Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology.**
 - o Available free online at <http://ir.knust.edu.gh/xmlui/handle/123456789/7425?show=full>
 - o This study examined the partnership between the formal utility Ghana Water Company Limited (GWCL), and Tanker Associations for the provision of water services in Accra. The study was conducted mainly in the eastern part of Accra where Tanker Associations are located. Data were gathered from stakeholders (GWCL, Tanker Associations, Public Utility Regulatory Commission (PURC) and consumers) by using structured interviews and questionnaires administered to 300 households that receive water from tanker services. The work ascertained the partnership’s contribution to filling this supply gap. It looked at the partnership relation and its evolution over the years as well as its translation into improving tanker service quality relative to the situation before this partnership agreement. The results showed that the partnership started with an MOU signed between GWCL and Tanker Associations and this has been in place since 1997. Subsequently, water tanker service guidelines’ have been developed by the economic regulator, PURC, to enhance the partnership in the areas of water quality and pricing. The number of water tankers has risen from five in 1997 to over 600 in 2009 providing services to residents in Accra. The results further showed that the service delivered by tanker operators is such that water quantities used by consumers of water from tankers range from 35 l/c/d for the low-income, to 149 l/c/d for the high-income residents, water quality was perceived to be occasionally poor for drinking as 73 per cent of low-income drink compared to 0 per cent of the high-income residents. However, regulation and reliability is high as services are available daily from 7am to

5pm (10 hours of service). The study suggests that the mechanism for ensuring water quality in the partnership needs to be fully carried out to enhance the delivery of good quality water for residents. Pricing and its effect are discussed.

- **Kariuki, M., and Schwartz, J. 2005. "Small-scale private service providers of water supply and electricity: A review of incidence, structure, pricing and operating characteristics."**
 - o Available free online at http://waterwiki.net/images/8/8c/SPSPs_Report_World_Bank.pdf
 - o This document summarizes the key findings and conclusions of a literature review of small-scale private service providers of water supply and electricity (SPSPs) conducted over a six-month period in 2003... SPSPs appear most prevalent in countries with low coverage levels, ineffective public utilities that provide inadequate or partial services and remote, difficult-to-access regions. SPSPs are especially prevalent in post-conflict countries, and others with weak or failed states. Of the countries for which evidence of SPSPs was available, at least half fall into this category. SPSP provision of networked services appears to be significantly higher for electricity than for water supply... Most SPSPs identified through the literature are single-purpose entities established for the express purpose of delivering water supply or electricity. SPSPs take a variety of organizational forms, both for-profit and non-profit. As such, they are established for a variety of reasons including: to meet consumer demand, respond to crises or as part of larger business ventures. The technology employed may extend upstream from distribution services to the means for producing or generating water supply or electricity, so capital needs vary accordingly. The vast majority of SPSPs have fewer than 50 employees and usually fewer than 10. A lack of affordable financing is a constraint for most SPSPs, who fund investments mainly through their own earnings and savings, loans from friends and family, and money borrowed from formal and informal lenders.

- **Kjellen, M., and McGranahan, G. 2006. "Informal water vendors and the urban poor." IIED Human Settlements Discussion Paper Series (IIED, London).**
 - o Available free online at <http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/10529IIED.pdf>
 - o Water vending is probably as old as human society and trade, but in recent centuries it has been overshadowed by the expansion of networked piped systems. Water vending is now often taken as a symptom of a failure in these piped systems, which still provide water to only a minority of urban dwellers in many parts of the world. When collecting international statistics on access to water, those who buy their water from a vendor are classified as not having reasonable access to an improved water supply, along with people who get their water from unimproved wells or surface-water sources. In many cities, water vending is actively discouraged. Recent research indicates, however, that non-utility water vendors (henceforth simply water vendors) provide an important service. By suppressing water vending, there is a danger that authorities are making it still more difficult for deprived residents to obtain water. By assuming that vendor water is inherently inadequate, important opportunities for improvement are being ignored. On the other hand, assuming that water vending is inherently desirable is also problematic. The challenge is not to promote or suppress water vending, any more than it is to promote or suppress private-sector participation in utility operations. The challenge is to improve currently inadequate water and sanitation services, through the most effective means available, including water vending, where appropriate... This paper looks at how water-vending systems

operate and how effective they are in meeting the needs of the poor. It raises questions about what can be done to increase the effectiveness of watervending systems, and whether getting vendors to provide better water services to the urban poor can make a positive contribution to international water goals. The paper concentrates on small-scale and informal vendors, most of whom work independently, with very little capital. Despite these limitations, the paper covers an extremely diverse range of vendors, some of whom are simply one part of a large supply chain, while others control a natural water source and sell the water directly to the final consumer.

- **Larbi, G. 2000. “Service provision in a changing governance environment with special reference to West Africa.” Report prepared for International Development Research Centre (Canada).**
 - o Available free online at <http://idl-bnc.idrc.ca/dspace/bitstream/123456789/26476/1/118783.pdf>
 - o This paper provides a useful overview of the overall trends and issues affecting service provision in Africa. It deals particularly with institutional and financial issues. These include widespread shifts towards structural adjustment, and the associated privatization (outsourcing, contracting, etc.) of service provision. Although it focuses on West Africa, its insights are relevant for other African contexts.

- **McIntosh 2003. *Asian water supplies: Reaching the urban poor*. Asian Development Bank and IWA Publishing (London).**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/29250/asian-water-supplies.pdf>
 - o This book is intended as a guide and sourcebook on urban water supplies in Asia for governments, utilities, consultants, development agencies, and nongovernment organizations. It seeks to undermine some of the myths and misconceptions that have undermined effective water-supply practice in Asia. It discusses some important themes such as the links between water and poverty, and issues surrounding governance, government policy and water utility management practices in Asian cities. The book also includes a chapter on small-scale water providers. Although such providers have been largely ignored by government and development-agency water policies, “in terms of the total revenue turnover from water in megacities, like Jakarta or Manila, SSWPs are responsible for more revenue turnover than formal utilities.” The author continues: “Is there a need to regulate SSWPs? Evidence suggests that there is not. That would probably drive many of them out of business. To a large extent, the market promotes regulation through customer choice concerning price and quality of water. Competition is strong. There is, however, a need to recognize SSWPs officially” (p. 51).

- **Miraftab, F. (2004). “Neoliberalism and casualization of public-sector services: The case of waste collection services in Cape Town, South Africa,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 28(4), pp. 874-892.**
 - o This article is concerned with the South African state’s adoption of global neoliberal ideology and how this contributes to the casualization of labour. While most research has examined labour casualization with respect to the behaviour of private-sector companies and firms, this article examines the behaviour of the public sector. Taking the example of Cape Town’s municipal government, known as the unicity, and its strategies for collecting waste in black townships, I discuss the full-cost-recovery principles of the municipal government and the ways in which local governments, like privatesector firms, further the casualization of labour. That is,

the consequence of recovering costs in part by promoting shortterm contracts for labour paid at minimum wage under precarious conditions.

- **Moran, D., and Batley, R. 2004. “Literature review of non-state provision of basic services.” Governance Resource Centre, School of Public Policy, University of Birmingham (UK).**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.birmingham.ac.uk/Documents/college-social-sciences/government-society/idd/research/non-state-providers/literature-review-12april04.pdf>
 - o “This paper provides a review of recent literature in the field of the non-state provision of services, focussing in particular on how government and civil society relate to the providers of those services (NSPs). The literature review is in two sections. Section one is an overview that draws out common themes and comparisons and highlights potential areas for further research. It is based on Section 2, which comprises three sector-focussed appendices covering experience in NSP provision in primary health care, primary education, and basic water and sanitation... The particular concern of the review is with literature relating to interventions to support the provision of services to poor consumers by smaller and more informal providers.”
 - o In terms of water and sanitation service provision, the review covers issues and debates in the following areas: arguments for state and non-state provision of drinking water and sanitation; the type and scope of non-state service providers; relationships and political processes between state and non-state actors; government intervention in nonstate service providers (i.e. regulation, contracting, supportive efforts); as well as community cooperation with non-state service providers.
- **Moretto, L. 2007. “Urban governance and multilateral aid organizations: The case of informal water supply systems,” *Rev Int Org*, 2, pp. 345-370.**
 - o This paper explores the different urban governance models proposed by multilateral aid organizations in accessing water through informal supply systems, to assess the rationale and guiding principles at the basis of their different “governance approaches.” There can be no doubt that most developing countries are now experiencing rapid and unprecedented urban growth, which is bringing about a rising demand for urban services, especially those concerning water supply. To cope with this pressing issue, the response of multilateral aid organizations – such as the World Bank, UN-HABITAT and the European Union – has been represented by the design and implementation of different urban governance and management systems, called to support an equitable and efficient access to urban water supply services. This paper focusses on the different urban governance approaches through which multilateral donors support informal networks and small-scale providers to provide water supply in cities of developing countries. It highlights how these different urban governance approaches address the overall issues of poverty reduction while in reality, in certain cases, they also aim to affect and regulate domestic public policies of Third World countries. In particular, it argues that the governance model proposed – and imposed – by the World Bank continues to belong to a neoliberal policy agenda, which considers water and urban services as commodities to be managed through widespread competition and market mechanisms. On the contrary, UN-HABITAT, and the European Union to a certain extent, highlight the need for an urban governance system that promotes the ownership of development strategies by local communities and that rests on the principles of inclusiveness and equity.

- **Samson, M. 2004. “Organizing in the informal economy: A case study of the municipal waste management industry in South Africa.” International Labour Office (Geneva).**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.municipalservicesproject.org/sites/default/files/SAMSON%20Organizing%20Informal%20Economy.pdf>
 - o “Traditionally, the municipal waste management industry in South Africa has been firmly located within the formal economy, and typified by high levels of organization among both employers and workers, along with well-established institutions for collective bargaining. However, policy changes that have actively encouraged municipalities to externalize the provision of waste-management services have led to a dramatic shift in the nature of the sector. Whereas in the past, municipalities were the sole employers of municipal waste-management workers, a range of economic actors, including private companies, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), community-based organizations (CBOs), ward councillors/committees and short-term provincial poverty alleviation projects now employ and/or control labour within the sector. Some of these employers are informal. Aside from larger private companies, they are poorly organized, and do not negotiate with labour... Externalization has also led to increased job insecurity and informalization of work. As municipalities typically grant contracts for three to five years, job security for workers employed on these contracts is limited. Some are hired on fixed-term contracts, and others are contracted on a daily basis. Those appointed permanently face retrenchment if the employer is unsuccessful in renewing the contract with the municipality. With respect to informalization, in some instances there has been a rise in disguised employment relationships, such as the contracting of “one-person operators” (individuals who are ‘independently’ contracted to collect domestic refuse and transport it to temporary collection sites, but whose work is managed by a supervisor) to deliver services. For many workers, the shift into the informal economy is based on the denial of rights enshrined in labour laws and bargaining council agreements, due to lack of enforcement.”
- **Solo, T.M. 1999. “Small-scale entrepreneurs in the urban water and sanitation market,” *Environment and Urbanization*, 11(1), pp. 117-131.**
 - o This paper describes the importance of small-scale private sector or NGO providers of water and sanitation in a great range of urban areas in Africa, Asia and Latin America. It includes many examples of where – contrary to conventional wisdom – they provide good quality, low-cost services. Without these operations, large sections of the South’s urban populations, including tens of millions of low-income households, would be worse off. Yet these generally operate with no subsidy and have to recover their costs. This paper discusses how public policy can support (or at least not seriously constrain) small-scale entrepreneurs in water and sanitation provision while ensuring checks on the quality and price of the services they provide.
- **Van Dijk, M.P. 2008. “Role of small-scale independent providers in water and sanitation,” *Int. J. Water*, Vol. 4(3/4), pp. 275-289.**
 - o Small-scale independent providers (SSIPs) and households are good for 10-69 per cent of the household water supply and sometimes up to 95 per cent of the sanitation solutions in cities in developing countries. Different types of SSIP can be distinguished. They could be allowed to make a more important contribution to drinking water and sanitation in a situation where many governments cannot be the only one to supply drinking water and sanitary services.

Theoretical and practical arguments are used to explain why private-sector involvement is even more frequent in sanitation than in drinking water. The issue of how to improve efficiency in the water and sanitation sector will be raised by looking at ways to unbundle sanitation, to use technological innovations and to bring in more competition. The need for alternative technologies is stressed, since a fully fledged sewerage system in every Third World city would contribute to increased foreign debt in many countries, given that the steel and cement often need to be imported.

9. Informal Settlement

9.1 Informal Housing

“There are essentially two positions inherent in approaches to informal settlements in urban areas. One is “managerial,” which, accepting that under present conditions, fully formalizing informal settlement is impossible, seeks ways to regularize or cope with informality, integrating formal and informal systems where possible. The other is more “conceptual,” as it accepts that the definition of informality is based on certain precepts that are often not legitimate in the social constructs of value, and seeks to find ways in which these values and social constructs can be expressed and interact with other – generally politically dominant – concepts. The objective here is to create a new perception which in turn will shape the form of urban development.” (Jenkins, 2001:2)

Empirical analyses of housing practices in many cities of the developing world have revealed that “housing production and exchange happen in a continuum of formal and informal processes,” as Fawaz (2009) has argued in the case of Hayy el-Sellom (Beirut). The idea that formal and informal practices are interdependent and co-produced is also applicable to land management, as authors such as van Horen (2000) have argued.

There has been much critical discussion of the shortcomings and inappropriateness of conventional housing policies. Numerous authors have pointed out that formal housing policy tends to neglect or ignore important realities of housing demand and market function in urban areas, with attendant consequences. Lemanski (2009) argues that South African formal housing policy both produces and ignores informal backyard settlement in urban areas. Charlton (2010) has pointed out that municipal housing efforts in Johannesburg have entailed a problematic assumption that home ownership should be the primary promoter of urban inclusion and wealth-creation. In fact, “home ownership is neither desirable nor feasible for some residents.” Huchzermeyer (2003) has been equally critical of the South African capital subsidy system for housing and informal settlement intervention, which “entitles low-income households to a uniform product, consisting of a standardized serviced plot with freehold tenure and a core housing structure, in a formalized township layout.” Such a system tends to promote the forced removal of residents and the perpetuation of the fragmented apartheid city. Despite the fact that in 2004 the South African government formulated a national housing policy promoting *in*

situ informal settlement upgrading (as opposed to a plan-service-occupy development), Huchzermeyer (2006) has noted the reluctance of municipal agencies to carry out *in situ* upgrading approaches.

Outside of South Africa, Gough and Yankson (2010) argue that housing and labour laws and practices in Accra (Ghana) invariably overlook the important function and unique form of tenancy associated with caretakers (of incomplete building sites). Based on a case study of Beirut (Lebanon), Fawaz (2009) has criticized recent policy efforts to integrate informal housing markets within larger formal markets, noting that the integration process has merely weakened “informal” institutions (e.g. gossip, reputation) “without properly activating other institutions.” Keivani and (2001) are also critical of the expansion of the role of private land and housing markets in developing countries, citing “the severe underdevelopment of institutional capacities and human and material resources” as a cause of private-market inefficiency.

Other themes of interest include:

- Moving beyond the idea that informal settlement happens “from scratch” in empty space, and that informal settlement is essentially the same, regardless of socio-spatial context – peripheral settlement in Mexico City, according to Wigle (2010) is influenced by a range of pre-existing social relations and practices relating to property.
- Empirical studies of housing transformations in informal settlements (Sheuya, 2009), modes of informal housing finance (Sheuya, 2007), as well as local resident perspectives of informal accommodation (Ansell and van Blerk, 2005).
- Analysis of community organization and resistance to local state-housing interventions (Skuse and Cousins [2007] look at struggles for permanency in informal housing in Cape Town).
- **Ansell, N., and van Blerk, L. 2005. “Where we stayed was very bad...’ Migrant children’s perspectives on life in informal rented accommodation in two southern African cities,” *Environment and Planning A*, 37, pp. 423-440.**
 - o Most research and initiatives relating to children’s experiences of urban space have focussed on the physical environment. Housing policies in Third World countries have also emphasized the provision of physical infrastructure and buildings, and urban aesthetics. In this paper, the authors draw on the voices of young informants from Maseru (Lesotho), and Blantyre (Malawi), who, in discussions concerning moving house, chose to talk about social and economic aspects of life in the informal-sector rented accommodation that is increasingly characteristic of these and many other African cities. The children offer insight into the peopling of urban space, mapping unruly environments characterized by disorder, gossip, and social contestation, far removed from the hard technocratic spaces imagined by planners. Their observations are important not only because children represent a very large and relatively neglected proportion of African urban dwellers but also because they offer a unique insight into the dynamic character of urban environments. As close observers of adult decision-making processes, children are informed commentators on motivations for moving house as well as the impacts of urban environments on their own lives. Not only do the children highlight the inadequacies of the informal private rental sector, they also offer a window onto why it is inadequate.

- **Charlton, S. 2010. “Inclusion through housing: Limitations and alternatives in Johannesburg,” *Urban Forum*, 21, pp. 1-19.**
 - o Cities concerned with the inclusion of marginalized inhabitants search for practical strategies towards this end. In Johannesburg, ownership of formal housing is seen as one such means. Home ownership is assumed to foster urban inclusion in various ways. An additional appeal is the wealth-creating potential of the property ladder, but findings from the neighbourhood of Al-alexandra demonstrate that home ownership is neither desirable nor feasible for some residents. Furthermore, the state’s current housing programme has diverse meanings for people in terms of notions of home and property ownership. If the objective is to promote inclusion, opportunities can be found by shifting the focus away from home ownership towards the constituent parts of “housing.” Access to services is a key dimension of the notion of inclusion and need not be linked to place of residence, or to home ownership, but can also be promoted at key public parts of the city.

- **Fawaz, M. 2009. “Contracts and retaliation: Securing housing exchanges in the interstice of the formal/informal Beirut (Lebanon) housing market,” *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 29, pp. 90-107.**
 - o The current housing policy paradigm supports the integration of informal settlements’ housing markets with the larger housing markets. Given, however, that housing production and exchange happen on a continuum of formal and informal processes, this article seeks to look at the effects of this integration on the conditions of housing acquisition for low-income urban dwellers. Based on a case study in Hayy el-Sellom (Beirut), the article traces the changing practices that ensued from the integration of this informal settlement’s housing market in the affordable housing market of the city’s suburbs by looking at how exchanges were secured and redress sought in cases of default. Research findings indicate that the introduction of practices borrowed from the larger housing market did not improve market securities. This suggests that rather than focussing on the formal-informal divide, planners should devise context-specific methods to address locally identified market weaknesses.

- **Gough, K.V., and Yankson, P. 2010. “A neglected aspect of the housing market: The caretakers of periurban Accra, Ghana,” *Urban Studies*, published online 16 August, pp. 1-19.**
 - o In housing markets in sub-Saharan Africa, construction is predominantly undertaken by individuals rather than by the state or private companies. Due to lack of housing finance, the construction process takes many years, hence owners often engage live-in caretakers to protect their property. Based on fieldwork conducted in peri-urban Accra, this paper explores why the demand for caretakers arises, why there is a supply of caretakers, who the caretakers are and their living conditions. Although life as a caretaker is far from ideal, the demand for and supply of caretakers are likely to continue for the foreseeable future. Caretaking is a form of housing tenancy which is overlooked in housing and labour laws and practices, and hence demands more attention from both researchers and policy-makers.

- **Huchzermeyer, M. 2003. “A legacy of control? The capital subsidy for housing, and informal settlement intervention in South Africa,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 27(3), pp. 591-612.**
 - o ...In the absence of a policy framework for the integration of urban informal settlements, current informal settlement intervention in South Africa is structured through the capital subsidy scheme of the national housing policy. This entitles low-income households to a uniform product, consisting of a standardized serviced plot with freehold tenure and a core housing structure, in a formalized township layout. Through this form of intervention, informally developed settlements are replaced by fully standardized townships on cheap tracts of land (usually involving relocation), thus largely perpetuating the existing structure of the South African city. In this article I show that this approach may be discredited on very basic grounds. I therefore ask how such an inappropriate approach has remained unchallenged...

- **Huchzermeyer, M. 2006. “The struggle for *in situ* upgrading of informal settlements: Case studies from Gauteng.” Paper presented at the Southern African Housing Foundation Conference & Exhibition, 9-11 October, Cape Sun (South Africa).**
 - o Available free online at <http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/handle/10539/11930>
 - o Department of Housing released a new Informal Settlement Upgrading Programme in 2004, which makes *in situ* upgrading of informal settlements possible with minimal disruption to residents’ lives. To date, the new programme is not necessarily the municipalities’ choice when intervening in an informal settlement. This paper presents the case of three informal settlement communities in Gauteng province, which have struggled for recognition of basic principles of the informal settlement upgrading programme. Their requests have been met with great reluctance from local government. Through these cases, the paper seeks point to some of the critical re-skilling and capacity-building areas necessary before local government can roll out the informal settlement upgrading programme at scale.

- **Keivani, R., and Werna, E. 2001. “Modes of housing provision in developing countries,” *Progress in Planning*, 55, pp. 65-118.**
 - o In the face of an estimated one billion people living in inadequate housing conditions in developing countries, the need for scaling up housing supply has become an urgent focus of policy debate. To this end, the expansion of the role of private markets has formed the central thesis of the “enabling strategy” for developing the housing sector as a whole, rather than relying on project-based approaches such as sites-and-services and settlement upgrading programmes. Policy recommendations emanating from such a standpoint concentrate on adjustments to supply and demand through deregulation and institutional development of the land and housing markets in developing countries, in order to overcome largely external constraints to a more efficient market mechanism. This conception of the enabling strategy, however, has been subject to much debate and criticism for its over-concentration on private markets and exclusion of alternative/complementary modes of housing provision from serious policy consideration. By utilizing the structure and agency approach as its basic methodological tool of analysis, this paper provides a comprehensive review of the scope and potential of different modes of housing provision in different contexts in developing countries. Thereby, it provides a firm comparative basis for examining the potential for expanded private market activity. The paper concludes that the

severe underdevelopment of institutional capacities and human and material resources coupled with intricate and complex social, political, cultural and economic interactions between various agents and structures of provision create major obstacles to the efficiency of private land markets in developing countries. Therefore, while private markets can and should be supported, they cannot form the focus of the enabling strategy in most developing countries. Instead, the paper argues for a comprehensive approach to enabling strategies which combines adjustments to overall supply-and-demand conditions with the identification and inclusion of different modes and agents of housing provision in a holistic integrated policy.

- **Kigochie, P.W. 2001. “Squatter rehabilitation projects that support home-based enterprises create jobs and housing: The case of Mathare 4A, Nairobi,” *Cities*, 18(4), pp. 223-233.**
 - o This paper examines how home-based enterprises (HBEs) in squatter settlements benefit from rehabilitation. High unemployment and lack of affordable housing for the urban poor are some of the most pressing problems in less developed countries. To curb both problems, international donor agencies urge governments to employ policies that combine shelter provision with job creation. Such policies can relax building codes, making housing affordable, and remove barriers that inhibit the growth of the informal sector. Governments are also encouraged to cooperate with nongovernmental organizations, community-based organizations and residents in an effort to create jobs and provide affordable housing. Mathare 4A Housing Project is employing such policies and has managed to produce upgraded and affordable shelter by relaxing building codes and using inexpensive, local building materials. The project supports existing HBEs, creates jobs and raises standards of living. The rehabilitated enterprises have better shelter and infrastructure, are more efficient, accessible and competitive, and have diversified the neighbourhood economy.
- **Lemanski, C. 2009. “Augmented informality: South Africa’s backyard dwellings as a by-product of formal housing policies,” *Habitat International*, 33(4), pp. 472-484.**
 - o Insufficient and inadequate housing for the urban poor has a long history in South Africa, as in other African cities. Nearly one-fifth of urban households in South Africa reside in an informal dwelling. While most live in informal settlements, significant proportions have erected informal structures (essentially “shacks”) in the backyard of another property, a distinctly South African phenomenon. Backyard dwellings have historically been overlooked by housing policies that focus on upgrading and/or eradicating informal settlements. Previously, backyard dwellers were perceived as marginalized, living in appalling conditions and exploited by cavalier landlords. However, the post-apartheid provision of state-funded housing for the poor has altered the nature of backyard housing, creating a new class of cash-poor homeowners who are dependent on income from backyard dwellers’ rent, thus ensuring a more equitable power pendulum between landlord and tenant. This paper uses research conducted in a low-income state-subsidized housing settlement in Cape Town to explore the new dimensions of informal backyard housing, both for landlords and tenants, as a consequence of South Africa’s formal housing policies.

- **Sheuya, S.A. 2007. “Reconceptualizing housing finance in informal settlements: The case of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania,” *Environment and Urbanization*, 19(2), pp. 441-456.**
 - o Most urban dwellers in developing countries live in informal settlements in housing that is built incrementally. Low-income households most often have no access to formal housing finance institutions and largely depend on informal housing finance mechanisms in addition to the recently established shelter microfinance institutions. However, both formal and informal shelter-financing institutions have a requirement for savings. Based on empirical investigations in two informal settlements in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, this paper explores the nature of savings in incremental housing development. The findings show that unpacking the concept of savings has the potential to uncover new opportunities for promoting housing finance in informal settlements, other than shelter microfinance.

- **Sheuya, S. A. 2009. “Urban poverty and housing transformations in informal settlements: The case of Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania,” *International Development Planning Review*, 31(1), pp. 81-108.**
 - o Housing is an important asset of the urban poor. Depending on the ability to manage the asset and on the regulatory framework, households can earn income from renting out rooms and move out of poverty. This study is on housing transformations in informal settlements, unlike similar earlier research on government-built housing. Based on empirical investigations in two informal settlements in Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania, the article explores the effects of housing transformations on urban poverty. Owner households earn substantial amounts of income from renting out rooms and from water vending. Grown-up children “nest” in their parents’ homes and use them as working spaces, thus enhancing the stock of social capital in owner households. On the negative side, housing transformation contributes to excessive plot coverage, in-house crowding, occupational health hazards and poor sanitary conditions. Through road encroachment, housing transformation can render settlement structure dysfunctional. The negative externalities undermine efforts to increase household income and to promote health in informal settlements, and are likely to compromise some of the Millennium Development Goals targets in Tanzania. Operationalizing empowerment in informal settlements is one of the most promising ways forward.

- **Skuse, A., and Cousins, T. 2007. “Spaces of resistance: informal settlement, communication and community organization in a Cape Town township,” *Urban Studies*, 44(5/6), pp. 979-995.**
 - o This paper examines struggles for urban permanency in an informal settlement on the fringes of Cape Town in the run up to the South African national election of 2004. It focusses on the rapid emergence of the settlement of Nkanini (Forceful) and the key social, cultural, political and communicative dynamics that framed the ensuing bitter struggle between residents and local City of Cape Town authorities over claims to occupy the land. Analysis frames this struggle in terms of a local appropriation of basic human-rights legislation that informs community action and therein claims to residential formality.

- **Soliman, A.M. 2010. “Rethinking urban informality and the planning process in Egypt,” *International Development Planning Review*, 32(2), pp. 119-143.**
 - o The question of urban informality today concerns the majority of the inhabitants and policymakers of regional metropolises and secondary cities. The first aim of this article is to show that diverse mechanisms are behind the complexity of urban housing informality in Egyptian cities.

It explores the process of an Action Plan and it improves the understanding of the implementation process within informal housing areas. Secondly, it shows how the conditions of informal housing can be formulated at the local level with “technical enablement,” enabling governance of informal housing that facilitates cooperation among various actors. Understanding the built environment of informal housing developments would enable state and housing professionals to *accumulate*, *eliminate*, and *integrate* informal housing areas within formal planning zones, and the value of informal properties should be harnessed to promote development and alleviate poverty. It concludes that the role of the government should be changed from *provider* or *facilitator* into *enabler*.

- **Wekesa, B.W., Steyn, G.S., and Otieno, F.A.O. 2011. “A review of physical and socio-economic characteristics and intervention approaches of informal settlements,” *Habitat International*, 35, pp. 238- 245.**
 - o Informal settlements provide shelter to millions of poor urban dwellers in developing countries. Using a literature survey, this paper reviews physical and socio-economic characteristics and the factors attributed to proliferation of the informal settlements and intervention approaches. The main objective was to establish how such settlements could be improved and hence the quality of life of a majority of the urban population.
 - o Physical and socio-economic conditions found in informal settlements are generally hazardous to health and tend to exacerbate the severe socio-economic conditions of the urban poor as well as environmental pollution and degradation of the local ecosystems. Proliferation of the informal settlements, particularly in most cities of developing countries is as a result of market and public-policy failure for a significant segment of the urban poor population.
 - o Intervention approaches, starting back in the 1950s, include strengthening of public institutions and creation of policies and legislations to address the living environments of the urban poor, reforming building codes and standards, involvement of the private sector in housing provisions and programmes targeting both rural and urban development. Critical examination of these measures suggests the need for self-determination. In addition to these programmes, particularly informal settlement upgrading, this paper advocates the need for building technologies that are responsive to the urban poor and their environment. These are technologies that empower urban poor communities to make their own contribution to the process of improving their living conditions and hence quality of life.
- **Wigle, J. 2008. “Shelter, location, and livelihoods: Exploring the linkages in Mexico City,” *International Planning Studies*, 13(3), pp. 197-222.**
 - o For many low-income households in cities of the developing world, “self-help” or informal housing provides not only their shelter, but also functions as a vital productive asset. The land accessible to the urban poor for informal housing, however, is often remotely located in the urban periphery. While providing access to shelter, such peripheral locations may undermine the potential of shelter to serve as a productive asset, especially for women whose mobility is constrained by their dual roles as caregivers and wage-earners. This research explores how location influences the potential of housing to serve as a productive asset in two informally settled communities in different parts of Mexico City. The paper argues that the “right to shelter” associated with informal housing needs to be “scaled-up” to include the “right to the city” through

closer consideration of the linkages among shelter, location, and livelihoods. Such a policy focus necessarily situates housing in a broader socio-spatial context and would serve to complement the prevailing emphasis on community or place-specific upgrading activities in informal or low-income settlements. Finally, the paper raises questions about the role of planning in improving the livelihood opportunities of lower-income households.

- **Wigle, J. 2010. “Social relations, property and “peripheral” informal settlement: The case of Ampliación San Marcos, Mexico City,” *Urban Studies*, 47(2), pp. 411-436.**
 - o This article explores the complexities of informal urbanization at the metropolitan periphery of Mexico City through a case study of Ampliación San Marcos, a former agricultural area on the city’s south-eastern periphery. While the physical annexation of small towns and their environs is a common feature of Mexico City’s growth, the settlement of Ampliación San Marcos is more accurately described as a two-pronged process involving the extension of a nearby preHispanic town and the expansion of Mexico City itself. The case study shows that the rural periphery of Mexico City is no tabula rasa upon which urban growth simply “takes place,” rather, settlement processes are influenced by longstanding in situ social relations and practices related to property. The paper highlights the importance of considering the relationships among social relations, property and informal settlement for understanding the complexity of metropolitan growth and change in large cities such as Mexico City.

9.2 Informal Land Management and Markets

An obvious trend in this literature, driven by increasing empirical research of the modes by which poor people access housing and land, entails a shift from legalistic conceptions of tenure systems (i.e. according to a sharp legal/illegal dichotomy) towards a broader perspective that recognizes “intermediate levels of legality” as well as socio-psychological factors such as “perceived tenure security” (van Gelder, 2009). Recently there have been numerous studies of informal tenure practices (Few *et al.*, 2004; Hendriks, 2008; Nkurunziza, 2007, 2008) and the interface between formal and informal systems (Marx and Rubin, 2008; Musyoka, 2006). Forms of land and shelter access not according with the neat formal/informal binary, yet fulfilling vital functions within low-income communities, are imperative points of policy attention. For example, Musyoka’s (2006) case study of land subdivision in Eldoret (Kenya) finds that “non-compliant” tenure systems may improve access to land for middle and low-income housing (thereby averting conflict over access to undeveloped land). They further allow residents to avoid “cumbersome and costly” formal procedures for the subdivision and allocation of publicly owned land, while simultaneously providing “relative security of tenure.” Alan Gilbert (2008) is another author who has appealed for tenure-neutral shelter policies. Hendriks (2008) argues for the “viability of a ‘third way’” of hybrid land access through formal collective land purchase and informal land subdivision in sub-Saharan African metropolitan contexts.”

We can observe numerous studies of programmes to formalize land-tenure systems in informal settlements (Barry, 2006; Benjaminsin *et al.*, 2008; Parsa *et al.*, 2010; Magigi and Majani, 2006; Payne *et al.*, 2008), as well as more general critical discussions surrounding conventional settlement upgrading and land management policy and practice (Gilbert, 2002, 2008; Mertins *et al.*, 1998; Toulmin, 2008; van Gelder, 2009). Typically, Basil van Horen (2000) argues that “upgrading should comprise a gradation of strategies that legitimize and integrate aspects of settlements” *de*

facto institutions into the planning process. In so doing, it is possible to contribute to legal regulatory frameworks that are more appropriate to informal settlements.”

Several authors are specifically interested in efforts to reformulate land markets to function better for the urban poor and contribute to poverty reduction (Brown-Luthango, 2010; Marx, 2006, 2007, 2009). Colin Marx has been particularly interested in applying new, integrated conceptions of “the economy” and land markets to land management policy: such conceptions would recognize that formal and informal economic and land practices are interdependent and “co-constitutive.” Marx (2006) argues that two main representations are responsible for confining attempts to make urban land markets work for the poor. The first is the idea that “efficient” (i.e. competitive) land markets are a vital aspect of economic growth, which tends to exclude poor people from accessing favourable and “productive” locations. The second is that poor people’s economic activities are unable to contribute to urban economic growth. Combined, these representations severely undermine efforts to “justify and argue for meaningful changes to the way in which poor people access and exchange land” (Marx, 2006:27).

- **Barry, M. (2006). “Formalizing informal land rights: The case of Marconi Beam to Joe Slovo Park,” *Habitat International*, 30(3), pp. 629-644.**
 - o Providing adequate shelter and improving the lives of people in informal settlements represents a major development challenge. Upgrading informal settlements holds many unique challenges for external agents involved in this process. It is important that these agents understand the social and political dynamics of informal settlements and how these can influence project plans and strategies. Moreover, project planners should also understand how a changing national social and political environment and the general quality of governance in society impact on intervention projects. Social change theory provides a basis for understanding the social and political dynamics of informal settlements. The Marconi Beam informal settlement in Cape Town has been analyzed from a stage of rapid growth in the early 1990s through to the settlement’s demolition, following which people have been living in formal houses in the nearby suburbs of Joe Slovo Park and du Noon for at least three years. This has taken place during a period of far-reaching social, political and economic change in South Africa.
- **Benjaminsin, T.A., Holden, S., Lund, C., and Sjaastad, E. 2008. “Formalization of land rights: Some empirical evidence from Mali, Niger and South Africa,” *Land Use Policy*, 26, pp. 28-35.**
 - o In this paper, we re-interpret three cases of research previously carried out in Mali, Niger and South Africa in light of the recent debate about formalization of land rights that has emerged since the publication of Hernando de Soto’s “Mystery of Capital.” The Malian case shows that lack of broad access to formalization processes in high-pressure areas may play into the hands of those with power, information, and resources. The case also demonstrates that timing of formalization efforts in urban areas characterized by rapid expansion is crucial in terms of distributive outcomes. The Nigerian case demonstrates how impending formalization led to a scramble for land and increased conflicts in a context of institutional competition and limited administrative capacity. The South African case shows that the very process of surveying and registering rights may also change the rights themselves. Formalization procedures may also amplify the tension between individual and communal rights, and boost privatization.

- **Berner, E. 2000. “Learning from informal markets: Innovative approaches to land and housing provision.” Paper presented at the ESF/N-AERUS and UNRISD Workshop: “Cities of the South: Sustainable for whom?,” 3-6 May, Geneva (Switzerland).**
 - o Substandard and insecure housing conditions are recognized as a crucial aspect of urban poverty. In most large cities in the developing world, the formal market serves only a minority of the population. It is estimated that between 30 and 70 per cent live in “irregular” settlements and that up to 85 per cent of the new housing stock is produced in an extra-legal manner, with severe social and environmental consequences. John Turner’s groundbreaking work and the first Habitat conference in Vancouver in 1976 became markers of a paradigm shift towards an enabling and participatory approach to housing provision.
 - o However, little progress has been made in translating the new paradigm into practical and sustainable policies. Relocation schemes, social housing, slum upgrading, and sites and services are beset by two related problems: They are far too small-scale to serve the growing demand, and products are far too expensive to be affordable for low-income groups.
 - o Based on Pal Baross’s argument, the paper states that the conventional sequence of Planning-Servicing-BuildingOccupation is a key factor in both market and state failures. Each of these steps leads to a steep price increase and speculation, and in effect raw land is turned into a scarce and expensive commodity. In informal subdivisions the sequence is reversed. Housing and infrastructure are developed and improved incrementally, according to the needs and capacity of residents. To incorporate this logic into public policies is a promising approach to the alleviation of housing poverty. The paper introduces the Philippines’ “Community Mortgage Programme” and Hyderabad’s incremental development scheme “Khuda ki Basti” as best practices in this direction. Both programmes have effectively enhanced the supply of land and housing for low-income groups, albeit on a very different scale. Their replicability is a question of political will rather than a technical one. Vested interests in both formal and informal land markets are likely to put up stiff resistance against serious reforms in this sector.
- **Brown-Luthango, M. 2010. “Access to land for the urban poor – policy proposals for South African cities,” *Urban Forum*, 21(2), pp. 123-138.**
 - o The issue of land is a critical one in post-Apartheid South Africa. Growing informality and poverty in urban areas, driven to a large extent by urbanization, necessitates greater concerted action around land-use management in urban areas to ensure more equitable, environmentally and socially sustainable use of finite land resources. The operation of the urban land market has been identified as a significant obstacle preventing the urban poor from accessing affordable land. A new approach, advocated by the UK Department for International Development and the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation entitled “Making Markets Work for the Poor—M4P” emerged in the 1990s. The M4P approach recognizes that even successful market development will not distribute land to the poor and intervention in the land market is therefore required to promote more equitable land distribution patterns. The M4P perspective however has been accused of an obsession with economic solutions to the problem of landlessness and informality to the exclusion of other socio-political and legal remedies. The Brazilian case provides an example of a more progressive approach as it combines social policy and legal reform to regulate the use of urban land to ensure that land fulfils its “social function.” The presence of large tracts of vacant and unused land in cities is an important issue in the context

of growing informality and competition for land and therefore requires urgent policy attention. The paper discusses the Brazilian case and the instruments used in that country to deal with vacant/unused land in cities. It argues that the progressive taxation of vacant land in cities could be a potentially valuable policy instrument in South African cities. Land-based fiscal instruments can be utilized by local government to manage the use of land and to access additional revenue that can be redistributed to the poor for the provision of infrastructure and services. Although these tools are not a panacea for challenges of informality and poverty in the developing world, they do have the potential to augment municipal income and to facilitate urban renewal, infill development and a more compact city. The paper argues though that these tools should be applied on a city-wide scale; part and parcel of an overall urban land-reform strategy and plan for the city.

- **Fekade, W. 2000. “Deficits of formal urban land management and informal responses under rapid urban growth, an international perspective,” *Habitat International*, 24(2), pp. 127-150.**
 - o The objectives of public urban land management, namely the provision of affordable buildable urban land in sufficient quantities and guidance of the growth of cities and ensuring their efficient functioning are, on the whole, not being achieved in Sub-Saharan Africa. The main reasons for this are outdated and restrictive land-use control and regulatory standards and unreformed tenure arrangements. The informal sector, unacknowledged and illegal, at best tolerated, has been making up for the inefficiencies of public land management. The informal sector has proven adaptive and responsive and has been providing the bulk of the urban population with buildable urban land. Public housing programmes, sites and services and upgrading have all been attempted as ways of meeting the housing needs of the population with limited success. Yet over time, informal settlements do improve in quality, providing satisfactory living conditions for a large proportion of the urban population. A number of examples of this are examined in the paper. There are lessons to be learned from these cases, which have implications for urban development policy. This paper examines these implications.
- **Few, R., Gouveia, N., Mathee, A., Harpham, T., Cohn, A., Swart, A., and Coulson, N. 2004. “Informal sub-division of residential and commercial buildings in Sao Paulo and Johannesburg: Living conditions and policy implications,” *Habitat International*, 28, pp. 427-442.**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.ehrn.co.za/publications/download/70.pdf>
 - o The spontaneous conversion of formal residential and commercial buildings into high-density, informal housing is a major policy issue in the inner cities of developing countries. Yet there remains little research material to date analyzing the residence dynamics, environmental health and related policy implications of this form of settlement. This paper presents and compares findings from two preliminary studies of informal sub-divided housing in the cities of Sao Paulo, Brazil, and Johannesburg, South Africa. It points to some of the policy implications of the work, in light of broader debate on the management of informal settlements, and calls for further research examining this housing form within developing countries.
- **Gilbert, A. 2002. “On the mystery of capital and the myths of Hernando de Soto: What difference does legal title make?,” *International Development Planning Review*, 24(1), pp. 1-19.**
 - o Hernando de Soto’s new bestseller, *The Mystery of Capital*, attributes the failure of capitalism in the Third World to the lack of property titles. While this is hardly a new argument, it is acquir-

ing renewed momentum because his is a very influential voice within Washington. On hearing his advice, Latin American governments will increase the pace of distribution of title deeds. My question in this paper is to ask what difference the “gift” of a title deed actually makes to the lives of the poor? Does it permit them to borrow money from the formal sector as de Soto and the World Bank claim? Does it open up a new world of capital accumulation for the poor because it now allows property to be transferred legally from one “owner” to another? Or, does it in fact make so little difference that most of the so called advantages of legalisation are a sham? Using data gathered in the now legalized self-help settlements of Bogotá, I will question each of the main benefits of legalization. I will show how sales are sometimes more frequent when people lack legal title, how informal finance is available from the initial formation of an illegal settlement and how little formal finance is forthcoming after legalization. Most importantly, I will show that there is little sign of a secondary housing market developing in legalized settlements. It is hard for the poor to make money from home ownership when they cannot sell their houses.

- **Gilbert, A. 2008. “Viewpoint: Slums, tenants and home-ownership: On blindness to the obvious,” *International Development Planning Review*, 30(2), pp. i-x.**
 - o Up to one billion tenants may be living in cities across the globe, but most governments continue to ignore them. Insofar as they recognize that tenants exist, the policy is to turn them into home-owners. Even in the UK and US, where this strategy has been underway for some years, it has not managed to reduce the numbers of tenants during the last decade. With the sub-prime crisis, the proportion of tenants is likely to rise. In the rest of the world, few governments recognize that renting is an essential shelter option. This viewpoint demonstrates why tenants and landlords are not likely to disappear, and explains why, for many, renting is a vital housing option. Fundamentally, it is a plea for a tenure-neutral shelter policy.
- **Hendriks, B. 2008. “The social and economic impacts of peri-urban access to land and secure tenure for the poor: The case of Nairobi, Kenya,” *International Development Planning Review*, 30(1), pp. 27-66.**
 - o The current research on urban land markets suggests that the social and economic impacts of land access are higher when land tenure is formalized and integrated into the formal economy. Research in sub-Saharan African cities suggests that informal systems can be a gradual and more equal alternative. This paper analyzes the process, social and economic impacts of access to land and tenure by poor households moving from informal settlements to the periurban areas of Nairobi through studying six recent cases of land-buying cooperatives, trusts and societies, including one case in which the poor actually relocated. It indicates the viability of a “third way” of hybrid land access through formal collective land purchase and informal land subdivision in sub-Saharan African metropolitan contexts. It demonstrates beneficial economic impacts of investments in housing improvements and renting rooms as alternatives to collateralized lending, and how these can be further increased through process optimization and inclusive (peri-)urban land governance.
- **Ikejiofor, U. 2006. “Equity in informal land delivery: Insights from Enugu, Nigeria,” *Land Use Policy*, 23, pp. 448-459.**
 - o Mounting exclusionary forces have made the task of achieving equity in urban land delivery more elusive than it has ever been. Statistics show that, in practice, most land for urban devel-

opment (especially that occupied by the poor) is supplied outside state regulatory frameworks, and there is overwhelming evidence of the importance of secure access to land and housing to the livelihood strategies of poor urban households. This paper, therefore, explores the issue of equity in informal channels of land delivery by drawing from insights gained from recently concluded DFID-funded research of informal land-delivery processes and access to land for the poor in Enugu, Nigeria. It finds that escalating costs and the resistance of pre-capitalist elements (some aspects of traditional culture) have meant that informal channels of land delivery are increasingly failing to meet equity concerns in providing access to land in cities, and that poor city immigrants and other vulnerable groups, especially women, are particularly disadvantaged.

- **Jenkins, P. 2001. “Regularizing ‘informality’: Turning the legitimate into legal? Land reform and emerging urban land markets in post-Socialist Mozambique.” Paper prepared for the N-AERUS Workshop: “Coping with Informality and illegality in human settlements in developing cities” (Leuven).**
 - o Land has been nationalized in Mozambique since Independence in 1975, despite the new 1990 Constitution which specified a market economy. Recent national land reform in 1997 maintained state custodianship of land, with usufruct titles, however land is becoming increasingly commodified – especially in the capital city, Maputo. This paper draws on research undertaken by the author in 1998/99 which identified the emerging urban land markets, and more recent research in late 2000, which has investigated the nature of “informal” land access and the impact of the emerging residential land markets on the urban poor. The weak nature of the state and the market in Mozambique and resulting unregulated speculative market activity in urban land is tending to lead to exclusive benefit of the political, administrative and economic elites and undermine any benefit of public land ownership for the urban poor majority. In this situation informal land management has more legitimacy than the formal system, as is reflected in central government’s promotion of urban land reform in Mozambique, where the stated objective is to “turn the legitimate into legal.” This approach assumes simplistic concepts of legality, which are based on the binary and negative concepts of “informal” as opposed to “formal,” and not on cultural attitudes to land. In addition, given the weakness of the state and the limited interests of the formal market, this approach runs the risk of further exacerbating the situation of the poor unless it draws on the resources of civil society. This paper reviews the conceptual and practical bases for alternative urban land management in Mozambique, with broader relevance for urban land access for the poor in the developing world.
- **Kombe, W.J., and Kreibich, V. 2000. “Reconciling informal and formal land management: An agenda for improving tenure security and urban governance in poor countries,” *Habitat International*, 24(2), pp. 231- 240.**
 - o This paper is concerned with the agenda for reconciling informal and formal institutions and procedures of urban land management in developing countries. It argues that progress can be made in overcoming the deficits of the formal system by gradual integration of the informal sector into decision-making concerned with housing land supply, security of tenure rights, lay-out regulation and land servicing. Studies of informal housing land development in Tanzania offer ample evidence about the close linkages between the two sectors. Success in this area would require the recognition of existing informal institutions, the decentralization of land-management responsibilities and the extension of current urban planning legislation to cover such situations. The paper concludes that if the potential of the informal sector is tapped in land regularization,

then the legal framework for property and land management must provide a clear separation of ownership rights and land-use prescriptions. The public sector should retain the right to define principles and concepts for the distribution and assignment of land use, while individual entitlement to private property ownership should be guaranteed and protected.

- **Kreibich, V. 2000. “Editorial: Informal land management: An introduction,” *Habitat International*, 24(2), pp. 121-125.**
 - o ...The unprecedented growth of informal settlements in the 1980s and 1990s amidst economic stagnation or decline has generated fears about an urban crisis that might emanate from the increasing inequality of housing conditions and from the continued decrease of environmental quality in urban areas, but research on the forces that generate and sustain informal settlements is by far incomplete. This collection of papers is trying to widen the scope of our knowledge by focussing on informal urban land management as a response to public-sector deficits and thus drawing attention to the inherent potentials of self-regularized settlement development...
- **Magigi, W., and Majani, B.B.K. 2006. “Community involvement in land regularization for informal settlements in Tanzania: A strategy for enhancing security of tenure in residential neighborhoods,” *Habitat International*, 30, pp. 1066-1081.**
 - o This paper documents and analyzes how landholders managed to uplift status of their neighborhood from hazard land as designated by the 1978 master plan to a regularized residential settlement through land regularization in Dar es Salaam city. Specifically, it explores policy framework governing land regularization and how the local community explored the opportunities it offers. Documents the local community planning and land regularization processes undertaken, focussing on land-use planning, drainage construction, and cadastral survey and discusses how financial resources were raised, trust was built as well as factors that sustained community involvement towards meeting their interests of securing tenure. The paper also draws challenges facing land-regularization policy and recommends areas for further interventions commensurate with the human-dimension challenges in securing tenure. Underlying community involvement, those aspects of community connected to the idea of social capital, namely existence of committed leadership in land-development matters, embracing mechanisms for participatory decision-making processes and educational background of local leaders, were particularly important in determining success for the case. Others include economic ability to contribute, high proportion of landholder settlers, land-conflict task force formulation, local consensus to solve commonly felt problems, existence of strong community organization, and unwritten norms put in place to regulate individual behaviour in building construction. Weak legal recognition of informal settlement, lengthy and bureaucratic procedures in planning and approval of regularization plans, weak knowledge on land management matters, short-term title deeds with low financial betterments and political popularity are identified as critical challenges. Some recommendations put forward include formalization of the grassroots role in decision-making, decentralizing some land-development control functions to sub-ward leaders, and training the same in basic land-management matters. Others include definition of norms, by-laws and government facilitation of informal land parcelling. Besides, community support should be sought so as to create partnership in the promotion of security of tenure in informal areas. The study concludes that, unless land-development activities ongoing in informal settle-

ments are closely monitored and regulated as the settlements grow, it will be too costly socially and economically to retrofit once the settlement have identified.

- **Marx, C. 2006. “Conceptualizing “the economy” to make urban land markets work for the poor,” Urban LandMark Position Paper 3, prepared for the Urban Land Seminar, November 2006, Muldersdrift (South Africa).**
 - o This paper suggests that to make urban land markets work for poor people it is necessary to engage in activities that reconceptualise dominant understandings of “the economy” and especially, one of the key economic processes – economic growth. This is because the way in which researchers and policy makers currently perceive urban poverty, urban land markets, and their interrelationship already contains an implicit understanding of a relationship between poor people and “the economy” that ultimately restricts contemporary attempts to reduce poverty. In order to capitalize on the extensive research on how poor people access urban land, it is necessary to use this work to re-place (land) markets within a broader, more diverse understanding of “the economy” and economic growth.
- **Marx, C. 2007. “Do informal land markets work for poor people? An assessment of three metropolitan cities in South Africa: Literature review.” Urban LandMark.**
 - o Available free online at <http://isandla.org.za/publications/89/>
 - o The literature on urban land generally suggests that there is a straightforward, albeit complex, relationship between (formal) urban land-management processes and land markets and informal land markets. Researchers and policymakers understand that the interplay of urban management processes and markets either “force” or encourage people to resort to informal land arrangements. On one side, urban land management processes and policies and the land market are arrayed to constitute formality. On the other side, the somewhat anarchic and unregulated activities (usually of poor people) are gathered together under the rubric of informality. Separating the two is a range of “barriers to entry” inherent in the formal policies and urban land-management systems and the market.
 - o In this review however, we argue that for researchers and policymakers to suggest that there is a uni-directional relationship between informal land dynamics and land-management processes is only half the story: Informal land dynamics and land management processes are more complexly intertwined than the current literature suggests. There is a need to think about how processes in different parts of the city co-constitute each other and gain their meaning and social value in the overall process we call the social production of the city (Calderón Cockburn 1999a). As will become evident through the review, the view that informality and formality co-constitute each other has serious implications for interventions in urban land systems, in that it opens up new possibilities for addressing the land processes that appear to impoverish large numbers of urban residents.
 - o The aim of this review is to provide an overview of two distinct sets of literature that are often related and sometimes overlap. The first is the literature related to informal market dynamics and understandings of informality. The second includes an international review of the dynamics and management of urban land systems, but with a specific emphasis on countries in the South.

- **Marx, C. 2009. “Conceptualizing the potential of informal land markets to reduce urban poverty,” *International Development Planning Review*, 31(4), pp. 335-353.**
 - o There is a strong argument that the formalization of informal land markets can reduce urban poverty. In this view, the potential to reduce poverty lies in the ability of the state to introduce appropriate forms of formality and the intrinsic abilities of markets to generate wealth. Pointing to evidence that the results of formalization initiatives have been less impressive in practice, I argue that one of the reasons is a failure to analyze informal land markets in their own terms. Drawing on evidence from informal land markets in informal settlements in three of South Africa’s metropolitan areas, I demonstrate how informal land markets can be seen in their own terms, and the difference this makes to analyzing their potential to reduce poverty.

- **Marx, C., and Rubin, M. 2008. “Divisible spaces’: Land biographies in Diepkloof, Thokoza and Doornfontein, Gauteng.” Final draft report prepared for Urban LandMark.**
 - o Available free online at <http://www.urbanlandmark.org.za/downloads/Land%20Biographies%20Full%20Report%20LowRes.PDF>
 - o Land-use management is the formal and informal process of dividing spaces: physical spaces, imagined spaces, mapped spaces, legal spaces, ethnic spaces, public spaces... This report explores how urban land is endlessly divided and re-divided within the context of the interaction of formal and informal land-use management systems. What processes, practices, techniques and power are required to make it possible to divide spaces in smaller or larger parcels? It is important to understand these processes and practices because the divisions have direct consequences for what activities happens where, whether resources are distributed or concentrated and who controls different activities. The interface between formal and informal land-use management systems is a very complex context in which to analyze how land is accessed, held, and traded by poorer urban people. However, this research shows that the interface between what is considered formal and informal land-use management is a site that generates rich insights into the nature of how poor people use urban land, and provides a resource for future progressive practice.
 - o The aim of this project is an attempt to understand and unpack how urban land has moved through formal and informal systems of land management over time. It is an experiment intended to add to the growing body of theoretical and empirical work on land, land use, administration and management in South Africa. The report demonstrates some of the complexities that exist in relation to these issues, and documents the co-existence of various systems within the same spaces, as well as multiple formal and informal systems, which at points cohere and dovetail, but which also come into conflict with each other, as people in each system “fight” for a particular logic to take precedence.

- **Mertins, G., Popp, J., and Wehrmann, B. 1998. “Land tenure and land regularisation in informal urban settlements in developing countries.” GTZ (Germany).**
 - o “Security of land tenure actually forms the cornerstone in informal settlement development. This occurs in accordance with the globally recognized “right of housing” as a human right. In Chapters 2 and 3, types of land tenure, informal land claims and resulting conflicts in cities in developing countries were summarized. These conflicts have been known since the 1970s. The same holds true to a somewhat lesser extent for problems associated with public regularization of

urban informal settlements (Chapter 5.6), but is not at all applicable to the understanding of the complexities of land markets in informal settlements (Chapter 4). Neither does it apply to options available to provide security of tenure (Chapter 5.3). A considerable need for research exists here. There is an equally large deficit in development cooperation projects in applying or testing alternative methods, in particular options for preventive management (Chapter 6)...” (p. 68).

- **Musyoka, R. 2006. “Non-compliance and formalization: Mutual accommodation in land subdivision processes in Eldoret, Kenya,” *International Development Planning Review*, 28(2), pp. 235-261.**
 - o Conflicts over land are central to Kenya’s political economy. In particular, the displacement of indigenous inhabitants during the process of establishing settler agriculture and the association of dispossession and land claims with particular ethnic groups has continued to fuel conflict and drive government attempts to develop appropriate policies and legislation. Colonial attempts to resolve the problems of overcrowding in “native reserves” led to a land tenure system based on freehold title, even for African farmers. The concepts of individual title and a commercial land market have, therefore, been embedded in the consciousness of black Kenyans from before independence. In many urban centres, the laws on tenure and subdivision and the prevalence of private ownership have given rise to extreme shortages of land for low-income residential development and conflict over access to undeveloped land. The situation in Eldoret is different. Even though the town is located in the centre of a former settler agricultural area, plentiful supplies of plots for middle- and low-income housing are provided through informal subdivision, and relations between the government agencies responsible for regulating land and informal subdividers are generally good, even though many of the former disapprove of the activities of the latter. Some areas have been regularized, and even in those that have not, most plot owners enjoy relative security of tenure. The paper describes the processes at work, examines the extent and nature of non-compliance, analyzes the responses of local government and explains why relations between the social actors involved are generally accommodating rather than conflictual.
- **Nkurunziza, E. 2007. “Informal mechanisms for accessing and securing urban land rights: The case of Kampala, Uganda,” *Environment and Urbanization*, 19(2), pp. 509-526.**
 - o There is a growing consensus in research that informal settlements are not as chaotic as often portrayed. The processes through which households in these settlements access housing land are not anarchic but structured and regulated by some form of social ordering. This paper analyzes and explains the nature of the institutions that actually regulate and underpin land-delivery processes in Kampala’s informal settlements. Contemporary land-access processes are examined in three case-study settlements where institutions that are responsive to the local contexts have been developed and utilized. These non-state institutions are shown to be eclectic in nature, drawing on various normative orders including state law, rules of market exchange and customary practices. Their success in delivering large quantities of housing land is attributed to the social legitimacy they command, evidenced by the general acceptance and respect they enjoy from those whose relations they regulate.

- **Nkurunziza, E. 2008. “Understanding informal urban land access processes from a legal pluralist perspective: The case of Kampala, Uganda,” *Habitat International*, 32, pp. 109-120.**
 - o There is an emerging consensus in recent research on urban land that informal settlements do not exist in a Hobbesian state of nature and that the processes through which households living therein access housing land are not anarchic but are structured and regulated by some form of social ordering. Starting from a legal pluralist standpoint, this paper analyzes and explains the nature of the institutions that actually regulate and underpin land-delivery processes in Kampala’s informal settlements. By examining contemporary land-access processes in three case-study settlements, it is argued that in situations where actors in land-delivery processes are unable to deploy the often expensive and cumbersome formal approaches, institutions that are responsive to the local contexts have been developed and utilized. These non-state institutions are shown to be eclectic in nature, drawing on various normative orders, including state law, rules of market exchange, and customary practices. Their success in delivering large quantities of housing land is attributed to the social legitimacy they command, encapsulated by their general acceptance and respect by those whose relations they regulate.

- **Parsa, A., Nakendo, F., McCluskey, W.J., and Page, M.W. 2010. “Impact of formalization of property rights in informal settlements: Evidence from Dar es Salaam city,” *Land Use Policy*, doi:10.1016/j.landusepol.2010.12.005.**
 - o This paper aims to study the responsiveness of the informal property market and management systems towards the introduction of land registration for informal settlements in Tanzania. City governments are increasingly recognizing the need to strengthen legal rights for the urban poor as a means to bring them more effectively into the urban economy and ensure better provision of water, sanitation and other primary services. The research focuses on Tanzania and in particular two case studies within Dar es Salaam. The findings of the work suggest that the introduction of residential licences while potentially assisting in creating legal certainty has not resulted in the financial sector accepting them as full security against loans. Accessing credit by the poor, however, has not yet been fully realized, resulting in some further hurdles for the financial sector to overcome. Finally, and of some significance, is that registration of property in the informal settlements has provided the opportunity of formal property transactions within these settlements.

- **Payne, G., Durand-Lasserve, A., Rakodi, C., Marx, C., and Ndiaye, S. 2008. “Social and economic impacts of land titling programmes in urban and peri-urban areas: International experience and case studies of Senegal and South Africa.” Government of Norway, Swedish International Development Agency, and UN-Habitat.**
 - o Available free online at <https://www.birmingham.ac.uk/Documents/college-social-sciences/government-society/idd/research/social-economic-impacts/social-economic-impacts-final.pdf>

- **Rakodi, C. 2007. “Land for housing in African cities: Are informal delivery systems institutionally robust and pro-poor?,” *Global Urban Development*, 3(1), pp. 1-14.**
 - o In the early years of rapid rural-urban migration and urban growth, many poor households were able to get access to land to manage the construction of their own houses for little or no payment, through claims to family land, “squatting” or similar arrangements. Following research in the 1960s and 1970s, there was a feeling that the processes of “squatting” and allocation

of customary land by legitimate rights holders, as well as more complex variations on these in some cities, were fairly well understood. Upgrading policies and projects of the 1970s and 1980s were designed and implemented on this basis. However, even though, in recent years, informal land-delivery processes have provided half or more of all residential land in African cities, research has concentrated on analyzing the shortcomings of formal land administration rather than understanding how these processes have been evolving. As a result, the land policy and administration reforms on which many countries have embarked since the 1970s have not only concentrated on rural land but have also often been ill-informed and ineffective with respect to urban land. In addition, they have lacked legitimacy, giving rise to difficulties of compliance and enforcement, in part because they are not based on an understanding of the social rules governing how people act in partly commercialized informal land systems. This paper will report on some of the findings from a recent research project that examined contemporary informal land-delivery systems in five medium-sized cities in Anglophone Africa: Eldoret in Kenya, Kampala in Uganda, Maseru in Lesotho, Gaborone in Botswana, and Enugu in Nigeria. The aim of the project was to improve understanding of informal urban land-development processes. It analysed the characteristics of contemporary informal land markets and delivery systems...

- **Tipple, G. 2004. "Settlement upgrading and home-based enterprises: Discussions from empirical data," *Cities*, 21(5), pp. 371-379.**
 - o This paper seeks to add to the sparse literature on the relationship between home-based enterprises (HBEs) and upgrading by interrogating data in four surveys of 150 HBE operating households carried out in a DFID-sponsored study in Cochabamba, New Delhi, Surabaya and Pretoria. It finds that HBEs increase income substantially, and provide services, such as local shops, that should be regarded as essential for low-income households. The evidence on the effect of better servicing on HBEs is generally positive. The spatial implications of HBEs are complex. Their presence takes away domestic space, and this is found to be important where space is very scarce (in Delhi). The paper suggests that upgrading should introduce service levels suitable for considerable HBE activity and, in very crowded conditions, consider measures to increase dwelling size where possible.
- **Toulmin, C. 2008. "Securing land and property rights in sub-Saharan Africa: The role of local institutions," *Land Use Policy*, 26, pp. 10-19.**
 - o Central governments have neither the capacity nor the local knowledge to implement a just, large-scale national landregistration system. Support for local institutions to undertake intermediate forms of land registration has been shown to be far more effective in many places – although these need careful checks on abuses by powerful local (and external) interests, measures to limit disputes (too many of which can overwhelm any institution) and measures to ensure that the needs of those with the least power – typically women, migrants, tenants and pastoralists – are given due weight. These locally grounded systems can also provide the foundation for more formal registration systems, as needs and government capacities develop. Even if there are the funds and the institutional capacity to provide formal land-title registration to everyone in ways that are fair and that recognize local diversity and complexity, and could manage disputes, this may often not be needed. For the vast majority of people, cheaper, simpler, locally grounded systems of rights registration can better meet their needs for secure tenure.

- **van Gelder, J. 2009. “Legal tenure security, perceived tenure security and housing improvement in Buenos Aires: An Attempt towards Integration,” *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 33(1), pp. 126-146.**
 - o This article critically reviews several claims underlying different positions in the debate on tenure legalization, and empirically investigates them in a low-income settlement in Buenos Aires, Argentina. Even though both tenure legality, in the form of property titles, and perceived tenure security have separately been shown to influence housing improvement, most research has taken a relatively rudimentary approach to their measurement, and little work has been done to examine their interrelations. These issues are taken up in the present article in which the legal-illegal tenure dichotomy embedded in standard perspectives on legalization is broadened to include intermediate levels of legality, and subsequently linked to a social-psychological perspective on perceived tenure security. The question of to what extent property titles facilitate access to credit is also examined. The results show that tenure legality and perceived tenure security are in fact closely related in the settlement under study, as higher levels of legality also imply higher perceived tenure security. Furthermore, both tenure legality and perceived tenure security are significant predictors of housing improvement and, consequently, settlement development. There was, however, no relation between tenure legality and access to credit.

- **van Horen, B. 2000. “Informal settlement upgrading: Bridging the gap between the de facto and the de jure,” *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 19, pp. 389-400.**
 - o In order for informal settlement upgrading to build the institutions necessary to ensure continuity of the improvement process, planners must move beyond a narrow concern with legality and illegality. Upgrading should comprise a gradation of strategies that legitimize and integrate aspects of settlements’ de facto institutions into the planning process. In so doing, it is possible to contribute to legal regulatory frameworks that are more appropriate to informal settlements. This article considers planning, tenure delivery, and public participation as three aspects of a recent upgrade in South Africa, and the extent to which they bridged the gap between the *de jure* and *de facto*.

About WIEGO: Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing is a global research-policy-action network that seeks to improve the status of the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy. WIEGO builds alliances with, and draws its membership from, three constituencies: membership-based organizations of informal workers, researchers and statisticians working on the informal economy, and professionals from development agencies interested in the informal economy. WIEGO pursues its objectives by helping to build and strengthen networks of informal worker organizations; undertaking policy analysis, statistical research and data analysis on the informal economy; providing policy advice and convening policy dialogues on the informal economy; and documenting and disseminating good practice in support of the informal workforce. For more information visit: www.wiego.org.

About Inclusive Cities: The Inclusive Cities project aims to strengthen membership-based organizations (MBOs) of the working poor in the areas of organizing, policy analysis and advocacy, in order to ensure that urban informal workers have the tools necessary to make themselves heard within urban planning processes. Inclusive Cities is a collaboration of MBOs of the working poor, international alliances of MBOs and those supporting the work of MBOs. For more information visit www.inclusivecities.org.



Women in Informal Employment
Globalizing and Organizing