

# Review of Value Chain Analyses in the Commodities and Horticulture Sectors

Roles, Constraints and Opportunities for Informal Workers



Women in Informal Employment  
Globalizing and Organizing

## **About WIEGO**

Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing is a global research-policy-action network that seeks to improve the status of the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy. WIEGO builds alliances with, and draws its membership from, three constituencies: membership-based organizations of informal workers, researchers and statisticians working on the informal economy, and professionals from development agencies interested in the informal economy. WIEGO pursues its objectives by helping to build and strengthen networks of informal worker organizations; undertaking policy analysis, statistical research and data analysis on the informal economy; providing policy advice and convening policy dialogues on the informal economy; and documenting and disseminating good practice in support of the informal workforce.

For more information see [www.wiego.org](http://www.wiego.org).

## **About the Author**

This report was prepared by Man-Kwun Chan. Man-Kwun is an independent consultant specializing in gender, social development and ethical supply chain issues.

# Contents

<b>Review of Value Chain Analyses in the Commodities Sector .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Roles, Constraints and Opportunities for Informal Workers .....	1
1.1 Background and Purpose of the Review .....	4
1.2 Methodology, Scope and Limitations of the Review 1.2.1 Scope of the Review .....	4
1.3 How this Report is Structured .....	10
<b>2. Available Literature on Value Chains &amp; Informal Workers in the Commodities Sector: Overview &amp; List of References.....</b>	<b>10</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	10
2.2 Overview of the Literature: Coverage and Key Gaps.....	11
2.3 Summary Table of all Resources Reviewed .....	13
2.4 Alphabetical List of References (Including Summaries for 16 Key Resources) .....	17
<b>3. Roles and Conditions of Informal Workers: Key Findings from the Literature .....</b>	<b>33</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	33
3.2 Informal Workers in Formal Enterprises (Workers In Packhouses, Processing Units and Commercial Farms) .....	34
3.3 Owners of Informal Enterprises (Smallholders, Small-Scale Processors, Traders) ....	40
3.4 Informal Workers in Informal Enterprises (Hired Labour Employed by Smallholders).....	48
3.5 Contributing Family Labour (Unpaid Family Labour on Smallholdings, etc.).....	49
<b>4. Actions and Policies to Support Informal Workers: Key Findings from the Literature .....</b>	<b>53</b>
4.1 Introduction .....	53
4.2 Recommended Policies and Actions to Support Waged Workers .....	53
4.3 Recommended Policies and Actions to Support Owners of Informal Enterprises .....	56
4.4 Recommendations to Support Contributing Family Labour.....	59
<b>5. Can Value Chain Analysis Help Informal Workers? – A Critique .....</b>	<b>60</b>
5.1 Introduction .....	60
5.2 Strengths and Limitations of VCA as a Tool To Help Informal Workers.....	60
5.3 Recommendations on How to Make VCAs More Effective at Helping Informal Workers .....	61

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1 Background and Purpose of the Review

This review has been commissioned by Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) in order to inform its key constituencies – namely, informal workers’ organizations, development agencies and researchers – about the following:

- the current situation faced by informal workers in global commodity value chains, in particular women workers, and what policies and actions need to be implemented by whom in order to improve their income and working conditions
- the strengths and limitations of value chain analysis (VCA) as an approach or tool for (a) increasing understanding about informal workers, in particular women workers, in global value chains, and (b) supporting the adoption of appropriate policies and actions that will bring about concrete improvements for these workers

From its inception, WIEGO understood the importance of value chain analysis as an approach for understanding and addressing the issues faced by informal workers in global value chains. At the same, WIEGO also recognized that most value chain analyses tend to focus only on the *firms or entrepreneurs* in the value chain, and ignore the role of the *workers* – particularly informal workers – employed by these firms as key stakeholders in the chain. Therefore, in the early 2000s, WIEGO’s Global Trade Programme undertook pioneering work to develop approaches to global value chain analysis that properly took into account the roles, contribution and constraints faced by informal workers. The programme also supported the application of these approaches, conducting a number of country studies on the conditions faced by informal workers in the garment and non-timber forest products sectors.

However, since the early 2000s WIEGO’s focus has shifted away from VCAs; moreover, to date WIEGO has conducted little research on the roles and conditions of informal workers in *agricultural* value chains. This study has therefore been commissioned to address both these gaps: to inform WIEGO constituencies about the situation of informal workers in global agricultural value chains, and to update them on recent developments in VCA in terms of its contribution to addressing informal worker issues.

## 1.2 Methodology, Scope and Limitations of the Review

### 1.2.1 Scope of the Review

The review was entirely based on secondary literature and did not include any primary field research. The consultant was asked to review all reports and resources that met all of the following criteria:

- constituted or included a value chain analysis of the export cocoa, coffee, tea or horticulture sectors
- included a significant description and analysis of the roles and conditions of informal workers in the relevant chains
- were freely available on the Internet
- were published since 1995
- are published in the English language

Because of the limited number of resources identified that actually met all of the above criteria, the scope of the literature review was expanded to include other types of resources that were judged to contribute to the overall purpose of the review. The types of additional resources included are described in more detail in **Section 2.2**. An explanation of the working definitions used for “value chain analysis” and “informal workers,” and of how they were arrived at, is provided in **Sections 1.2.3** and **1.2.4** respectively.

## **1.2.2 The Review Process: Key Steps**

The literature review involved the following key steps:

### **STEP 1: REVIEW OF CURRENT DEFINITIONS AND USAGE OF THE TERMS “VALUE CHAIN ANALYSIS” AND “INFORMAL WORKERS”**

This included development of working definitions of both terms for the purpose of the review (see **Sections 1.2.3** and **1.2.4**).

### **STEP 2: IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCES THAT POTENTIALLY FELL WITHIN THE SCOPE OF THE REVIEW**

**Section 1.2.5** below provides a summary of the key search terms and approaches used. Overall, approximately 70 resources were identified as being potentially relevant for inclusion in the review.

### **STEP 3: INITIAL REVIEW OF “LONG LIST” AND CATEGORIZATION OF SHORTLISTED RESOURCES**

The consultant then carried out an initial review of the 70 long-listed resources, in order to determine whether they fell within the scope of the review. On the basis of this initial review, the consultant realized that there were relatively few resources (only nine in total) that satisfied the criteria for inclusion in the review. Moreover, collectively these nine resources did not provide sufficient information on several key categories of informal workers that are of relevance to the study. As explained above, the consultant therefore decided to expand the scope of the review to include certain types of additional resources that were judged to contribute to the overall purpose of the study. Based on this approach, 49 resources were short listed for inclusion in the review, and these were then categorized into the following four types (see **Section 2.2** below):

- **Category 1:** Systematic value chain analyses incorporating a labour perspective (i.e., resources that fall within the pre-defined scope of the review)
- **Category 2:** Empirical value chain impact studies
- **Category 3:** Overview value chain impact studies
- **Category 4:** Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses

### **STEP 4: PREPARATION OF SUMMARIES AND DETAILED REVIEW OF THE MOST RELEVANT RESOURCES**

The consultant then conducted a detailed review of 16 out of the 49 short-listed resources that were judged to be most relevant to the pre-defined scope and purpose of the review. These were comprised of:

- all resources in Category 1

- the seven resources in Category 2 that were judged to include the most detailed analysis of the roles and conditions of informal workers, and which collectively provided sufficient information on the different types of informal workers of relevance to this study

Summaries of these 16 resources were prepared; these have been incorporated into the annotated literature list in **Section 2.3** below; relevant findings from each of these resources have also been incorporated into the review findings in **Section 3** of the report.

#### **STEP 5: PREPARATION OF REFERENCE LIST FOR ALL REMAINING SHORTLISTED RESOURCES**

Due to time constraints, it was unfortunately not possible to carry out a detailed review of the remaining 33 short-listed resources. However, full citation details and website links (where available) for each of these resources have been included in **Section 2.3**.

### **1.2.3 What is a “Value Chain Analysis”?**

#### **WORKING DEFINITION OF “VALUE CHAIN ANALYSIS”**

For the purposes of this review, a “value chain analysis” (VCA) was defined as any study which:

- describes the roles of the different actors involved in the production and trade of a commodity, and the costs, benefits, opportunities and/or constraints accrued/faced by each actor; and
- describes the relationships between these different actors in the chain.

#### **HOW THIS DEFINITION WAS ARRIVED AT**

Searches on Google and Google Scholar revealed that there are few clear definitions of what constitutes a VCA, and that there is certainly no widely accepted “standard” definition of what such an analysis entails.

Since no clear definition could be identified, the author therefore explored how VCA is used in practice by practitioners. A wide range of approaches was found. Virtually all self-proclaimed VCAs include some kind of analysis of the relationships between key economic actors along a product’s supply chain, and usually an assessment of the costs, benefits and/or constraints accrued/faced by each chain actor. However, beyond these common elements, VCAs vary considerably both in terms of the *purpose* they serve and the *scope* of the analysis. The author therefore decided to use these common elements as the basis of the working definition of VCA for this review.

#### **VARIATION IN THE PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF VCAS**

As noted by Mayoux and Mackie (2007), the variation in purpose of VCAs is not surprising given the wide range of individuals and institutions who use the approach. VCAs are used by global businesses, industry analysts, researchers, agricultural development specialists, gender specialists, and development economists, as well as workers’ rights activists. They variously use VCAs to help increase profits for an individual business, increase national foreign exchange earnings, contribute to growth in GDP, identify the distribution of economic costs and benefits along the chain, and contribute to poverty reduction in a general sense, as well as to help promote workers’ rights.

Reflecting this variability in the purpose of VCAs, the scope of analysis varies widely from study to study. Thus, VCAs variously include one or more of the following elements, but hardly any VCAs include them all:

- an analysis of the *power relations* between the different economic actors in the chain, sometimes referred to as the “governance” structure
- an analysis of the flow of *information or knowledge* between actors in the chain, which relates to but is not necessarily the same as the flow of physical goods
- an analysis of *where (economic) value is created and/or captured* in the chain
- an analysis of the *institutional and social context* in which value chain actors operate, in other words an analysis of the role of *non-commercial actors* (e.g., governments, NGOs, trade unions, inter-governmental bodies and other standard setting bodies) in influencing the actions and relations between the different commercial actors
- an analysis of the extent to which the *most vulnerable actors* in the chain (e.g., small-scale producers) are benefiting or could benefit in the future from value chain activities
- an analysis of the roles, conditions and rights of *employees* in the chain

#### **IMPLICATIONS FOR THIS REVIEW**

The variability in the purpose and scope of existing VCAs has an important implication for this review, namely, that few VCAs actually set out to address issues faced by workers, whether formal or informal. This is borne out by the detailed assessment of the coverage of VCAs reviewed (see **Section 2.1** below), which confirms that few VCAs provide information on the roles and conditions of informal workers other than smallholders. It is for this reason that the author decided to expand the scope of the review to include additional types of (non-VCA) studies that were judged to be relevant to the overall purpose of the review.

#### **1.2.4 Who are “Informal Workers” in the Context of Commodity Value Chains?**

##### **WORKING DEFINITION OF “INFORMAL WORKERS”**

The working definition of “informal workers” used by this review was based on the definition and categorisation of “informal jobs” set out by the International Labour Office in 2002.<sup>1</sup> Thus, for the purposes of this review, an informal worker is anyone who engages in one or more informal jobs, and an “informal job” is defined as any job that falls outside the framework of regulations. This may occur either because: (a) the enterprise in which the job is located is too small and/or not registered under commercial law; and/or (b) the employment status associated with the job is “atypical” and is therefore not specifically covered by labour legislation, or labour legislation has not been tested in application to that type of job. It should be noted that, according to the above definition, informal workers can be found in formal as well as informal enterprises, and an owner-manager of an informal enterprise is considered an informal worker by virtue of the informal status of his or her enterprise.

---

<sup>1</sup> See: International Labour Office. 2002. *Report VI: Decent Work and the Informal Economy. Sixth Item on the Agenda, International Labour Conference, 90<sup>th</sup> Session, 2002*. Geneva: International Labour Office.

## **DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF INFORMAL JOBS**

Different types of informal jobs can therefore be categorized based on (a) the type of enterprise in which the job takes place, and (b) the employment status associated with the job in question, as below:

Types of informal jobs found in **formal sector enterprises** are:

- employees employed in atypical jobs, such as those on casual or temporary contracts
- contributing (i.e., “unpaid”) family labour

Types of informal jobs found in **informal sector enterprises** are:

- own-account workers and employers – people who own their own informal sector enterprises and thus are considered “informal” workers by virtue of the informal status of their enterprise
- employees employed in atypical jobs, such as on casual or temporary contracts
- contributing (i.e., “unpaid”) family labour
- members of informal producer cooperatives

Types of informal jobs found in **households** are:

- producers of goods for own final use by their household (e.g., subsistence farming)
- paid domestic workers

## **DIFFERENT TYPES OF INFORMAL WORKERS FOUND IN GLOBAL COMMODITY VALUE CHAINS**

Using the categorization of informal jobs outlined above, informal workers found in global commodity supply chains can be divided into the following key groups:

- **Seasonal, temporary, casual and contract workers on commercial farms/plantations and in commercial packing and processing units** – These people work for formal enterprises, but are considered informal workers because they are employed in “atypical” jobs.
- **Smallholders, and small-scale processors and traders supplying global commodities** – These people are owners of enterprises, but are considered informal workers by virtue of the informal status of their enterprise.
- **Seasonal, temporary, casual and contract workers on smallholder farms**
- **Unpaid family labour working on smallholder farms**

This categorization of informal workers is used throughout the main sections of this report (Sections 2, 3 and 4). Section 3 disaggregates the findings on roles and conditions by category of informal worker, and indeed reveals that the conditions and constraints faced by each group are quite distinct. The recommendations in Section 4 are, therefore, also grouped by these worker categories, since different solutions are needed for their differing sets of constraints.

### **1.2.5 Search Terms and Approaches Used**

The Consultant used the following four approaches to identify relevant literature:

- examination of relevant resources known to the consultant from previous work

- review of specialist websites
- Google Scholar search (using the advanced search facility)
- general Google search (using the advanced search facility)

Each of these approaches is described in more detail below.

#### **EXAMINATION OF RELEVANT RESOURCES KNOWN TO THE CONSULTANT FROM PREVIOUS WORK**

The author examined a range of resources identified from previous work on global supply chain labour conditions and gender issues in agricultural value chains. This included going through over 80 resources collated during a recent review of secondary literature on the roles and conditions faced by women smallholders involved in global agricultural value chains.

#### **REVIEW OF SPECIALIST WEBSITES**

The author reviewed the following websites to identify potentially relevant resources:

- **Capturing the Gains website** ([www.capturingthegains.org](http://www.capturingthegains.org)): This is an international research network that aims to develop knowledge on employment and well-being of workers and small producers in global production networks.
- **Agri-ProFocus Gender in Value Chains website** (<http://genderinvaluechains.ning.com/>): This provides a regularly updated list of available resources on gender and agricultural value chains, which is compiled by a working group with representatives from KIT, HIVOS, Cordaid, ICCO and Oxfam Novib.
- **Websites of multi-stakeholder initiatives working on international labour rights:** The following initiatives' websites were reviewed: Ethical Trading Initiative ([www.ethicaltrade.org](http://www.ethicaltrade.org)); Fair Labor Association ([www.fairlabor.org](http://www.fairlabor.org)), Ethical Trading Initiative – Norway ([www.etiskhandel.no/English/index.html](http://www.etiskhandel.no/English/index.html)); and Social Accountability International ([www.sa-intl.org](http://www.sa-intl.org)).
- **Websites of international labour rights NGOs:** Websites of Women Working Worldwide ([www.women-ww.org](http://www.women-ww.org)) and Banana Link ([www.bananalink.org.uk](http://www.bananalink.org.uk)) were also specifically reviewed.

#### **GOOGLE SCHOLAR SEARCH**

The following searches were conducted using Google Scholar (<http://scholar.google.co.uk>):

- find articles with the following search terms in the title of the article: the exact wording or phrase “value chain” and one or more of the words “worker”, “smallholder” or “labour”
- find articles with the following search terms in the title of the article: the exact wording or phrase “value chain” and one or more of the words “cocoa”, “coffee” or “tea”

#### **GENERAL GOOGLE SEARCH**

The following searches were conducted using Google's general search engine ([www.google.co.uk](http://www.google.co.uk)):

- find web pages with the following search terms in the title of the page: the exact wording or phrase “value chain” and one or more of the words “worker”, “labour” or “employment”

- find web pages with the following search terms in the title of the page: the exact wording or phrase “supply chain” and one or more of the words “worker”, “labour”, “employment”, “women”, “gender” or “female”
- find web pages with the following search terms anywhere in the page: the exact wording or phrase “value chain” and one or more of the words “horticulture”, “fresh produce”, “vegetable”, “fruit” or “flower”

### 1.3 How this Report is Structured

The rest of the report is structured as follows:

- **Section 2** provides an overview of relevant literature identified, a brief analysis of the key coverage and gaps in this literature, and a list of all the references reviewed.
- **Section 3** presents the key findings from the literature on the roles and conditions faced by the four key categories of informal workers. For each category of worker, findings are presented on workers’ general roles and conditions, key differences between sectors/countries, and changes in conditions over the last 10-15 years.
- **Section 4** brings together recommended policies and actions to improve the situation of informal workers, as identified from the literature reviewed. Examples of relevant actions and policies that are currently being taken are provided where available. The recommendations are grouped according to the category of informal worker they are intended to support.
- **Section 5** assesses the extent to which VCA is a useful approach or tool for understanding and improving the conditions of informal workers in global value chains, and provides recommendations on what can be done to make VCAs more effective at helping these workers.

## 2. Available Literature on Value Chains & Informal Workers in the Commodities Sector: Overview & List of References

### 2.1 Introduction

**Section 2** is structured as follows:

- **Section 2.1** provides an overview and analysis of the key coverage and gaps in the relevant literature identified. It includes an analysis of which types of informal workers are addressed by the literature, as well as the geographical and crop/commodity focus of the resources.
- **Section 2.2** provides a summary table of all relevant resources found. It allows readers to easily identify resources by country/geographical focus, commodity/crop focus and type of resource.
- **Section 2.3** provides an alphabetical list of all the resources. Full citation details and web links (where available) are provided for all resources. For each of the sixteen studies that were judged to be most relevant to the purpose and scope of this review, further information is also provided on (a) the purpose and scope of the resource; (b) the extent to which it addresses the roles and conditions of informal workers; and (c) the extent to which it covers current or potential policies and actions to improve the situation of informal workers.

## 2.2 Overview of the Literature: Coverage and Key Gaps

### 2.2.1 Introduction

As already noted, only nine studies were identified that met the scope of the literature review as specified in the consultant's Terms of Reference. The coverage and key gaps in this category of resources ("Category 1") is addressed in **Section 2.1.2** below.

However, in the process of conducting the literature search, the author identified a larger number of reports/resources that were strictly speaking not VCAs, in that they did not include a systematic analysis of the roles and interactions of key actors at all stages of the value chain, but nevertheless provided information that contributed to the overall purpose of this literature review. The scope of these additional reports/resources, which can be divided into three categories, are described in **Sections 2.1.3 – 2.1.5** below:

- **Section 2.1.3** describes the scope of **empirical value chain impact studies (Category 2)**.
- **Section 2.1.4** describes the scope of **overview value chain impact studies (Category 3)**.
- **Section 2.1.5** describes the scope of **guidance documents on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses (Category 4)**.

### 2.2.2 Category 1: Systematic Value Chain Analyses Incorporating a Labour Perspective – Coverage and Key Gaps

The term "systematic value chain analysis" is used in the rest of this report to refer to studies that comply with the definition of "value chain analysis" given in **Section 1.2.3** above. A key finding from this literature review is that there are hardly any systematic value chain analyses of the commodities sector that incorporate a comprehensive assessment of the roles and conditions of different groups of workers (formal or informal) at *each stage* along the value chain. In fact, only two studies of this kind were identified (GATE 2007 and ITC forthcoming). Both focused on horticultural value chains: one studied the thornless artichoke value chain in Peru, and the other the mango value chains in Ghana and Mali.

The remaining seven VCAs that fell within the original scope of the review focused solely on one group of informal workers: smallholders. The relative abundance of VCAs addressing smallholders, in contrast to the paucity of VCAs addressing other categories of informal workers, reflects the fact that the vast majority of VCAs still focus primarily on *entrepreneurs* (i.e., owner-managers of enterprises) in the value chain, while continuing to ignore the role of *employees* working for these enterprises as key actors or beneficiaries in the chain.

Clearly, these findings are worrying in that they demonstrate how value chain analysis as a discipline is still largely ignoring the role of workers, both formal and informal, as key players in value chains. In this sense, little appears to have changed since the late 1990s/early 2000s when WIEGO first identified this weakness in the application of VCAs. This important concern is addressed further in **Section 5.2** below.

In terms of the coverage of the VCA studies that incorporated a smallholder perspective:

- **The majority (four out of seven) of the studies were on coffee.** In fact, at least three additional VCA studies were identified on the coffee sector: the only reason they were not included in this review was that the resources were not freely available. Of the three remaining studies, two were on horticulture (raspberries and mangoes) and one was on cocoa. No smallholder-focused VCAs were found on the tea sector.

- **In terms of geographical coverage, three studies focused on Africa and three on South/Central America.** One study did not have a specific country or regional focus.

### 2.2.3 Category 2: Empirical Value Chain Impact Studies – Coverage and Gaps

These are empirical studies that examine the impact of engagement in specific global value chains on one or more groups of workers in the chain. These types of studies are strictly speaking not VCAs in that they do not include a systematic assessment of the roles and conditions of key actors at *all* levels of the chain. Instead, they tend to focus only on those actors who engage directly with the target group of workers, and on how the policies and actions of these actors affect workers.

Overall, 18 resources were identified in this category. The scope of these resources is summarized below:

- **The large majority (15 out of 18) of the studies focused on impacts of GVC engagement on employees in formal enterprises,** i.e., formal and informal workers in commercial plantations, packhouses and processing units. Four studies included an analysis of impacts on smallholders, three studies included an analysis of unpaid family labour, and only two studies explored conditions of informal workers in informal enterprises (hired workers on smallholder farms).
- **The large majority (15 out of 18) were studies of horticultural products,** mostly specific vegetable or fruit crops. In contrast, there were only two studies on the coffee sector, two on cocoa and one on tea.
- **The majority (14 out of 18) of the studies were conducted in African countries,** with four studies in South or Central America, one in the USA and one in the UK. No studies were found of Asian countries.
- **Half of the studies (9 out of 18) were impact assessments of sustainability standards,** i.e., assessments of the impact of voluntary codes of labour practice or sustainability certification schemes on workers.
- **Over half of these studies (11 out of 18) had gender issues/women’s participation as their main focus.** This reflects the fact that, firstly, there has been growing interest in the gender impacts of GVC participation, and secondly, that a focus on women more or less necessitates the adoption of a labour perspective, given women’s predominance as employees rather than entrepreneurs in most global value chains.

### 2.2.4 Category 3: Overview Value Chain Impact Studies – Coverage and Gaps

These are overview studies that identify key trends in terms of the impact of global value chain participation on workers. They are distinguished from Category 2 studies in that they are reviews of secondary literature and do not, therefore, incorporate findings from primary empirical research. Ten studies were identified in this category:

- **All of the studies covered the agriculture or food sector as a whole,** although three of these included specific case studies of the horticulture sector. Thus, while many of these studies do not address the roles and conditions of workers in the tea, coffee, cocoa or horticulture sectors specifically, they have been included in the review because many of the trends identified for the agriculture sector as a whole are likely to be relevant to workers in the focus sub-sectors.
- **Over half (6 out of 10) of the studies had gender issues/women’s participation as their main focus.**

### **2.2.5 Category 4: Guidance Documents on How to Conduct Labour-Sensitive VCAs – Coverage and Gaps**

These are manuals or guidelines that provide methodological guidance on how to conduct VCAs and/or how to design value chain interventions in a way that fully addresses the needs and priorities of workers, as well as entrepreneurs, in the chain. These types of resources have been included in the review because they may assist WIEGO constituencies to conduct labour-sensitive VCAs of value chains/countries where gaps in knowledge have been identified. Overall, 12 resources were identified in this category:

- **All of the resources address the agricultural sector as a whole**, although two resources include specific case studies of horticultural products, and one includes case studies of cocoa, coffee and tea.
- **The large majority (10 out of 12) focused specifically on how to conduct gender-sensitive VCAs and/or design gender-sensitive value-chain interventions.** The large number of gender-sensitive VCA/value chain development manuals and guidelines is striking when compared to the small number of actual empirical gender-sensitive VCAs that have been conducted on specific agricultural commodities. Only two such empirical VCAs were identified (GATE 2007 and ITC forthcoming).

### **2.3 Summary Table of all Resources Reviewed**

The table below lists all of the resources included in the review. The following information is provided for each resource:

- whether or not a summary of the resource is available in **Section 2.3** below (Column 2)
- the country or geographical focus of the resource
- the crop/commodity focus of the resource

Full details and summaries (where available) of each resource are listed alphabetically in **Section 2.3** below.

REFERENCE/RESOURCE	SUMMARY	GEOGRAPHICAL FOCUS			CROP/COMMODITY FOCUS				
		Africa	South/ Central America	Global/ other	Coffee	Cocoa	Tea	Horticulture	Agriculture (general)
<b>CATEGORY 1: SYSTEMATIC VALUE CHAIN ANALYSES INCORPORATING A LABOUR PERSPECTIVE</b>									
Challies 2010	✓	Chile			Raspberries				
Coulter and Abena 2010	✓	Cameroon			✓	✓			
FAO c. 2004	✓	Kenya			Mangoes				
Fitter and Kaplinsky 2001	✓				✓				
Fromm and Dubon 2006	✓	Honduras			✓				
Greater Access to Trade Expansion Project (GATE) 2007	✓	Peru			Artichokes				
Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana, c. 2009	✓	Ghana			✓				
International Trade Centre (ITC) forthcoming	✓	Ghana Mali			Mangoes				
Tuvhag 2008	✓	Costa Rica			✓				
<b>CATEGORY 2: EMPIRICAL VALUE CHAIN IMPACT STUDIES</b>									
Barrientos 2006		South Africa			Fruit				
Barrientos et al., c. 2003	✓	South Africa			Apple				
Barrientos et al. 2009	✓	Ghana			Pineapple				
Commonwealth Secretariat 2004		Ghana South Africa			✓ Deciduous fruit				
Dolan 2002	✓	Kenya			French beans				
Dolan et al. 2002		Kenya			Cut flowers				
Ethical Trading Initiative (ETI) 2007		Colombia			Flowers				
International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) 2010	✓	Rwanda			✓	✓			
Maertens and Swinnen 2009		Senegal Africa region			Green beans Tomatoes				
Oxfam 2004	✓	South Africa Chile Colombia			US Cut flowers Vegetables Fruit				
Prieto Carron 2006		Nicaragua			Bananas				

REFERENCE/RESOURCE	SUMMARY	GEOGRAPHICAL FOCUS			CROP/COMMODITY FOCUS				
		Africa	South/ Central America	Global/ other	Coffee	Cocoa	Tea	Horticulture	Agriculture (general)
Smith 2006a		Costa Rica			Bananas				
Smith 2006b		UK			Horticulture				
Smith et al. 2004		South Africa Kenya Zambia			Flowers Fruit Vegetables				
Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union (TPAWU) 2011		Tanzania			✓				
UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad-Certification Support Network 2009	✓	Ghana Côte d'Ivoire			✓				
WEMAN Productions 2007	✓	Uganda			✓				
Women Working Worldwide et al. 2007		Kenya Tanzania Uganda Zambia			Flowers Vegetables				
<b>CATEGORY 3: OVERVIEW VALUE CHAIN IMPACT STUDIES</b>									
Barrientos 2001		Includes case study on South Africa	Includes case study on Chile	Global				Includes case studies on deciduous fruit	✓
Barrientos 2008		Includes case study on South Africa		Global				Includes case study on deciduous fruit	✓
Barrientos and Smith 2006		South Africa	Costa Rica	UK	Horticulture				
Bolzani et al. 2010				Global	✓				
Humphrey and Memedovic 2006				Global	✓				
International Labour Organization 2007				Global	Food processing, manufacture and distribution				
Mehra and Hill Rojas 2008				Global	✓				
Posthumus 2007				Global	✓				
Riisgaard et al. 2010				Global	✓				
Schneider and Gugerty 2010		Sub-Saharan Africa			✓				

**CATEGORY 4: GUIDANCE ON CONDUCTING LABOUR-SENSITIVE VALUE CHAIN ANALYSES**

Barrientos et al. 2010		Global				✓
Chan 2010		Sub-Saharan Africa, with case studies on Ghana, Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda	✓	✓	✓	✓
Development & Training Services, Inc. 2009		Global				✓
Ethical Trading Initiative 2005		Includes case study on Kenya	Global	✓	Includes case study on green beans	✓
Gammage et al. 2009		Includes case study on Peru	Global		Includes case study on artichokes	✓
Laven et al. 2009		Global				✓
Laven and Verhart 2011		Global				✓
Mayoux 2010a		Global				✓
Mayoux 2010b		Global				✓
Mayoux and Mackie 2007		Global				✓
SNV 2010		Global				✓
World Bank et al. 2009		Global				✓

## 2.4 Alphabetical List of References (Including Summaries for 16 Key Resources)

### **Barrientos 2001**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S. 2001. "Gender, Flexibility And Global Value Chains." *IDS Bulletin*, Vol. 32, No. 3. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex. Institute of Development Studies.

**Available online at:** [www.siyanda.org](http://www.siyanda.org)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general), with case studies on deciduous fruit

**Country focus:** Global, with case studies on South Africa and Chile

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### **Barrientos 2006**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S. 2006. "The ETI Code of Labour Practice: Do Workers Really Benefit? Part 2c: Findings and Recommendations from a Case Study in South Africa (Fruit)." Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:**

[www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202c%20safrica.pdf](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202c%20safrica.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (fruit)

**Country focus:** South Africa

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### **Barrientos 2008**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S. 2008. "Women Treading the Corridors of Corporate Power." Pathways of Women's Empowerment RPC.

**Available online at:** [www.pathwaysofempowerment.org/Global/Barrientos\\_April\\_08.pdf](http://www.pathwaysofempowerment.org/Global/Barrientos_April_08.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general), with case study on deciduous fruit

**Country focus:** Global, with case study on South Africa

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### **Barrientos and Smith 2006**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S. and S. Smith. 2006. "The ETI Code of Labour Practice: Do Workers Really Benefit? Part 1: Main Findings and Recommendations from an Independent Assessment for the Ethical Trading Initiative." Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:**

[www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%20Part%201,%20main%20findings\\_0.pdf](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%20Part%201,%20main%20findings_0.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture

**Country focus:** Costa Rica, South Africa and the UK

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### **Barrientos et al. c.2003**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S., A. Kritzinger, G. Muller, H. Rossouw, P. Termine, N. Tregurtha and N. Vink. c.2003. *The Global Value Chain and Changing Employment Relations in South African Fruit: Summary of Findings.*

**Available online at:** <http://www.inti.gov.ar/cadenasdevalor/Draft4summaryofreport.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (apples)

**Country focus:** South Africa

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This paper summarizes the key findings of research undertaken in South Africa between 2001-2002. It describes the recent changes in the South African export apple industry resulting from restructuring of global fruit value chains, increasing global competition between supply countries, and social, political and legal transformation at the national level. It then explores the impacts of these multiple influences on the conditions of workers in the export apple value chain in South Africa.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

Distinguishing between different categories of workers depending on their employment status was integral to the study approach and purpose. The research methodology was designed to include a cross-section of permanent and non-permanent workers, female and male workers, and migrant and third-party contracted works. Similarities and differences in conditions between these different categories of workers are identified and highlighted throughout.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

This report does not cover good practice policies or actions currently undertaken by relevant stakeholders, nor does it provide recommendations on what needs to be done to improve the situation of informal workers.

***Barrientos et al. 2009***

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S., J. Anarfi, N. Lamhauge, A. Castaldo, N. Akua Anyidoho. 2009. *Social Protection for Migrant Labour in the Ghanaian Pineapple Sector*. Working Paper T-30. Brighton: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:** <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/r4d/PDF/Outputs/MigrationGlobPov/WP-T30.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (pineapples)

**Country focus:** Ghana

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This paper presents findings from research carried out in the pineapple export sector in Ghana between 2006-7. The aim of the study was to assess the comparative risks and vulnerabilities faced by internal migrant workers in the pineapple export sector in Ghana, what channels for social protection are open to them, and how these channels of protection can be made more effective for migrant workers.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The study focused on internal migrant workers employed by pineapple exporters and farmers (both small and large scale). Although the majority of the 255 migrant workers interviewed were permanent workers, a large proportion (45%) were non-permanent (temporary or casual) and two-thirds of the 255 workers did not have written employment contracts. The report identifies differences in wages, working conditions and social protection access between these different categories of workers.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report addresses both of the following in some detail:

- an assessment of current channels of social protection used by/provided to migrant workers, including informal reciprocity networks, public sector social insurance and assistance arrangements, and support provided via employers (including protection afforded by CSR/social standards)
- recommendations on what the private sector, public sector and trade unions could do to enhance migrant workers' ability to withstand negative employment impacts arising from external market shocks

**Barrientos et al. 2010**

**Full citation details:** Barrientos, S., G. Gereffi and A. Rossi. 2010. *Economic and Social Upgrading in Global Production Networks: Developing a Framework for Analysis*. Capturing the Gains Working Paper 2010/03.

**Available online at:** [www.capturingthegains.org/pdf/ctg-wp-2010-03.pdf](http://www.capturingthegains.org/pdf/ctg-wp-2010-03.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

**Bolzani et al. 2010**

**Full citation details:** Bolzani, D., S. de Villard. and J. Dey De Pryck. 2010. *Agricultural Value Chain Development: Threat or Opportunity for Women's Employment?* Gender and Rural Employment Policy Brief No. 4. FAO-ILO-IFAD.

**Available online at:** [www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/documents/publication/wcms\\_150833.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_150833.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

**Challies 2010**

**Full citation details:** Challies, E.R.T. 2010. *Agri-food globalisation and rural transformation in Chile: smallholder livelihoods in the global value chain for raspberries*. Thesis (PhD), Victoria University of Wellington.

**Available online at:**

<http://researcharchive.vuw.ac.nz/bitstream/handle/10063/1389/thesis.pdf?sequence=1>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (raspberries)

**Country focus:** Chile

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This PhD thesis examines how participation in the global value chain for raspberries impacts on the livelihoods of smallholder raspberry growers, drawing on findings from a case study of raspberry smallholders in Chile. The research uses value chain analysis to examine the role of public and private sector organizations governing and coordinating activities along the raspberry value chain in Chile. In addition, the research also used a livelihoods analysis to examine the significance of raspberry production within diversified household livelihood strategies,

considering key assets, capabilities and mediating factors shaping smallholders' access to the value chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The thesis provides an in-depth analysis of the roles and conditions of smallholders and the extent to which they benefit from global value chain participation; however, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the raspberry value chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The thesis provides an analysis of key opportunities and threats for smallholder participation in the raspberry global value chain, and includes a brief discussion on policy directions that would help ensure that smallholders continue to benefit from chain participation. However, it does not provide detailed recommendations for specific actors.

**Chan 2010**

**Full citation details:** Chan, M-K. 2010. *Improving Opportunities for Women in Smallholder-based Supply Chains: Business case and practical guidance for international food companies*. Prepared for the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation.

**Available online at:**

[www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk/research/ResearchProgrammes/businessfordevelopment/#gender](http://www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk/research/ResearchProgrammes/businessfordevelopment/#gender)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general), with case studies on cocoa, coffee and tea

**Country focus:** Sub-Saharan Africa, with case studies on Ghana, Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

**Commonwealth Secretariat 2004**

**Full citation details:** Commonwealth Secretariat. 2004. *Chains of Fortune: Linking Women Producers and Workers with Global Markets*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat.

**Available online at:** [www.wiego.org/program\\_areas/global\\_markets/ChainsofFortune.pdf](http://www.wiego.org/program_areas/global_markets/ChainsofFortune.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Cocoa, horticulture (deciduous fruit)

**Country focus:** Ghana, South Africa

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**Coulter and Abena 2010**

**Full citation details:** Coulter, J. and P.E. Abena. 2010. *Study of Value Chain Finance for Coffee and Cocoa in Cameroon: Report to UNCTAD*.

**Available online at:**

<http://www.unctad.info/upload/SUC/CoffeeCocoaCameroonOct2010/ValueChainCoffeeCocoaCoulterEtoaAbena.PDF>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee and cocoa

**Country focus:** Cameroon

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This document reports on findings from a study commissioned by UNCTAD, the aim of which was to identify ways of improving value chain finance in Cameroon's coffee and cocoa sub-sectors, with a special focus on improving access to finance for smallholders. The report reviews the value chains for both commodities and identifies general constraints faced by smallholders and other actors along the chain. It then reviews the strengths and weaknesses of existing

financing initiatives, and proposes a number of promising models/approaches to further improve smallholder access to finance in the future.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report examines the constraints and needs of coffee and cocoa smallholders, particularly in relation to their access to finance; however, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the coffee and cocoa value chains.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides detailed recommendations for improving smallholders' access to finance, setting out different business/institutional models to be considered.

***Development & Training Services, Inc. 2009***

**Full citation details:** Development & Training Services, Inc. 2009. *Promoting Gender Equitable Opportunities In Agricultural Value Chains: A Summary*.

**Available online at:**

<http://dl.dropbox.com/u/2878918/GATE%20Gender%20and%20Ag%20Value%20Chains%20A%20Summary.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

***Dolan 2002***

**Full citation details:** Dolan, C.S. 2002. "Gender and Witchcraft in Agrarian Transition: The Case of Kenyan Horticulture." *Development and Change*, Vol. 33, No. 4, pp. 659–681. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

**Available online at:** A freely available on-line source could not be identified

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (French beans)

**Country focus:** Kenya

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This article examines the social impacts of French bean contract farming on smallholders and their households in Kenya, based on fieldwork conducted between 1994-2000. In particular, it explores conflicts between male contract farmers and their wives over use/distribution of land, labour and income, conflicts that arise are exacerbated by engagement in contract farming. The article examines these conflicts through the lens of witchcraft, showing how wives are using witchcraft allegations and acts as a means of seeking compensation or redress for the unequal distribution of costs and benefits from contract farming.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The article focuses on the roles and conditions of unpaid family labour on smallholder farms engaged in export horticultural production. It describes in detail the costs (and benefits) of contract farming for the wives (i.e., unpaid female family labour) of male contract farmers, and the implications these have on intra-household dynamics.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The article describes women workers' own responses/actions to the unequal distribution of costs and benefits arising from their household's engagement in contract farming. However, it does not discuss either current or potential institutional responses to improve their conditions.

### ***Dolan et al. 2002***

**Full citation details:** Dolan, C.S., M. Opondo and S. Smith. 2002. *Gender, Rights & Participation in the Kenya Cut Flower Industry*. NRI Report No: 2768. SSR Project No. R8077 2002-4. Chatham: Natural Resources Institute.

**Available online at:** [www.nri.org/projects/NRET/kenyareportfinal2.pdf](http://www.nri.org/projects/NRET/kenyareportfinal2.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (cut flowers)

**Country focus:** Kenya

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### ***Ethical Trading Initiative 2005***

**Full citation details:** Ethical Trading Initiative. 2005. *ETI Smallholder Guidelines: Recommendations for Working with Smallholders*.

**Available online at:** [www.ethicaltrade.org/resources/key-eti-resources/eti-smallholder-guidelines-eng](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/resources/key-eti-resources/eti-smallholder-guidelines-eng)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general), with case studies on green beans and tea

**Country focus:** Global, with case study on Kenya

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

### ***Ethical Trading Initiative 2007***

**Full citation details:** Ethical Trading Initiative. 2007. *Final Report of ETI Multi- Stakeholder Seminar on Colombia Flower Industry, Bogotá, 18 April 2007*.

**Available online at:** [www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/ETI%20multi-stakeholder%20seminar%20on%20the%20Colombia%20flower%20industry.pdf](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/ETI%20multi-stakeholder%20seminar%20on%20the%20Colombia%20flower%20industry.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (flowers)

**Country focus:** Colombia

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### ***FAO c.2004***

**Full citation details:** Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. c.2004. *Value Chain Analysis: A Case Study Of Mangoes In Kenya*. Commodities and Trade Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.

**Available online at:**

[www.responsibleagroinvestment.org/rai/sites/responsibleagroinvestment.org/files/FAO\\_Value%20chain%20Analysis\\_Kenya%20Case.pdf](http://www.responsibleagroinvestment.org/rai/sites/responsibleagroinvestment.org/files/FAO_Value%20chain%20Analysis_Kenya%20Case.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (mangoes)

**Country focus:** Kenya

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

#### **PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This FAO document analyzes the mango value chain in Kenya. It examines production, marketing and processing activities, the constraints faced by smallholder producers and traders, and opportunities for future development of the chain.

#### **TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The document includes a summary of key constraints faced by smallholders in the value chain; however, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the mango value chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The document provides brief recommendations on the types of support needed to improve smallholder participation and returns from engagement in the (export and domestic) mango value chain.

***Fitter and Kaplinsky 2001***

**Full citation details:** Fitter, R. and R. Kaplinsky. 2001. "Who Gains from Product Rents as the Coffee Market Becomes More Differentiated? A Value Chain Analysis." *The Value of Value Chains, IDS Bulletin Special Issue*, Vol. 32, No. 3.

**Available online at:**

[http://eprints.brighton.ac.uk/1439/1/Who\\_Gains\\_From\\_Product\\_Rents\\_as\\_the\\_Coffee\\_Market\\_Becomes\\_More\\_Differentiated.pdf](http://eprints.brighton.ac.uk/1439/1/Who_Gains_From_Product_Rents_as_the_Coffee_Market_Becomes_More_Differentiated.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This paper explores whether/how differentiation of the global coffee market benefits poor producers in developing countries, focusing in particular on the distribution of income between producing and importing countries. It uses value chain analysis to assess the input-output relationships between actors, the inter-country distribution of gains, and the power and governance relations that influence these distributional effects.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

This study addresses the roles and conditions of smallholders and the extent to which they benefit from global value chain participation; however, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the coffee value chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

This paper does not provide specific recommendations on how to improve benefits to smallholders from value chain participation.

***Fromm and Dubon 2006***

**Full citation details:** Fromm, I. and J.A. Dubón. 2006. *Upgrading and the Value Chain Analysis: The Case of Small-scale Coffee Farmers in Honduras*. Paper produced for the Conference on International Agricultural Research for Development, University of Bonn, 11-13 October 2006.

**Available online at:**

[http://74.125.155.132/scholar?q=cache:T5knKIXWQ1AJ:scholar.google.com/+allintitle:+coffee+OR+cocoa+OR+tea+%22value+chain%22&hl=en&as\\_sdt=0,5&as\\_ylo=1995&as\\_yhi=2011&as\\_vis=1](http://74.125.155.132/scholar?q=cache:T5knKIXWQ1AJ:scholar.google.com/+allintitle:+coffee+OR+cocoa+OR+tea+%22value+chain%22&hl=en&as_sdt=0,5&as_ylo=1995&as_yhi=2011&as_vis=1)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee

**Country focus:** Honduras

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This study explores if/how coffee smallholders in Honduras have benefited from integration into the international coffee value chain. Drawing on primary field research in Honduras as well as secondary sources, it analyses the different factors affecting the extent to which smallholders are

benefiting from value chain participation, including whether engagement in differentiated coffee markets provides additional advantages to smallholders.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

This study addresses the roles and conditions of smallholders and the extent to which they benefit from global value chain participation; however, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the coffee value chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The paper does not provide specific recommendations: however, the analysis of the relative impacts on smallholders of different value chain conditions/interventions provides useful pointers on how smallholder value chain interventions might best be targeted.

***Gammage et al. 2009***

**Full citation details:** Gammage, S., C. Manfre and K. Cook. 2009. *Gender and Pro-Poor Value Chain Analysis: Insights from the GATE Project Methodology and Case Studies*. Washington, DC: United States Agency for International Development (USAID).

**Available online at:**

<http://dl.dropbox.com/u/2878918/GATE%20Gender%20and%20ProPoor%20VC%20Analysis%20Insights.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general), with case study on artichokes

**Country focus:** Global, with case study on Peru

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

***GATE 2007***

**Full citation details:** Greater Access to Trade Expansion (GATE) Project. 2007. *A Pro-Poor Analysis Of The Artichoke Value Chain In Peru*. Research Brief, June 2007.

**Available online at:** [http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\\_docs/PNADJ403.pdf](http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PNADJ403.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (artichokes)

**Country focus:** Peru

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This paper reports on a USAID-funded study of the export artichoke value chain in Peru, the aim of which was to identify interventions that could contribute to pro-poor growth. The study used a pro-poor and gender-sensitive value chain analysis, amongst other methodologies, to identify the current distribution of costs and benefits between different actors along the chain, as well as identify overall production and market opportunities and challenges facing chain actors. It then examined ways to enhance productivity and to improve the distribution of gains from employment in the chain to a larger number of poor women and men producers and workers along the chain.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides a systematic, gender-disaggregated analysis of the roles, constraints and opportunities facing all types of workers at each stage in the artichoke value chain. Specifically, it includes an assessment of the roles, conditions and employment status of women and men smallholders, and of male and female workers employed on small and large farms, in processing units and in the transport sector.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides recommendations on what could be done to improve the distribution of benefits from participation in the chain to a greater number of poor women and men workers and producers along the value chain, the majority of whom are currently employed in informal work.

***Humphrey and Memedovic 2006***

**Full citation details:** Humphrey, J. and O. Memedovic. 2006. *Global Value Chains in the Agrifood Sector*. Vienna: United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO).

**Available online at:**

[www.unido.org/fileadmin/user\\_media/Publications/Pub\\_free/Global\\_value\\_chains\\_in\\_the\\_agrifood\\_sector.pdf](http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/Publications/Pub_free/Global_value_chains_in_the_agrifood_sector.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

***Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana c.2009***

**Full citation details:** Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana. c.2009. *Mapping Sustainable Production in Ghanaian Cocoa. Report to Cadbury*.

**Available online at:**

<http://collaboration.cadbury.com/SiteCollectionDocuments/Mapping%20Sustainable%20Production%20in%20Ghanaian%20Cocoa%20Study.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Cocoa

**Country focus:** Ghana.

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This report presents the findings from a study of the Ghanaian cocoa sector commissioned by Cadbury and conducted by an independent research team from the UK and Ghana. The study examined the factors that make up sustainable production for cocoa farmers in Ghana, focusing on the socio-economic dimensions of sustainability. The study used value chain analysis and livelihoods analysis to identify farmers' own perspectives on what constituted sustainable production, to assess the current socio-economic conditions and constraints faced by farmers, and to develop recommendations for how chocolate manufacturers and other value chain actors can contribute to sustainable production for small-scale cocoa producers in Ghana.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides a detailed assessment of the roles and constraints faced by smallholders, and includes limited information on the roles and conditions of hired workers on smallholder farms.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides recommendations on potential policies and actions that can be taken by a range of value chain actors to improve the conditions of cocoa smallholders in Ghana.

***International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) 2010***

**Full citation details:** International Fund for Agricultural Development. 2010. *Study Report of the International Fund for Agricultural Development on Gender and Youth in the Tea and Coffee Value Chains*. IFAD Report No. 2295-RW.

**Available online at:** <http://genderlearning.wikispaces.com/file/view/PDCRE+-+Gender+Study+-+final+Sep10.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee and tea

**Country focus:** Rwanda

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This report presents the findings and recommendations from field research carried out in May-June 2010 in Rwanda. The aim of the study was to identify gender and youth aspects of the coffee and tea value chains in the country, with a view to identifying gender-targeting mechanisms that would best contribute to poverty reduction and overall value chain development in the coffee and tea sectors. It was intended that the recommendations/results from the study would be applied in the future implementation of an ongoing project, the Smallholder Cash and Export Crops Development Project (PDCRE), which is funded by IFAD, the Development Bank of Rwanda and other donors.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides a gender-disaggregated assessment of the roles, conditions and constraints of coffee and tea smallholders (members of producer co-operatives), and workers on tea and coffee farms/plantations, at coffee washing stations and tea factories. It includes an analysis of their employment status and level of protection under labour legislation.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report includes recommendations on what can be done to improve opportunities for women producers (co-operative members) and women workers in coffee and tea processing units.

***International Labour Organization 2007***

**Full citation details:** International Labour Organization. 2007. *The Impact of Global Food Chains on Employment in the Food and Drink Sector*. Issues paper for discussion at the Tripartite Meeting to Examine the Impact of Global Food Chains on Employment. Geneva: International Labour Office.

**Available online at:** [www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/sector/techmeet/tmfce07/tmfce-r.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/sector/techmeet/tmfce07/tmfce-r.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Food processing, manufacture and distribution

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

***International Trade Centre (Forthcoming)***

**Full citation details:** International Trade Centre. Forthcoming. *La Stratégie Mangue pour la CEDEAO*.

**Available online at:** Not yet available online (forthcoming publication). For publication plans/details, please contact the PACT II Programme Coordination Unit, International Trade Centre, email: [paccia-pact@intracen.org](mailto:paccia-pact@intracen.org).

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (mangoes)

**Country focus:** ECOWAS countries, with detailed case studies of Ghana and Mali

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This resource was commissioned by the International Trade Centre as part of the process of developing a regional strategy for the development of the mango export sector in the ECOWAS region. It was prepared as a draft chapter for incorporation into the final strategy document. The

chapter provides a description of the roles, constraints and opportunities faced by women in the export mango value chains in the ECOWAS region, with a specific focus on the chains in Ghana and Mali, and provides recommendations on how the draft mango strategy could be strengthened and implemented to ensure that women and men will benefit equally from future activities to be undertaken under the framework of the strategy.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The draft chapter provides a systematic analysis of the roles, constraints and opportunities facing all types of women workers at each stage in the mango value chain in Ghana and Mali.

Specifically, it includes an assessment of the roles, conditions/constraints and employment status of: (a) female owners of informal enterprises, including women smallholders, female mango processors, and female traders; (b) women working as unpaid family labour on smallholder mango farms; and (c) waged workers employed on small and large farms, in processing units and in packhouses.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The draft chapter provides detailed recommendations on what could be done, within the framework of the draft ECOWAS mango strategy, to improve the conditions faced by women workers all along the value chain and to ensure that potential negative gender impacts of the strategy are minimized. The recommendations include practical guidance and good practice examples from East and West Africa.

***Laven and Verhart 2011***

**Full citation details:** Laven, A. and N. Verhart. 2011. *Addressing Gender Equality in Agricultural Value Chains: Sharing Work in Progress*.

**Available online at:** <http://genderinvaluechains.ning.com/page/publications-1>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

***Laven et al. 2009***

**Full citation details:** Laven, A., A. van Eerdewijk, A. Senders, C. van Wees and R. Snelder. 2009. *Gender in Value Chains: Emerging Lessons and Questions. A Draft Working Paper*. Agri-ProFocus.

**Available online at:** <http://genderinvaluechains.ning.com/page/publications-1>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

***Maartens and Swinnen 2009***

**Full citation details:** Maartens, M. and J.F.M. Swinnen. 2009. *Gender and Modern Supply Chains in Developing Countries. LICOS Discussion Paper Series, Discussion Paper 231/2008*. Leuven: LICOS Centre for Institutions and Economic Performance.

**Available online at:** [www.econ.kuleuven.be/LICOS/DP/DP2009/DP231.pdf](http://www.econ.kuleuven.be/LICOS/DP/DP2009/DP231.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (green beans and tomatoes)

**Country focus:** Senegal, Africa region

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### **Mayoux 2010a**

**Full citation details:** Mayoux, L. 2010. *Tree of Diamond Dreams: Visioning and Committing to Action on Gender Justice. Manual for Field-Testing and Local Adaptation, GALS Stage 1.* The Hague: Oxfam Novib.

**Available online at:** <http://api.ning.com/files/Zx8GP9iGT01hKq35ulpZzxUkom-Rn263PX7tP1um7xBDwgnk3LzJpRg01tJlshy7GHsExYqbvZquqRxLHBu4cYc2ZHHMR1QO/101229diamonddreamsEnglishweb.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

### **Mayoux 2010b**

**Full citation details:** Mayoux, L. 2010. *Steering Life's Rocky Road: Gender Action Learning for Individuals and Communities. Manual for Field-Testing and Local Adaptation, GALS Stage 2.* The Hague: Oxfam Novib.

**Available online at:** <http://api.ning.com/files/SQvg-cG3CYNG-WoDmSB9i08uM06TrUecmljCyMF1iVALSbyv8QjhdRLzHacSihIMyEG71vK3uCJpITGyu3V Gw2FQKkTkNUNz/101228rockyroadEnglishweb.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

### **Mayoux and Mackie 2007**

**Full citation details:** Mayoux, L. and G. Mackie. 2007. *Making the Strongest Links: A Practical Guide to Mainstreaming Gender Analysis in Value Chain Development.* Addis Ababa: International Labour Office.

**Available online at:** [www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---emp\\_ent/documents/instructionalmaterial/wcms\\_106538.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/documents/instructionalmaterial/wcms_106538.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

### **Mehra and Hill Rojas 2008**

**Full citation details:** Mehra, R. and M. Hill Rojas. 2008. *Women, Food Security and Agriculture in a Global Marketplace.* International Center for Research on Women (ICRW).

**Available online at:** [www.icrw.org/publications/women-food-security-and-agriculture-global-marketplace](http://www.icrw.org/publications/women-food-security-and-agriculture-global-marketplace)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### **Oxfam 2004**

**Full citation details:** Oxfam. 2004. *Trading Away Our Rights: Women Working in Global Supply Chains.* Oxford: Oxfam International.

**Available online at:** [www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/papers/downloads/trading\\_rights.pdf](http://www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/papers/downloads/trading_rights.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (cut flowers, vegetable and fruit)

**Country focus:** Global, with horticulture case studies from Chile, South Africa, Colombia and the US

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This report presents the findings from research carried out in 12 countries on the impacts of purchasing practices used by global supermarkets and clothing companies on working conditions in their supply chains, with a special focus on conditions of women workers. It describes changes in corporate purchasing strategies over the past two decades, and documents the negative consequences these have had on workers in the clothing and food supply chains in both developing and developed countries. It also provides detailed recommendations on what key value chain actors should do to mitigate these negative impacts.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report examines the conditions faced by workers, particularly women workers, on/in commercial farms, greenhouses and packhouses, and includes an analysis of their employment status and the impact this has on their working conditions and access to legal protection and benefits.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report includes detailed recommendations on what retailers, producers and suppliers, national governments, the WTO and ILO, development banks, institutional investors and consumers can do to improve conditions for women workers.

**Posthumus 2007**

**Full citation details:** Posthumus, H. 2007. *Rural Employment Promotion Through the Value Chain Approach*. Background paper for the round-table discussion. IFAD Governing Council 2007.

**Available online at:** [www.ifad.org/events/gc/30/roundtable/value/value\\_chain.pdf](http://www.ifad.org/events/gc/30/roundtable/value/value_chain.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

**Prieto-Carron 2006**

**Full citation details:** Prieto-Carrón, M. 2006. "Corporate Social Responsibility in Latin America: Chiquita, Women Banana Workers and Structural Inequalities." *JCC 21*, Spring 2006.

**Available online at:**

[http://api.ning.com/files/1ry1JTt6rBL9C7dr4pgVNeaSqgpYxO8ezDmz\\*AKw3ySLC3C6DiA18CxZt0k7yzOF49HIXedEAiNM5nv-n6TNmZORLrbITTNh/PrietoCarron\\_2006\\_Chiquita\\_CSR\\_and\\_Latinamerica.pdf](http://api.ning.com/files/1ry1JTt6rBL9C7dr4pgVNeaSqgpYxO8ezDmz*AKw3ySLC3C6DiA18CxZt0k7yzOF49HIXedEAiNM5nv-n6TNmZORLrbITTNh/PrietoCarron_2006_Chiquita_CSR_and_Latinamerica.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (bananas)

**Country focus:** Nicaragua

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**Riisgaard et al. 2010**

**Full citation details:** Riisgaard, L., A.M. Escobar Fibla and S. Ponte. 2010. *Evaluation Study: Gender and Value Chain Development*. Copenhagen: The Danish Institute for International Studies.

**Available online at:** <http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/8/17/45670567.pdf>**Commodity/crop focus:**  
Agriculture (general)  
**Country focus:** Global  
**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### ***Schneider and Gugerty 2010***

**Full citation details:** Schneider, K. and M.K. Gugerty. 2010. *Gender & Contract Farming in Sub-Saharan Africa Literature Review*. Seattle: Evans School of Public Affairs, University of Washington.

**Available online at:**

[http://evans.washington.edu/files/Evans%20UW\\_Request%2067\\_Gender%20&%20Contract%20Farming\\_03-08-2010.pdf](http://evans.washington.edu/files/Evans%20UW_Request%2067_Gender%20&%20Contract%20Farming_03-08-2010.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Sub-Saharan Africa

**Type of resource:** Category 3 (Overview value chain impact study)

### ***Smith 2006a***

**Full citation details:** Smith, S. 2006. *The ETI Code of Labour Practice: Do Workers Really Benefit? Part 2d Findings and Recommendations From A Case Study in Costa Rica (Bananas)*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:**

[www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202d.pdf](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202d.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (bananas)

**Country focus:** Costa Rica

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### ***Smith 2006b***

**Full citation details:** Smith, S. 2006. *The ETI Code of Labour Practice: Do Workers Really Benefit? Part 2e: Findings And Recommendations From a Case Study in the UK (Horticulture)*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:**

[www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202e%20UK.pdf](http://www.ethicaltrade.org/sites/default/files/resources/Impact%20assessment%202e%20UK.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture

**Country focus:** UK

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### ***Smith et al. 2004***

**Full citation details:** Smith, S. D. Auret, S. Barrientos, C. Dolan, K. Kleinbooi, C. Njobvu, M. Opondo and A. Tallontire. 2004. *Ethical Trade In African Horticulture: Gender, Rights & Participation*. IDS Working Paper 223. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.

**Available online at:** [www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D//PDF/Outputs/mis\\_spc/r8077b.pdf](http://www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D//PDF/Outputs/mis_spc/r8077b.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (flowers, fruit and vegetables)

**Country focus:** South Africa, Kenya and Zambia

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### **Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union (TPAWU) 2011**

**Full citation details:** Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union. 2011. *Action Research Report: Factors Affecting Labor Conditions In Horticulture Industry In Tanzania*. Dar es Salaam: TPAWU.

**Available online at:** [www.women-ww.org/documents/Research-Booklet-TPAWU.pdf](http://www.women-ww.org/documents/Research-Booklet-TPAWU.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture

**Country focus:** Tanzania

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### **SNV 2010**

**Full citation details:** SNV (Netherlands Development Organisation). 2010. *Gender Mainstreaming in Value Chain Development: Practical Guidelines and Tools*. The Hague: SNV Netherlands Development. Organisation

**Available online at:**

[http://api.ning.com/files/lguQZrsbJ5rxCfujHxcpvxJtytAVsNEOaKXPZQlowyQD5yb-aNvv-dXqB\\*fMiZP0N35jFRLO7ZuZVT0YhhZPDSBbsvby4Zz0/SNVGenderMainstreaminginVCDFacilitationguide.pdf](http://api.ning.com/files/lguQZrsbJ5rxCfujHxcpvxJtytAVsNEOaKXPZQlowyQD5yb-aNvv-dXqB*fMiZP0N35jFRLO7ZuZVT0YhhZPDSBbsvby4Zz0/SNVGenderMainstreaminginVCDFacilitationguide.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

### **Tuvhag 2008**

**Full citation details:** Tuvhag, E. 2008. *A Value Chain Analysis of Fairtrade Coffee - With Special Focus on Income and Vertical Integration*. Thesis (MSc), Lund University.

**Available online at:** <http://biblioteket.ehl.lu.se/olle/papers/0003180.pdf>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee

**Country focus:** Costa Rica

**Type of resource:** Category 1 (Systematic value chain analysis incorporating a labour perspective)

#### **PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This Masters thesis examines whether participation in Fairtrade as opposed to conventional value chains improves returns to producers, using a comparison of the conventional and Fairtrade coffee value chains in Costa Rica as a case study. Value chain analysis is used as the main analytical approach to address this question.

#### **TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The thesis examines the impact of engagement in the Fairtrade and conventional value chains on the incomes and conditions of smallholders; however, apart from a passing reference, it does not address issues facing other types of informal workers in the coffee value chain.

#### **TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The thesis does not provide substantive recommendations on how to improve benefits to smallholders from engagement in coffee value chains.

### **UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad-Certification Support Network 2009**

**Full citation details:** UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad-Certification Support Network 2009. *The Role Of Certification and Producer Support in Promoting Gender Equality in Cocoa Production*.

**Available online at:**

[http://www.goodinside.jp/serve\\_attachment.php?file=archive/downloads/cocoagenderreport\\_utz-solidaridad.pdf](http://www.goodinside.jp/serve_attachment.php?file=archive/downloads/cocoagenderreport_utz-solidaridad.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Cocoa

**Country focus:** Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

The aim of this report is to draw attention to the important role played by women in cocoa production in West Africa, despite the fact that cocoa is widely perceived to be a “man’s crop,” and to provide recommendations on what sustainability certification bodies and producer support organizations can do to improve the income and position of these women. Focusing on Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire, the report describes the roles played by women in cocoa farming, the obstacles they face, and what opportunities exist to improve their situation. It also analyses the extent to which current standards and policies promoted by UTZ Certified and the Solidaridad Certification Support Network address relevant gender issues, and how these could be improved to address the needs and priorities of women working in cocoa production.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report addresses the roles and conditions of women cocoa smallholders, of women working as unpaid family labour on their husbands’ cocoa farms, and of women working as hired labour on smallholder cocoa farms.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The report provides detailed recommendations on how the content, implementation and auditing of sustainability certification standards/codes can be improved to better address gender issues, and on what support can be provided to producer organizations to help ensure that women smallholders and workers benefit equally from membership and support services.

**WEMAN Productions 2007**

**Full citation details:** WEMAN Productions. 2007. *Balanced Trees Bear Richer Fruit. Adding Value to the Coffee Chain: Women’s Empowerment in Western Uganda*. Film. Netherlands: WEMAN (Women’s Empowerment Mainstreaming And Networking), Oxfam Novib.

**Available online at:** [www.youtube.com/view\\_play\\_list?p=EFAE48597B4E4C2C](http://www.youtube.com/view_play_list?p=EFAE48597B4E4C2C)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Coffee

**Country focus:** Uganda

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

**PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE RESOURCE:**

This two-part film documents the constraints faced by wives of male coffee smallholders in Uganda, and showcases the activities undertaken by a local women’s group and coffee cooperative, with support from Oxfam Novib, to address gender inequalities in these coffee growing communities. It describes the specific participatory methods used by the programme to raise awareness of gender inequalities and the negative impacts these have on households, and highlights the programme’s achievements in changing men’s attitudes and practices.

**TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT ADDRESS THE ROLES AND CONDITIONS OF INFORMAL WORKERS?**

The film addresses the roles and constraints faced by women working as unpaid family labour on men’s smallholdings; however, it does not address the conditions and constraints of other types of workers in the coffee value chain.

## TO WHAT EXTENT DOES IT COVER CURRENT OR POTENTIAL POLICIES AND ACTIONS TO IMPROVE THE SITUATION OF INFORMAL WORKERS?

The film describes tools and methodologies that have been successfully used to improve conditions of unpaid female family labour in Uganda.

### ***Women Working Worldwide et al. 2007***

**Full citation details:** Women Working Worldwide, Tanzania Plantation and Agriculture Workers Union, Uganda Workers Education Association, Workers Education Association of Zambia and Kenya Women Workers Organisation. 2007. *Promoting Women Workers' Rights in African Horticulture: Overview of research into conditions on horticulture farms in Kenya, Zambia, Tanzania and Uganda*. Manchester: Women Working Worldwide.

**Available online at:** [www.women-ww.org/documents/www\\_research\\_overview\\_final.pdf](http://www.women-ww.org/documents/www_research_overview_final.pdf)

**Commodity/crop focus:** Horticulture (flowers, vegetables)

**Country focus:** Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia

**Type of resource:** Category 2 (Empirical value chain impact study)

### ***World Bank et al. 2009***

**Full citation details:** World Bank, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations, and International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). 2009. Module 5 – Gender and Agricultural Markets: Overview. In *Gender in Agriculture Sourcebook*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

**Available online at:** <http://worldbank.org/genderinag>

**Commodity/crop focus:** Agriculture (general)

**Country focus:** Global

**Type of resource:** Category 4 (Guidance on conducting labour-sensitive value chain analyses)

## 3. Roles and Conditions of Informal Workers: Key Findings from the Literature

### 3.1 Introduction

**Section 3** presents the key findings on the roles and conditions of informal workers in the coffee, cocoa, tea and horticulture sectors. The findings are based on:

- a comprehensive review of the 16 resources judged to be most relevant to the scope and purpose of this assignment
- a selective review of the remaining 33 resources

**Section 3** presents the roles and conditions faced by each key category of informal worker in turn:

- **Section 3.2** summarizes key findings on the roles and conditions of **workers in formal enterprises (i.e., workers in commercial plantations, packhouses and processing units)**
- **Section 3.3** summarizes findings on **owners of informal enterprises (i.e., smallholders, small-scale processors and traders)**

- **Section 3.4** summarizes findings on **informal workers in informal enterprises (i.e., hired workers on smallholder farms)**
- **Section 3.5** summarizes findings on **contributing family labour (i.e., unpaid family labour on smallholder farms)**

For each category of worker, findings are presented on workers' general roles and conditions, key differences between sectors/countries, and changes in conditions over the last 10-15 years.

## **3.2 Informal Workers in Formal Enterprises (Workers In Packhouses, Processing Units and Commercial Farms)**

### **3.2.1 Roles and Conditions – General Trends**

The following roles and conditions were found across a range of the focus commodity sectors and in more than one country, and were therefore judged to be cross-cutting trends.

#### **THE MAJORITY OF WORKERS ARE INFORMALLY EMPLOYED**

**The majority of workers do not have written contracts of employment.** The literature indicates that most workers in commercial packhouses, processing units and commercial farms do not have written contracts of employment. For example, Barrientos et al. (2009) found that on exporters' pineapple farms in Ghana, less than half of migrant workers had written contracts. Similarly, Oxfam's research (2004) on Chilean fruit farms also found that the majority of workers had no written contract.

**Moreover, the majority of workers are employed on a non-permanent basis.** The literature also suggests that the majority of these workers are employed on a seasonal, temporary or casual basis, rather than on permanent contracts. For example, a USAID study on the export artichoke sector in Peru (GATE 2007) found that 79 per cent of all men and 84 per cent of all women working in processing plants and on artichoke farms have insecure jobs. Most are employed on a seasonal basis, i.e., they are hired for a specific period of time and then laid off. A similar situation was found in Chile (Oxfam 2004): 75 per cent of women in the agricultural sector are hired on temporary contracts picking fruit.

**Specifically, a substantial proportion of the workforce is indirectly employed.** The literature also shows that a substantial proportion of workers in commercial packhouses, farms and processing units are not employed directly by the enterprise, but rather are employed indirectly via labour agents or contractors (Oxfam 2004, Barrientos and Smith 2006). For example, in a survey of 18 apple growers in South Africa, nine (50%) used contract labour (Barrientos et al. c.2003). Similarly, in the GATE study of the Peruvian export artichoke value chain (2007), key informant interviews and focus group discussions with women workers revealed that there is widespread use of labour contractors/intermediaries, in particular on farms, and that this system of indirect employment often transfers many costs of employment to the worker (e.g., transport and equipment costs).

#### **MANY INFORMALLY-EMPLOYED WORKERS ARE LEGALLY ENTITLED TO GREATER LABOUR PROTECTION AND BENEFITS**

**Seasonal employment is often legal and legitimate.** In the case of agricultural commodities, it is important to note that in many cases the seasonality of employment is legitimate and legal, in that the season of operation of farms and packhouses is dictated by the agronomic characteristics

of the crop in question. This is the case for example with coffee in Rwanda: the coffee harvest only lasts 4-5 months per year, hence coffee washing stations are only operational during this period (IFAD 2010). Likewise, the mango harvest only lasts about four months per year in Mali. The mango drying units and packhouses tend not to process other fruit or crops, so are only operational during the mango harvest season (ITC forthcoming).

**However, many workers with non-permanent employment status actually work virtually all year round.** Notwithstanding the above, the literature demonstrated that it is also common for workers to be employed on a temporary or seasonal basis when the actual number of days worked entitles them to permanent employment status: in these cases, employers are breaking the law and denying workers their right to regular employment. For example, in the study of migrant workers in the export pineapple sector in Ghana (Barrientos et al. 2009), of the sample of 255 migrant workers, 94 per cent said they worked all year round, yet only 55 per cent of them had permanent employment status. Similarly, in the South African fruit sector, Oxfam (2004) found that women hired on seasonal contracts regularly work 8-11 months of the year, year after year.

**As a result, many workers do not receive the legal or social security protections they are entitled to.** For example, the Oxfam study (2004) found that the women illegally employed on a seasonal basis were not receiving paid sick leave or maternity leave that they should have been entitled to under law. In the case of migrant workers in the export pineapple sector in Ghana, only 12 per cent of casual and temporary workers were covered by the national social security scheme, yet nearly all of them were supposed to be covered since employers are legally obliged to register all employees after three months' employment – and in any case many of the non-permanent workers actually work all year round (Barrientos et al. 2009).

#### **INFORMAL WORKERS TEND TO HAVE WORSE WORKING CONDITIONS THAN PERMANENT WORKERS**

**Overall, working conditions decline with increased informality/insecurity of employment.** The literature indicated that, for the most part, workers with the least secure and least formal jobs had the worst pay and conditions. For example, Barrientos et al. (c. 2003) found that in South African apple farms and packhouses, the permanent workers had the best conditions, followed by seasonal and temporary workers, with contract and migrant workers at the bottom of the scale. This hierarchy was reflected in the different standards of living conditions between the various categories of workers. Similarly, Barrientos et al. (2009) found that permanent (migrant) workers in the Ghanaian pineapple sector are more likely to earn above the minimum wage than casual or temporary workers.

**Non-permanent workers also tend to have poorer access to social security protection and benefits.** In most countries, workers in insecure jobs (temporary, seasonal or casual) get fewer legal protections and benefits than those with permanent jobs. For example, informal workers are often entitled only to limited maternity leave and sick leave, are often excluded from health and pension schemes, and often have no access to non-wage benefits such as housing, transport, and food (Oxfam 2004). Moreover, even where non-permanent workers are legally entitled to social security benefits, in practice employers are less likely to honour these entitlements for non-permanent compared to permanent workers. Thus, in the case of migrant workers in the export pineapple sector in Ghana, whereas 55 per cent of permanent workers were covered by the national social security scheme, only 12 per cent of casual and temporary workers are covered (Barrientos et al. 2009). A similar situation was found in the coffee and tea sectors in Rwanda. Rwandan law says that employers should ensure all workers, including temporary and daily workers, join the national Social Security Fund, which covers costs for workplace injuries and occupational diseases as well as providing pensions. However, in practice only very few workers

in the coffee and tea sector are covered by the fund, and these are mostly permanent employees in coffee washing stations and tea factories (IFAD 2010).

**However, in some cases the picture can be more complex.** In the Peruvian artichoke sector for example, workers with insecure jobs have poorer access to non-wage statutory benefits, but on average earn slightly higher wages than those with secure jobs (GATE 2007). In the Ghanaian pineapple study, while permanent workers tended to earn more than casual or temporary workers, it did not follow that households of casual and temporary workers were poorer than those of permanent workers, since casual/temporary workers were more likely to have other sources of income, including from their own smallholdings (Barrientos et al. 2009).

#### **ALL WORKERS, BUT PARTICULARLY TEMPORARY AND CASUAL WORKERS, ARE VULNERABLE TO CHANGES IN MARKET CONDITIONS**

The literature highlighted the fact that workers involved in the focus export sectors are very vulnerable to changes in export market conditions, including changes in consumer preferences and increase in competition from other producing countries. For example, the sudden switch around 2003 from Sweet Cayenne to MD2 as the preferred pineapple type for export meant many Ghanaian producers growing Sweet Cayenne did not receive payments from exporters, or were unable to sell their output at all. As a result, wages went unpaid, and many workers, particularly temporary and casual workers, became unemployed (Barrientos et al. 2009).

#### **COMMON ABUSES OF LABOUR RIGHTS INCLUDE POOR WAGES, EXCESSIVE OVERTIME, AND LACK OF RESPECT FOR TRADE UNION RIGHTS**

With regard to respect for international labour rights, abuses commonly reported in the literature were poor wages, excessive overtime, lack of respect for trade union rights, discrimination against women, and use of irregular employment arrangements to avoid legal obligations. The first three issues are addressed below; the latter two issues are addressed elsewhere in the report.

**Wages in the export commodity sector are often higher than those found in other sectors, but frequently remain well below a living wage.** For example, primary migrant workers in the pineapple sector in Ghana reported that they now earn more than what they had been able to earn previously in their hometowns, and that their current jobs also provided more regular income.

Nevertheless, many workers in the export commodity sectors do not earn more than the minimum wage, and indeed in some cases earn less. Thus, on average the Ghanaian migrant pineapple workers were only earning around the minimum wage (Barrientos et al. 2009); one third of workers in Chilean fruit packhouses earn only the minimum wage or less; and in the UK horticulture industry, a 2003 government investigation found contract workers working for gangmasters picking fruit and flowers at piece rates far below the minimum wage (Oxfam 2004).

Moreover, even where employers are paying the minimum wage or slightly above, this can still fall far short of a living wage. In Colombia for example, women working in the flower industry are generally paid the minimum wage, but the legal minimum wage only covers 45 per cent of a family's basic needs (Oxfam 2004).

**The right to freedom of association and collective bargaining is frequently curtailed.** In Chile for example, seasonal workers on fruit farms are prohibited from bargaining collectively. Moreover, workers fear being blacklisted for becoming union members or for being active within the union, since employers share information about which workers are "troublemakers" (Oxfam 2004). On pineapple farms in Ghana, collective bargaining agreements, where they exist, tend

only to cover permanent workers, with temporary and casual workers – who typically make up the majority of the workforce – remaining outside the agreements (Barrientos et al. 2009).

**Working hours are frequently excessive, and overtime is often compulsory and inadequately compensated.** For example, on fruit farms in Chile, seasonal fruit pickers often work more than 10 hours a day, seven days a week. In Florida, USA, at the height of the picking season, tomato pickers can work 11 hours a day, seven days a week, and they do not receive overtime pay because US state and federal law excludes farm workers from this right. In South African fruit packhouses, complex labelling/packaging requirements and tight shipping deadlines can lead to up to eight hours' compulsory overtime a day, paid only at normal rates. Workers often only get told on the same day that they need to do overtime (Oxfam 2004).

#### **WOMEN REPRESENT A LARGE PROPORTION OF THE WORKFORCE, BUT TYPICALLY HAVE POORER ACCESS TO HIGHER PAID/SECURE JOBS AND FACE ADDITIONAL EMPLOYMENT-RELATED CONSTRAINTS**

**Women constitute a substantial proportion, and often the majority, of the workforce in packhouses and processing units.** For example, the literature provided evidence that women make up the majority of workers in artichoke processing units in Peru (GATE 2007); in flower and vegetable greenhouses in Ecuador, Guatemala, Kenya, Mexico and Zimbabwe (Oxfam 2004); in coffee factories in Uganda (WEMAN Productions 2007); and in mango packing and processing units in Ghana and Mali (ITC forthcoming).

**There is marked horizontal segregation of jobs by gender in farms, packhouses and processing units.** The literature shows that there is a strong gender division of labour on commercial farms as well packhouses and processing units. Women tend to do harvesting; peeling, slicing and chopping of fruit; sorting; grading and packing. In contrast, men tend to operate machinery including driving vehicles; loading and unloading of boxes/crates; and other heavy work requiring considerable physical strength. For example, GATE (2007) found that in the export artichoke sector in Peru, approximately 80 per cent of the labour used in processing activities like peeling, cutting, and de-leafing is female labour, while men mostly do jobs that involve operating and maintaining machinery. On Rwandan tea plantations, the majority of plucking is done by women, whereas men are mainly employed in loading, unloading and transporting the tea by vehicle (IFAD 2010). Likewise, there is a high degree of gender segregation in mango processing plants in Ghana and Mali, with women doing the slicing, grading and packing of the fruit, and men operating ovens and machinery and doing the heavy physical labour (ITC forthcoming).

**Vertical occupational segregation by gender is also commonplace.** The literature also indicates that women tend to be under-represented in better-paid and more secure jobs in all of the focus sectors. For example, data from two tea plantations in Rwanda show that whereas women workers make up 59 per cent of casual workers, women only comprise 6 per cent of junior full-time staff and 16 per cent of senior full-time staff (IFAD 2010). Moreover, Smith et al. (2004) found that in export fruit, flower and vegetable farms and packhouses in Kenya, Zambia and South Africa, men were more likely to be hired in positions viewed as higher skilled, for example as sprayers, irrigators and tractor drivers – positions which were usually permanent and which paid higher wages.

**Poor working conditions have specific negative impacts for women due to their primary responsibility for domestic work.** The literature also highlights specific negative consequences of poor working conditions, in particular excessive overtime, on women as compared to men. For example, both Oxfam (2004) and Smith et al. (2004) found that compulsory overtime arranged at

short notice causes particular challenges for women, since they often incurred extra costs in order to make alternative child care arrangements, or had to leave young children unsupervised.

**Sexual harassment is widespread.** The literature also indicates that sexual harassment by male supervisors is widespread, with supervisors demanding sexual favours in return for getting or keeping jobs. For example, in Smith et al.'s study (2005) of export horticulture commercial farms and packhouses in Kenya, South Africa and Zambia, workers in 11 of the 17 participating companies reported sexual harassment, for the most part referring to male supervisors demanding sexual favours in exchange for promotion, pay rises, or simply continued employment. The researchers found that women's concentration in non-permanent work makes them especially vulnerable to such abuse, as renewal of their contracts often depends on supervisor recommendations. Moreover, according to Oxfam's research (2004), excessive overtime often means that women have to work late into the night, which creates particular risks for women workers having to travel home after public transport vehicles have stopped running.

### 3.2.2 Key Differences Between Sectors and Countries

The characteristics of informal workers noted in **Section 3.2.1** above appear to be widespread across different countries and across the various focus sectors. However, the literature pointed to a number of important differences between commodities and/or countries: these are discussed below.

**The degree of seasonality in employment varies significantly by crop/commodity.** For example, IFAD (2010) notes that in Rwanda, tea harvesting and production occur throughout the year, and hence most tea plantation workers are employed full time. In contrast, coffee is seasonal and only provides employment for about four-five months per year. Meanwhile in the horticulture sector, pineapple farms provide year-round employment for many workers (Barrientos et al. 2009), whereas Malian mango farms, packhouses and processing units typically only provide four-five months' employment for the vast majority of the workforce (ITC forthcoming).

**The gender balance of workers on commercial farms also varies significantly by crop.** In contrast to processing and packing units, which appear to employ a large proportion of women workers regardless of the crop/commodity in question, the literature indicates that female participation rates vary much more widely on farms/plantations. For example, women make up 55-60 per cent of workers on tea plantations in Rwanda (IFAD 201), and nearly half (48%) of workers on commercial export artichoke farms in Peru (GATE 2007). In contrast, women only comprise a small minority of workers on commercial mango plantations in Ghana: for example on one plantation, out of 73 workers, only 7 (less than 10%) were women (ITC forthcoming).

**The extent to which horizontal job segregation translates into gender inequality in pay and conditions depends on the country, crop and the level in the chain.** The literature indicated that, while horizontal job segregation can lead to gender inequalities in pay, this is not always the case. For example, ITC (forthcoming) found that marked gender division of labour in mango processing units in Ghana did not seem to translate into gender pay differentials, since at the two units surveyed all workers on the same grade were paid the same daily wage rate, regardless of the type of work they did. Likewise, in the Peruvian export artichoke sector, GATE (2007) found that on large farms women earn the same or sometimes even slightly more than men: the female-male wage differential was 101 per cent.

In other cases however, horizontal job segregation does lead to women being concentrated in lower paid jobs. For example, in the Peruvian artichoke sector, in contrast to the situation on large farms, women workers on small-medium farms and in processing units on average earn

slightly less than men (88% and 94% respectively) (GATE 2007). IFAD (2010) found that in Rwandan coffee washing stations, the sorting of the coffee beans, which is mostly done by women, is remunerated at a fixed daily wage of about F 500-600 per day. In contrast, carrying and weighing of the coffee beans, which is mostly done by men, is remunerated at a piece rate which typically generates a higher income per day, usually in the region of F 700-800.

### **3.2.3 Evidence of Changes in the Last 10-15 Years**

#### **CASUALIZATION AND FEMINIZATION OF LABOUR?**

**Little evidence was found of the feminization and casualization of labour in the focus sectors.** In the overview value chain impact studies (i.e., Category 3 resources), frequent reference is made to the “feminization” and “casualization” of labour in the agricultural sector as a whole, resulting from increased pressure from international buyers (e.g., Posthumus 2007; Lastarria-Cornhiel 2008). However, while the literature provided significant evidence that there is currently a high proportion of women and casual workers in many of the focus commodity value chains, little evidence could be found to support the view that the proportions has actually *increased* in recent years. This of course does not necessarily imply that these changes are not taking place. However, the case that recent changes in global value chain characteristics are causing feminization and/or casualization of labour does not appear to be “proven” as yet for the focus commodity sectors.

Moreover, where evidence was found of casualization, important factors other than buyer demands were also influential in bringing about these changes. Barrientos et al. (c. 2003) found clear evidence that commercial apple growers in South Africa had reduced the number of permanent workers and increased the number of non-permanent workers they employed. Thus, out of 18 growers interviewed, 15 said they were reducing permanent labour, and half of them had recently started using contract labour. However, although increasing pressure from buyers was one contributing factor, during the same period the industry also faced increasing competition from other producing countries as well as significant changes in national labour legislation, both of which were specific to South Africa and are likely to have contributed significantly to the casualization of labour.

#### **INCREASED PRESSURE ON WORKERS**

There is some evidence in the literature to suggest that workers are being put under increasing pressure to meet production targets and deadlines. For example, Oxfam (2004) found that in Colombia, flower workers’ production targets have been dramatically increased, from 24 flower beds in the 1980s to 42 beds in the early 2000s. Workers were expected to meet the higher production targets for the same pay.

#### **RELAXATION OF LABOUR LAWS**

The literature also indicates that in the last 10-15 years, a significant number of producing countries have relaxed their labour laws in response to global market pressures. For example, according to Oxfam (2004), labour law reforms that took effect in Colombia in 2002 lengthened the working day, cut overtime pay, reduced severance pay and introduced more flexible contracts. These changes have had negative impacts on workers in the export flower industry.

## **VOLUNTARY LABOUR CODES/STANDARDS HAVE IMPROVED WORKING CONDITIONS FOR MANY PERMANENT WORKERS, BUT FEW TEMPORARY, CASUAL AND CONTRACT WORKERS**

Available literature on the impact of voluntary labour codes and standards demonstrates that such codes/standards have led to some improvements in working conditions for workers that fall within the scope of these codes. According to a five-country study of the impact of labour codes, which included horticulture case studies in South Africa, Costa Rica and the UK (Barrientos and Smith 2006), codes have led to fairly widespread improvements in the following areas for scoped workers:

- **Improvements in health and safety**, including improved provision of sanitation and safety equipment and facilities, and improved health and safety procedures and training. In many cases these measures have led to fewer accidents, better worker health and workers feeling safer and more secure at work.
- **Reduced regular and overtime hours**. However, while some workers, especially women, have appreciated these changes, the impact of reduced hours has been negative for other workers, since it has led to a reduction in their overall earnings.
- **Ensuring payment of the minimum wage and provision of state insurance and pensions**. In some cases code implementation has led to wages of seasonal and contract workers being increased to the national minimum wage.

The literature also indicates that, compared to other key categories of informal workers (i.e., smallholders and workers in informal enterprises), workers employed in formal enterprises have been the most likely to benefit from codes. However, within formal enterprises, formal workers (i.e., permanent and regular workers) have benefited more from codes than informal workers; the latter, in particular migrant and contract workers, have typically seen little improvement in their conditions as a result of codes (e.g., Barrientos and Smith 2006).

Moreover, the literature also shows that codes have had limited impact in addressing widespread gender discrimination and abuse of trade union rights, nor have they had much impact in ensuring the provision of regular employment and payment of a *living* (as opposed to minimum) wage (Barrientos and Smith 2006). For example, on Ghanaian pineapple export farms where supermarket codes apply, employment legislation regarding regular employment is systematically flouted. Thus, nearly half of all workers remain uncovered by the state social security scheme, and many workers employed on a casual basis actually work all year round (Barrientos et al. 2009).

### **3.3 Owners of Informal Enterprises (Smallholders, Small-Scale Processors, Traders)**

#### **3.3.1 Roles and Conditions of Smallholders – General Trends**

The following roles and conditions were found across a range of the focus commodity sectors and in more than one country, and were therefore judged to be cross-cutting trends.

#### **PRODUCTION OF FOCUS COMMODITIES FOR EXPORT CAN CONTRIBUTE SIGNIFICANTLY TO SMALLHOLDER HOUSEHOLD INCOME AND IMPROVE LIVELIHOODS**

The literature indicates that, despite the constraints outlined below, engagement in the focus export commodity chains can contribute significantly to smallholders' household incomes. A key advantage compared to growing crops for the domestic market is that the focus export crops

typically fetch higher farmgate prices: thus, FAO (c. 2004) reports for example that in Kenya, exotic (exported) mango varieties fetch higher farmgate prices than local varieties.

Moreover, the literature provides evidence that the extra income from export sales can generate positive impacts on smallholder livelihoods. For example, Challies' research on smallholder production of raspberries for export (Challies 2010) showed that, although raspberry production was not the primary income source for most of the participating smallholder households, raspberry income had nevertheless allowed smallholders to: make on-farm investments that have led to improved productivity and increased compliance with market standards; make investments in other small business ventures; carry out home improvements; and increase savings to pay for children's education. Challies also identified significant non-economic benefits for the smallholders: men and women alike reported that it was far more rewarding working on their own farm (compared to carrying out waged labour), and women in particular valued the opportunity provided by raspberry production to work at home. Women expressed a strong preference for working at home, due to the dangers associated with working as temporary labourers away from home, and the ability to combine work with domestic responsibilities and spending time with family and friends.

**However, it is important to recognize that smallholder households typically rely on multiple sources of income/livelihood, of which export commodity production is only one.** The literature also draws attention to the fact that, although income and benefits from export production can be significant, smallholder households seldom rely solely on export crops for income. For example, smallholder households involved in raspberry production in Chile tend to depend on off-farm waged labour as their main source of income, and grow at least one other cash crop other than raspberries (Challies 2010). Similarly, coffee farmers in Uganda supplement their coffee income with other crops mainly sold in local markets, such as maize, pineapples and beans. Moreover, 70 per cent of the households had at least one (male) member who migrated to town for work (WEMAN Productions 2007).

The implications of this are twofold. On the one hand, the extent to which export production increases overall household income is frequently not dramatic. However, on the positive side, this also implies that many smallholder households are unlikely to be as vulnerable to changes in export market conditions as some of the literature suggests, given that export sales only constitute one of several income sources for the household.

#### **HOWEVER, BARRIERS TO ENTRY MEAN THAT THE POOREST SMALLHOLDERS ARE UNABLE TO PARTICIPATE**

The literature also highlighted that production costs associated with the focus export crops can often be significantly higher than for alternative local crops. Thus for example in Peru, the cost of cultivating one hectare of thornless (export) artichokes is approximately US\$300 in the first year, and can increase in subsequent years. This makes thornless artichokes substantially more costly than growing the thorny artichokes that can be sold in the local market, since the latter require less inputs (GATE 2007).

Moreover, the literature indicates that the higher production costs frequently associated with export production act as a barrier to entry for the poorest farmers. Thus, in Peru, while 67 per cent of smallholders growing the thornless artichokes for export were below the national poverty line, they were typically less poor than smallholders growing other products (GATE 2007). Similarly, while many smallholder households in Ghana have mango trees, growing mangoes for export involves significant additional costs, such as purchase and planting of seedlings (since export varieties are different from the common local varieties), purchase of inputs and higher

maintenance costs. These high investment costs make export mango production impossible for many smallholders, including most female smallholders (ITC forthcoming).

**MOREOVER, PARTICIPATING SMALLHOLDERS FACE A RANGE OF CONSTRAINTS THAT LIMIT THE INCOME AND BENEFITS THEY GAIN FROM PARTICIPATION**

Much of the literature highlighted the fact that, even for those smallholders who are able to participate in the export market, they face many constraints that limit the amount of income and benefits they can gain from participation.

**For one, income provided by export crops is typically only seasonal.** For example, income from cocoa in Ghana is only seasonal, and a key challenge for cocoa smallholder households is being able to earn enough income in the cocoa off-season (Chan 2010). Similarly, in Mali, income from export sales of mangoes only provides income to smallholders for four months a year (ITC forthcoming); and although the raspberry season lasts longer than that of many alternative cash crops, income from raspberry production nevertheless only provides income for Chilean smallholders for around five months a year (Challies 2010).

**Secondly, high production costs can limit profitability.** For example, in the case of artichoke production in Peru, some farmers report that despite the higher price fetched for the thornless export variety, it is actually more profitable for them to grow the thorny varieties for sale in local markets, due to the significantly higher production costs associated with growing the thornless artichokes (GATE 2007).

**Thirdly, smallholders tend to have weak negotiating power and so are forced to accept sub-optimum prices and conditions.** According to GATE (2007), this is the case with thornless artichoke producers in Peru artichokes. The thornless variety is a new crop that has no local market, so producers are fully dependent on exporter-processors and are therefore forced to accept sub-optimum price and contract conditions. Similarly, Fromm and Dubon (2006) report that the coffee export chain in Honduras is characterized by asymmetric power relations, with only exporters having access to information on international market conditions. The exporters and intermediaries set the price and standards, leaving producers (mostly smallholders) little room for negotiation. Moreover, according to FAO (c. 2004), mango smallholders in Kenya often receive prices well below the prevailing market price due to their lack of collective bargaining power: farmers negotiate individually rather than collectively with traders and buyers, and often have poor access to information on alternative marketing possibilities.

**Even where smallholders are organized, producer groups' poor knowledge of international commodity markets often leads to poor decision-making and reduced income.** While effective organization can clearly help increase smallholders' bargaining power and conditions, their lack of market knowledge frequently hampers their success. For example, IFAD (2010) observes that in the case of coffee smallholder co-operatives in Rwanda, their "limited understanding of the workings of the world market have occasionally (most recently in 2008) led them to take some very bad decisions concerning the timing of the sale of their coffee. There is little doubt that improved knowledge of international market principles would help producers and their cooperatives to make more informed and hopefully better decisions."

**Finally, the smallholder sector is typified by low productivity, yet smallholders face substantial constraints to improving productivity.** For example, the primarily smallholder-based cocoa sectors in Ghana and Cameroon obtain average yields of 350-400 kilograms per hectare and under 400 kilograms per hectare respectively, yet potential yields are 1-3 tons per hectare (IDS c.2009; Coulter et al. 2010). In the coffee sector in Cameroon, productivity is also low at around

290 kilograms per hectare, compared to potential yields of up to over 2 tons per hectare. (Coulter et al. 2010).

The literature identified the following as key constraints that prevent smallholders from improving productivity:

- high cost and inappropriate use of fertilizers and pesticides
- poor availability and/or uptake of improved planting material
- poor knowledge of improved production and post-harvest handling techniques, due to poor access to information and extension services
- poor access to credit, which limits smallholders' ability to invest in inputs, labour, replanting and fixed assets for production
- poor transport and communications infrastructure, leading to inefficient and reliable delivery of products, high transport costs and high post-harvest losses (IDS c.2009; FAO c.2004; Coulter et al. 2010)

**SMALLHOLDER GAINS FROM PARTICIPATION IN THE FOCUS COMMODITY CHAINS ARE ALSO PRECARIOUS, AND CAN BE SWIFTLY ERODED BY CHANGES IN MARKET CONDITIONS**

The literature also draws attention to the vulnerability of smallholders to sudden changes in export market conditions. For example, Tuvhag (2008) argues that the negative impact of falling coffee prices during 1998-2001 on coffee producers in Nicaragua demonstrates smallholders' vulnerability to fluctuating prices in export markets. The author notes that during this period, extreme poverty in Nicaragua on average decreased by 47 per cent, and school enrolment rates at both the primary and secondary levels increased. In contrast, in coffee growing areas extreme poverty actually increased (by 5%), and primary school enrolment rates fell. Challies (2010) reports that increasing competition from other countries supplying fresh raspberries means that Chilean exporters have started moving from fresh to processed/frozen raspberries, and also to newer non-traditional agricultural exports, particularly blueberries. Whereas smallholders have a competitive advantage compared to larger scale producers in the production of fresh raspberries, the opposite is the case for processed raspberries and blueberry production: the latter is much more conducive to large-scale production than raspberries. Therefore, smallholder participation in the Chilean fruit export chain could fall rapidly in the near future.

**FEWER WOMEN SMALLHOLDERS ENGAGE IN THE FOCUS VALUE CHAINS DUE TO GREATER BARRIERS TO ENTRY, AND THOSE WHO DO ENGAGE FACE DISPROPORTIONATE CONSTRAINTS**

**The literature indicates that fewer women than men smallholders are involved in production of the focus export crops, because women face greater barriers to entry – in particular poor/insecure access to land** (e.g., Schneider et al. 2010). For example, ITC (forthcoming) reports that in Mali, women make up less than 1 per cent of mango smallholders involved in export production, primarily because women do not have secure access to land (they are only given usufruct rights to grow annual crops). In Ghana, women typically only comprise 2-5 per cent of members in mango producer groups. Access to land is also an issue in Ghana, however the main barrier to entry for women is the scale of investment required to establish a mango farm, combined with the lack of income from the mango trees in the first few years after establishment. This affects women more than men because women have less savings (ITC forthcoming). Similarly, WEMAN Productions (2007) report that in coffee growing areas in Uganda, women are mostly still denied land rights and are therefore largely restricted to farming

on land owned by their families or husbands, with little security of tenure. Their lack of land title also means poor access to credit and export markets.

Moreover, the literature also points to the fact that women smallholders who are engaged in export production face greater constraints and lower returns than men. Key constraints mentioned include:

- **Women smallholders tend to have smaller plots than male smallholders.** For example, IFAD (2010) found that in Rwanda, male coffee producers/heads of households had on average 194 trees, whereas female heads of household had on average only 139 trees. Moreover, UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) reported that women cocoa farmers in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana tend to have smaller plots than men.
- **Women smallholders also tend to have poorer access to other factors of production.** Women typically have poorer access than men to household labour, credit, training and extension, and membership of producer groups. The result is that women farmers often achieve lower yields than men (UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad 2009; ITC forthcoming).
- **Women smallholders are constrained by their responsibility for domestic work.** Women also tend to have limited time to spend on export farms, due to their primary responsibility for childcare and domestic work, as well as production of subsistence crops (e.g., Chan 2010). For example, IFAD (2010) found that in Rwanda, despite the fact that in the aftermath of the genocide women have taken on many roles traditionally done by men, women continue to bear almost exclusive responsibility for domestic work, including cleaning, cooking, laundry, fetching water and childcare. As a result, to allow adequate time on their farms, women typically have to work more than 10 hours per day.

### 3.3.2 Smallholder Conditions – Key Differences Between Sectors/Countries

The characteristics of smallholders noted in **Section 3.3.1** above appear to be fairly widespread across different countries and across the various focus sectors. However, the literature pointed to a number of important differences between commodities and/or countries: these are discussed below.

#### **PROFITABILITY OF SMALLHOLDER PRODUCTION VARIES SIGNIFICANTLY BY CROP**

The literature indicated that the profitability and therefore income available to smallholders from export production varies significantly by crop. On the one hand, Challies (2010) found that export raspberry production in Chile is quite lucrative at small scales. Not only is the crop of relatively high value (in particular for fresh export), but smallholders also enjoy a significant competitive advantage compared to larger producers, due to the relatively low start-up capital requirements, a rapid return on the initial investment, and the ability to meet labour requirements from within the household. On the other hand, tree crops such as coffee, tea, cocoa and mango are associated with high investment costs and lack of income in the initial years, which can make it difficult for smallholders to make a profit, at least in the first few years after establishment (IFAD 2010; ITC forthcoming). Moreover, as already noted, the high costs of inputs make export artichoke production in Peru less profitable for some farmers than growing local varieties for domestic markets (GATE 2007).

#### **PRODUCTIVITY CAN ALSO VARY SIGNIFICANTLY BY COUNTRY/REGION**

Some of the literature also indicates that smallholder productivity for any given crop can vary quite substantially between developing countries, presumably depending on the availability of key production inputs such as finance, training and extension in different countries. For example, Coulter et al. (2010) contrast the low productivity of smallholder coffee growers in Cameroon (typically around 290 kg per ha) with the high productivity levels found in Vietnam (2,200 kg per ha) and in Indonesia (700 kg per ha). Yet coffee production in both Vietnam and Indonesia is also predominantly smallholder-based.

#### **ALTHOUGH WOMEN GENERALLY PARTICIPATE LESS THAN MEN, FEMALE PARTICIPATION RATES VARY SIGNIFICANTLY BY CROP AND COUNTRY**

Although the literature indicates that in general women smallholders participate less than male smallholders in export production, some of the literature also demonstrates the variability in female participation rates (e.g., Schneider and Gugerty 2010). On the one hand, as already noted female smallholders' participation in export mango production is very low in both Mali and Ghana (less than 1% and between 2-10% respectively) (ITC forthcoming). However, female participation in smallholder coffee production in Rwanda is significantly higher: an estimated 116,000 (30%) out of 390,000 coffee growers are women, and there is no significant gender difference in membership of coffee producer co-operatives (IFAD 2010). Moreover, several studies cited in Schneider and Gugerty (2010) found that women actually made up the majority of contract farmers in several non-traditional export vegetable schemes in Kenya and Zimbabwe.

### **3.3.3 Smallholder Conditions – Evidence of Changes in Last 10-15 Years**

The literature highlighted significant changes in the terms and conditions of smallholder engagement in the focus value chains over the last 10-15 years. The key changes identified are discussed below.

#### **PRODUCERS OF TRADITIONAL EXPORT COMMODITIES HAVE FACED FALLING REAL PRICES, AND A DECLINE IN PRICE STABILITY, PRODUCT QUALITY AND ACCESS TO PRODUCTION INPUTS AND SERVICES FOLLOWING MARKET LIBERALIZATION**

**The literature shows that coffee and cocoa producers have faced a (continuing) long-term decline in real prices over the last 10-15 years.** The world coffee price approximately halved in real terms from the 1960s until the early 2000s, due to limited barriers to entry and emergence of new supply countries (Fitter et al. 2001). Since the mid-1980s, there has also been a long-term decline in the world price of cocoa, reaching a trough in the late 1990s. Although world market prices saw a partial recovery after 2000/1, in real terms prices were still 13 per cent lower in 2005/6 than in 1993/4 (IDS c.2009).

Moreover, since the early 1990s, market liberalization measures promoted by global finance institutions have led to a number of important changes for smallholder producers in the traditional commodities sectors.

**Firstly, market liberalization has led to reduced access to production inputs and services for smallholders.** In the Ghanaian cocoa sector for example, prior to the liberalization of domestic cocoa purchasing in 1993, the Produce Buying Company made cash advances to cocoa farmers on the basis of future cocoa sales. However, the emergence of multiple Licenced Buying Companies (LBCs) since liberalization has made it difficult to operate similar loan schemes, due

to the risk of farmers selling to another LBC. As a result, access to finance and credit has become a major problem for cocoa smallholders, with many farmers depending on informal moneylenders who demand high interest rates and large assets (e.g., cocoa farms) as collateral. Moreover, farmers have also seen a significant reduction in access to cocoa extension/advice. As part of the liberalization measures, dedicated government-supported extension services for cocoa farmers were curtailed in 2001 and amalgamated under the unified extension services of the Ministry of Food and Agriculture, leading to a decline in both the quantity and quality of extension services (IDS c.2009).

**Secondly, while liberalisation has allowed producers to get an increased share of FOB prices, it has also increased their exposure to high price fluctuations.** For example, liberalization of the coffee and cocoa sectors in Cameroon constituted a mixed blessing for smallholders. On the positive side, farmers found themselves getting paid on time, and with increased competition and reduced taxes, they got a higher proportion of the export prices. On the other hand, they felt the full impact of world price variability and experienced periods where prices did not cover the costs of production, a problem that was particularly severe with coffee. As a result, many coffee farmers were forced to give up coffee farming, diversifying instead into a range of local food crops such as plantain, maize and groundnuts (Coulter et al. 2010).

**Thirdly, market liberalization has led to a decline in quality and therefore export price, due to growing disorganization in the chain.** The literature also shows that at least in some countries, liberalization has led to declining product quality. In Cameroon for example, liberalization led to a proliferation of local buyers and exporters. As a result the market became more chaotic, and smallholders found they could sell cocoa and coffee regardless of its quality. Thus with a reduced incentive to ensure high standards, the quality of coffee and cocoa supplied by smallholders deteriorated, which in turn negatively affected the export price (Coulter et al. 2010).

#### **INCREASED MARKET DIVERSIFICATION HAS CREATED HIGHER VALUE EXPORT OPPORTUNITIES FOR SOME SMALLHOLDERS, BUT THE MAJORITY OF SMALLHOLDERS ARE NOT BENEFITTING**

**Some of the literature highlights how the differentiation of certain commodity markets in recent years has created new, higher value export opportunities for smallholders.** Particular attention is given to the coffee market, where the growth in markets for specialty, organic and fair trade products since the 1990s has been substantial. According to Fromm and Dubon (2006), the farmgate price for specialty coffee in Honduras can be up to twice that for regular coffee, and initiatives by NGOs and local institutions to increase smallholders' access to these markets has led to higher prices for participating smallholders. Participation in high value markets has also brought other benefits to smallholders compared to participation in regular markets: these include entry into more binding (longer term and trusting) contractual relationships with buyers, increased compliance with quality and environmental standards, and greater product up-grading. Their analysis also shows that the first two factors have a large positive influence on farmers' total coffee sales.

**Fairtrade VCs also appear to have brought specific additional benefits for smallholders.** For example, Tuvhag (2008) highlights the benefits to smallholders of the price stabilization mechanism and improved access to credit and information brought about participation in the Fairtrade coffee value chain in Costa Rica. Indeed, he argues that these two factors, rather than the price premium per se, are more important in helping smallholders to diversity opportunities in the long run.

However, the literature also highlights the fact that the majority of smallholders do not benefit from the growth in high value markets in consumer countries. There are three factors at play here.

**Firstly, high value products usually only represent a small proportion of overall export volumes** (e.g., Fitter and Kaplinsky 2001). For example, specialty coffee only represents 2 per cent of coffee exports from Honduras (Fromm et al. 2006). In Ghana, despite the country being a long-established and significant exporter of Fairtrade cocoa (IDS c. 2009), Fairtrade cocoa exports still only accounted for just over 1 per cent of total cocoa exports from Ghana in 2008/9.<sup>2</sup>

**Secondly, increasing price differentiation in consumer markets is not in general leading to growing differentiation in prices paid to growers.** Fitter and Kaplinsky's analysis (2001) of price differentiation in the international coffee market demonstrated that, between the mid-1980s and 2000, differentiation of coffee retail prices and global market prices increased significantly. In contrast, the differentiation in prices paid to growers had not increased in ten major exporting countries, and if anything had *decreased* during the same period. According to Fitter and Kaplinsky and Tuvhag (2008), the key reasons for the failure of growers to capture a proportionate share of retail price increases for high quality products are the de-concentration/decreasing organization of growers on the one hand (in part due to donor-influenced liberalization measures), coupled with increasing concentration of power in consumer markets (i.e., increasing concentration of importing, roasting and retail markets). The international coffee market is therefore characterized by an increasingly asymmetric set of power relations, with producer countries unable to negotiate or secure a fair share of the profits.

**Finally, high value markets are often associated with higher costs, and are therefore not necessarily more profitable and create additional barriers to entry for smallholders.** For example, IDS (c.2009) highlights the following additional costs of growing cocoa for Fairtrade and organic as opposed to mainstream markets: the costs of acquiring and sustaining the capacity to meet inspection fees; the costs of implementing efficient traceability systems; and the costs of meeting higher quality standards.

#### **VOLUNTARY CODES AND STANDARDS HAVE INCREASED BARRIERS TO ENTRY FOR MOST SMALLHOLDERS**

**Much of the literature on smallholders highlights the additional barriers to entry created by the increasing demand for compliance with voluntary and other market standards.** For example, FAO (c.2004) pinpoints compliance with EUREP GAP<sup>3</sup> standards as the main challenge for smallholders wishing to enter or continue to supply the mango export market in Kenya. Similarly, Challies (2010) comments on the challenge for Chilean raspberry smallholders of complying with the Buenas Practicas Agricolas (BPA) standards, which were introduced by the Chilean Ministry of Agriculture in response to changing global market requirements. The BPA standards are less stringent than global market standards such as Global GAP and USA GAP, but they still require levels of investment and technical know-how that many smallholders cannot meet without support. Further, Challies points out that BPA compliance alone is increasingly insufficient to guarantee participation in the global value chain, which leaves non-compliant growers in an increasingly tenuous and vulnerable position.

**Moreover, while various initiatives exist to help smallholders comply with standards, many only target "larger" smallholders.** In Chile for example, *Plan Nacional*, the main national level

---

<sup>2</sup> Source: [www.fairtrade.org.uk/producers/cacao/kuapa\\_kokoo\\_union.aspx](http://www.fairtrade.org.uk/producers/cacao/kuapa_kokoo_union.aspx)

<sup>3</sup> Now renamed GLOBAL GAP

government programme concerned with increasing smallholder compliance, is targeted primarily at farms of over 0.5 hectares: yet the majority of smallholder raspberry farms are less than 0.5 ha in size. Moreover, over the three-year project cycle the programme target is to reach 800 growers in total: this only represents less than 10 per cent of the estimated 10,000-plus small-scale raspberry growers in Chile (Challies 2010).

#### **CHANGING DEMOGRAPHICS AND YOUTH ASPIRATIONS HAVE LED TO SCARCITY OF LABOUR**

Some of the literature also highlights the impacts of growing rural-urban migration and changing youth aspirations on the availability of labour for export commodity production. For example, IDS (c.2009) found that increasing rural-urban migration in Ghana has reduced the previous supply of migrant seasonal farm labour in cocoa producing regions. As a result, the high cost and poor availability of labour constitute increasing challenges for Ghanaian cocoa farmers, challenges which in turn negatively impact farm size, productivity and total output.

#### **3.3.4 Roles and Conditions of Informal Entrepreneurs Other than Smallholders**

The value chain literature on the focus commodities provided very little information about owners of informal enterprises other than smallholders. In fact, only one of the 16 key resources reviewed (ITC forthcoming) provided an analysis of the role of informal processors and intermediaries/traders at all. The ITC study, which focused on women's roles in the export mango value chains in Mali and Ghana, found that women predominate as owners of mango processing units, but are limited to small-scale (presumably mostly informal) enterprises. Constraints faced by these small-scale women processors included limited access to finance, difficulty in finding markets, and poor access to operational equipment and materials.

The ITC study also found that women play a key role as *pisteurs* (traders/intermediaries) in the Bamako area, one of Mali's main export production zones. Women's predominance as *pisteurs* reflects the fact that women are traditionally responsible for sale of agricultural products in local markets. Key constraints identified for women *pisteurs* included difficulty in raising start-up funds, lack of capital to expand/upgrade their operations (which are currently small-scale), and high reject rates from exporters.

### **3.4 Informal Workers in Informal Enterprises (Hired Labour Employed by Smallholders)**

This category of informal workers is not well covered in the value chain literature. Only three of the 16 key resources reviewed addressed issues facing hired labour on smallholder farms, and in two of these cases the analysis was not detailed. The available literature provided some relevant information on the general roles and conditions of these workers, but did not provide any significant information on differences between sectors/countries or on changes in conditions in the last 10-15 years. Key findings identified included:

- **Although many smallholders rely primarily on family labour, many do hire labour at peak periods.** Thus, ITC (forthcoming) found that most mango smallholders in Ghana hire labour during the harvest season, and UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) report that while 87 per cent of labour on cocoa smallholdings in Côte d'Ivoire is provided by the producers' household, hired labour is also used to supply the remainder.

- **Migrant workers often make up a substantial proportion of hired workers on smallholder farms.** For example, UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) estimate that 30 per cent of hired workers on cocoa smallholdings in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire are migrant, many of whom come from neighbouring countries such as Mali, Burkina Faso, Niger and Guinea. Meanwhile, on pineapple farms in Ghana, 35-40 per cent of workers are estimated to be (internal) migrant workers, many of whom work on smallholder farms (Barrientos et al. 2009).
- **Female labour is often significant.** For example, Dolan (2002) found that over 75 per cent of labour hired by smallholder contract farmers to plant, pick, weed and grade French beans were female; and ITC (forthcoming) found that approximately 50 per cent of hired labourers on smallholder mango farms are women.
- **Gender division of labour is marked.** For example, ITC (forthcoming) found strong gender division of labour amongst hired workers on Ghanaian mango smallholdings, with men mainly employed to do the pruning and pick the fruit from the trees, while women are largely employed to wash, grade and carry the fruit from the farm. In the case of hired labour on cocoa smallholdings in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire, UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) report that women are mainly employed to do the sorting and sifting of beans on the drying tables.
- **Gender division of labour often leads to differences in pay between women and men workers.** For example, ITC (forthcoming) found that on mango smallholdings in Ghana, workers get paid the same daily wage for most tasks. However, pruning – which is mainly done by men – is paid on a piece rate, and those who work fast get paid significantly more per day than other types of workers. In addition, UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) found that on cocoa farms in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire, tasks done by women tend to be associated with lower pay, whereas more physically demanding tasks – which are mainly done by men – are better paid.
- **Common problems faced by hired workers on smallholder farms** include poor wages, lack of paid annual and sick leave, lack of proper compensation for overtime work, restrictions on freedom of association, and poor access to health and safety equipment and facilities including personal protective equipment, medical facilities, toilet facilities and safe drinking water (Ethical Trading Initiative 2005).

### **3.5 Contributing Family Labour (Unpaid Family Labour on Smallholdings, etc.)**

#### **3.5.1 Roles and Conditions – General Trends**

This category of informal workers is not well covered in the value chain literature (only three of the 16 key resources reviewed addressed this category). Moreover, contributing family labour only has any visibility at all in the literature that focused specifically on gender issues. The key issues facing this group of workers are summarized below.

#### **CONTRIBUTION OF UNPAID FAMILY LABOUR IS FREQUENTLY A PRE-REQUISITE FOR THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF SMALLHOLDER EXPORT PRODUCTION**

A number of the references point out the fact that the economic viability of smallholder export production, including contract farming in export value chains, is fundamentally dependent on the (usually male) smallholder's access to (usually female) unpaid family labour. Companies only tend to source products from smallholders in cases where small-scale production offers cost or other commercial advantages over large-scale production, and typically companies view

smallholders as having a competitive advantage in producing labour-intensive crops (e.g., Challies 2010; Dolan 2002; Mehra and Hill Rojas 2008). Yet production of these crops is frequently only profitable for smallholders if much of the labour can be supplied by unpaid family labour rather than hired labour (Dolan 2002).

#### **MAJORITY OF EXPORT CONTRACTS ARE GIVEN TO MEN, BUT WIVES PROVIDE A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF LABOUR ON MALE SMALLHOLDERS' EXPORT PLOTS**

Moreover, the literature on gender and contract farming highlights the fact that in the majority of cases, it is men who are given the supply contracts, i.e., men are the “smallholders,” whereas it is primarily women who are the ones supplying unpaid family labour. Indeed, the literature highlights the fact that wives typically supply a substantial amount, and often the majority, of labour on male smallholders' export plots (e.g., Mehra and Hill Rojas 2008; Chan 2010). For example, Dolan (2002) found that in Mehru, Kenya, over 90 per cent of French bean contracts were issued to men, but it is unpaid female family labour that does the majority of the labour on these farms. She found that women perform 72 per cent of the labour on French beans, whereas only about 27 per cent of men do any work on French bean plots at all. Moreover, even when men do contribute labour, most of the tasks they do, such as ploughing and fertilizer application, require less overall labour. Similarly, Chan (2010) found that at a smallholder coffee cooperative in Uganda, more than 85 per cent of registered coffee farmers were men, yet women did 90 per cent of the work on members' coffee farms; and even in Côte d'Ivoire where cocoa farming is predominantly seen as a “male” activity, wives are regularly involved in 12 out of 19 key stages of cocoa production on male-owned cocoa farms, with primary responsibility for tending immature cocoa plots and carrying out post-harvest activities (UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad 2009).

**Moreover, the literature indicated that marked gender division of labour is common in smallholder cultivation, with wives responsible for specific tasks.** Thus for example, IFAD (2010) found that on coffee smallholdings in Rwanda, planting, shaping and pruning is mainly done by men, whereas weeding and harvesting is mainly done by women. On tea smallholdings, clearing land for new fields, planting of tea bushes and pruning is mainly done by men, whereas weeding and plucking is mostly done by women. In male-owned mango smallholdings in Ghana, men do the majority of the work, but women assist specifically with managing and cooking for hired labour, and carrying out harvesting and post-harvest activities (ITC forthcoming).

#### **FREQUENTLY HOWEVER, WIVES ARE NOT COMPENSATED FOR THEIR LABOUR AND RECEIVE LITTLE OF THE INCOME AND BENEFITS FROM EXPORT CROPS**

The literature strongly suggests that, while women contribute a substantial amount of the labour on male-owned export farms, wives are typically not compensated for their labour. Thus, in the case of French bean production in Kenya, while women do the majority of the work on men's bean plots, Dolan (2002) found that men do not reciprocate by contributing more of their own labour to women's plots. In contrast, since engaging in bean production men are actually contributing *less* labour than before to women's plots; as a result, women have had to start hiring labour to perform tasks that were previously done by their husbands.

**In addition, wives are typically not given a fair share of the income from export crops.** Thus in the Kenyan French bean example, Dolan (2002) found that while women provide 72 per cent of the labour, they only receive 38 per cent of the income from French beans. This is because customarily, household income is pooled and the male head of household decides how income is

spent. Whether or not wives get to keep the income from French beans therefore depends largely on the husband's goodwill. Moreover, Dolan found that even when women did receive the money, they were often compelled to contribute this cash to types of household expenditure that would typically have been the husband's responsibility. IFAD (2010) reports a similar situation with income from coffee and tea in Rwanda. Even although women spend about twice the amount of time tending the crops than men, other than in female-headed households, men are usually the ones who collect and retain payment for the produce and decide on how it is spent. Typically, men allocate some of the income for basic household necessities, but then keep the rest for personal use.

#### **IN SOME CASES, EXPORT PRODUCTION HAS A NET NEGATIVE IMPACT ON WOMEN'S INCOME AND WELL-BEING**

Furthermore, the literature indicates that not only do women fail to receive a fair share of the benefits, in some cases they actually suffer a net loss in income and/or well-being as a result of the household's engagement in export production.

**In particular, much of the literature draws attention to the fact that unequal distribution of income from export crops can lead to intra-household conflict and domestic violence** (e.g., Schneider and Gugerty 2010; Dolan 2002). For example, Dolan (2002) reports that in Mehru, Kenya, women farmers describe French beans, coffee and tea as "crops that cause wife-beating." This is because many husbands misuse the income from these crops, and wives who challenge their husbands on this behaviour are frequently subjected to domestic violence. A similar case is reported in Tanzania, where the wife of a coffee farmer was regularly beaten for asking her husband what he had done with the income from their coffee farm (Chan 2010).

**The literature also reports cases of men appropriating land over which wives previously had usufruct rights.** For example, ITC (forthcoming) alludes to reports that men in the north of Ghana have been cutting down shea trees on their farms in order to grow mangoes for export. Traditionally, men have permitted their wives to collect and sell sheanuts from their farms, and this has been an important source of cash for women given that very few women in this region have their own land. There are therefore concerns that the growth in export mango production is eroding a key income source for wives of mango growers.

Dolan (2002) reports similar dynamics regarding French bean production in Kenya. Over 95 per cent of land in Kenya is registered to men, and women's access to land remains highly contingent on their status as wives, mothers and daughters. Prior to smallholders' engagement in export horticulture, husbands typically gave their wives usufruct rights for garden plots where women could grow vegetables for household consumption and sale to local markets. Importantly, women were also given control over the income they obtained from these crops. However, the rise of export French bean contract farming has led men to challenge these usufruct rights. Over 33 per cent of the 94 women interviewed by Dolan claimed that their husbands had either forced them to grow French beans on their plots, or had retracted their usufruct rights altogether (i.e., re-appropriated the land). Given that these vegetable plots are typically the only land women can use for crop production, these women have few options for alternative income-generating activities.

## **HOWEVER, THESE GENDER INEQUALITIES ARE LARGELY A RESULT OF ENTRENCHED PATRIARCHAL POWER RELATIONS RATHER THAN ENGAGEMENT IN EXPORT HORTICULTURE *PER SE***

While the literature clearly indicates that wives of male smallholders have borne a disproportionate share of the costs and received few of the gains from export production, it is worth noting that these gender inequalities are primarily caused by entrenched patriarchal power relations than by engagement in export horticulture *per se*. As Dolan (2002) implies, the negative impacts for women of engaging in export production are better perceived as symptoms of underlying socio-cultural attitudes and practices, rather than as intrinsic characteristics of export value chains in themselves.

### **3.5.2 Key Differences Between Crops/Countries**

The conditions faced by unpaid female family labour outlined in **Section 3.5.1** above appear to be fairly widespread across different countries and across the various focus sectors. However, the literature did also indicate that the extent of gender inequalities can vary significantly by crop and country.

**In particular, the literature shows that the extent to which wives contribute labour to husbands' export plots differs substantially depending on the crop involved.** On the one hand and as already noted, women contribute the majority of labour on men's coffee farms in Uganda (Chan 2010), and on men's French bean plots in Kenya (Dolan 2002). In contrast, in export mango production in Ghana and Mali, wives do contribute some labour to men's mango farms, but they only carry out a small number of specific tasks and it is the men themselves who carry out the majority of the work (ITC forthcoming).

**The literature also hints at the fact that the extent to which wives are rewarded for their labour is dependent on women's relative status and role within the communities in question.** Thus for example, Dolan (2002) highlights how social structure mediates the impacts of engagement in contract farming, in particular the extent to which engagement leads to intra-household conflicts over land and labour. UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) report that wives working on their husband's cocoa farms in Côte d'Ivoire, Liberia and Sierra Leone are sometimes paid for their labour in cash or in kind, despite the fact that women do only a minority of the work on the cocoa farms. In contrast, Chan (2010) found that, despite doing the vast majority of work on men's coffee farms, wives in Uganda are rarely given a share of the coffee income or have a say in how that income is spent.

### **3.5.4 Evidence of Changes in Last 10-15 years**

Overall, the literature did not suggest that any significant changes have taken place in the relative conditions of contributing family labour over the last 10-15 years, apart from in cases where there had been external (e.g., NGO, donor) interventions to address this issue.

**Nevertheless, there is some evidence that cultural norms endorsing these gender inequalities are gradually being eroded in some cases.** The literature certainly indicates that individual cases of wives challenging husbands over the distribution of land and income are not uncommon. For example, WEMAN Productions (2007) reports a case in Uganda where a husband sold the land his two co-wives were farming, without consulting the wives. The two women took the case to court and were rewarded compensation. Similarly, Dolan (2002) reports cases of wives in Kenya taking husbands to court over land appropriation and not sharing income from export crops; she also documents cases of wives successfully using witchcraft to discourage men from taking their

land and to force them to share income from export crops. Moreover, recent research in Nandi Hills, Kenya (Chan 2011) shows that traditional land tenure practices that have prevented women from owning and inheriting land are slowly changing with modernization, and that as a result more women are farming their own land and are thus able to retain the income from their labour.

**The literature also points to how sustainability certification initiatives can influence the role of unpaid female family labour – both positively as well as negatively.** For example, in one study of organic coffee production in Uganda reported by UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009), it was found that adoption of organic methods led to increased yields due to improved farm management, but that it also required more labour inputs especially in post-harvest handling. Most of this extra labour was disproportionately borne by unpaid female family labour, who had to work longer hours and were able to spend less time on their own off-farm income earning activities, leading to a reduction in women's individual incomes. In contrast however, a second study found that women in families involved in organic, fair trade production tended to have more influence on intra-household decision-making than women in families involved in conventional fair trade. The study concluded that this was probably the result of a larger demand for women's labour and consequently an increase in their bargaining power within the household.

## 4. Actions and Policies to Support Informal Workers: Key Findings from the Literature

### 4.1 Introduction

**Section 4** brings together recommended policies and actions to improve the situation of informal workers, as identified from the literature reviewed. Examples of relevant actions and policies that are currently being taken by workers' organizations, NGOs, donors and other actors are provided where available. As the findings in **Section 3** clearly show, each type of informal worker faces quite different types of conditions and constraints: hence each category of worker will require different solutions to improve their position. For this reason, the recommendations below are grouped according to the category of informal worker they are intended to support:

- **Section 4.2** provides recommendations in support of waged workers (i.e., informal waged workers in both formal and informal enterprises).
- **Section 4.3** provides recommendations in support of owners of informal enterprises (including informal processors and traders as well smallholders).
- **Section 4.4** provides recommendations in support of contributing family labour.

### 4.2 Recommended Policies and Actions to Support Waged Workers

#### 4.2.1 Recommendations to support Both Female and Male Waged Workers

The following recommended actions and policies to improve the conditions of waged workers were identified in the literature reviewed.

## **REGULARIZE EMPLOYMENT STATUS AND IMPROVE CONDITIONS AND PROTECTION FOR INFORMAL WORKERS, TO BRING THEM IN LINE WITH PERMANENT WORKERS**

The literature highlighted the gap in conditions between informal (seasonal, temporary, casual, contract) workers on the one hand, and formal (permanent) workers on the other hand, and provided a number of recommendations on what policies and actions would be needed to reduce this gap. These included:

- **Regularize employment status in line with the actual amount of work done by workers.** Barrientos et al. (2009), Oxfam (2004), GATE (2007) and UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) all advocate measures to ensure that eligible seasonal, temporary and casual workers are given permanent employment status. This is important because, as highlighted by Barrientos et al. (2009) and Oxfam (2004), permanent contracts give them access to improved working conditions, increased job security, paid leave, improved legal protection and a greater likelihood of benefiting from private sector codes and standards.
- **Extend labour law protections and benefits to cover all types of workers.** To improve conditions for all workers who are not legally entitled to permanent contracts, Oxfam (2004) and UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) recommend that national governments should extend the coverage of existing labour laws and protections to include all types of workers, and not just permanent workers as is frequently the case.
- **Extend benefits of voluntary standards and certification schemes to non-permanent workers.** UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009), Barrientos et al. (2009) and Barrientos and Smith (2006) also emphasise the importance of ensuring that voluntary/private sector labour codes and certification schemes extend their scope of influence to include non-permanent as well as permanent workers. They recommend that codes/standards must explicitly state their relevance for non-permanent workers, and that monitoring and implementation procedures and practices must be improved to ensure that informal workers are actually included.

## **PROMOTE COMPLIANCE WITH INTERNATIONAL LABOUR RIGHTS AND NATIONAL LABOUR LAWS**

The literature also emphasised the importance of ensuring compliance with international labour rights and national labour law, and provided the following recommendations for specific areas of focus and modes of engagement:

- **Compliance with national labour legislation and core ILO Conventions should be stipulated as a condition of contract.** ITC (forthcoming) advocated that donors providing financial and/or technical support to private companies should stipulate compliance with international and national labour rights as a condition of receiving support, and that payment of at least the minimum wage for *all* types of workers should specifically be required. Oxfam (2004) recommended that sourcing companies should include similar requirements in their purchase contracts with suppliers.
- **Support worker education programmes to inform workers about their legal rights.** ITC (forthcoming) and GATE (2007) both recommended that worker education programmes should be supported to inform workers about their legal rights, in particular their right to freedom of association and collective bargaining, and the conditions under which workers are entitled to permanent contracts and associated social protections.
- **Promote freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining for all workers.** For example, Barrientos et al. (2009) stress the need to ensure that collective bargaining agreements are extended to cover non-permanent as well as permanent workers. Oxfam (2004)

emphasizes the role of national governments in ensuring that all workers can, in practice, join unions and bargain collectively without fear of reprisal. Oxfam also advocates that sourcing companies should engage in constructive dialogue with global union federations and national unions to promote trade union rights.

- **Take measures to reduce excessive overtime and ensure that overtime work is properly compensated.** Oxfam (2004) and Barrientos and Smith (2006) both emphasise the need to reduce excessive overtime, and to ensure that any overtime performed is adequately compensated. Both stress that sourcing companies as well as employers/suppliers must take action to address these issues effectively (see below).

#### **INCREASE EFFORTS TO BUFFER THE NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF EXTERNAL MARKET SHOCKS**

The literature points to the need for commercial and government actors to do more to buffer the negative impacts of major commercial changes/shocks on waged workers. For example, Barrientos et al. (2009), in analysing the negative impacts of the sudden switch to MD2 by international pineapple buyers, argued that in future, such major shifts in demand should be made more gradually, and that buyers should engage with governments and donors to put in place mitigation measures. The authors also advocate for national governments to strengthen the enforcement of state employment/social security schemes, for example making sure that employers register all eligible employers under these schemes, in order to ensure that workers have a safety net in the face of negative external market shocks.

#### **REVISE SOURCING/PURCHASING PRACTICES IN ORDER TO MITIGATE NEGATIVE IMPACTS ON SUPPLY CHAIN WORKING CONDITIONS**

**The literature also highlights the need for global sourcing companies to acknowledge that their purchasing practices can be a root cause of poor labour practices in their supply chains,** and that therefore they must revise their buying practices accordingly. Thus Oxfam (2004) and Barrientos and Smith (2006) argue that buying companies must: make supplier performance on labour standards a key sourcing criterion; ensure lead times are reasonable; adjust supply chain management practices to minimise peaks and troughs in demand; ensure the price paid to suppliers allows adherence to labour standards; and work towards longer-term relationships with suppliers.

#### **4.2.2 Specific Recommendations to Support Female Waged Workers**

The literature focusing on gender issues in global value chains also provided the following specific recommendations for improving the conditions of female waged workers, highlighting the need for action from a wide range of public and private actors:

- ***Donors and development banks supporting private sector companies/initiatives should require adoption of equal opportunities employment policies and practices as a condition of contract/funding*** (ITC forthcoming).
- ***Employers/suppliers should provide special facilities and working conditions for mothers,*** including provision of child care facilities, nursing breaks, and lighter duties for pregnant women (Oxfam 2004; UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad 2009).

- **National governments should strengthen laws and policies concerning sexual harassment, occupational health and safety, and childcare provision to reflect women workers' specific needs** (Oxfam 2004).
- **Buying companies and certification bodies should ensure that sustainability codes/certification standards address women workers' issues.** They must ensure that women are included in consultations about code content, and that women workers' specific needs and priorities are included in code provisions. They must also ensure that interviews with women workers are part of standard procedure in audits, and that auditors have good gender skills (UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad 2009).

On a more fundamental level, Oxfam (2004) also advocates the need for all actors to implement policies and practices that promote a more equitable sharing of the costs of caring work among women and men, employers and the State.

## 4.3 Recommended Policies and Actions to Support Owners of Informal Enterprises

### 4.3.1 Recommendations to Support Smallholders

The value chain literature provided a wide range of recommendations on how to improve conditions for smallholders: key recommendations are summarized below.

#### **IMPROVE SMALLHOLDERS' BARGAINING POWER AND THEIR TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF TRADE**

Much of the literature on smallholders emphasized the importance of improving the terms and conditions of trade for smallholders (e.g., GATE 2007; Fromm and Dubon 2006). Thus for example, GATE (2007) calls for simpler contracts, more training for smallholders on the meaning of contracts, increased incentives for exporters/processors to comply with contracts, and negotiation of more favourable terms and conditions for smallholders.

Other literature highlights the importance of improving smallholder organization as a prerequisite for effectively negotiating better conditions for smallholders (e.g., Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana c.2009). Thus, FAO (c.2004) advocates the establishment of collective farmers' bodies to take responsibility for marketing and interaction with other value chain stakeholders, in order to improve smallholders' returns from engagement in the Kenyan mango value chain. Similarly, Coulter and Abena (2010) advocates the strengthening of primary marketing organizations (PMOs) as a key strategy for improving conditions for cocoa and coffee smallholders in Cameroon.

#### **IMPROVE MARKET ACCESS FOR SMALLHOLDERS**

Much of the literature emphasizes the importance of improving smallholders' access to export markets.

**In particular, the literature recommends facilitating smallholder access to high value markets.** For example, the Institute of Development Studies and the University of Ghana (c.2009) recommend that the Ghana Cocoa Board, international buyers, civil society organizations and other value chain actors should provide advice and support to Ghanaian cocoa smallholders and producer groups wishing to pursue single origin, Fairtrade or organic cocoa. Likewise, Challies (2010) recommends support for Chilean raspberry smallholders to access Fairtrade and organic markets.

Fromm and Dubon (2006) describe examples of current initiatives undertaken by NGOs and the Honduran Coffee Institute (IHCAFE) to support smallholders to access specialty coffee markets. For example, IHCAFE has supported the *Cup of Excellence*, an annual competition open to small as well as large coffee producers. Each year, national and international cuppers select the best coffee, which is then sold on international auction to the highest bidder. The prices paid in this auction have exceeded US\$200 a bag, which is more than three times higher than the price a smallholder farmer would receive in the local market.

**The literature also advocates establishing public and/or public-private programmes to support smallholders to comply with market codes and standards.** As already noted, compliance with standards such as GLOBAL GAP is seen as increasingly important to ensure access to export markets, and several authors (e.g., Challies 2010; Fromm and Dubon 2006) advocate stepping up support for smallholders to achieve compliance. Challies describes current initiatives being taken in the Chilean raspberry sector. For example, the Chilean government is providing intensive support to smallholder growers to achieve compliance with a national standard that mirrors the likes of GLOBAL GAP and USA GAP; and the government is also partnering with a number of private export firms to provide compliance support to smallholders.

#### **IMPROVE SMALLHOLDERS' ACCESS TO KEY PRODUCTION INPUTS**

The literature also highlights the importance of improving smallholder access to key production inputs including credit, extension services, land and improved planting material:

- **Improve smallholders' access to credit via establishment of more credit unions, group savings/credit schemes, and/or strengthened PMOs linked to banks and microfinance institutions.** Thus for example, the Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana (c.2009) advocate the establishment of collective credit schemes for cocoa smallholders, since these are more likely to be perceived by farmers as friendly institutions, and group pressure can be applied to minimize default. Meanwhile, Coulter and Abena (2010) recommend strengthening PMOs and linking them to microfinance institutions or rural banks, as a means of extending credit to cocoa and coffee smallholders in Cameroon. They propose that these partnership arrangements should firstly focus on pre-financing purchases from growers (since this is the most secure form of credit), and later extend to offering loans for production. They also point to some promising examples of such partnership initiatives that are already operational in Cameroon.
- **Improve extension services.** For example, the Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana (c.2009) emphasized the need to improve education for cocoa farmers about appropriate fertilizer application and other improved cultivation techniques; and FAO (c.2004) advocates improving extension services for mango smallholders to build their capacity on crop husbandry, application of new technologies and overall farm management.
- **Improve access to land and security of tenure.** For example, the Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana (c.2009) recommend a two-pronged approach of strengthening customary land tenure systems and privatising land, in order to improve security of access to land for Ghanaian cocoa farmers, and to manage increasing fragmentation of land holdings resulting from inheritance practices.
- **Increase supply of improved planting material.** For example, FAO (c.2004) highlights the need to improve plant breeding, particularly for improved/hybrid varieties, in order to improve productivity on mango smallholdings; and similarly, Coulter and Abena (2010) point to better availability of improved planting material as a critical prerequisite for improving productivity of smallholder cocoa in Cameroon.

## SUPPORT FUNCTIONAL UPGRADING TO INCREASE RETURNS FOR SMALLHOLDERS

Finally, the literature also advocates the promotion of “functional upgrading” as one avenue for increasing returns to smallholders (e.g., Fromm and Dubon 2006). For example, in order to improve returns for Ghanaian cocoa farmers and attract the youth back into cocoa farming, the Institute of Development Studies and University of Ghana (c.2009) recommend adapting models applied to horticulture and oil palm, where smallholders have control over more stages of the value chain.

### 4.3.2 Specific Recommendations to Support Women Smallholders

The literature on gender and value chains identified a number of recommendations to support more women to engage in export production in their own right. These included:

- **Where existing land ownership and inheritance laws are gender-equitable, organize campaigns/training to improve awareness of the law.** The literature notes that in many African countries, women are legally entitled to land ownership, but in practice these rights are not enforced. Some of the literature therefore advocates raising women’s awareness of the law in order to encourage them to claim their legal rights to land. For example, IFAD (2010) recommends organizing sensitization campaigns using radio and other popular media to raise awareness of Rwanda’s progressive land ownership laws, and training influential community leaders to encourage men to respect women’s right to land ownership.
- **Consider long leasing land owned by the State and private institutions (e.g., churches) to women’s groups,** including to women-headed households and women in male-headed households, so that women can use this land to grow export crops in their own right (IFAD 2010).
- **Ensure producer group/cooperative membership rules are gender-sensitive.** For example, Chan (2010) proposed basing membership eligibility on the principle of control over the crop, rather than land ownership; and IFAD (2010) recommends ensuring that women and men from the same household are allowed to be registered as members, and ensuring that shareholding requirements are not prohibitive for women. Moreover, UTZ CERTIFIED and Solidaridad (2009) emphasize that these principles also need to be applied to sustainability certification schemes that work with producer groups. Such schemes should encourage and support producer groups to adopt gender-sensitive membership rules, and engage local gender experts and/or women’s CSOs to provide specific support on gender issues.
- **Support affirmative actions/policies to ensure women are adequately represented in the leadership of producer groups** (e.g., Chan 2010). IFAD (2010) highlights the positive steps taken by the Rwandan government in this regard. The Cooperative Law states that the Board of Directors should take gender aspects into consideration wherever possible, and all institutions are constitutionally required to have at least 30 per cent women in their leadership bodies. In the smallholder tea and coffee cooperatives they visited, IFAD found that these gender ratios were respected, with female membership of management boards averaging 34 per cent.

### 4.3.3 Recommendations to support informal processors and traders

Only one of the 16 key references reviewed provided any recommendations for improving conditions of informal processors and traders, and given the gender focus of this resource (ITC

forthcoming) all of the recommendations were aimed at female processors and traders. ITC advocates that donors supporting the establishment of new SMEs should provide targeted support to would-be female entrepreneurs to help them overcome typically greater barriers to entry; and that where women processors/traders are already present in the export chain, donors should provide targeted support to help these women upgrade and expand their businesses and remain competitive. The report also provides an example of a current government- and donor-supported programme that has helped small-scale women traders and processors to upgrade their operations. The programme has supported a women's cooperative to establish a mango processing factory, and provided training and equipment to female mango traders to help them improve mango quality.

#### **4.4 Recommendations to Support Contributing Family Labour**

The literature addressing the role of women as unpaid family labour on smallholder export farms highlights the importance of increasing women's share of the benefits from export production, and provides a number of good practice examples.

For example, IFAD (2010) highlights the positive actions taken by the Rwandan government, which has sponsored public awareness campaigns to encourage men to share household income with their wives. IFAD's study indicated that the campaigns had been reasonably successful at raising awareness amongst coffee and tea growing households of the importance of sharing decision-making on household expenditure.

Chan (2010) describes how women members of a coffee cooperative in Uganda have used drama to encourage men in their community to share land and income from coffee with their wives. The women's drama group has achieved noticeable impact: members of the group and an extension officer working in the village reported that a significant number of men have now started giving a proportion of the harvested coffee cherries to their wives to sell, permitting them to keep the income generated. They also reported that some men had started drinking less and working harder on their coffee farms.

Also in Uganda, WEMAN Productions (2007) describe training conducted by two local organizations with support from Oxfam Novib to challenge existing gender inequalities amongst coffee growing households. Using simple pictures and diagrams suitable for illiterate learners, the programme has trained over 3,000 men and women farmers to analyze gender-based problems and identify potential solutions. The results have been impressive. Women who took part in the training reported a range of improvements:

- Some men have changed land agreements such that they now have joint ownership of the land with their wives. Men have been persuaded to make these changes because they recognize that this is the only way to ensure that their wife and children can keep the land if/when the husband dies.
- Some men now regularly consult their wives on how household income is spent.
- Some men have started sharing farming and domestic work with their wives, rather than leaving it all for their wives to do.
- Some men are spending less money on alcohol and contributing more to family expenses.

## 5. Can Value Chain Analysis Help Informal Workers? – A Critique

### 5.1 Introduction

This final section assesses the extent to which value chain analysis is a useful approach or tool for understanding and improving the conditions of informal workers in global value chains (Section 5.2), and provides recommendations on what can be done to make VCAs more effective at helping these workers (Section 5.3).

### 5.2 Strengths and Limitations of VCA as a Tool To Help Informal Workers

The present review of VCAs of the commodities sector revealed a number of strengths and weaknesses of VCA as an approach or tool for understanding and improving the conditions of informal workers. These are summarized below.

**Firstly, VCAs as they are currently conducted do not tell us very much about the roles, conditions and opportunities facing informal workers in global commodity value chains.** This is largely due to the fact that the vast majority of VCAs still focus primarily on *entrepreneurs* (i.e., owner-managers of enterprises) in the value chain, while continuing to ignore the role of *employees* working for these enterprises as key actors or beneficiaries in the chain. Thus, while existing VCAs tell us a fair amount about the conditions of smallholders (who are entrepreneurs in their own right), they reveal little about the conditions of other types of informal workers.

**Nevertheless, VCA can provide a useful analytical framework/tool for understanding informal workers in GVCs, if a labour perspective was more widely incorporated.** Labour-sensitive VCAs can help identify the roles and conditions of informal workers in global commodity value chains, how these are shaped by power relations between value chain actors, and how they are changing over time.

**However, VCA tells us less about *why* certain workers are worse off than others, and *how* to improve their conditions.** As alluded to by Laven et al. (2009), VCA as an approach is less well suited to identifying *why certain workers face greater or lesser constraints than others*, and also/therefore *how best to improve workers' conditions (i.e., strategies for action)*. Answering both of these questions requires an understanding of the social, cultural, political and regulatory contexts in which workers operate, which exist regardless of and often external to the global value chain dynamics. Thus for example, in order to understand why women workers tend to face greater constraints than male workers, and in order to identify effective strategies to address these constraints, it is necessary to understand underlying cultural norms and practices and their impact on gender roles and on women's access to land, finance, education and other productive assets.

**Therefore, VCA needs to be supplemented by an analysis of local socio-cultural, political and regulatory conditions in order to develop effective strategies for helping informal workers.** In other words, while VCA is a useful tool, it does not provide all the answers. As a number of VCA practitioners recognize, VCA needs to be supplemented by other analytical frameworks or tools in order to paint a comprehensive picture of the conditions faced by different types of informal workers, why these difference occur, and how their conditions might be improved. Thus for example, Challies (2010) combines VCA with a livelihoods analysis to determine how participation in the global value chain for raspberries impacts on the livelihoods of smallholder

raspberry growers in Chile; the Institute of Development Studies and the University of Ghana (c.2009) also use livelihoods analysis alongside VCA to examine the factors that make up sustainable production for cocoa smallholders in Ghana and to identify recommendations for Cadbury and other value chain actors; and Laven et al. (2011) highlight the need to incorporate a gender analysis alongside a value chain approach in order to identify and design gender-equitable value chain interventions.

### **5.3 Recommendations on How to Make VCAs More Effective at Helping Informal Workers**

In light of the strengths and limitations of VCA discussed in **Section 5.2** above, the author proposes that WIEGO's key constituencies can take the following actions to make VCA more effective at helping informal workers in global commodity value chains.

#### **RECOMMENDATION 1: PUSH FOR ALL DEVELOPMENT-FOCUSED VCAs TO INCORPORATE A LABOUR AND GENDER PERSPECTIVE**

WIEGO constituents should ensure that all VCAs conducted within the context of development programmes incorporate a labour and gender perspective, and should encourage others to do the same. This is imperative for ensuring a comprehensive analysis of the full range of value chain constraints and opportunities, as well as for ensuring that value chain interventions will benefit informal and women workers *per se*. While a substantial amount of guidance already exists on how to conduct gender-sensitive VCAs and how to design gender-equitable value chain interventions, there is as yet little if any specific guidance available on how to conduct a *labour-sensitive* VCA within an agricultural context. Developing simple, practical guidance on the latter issue for development practitioners should therefore also be a priority.

#### **RECOMMENDATION 2: ENSURE THAT VCAs FOCUSED ON SPECIFIC GROUPS OF WORKERS ARE COMPLEMENTED BY AN ANALYSIS OF THE SOCIAL, CULTURAL, POLITICAL AND REGULATORY CONTEXTS IN WHICH THE TARGET WORKERS OPERATE**

The exact focus of the additional analysis needed will of course depend on the group of workers being targeted and the specific purpose of the analysis or proposed intervention. Thus, for example, if the VCA is being conducted to improve opportunities for smallholders, a sustainable livelihoods analysis might be most appropriate; whereas if the VCA is being carried out to improve conditions of informal workers on large commercial farms, then an analysis of industrial relations and national labour legislation and its enforcement might be more important.

#### **RECOMMENDATION 3: DEVELOP LABOUR- AND GENDER-SENSITIVE VCA TOOLS THAT CAN BE USED BY WORKERS' ORGANIZATIONS THEMSELVES**

As already noted, there is no shortage of guidance and methodologies on how to conduct gender-sensitive VCAs. However, as Laven et al. (2009) point out, most of the methodologies are overly complex for most development practitioners, let alone workers and their organizations. Yet if VCAs are to be of direct use to workers' organizations, simplified guidance needs to be developed on how to conduct gender-sensitive VCAs. Simple guidance aimed at worker organizations on how to incorporate a labour (as well a gender) perspective into VCAs also needs to be developed. Participatory approaches to VCA that are currently being developed, such as the GALS methodology (WEMAN Productions 2007), constitute one promising avenue that could be further explored.

#### **RECOMMENDATION 4: DEVELOP LABOUR- AND GENDER-SENSITIVE VCA TOOLS FOR GLOBAL FOOD COMPANIES**

A common theme in the GVC literature is the degree of power held by global food companies (retailers, brands and processors), and hence their ability to influence supply chain labour conditions. Yet it appears that to date, little attempt has been made by VCA practitioners to convince or support these global companies to incorporate a labour or gender perspective into the way they analyze and manage their global supply chains. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) programmes implemented by these companies frequently address supply chain labour conditions, but they mostly focus on specific types of workers in specific levels of the value chain (mostly formal workers in formal enterprises and/or smallholders). The development of very simple, diagram- and checklist-based tools that “insert” a gender and labour perspective into a conventional supply chain map or analysis could help these companies to consider the roles and conditions of *all* types of workers, at *all* levels in their supply chains. In turn, this could help encourage companies to develop a more systematic approach to supply chain labour issues and extend the benefits of their ethical sourcing programmes to cover informal as well as formal workers.

#### **RECOMMENDATION 5: DEVELOP AWARENESS-RAISING MATERIALS TO INCREASE THE APPETITE FOR VCA TOOLS**

It is imperative to convince key decision makers of the *value* of addressing gender and labour issues, before they will even consider using any of the gender-sensitive (or labour-sensitive) VCA tools being developed. It is therefore also important to develop awareness-raising materials that demonstrate how an understanding of gender and labour issues in value chains can help sourcing companies, development donors and practitioners achieve development and commercial goals. The videos produced by WEMAN Productions (2007) are a good example of the type of awareness-raising materials that can be useful in this regard.