

WIEGO Child Care Initiative

Annotated Bibliography

Laura Alfery

April 2015



WIEGO Child Care Initiative Annotated Bibliography

WIEGO's Child Care Initiative (CCI) seeks to shift child care from the periphery of global social policy to the centre, so that it is seen as a core set of social services and as a core part of social security. The major concern for WIEGO within the wider debate on child care provision is the relationship between child care provision and the ability of women, particularly poorer women, to engage in income-earning work and to improve their economic position.

Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing is a global network focused on securing livelihoods for the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy. We believe all workers should have equal economic opportunities and rights. WIEGO creates change by building capacity among informal worker organizations, expanding the knowledge base about the informal economy and influencing local, national and international policies. Visit www.wiego.org.

About the Author:

Laura Alfery is a Social Protection Researcher at WIEGO and a Post-Doctoral Fellow at the Institute of Social and Economic Research at Rhodes University. For questions or comments on this publication, please contact Laura by email: Laura.Alfers@wiego.org.

Publication date: April 2015

ISBN: 978-92-95106-92-5

Published by Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) A Charitable Company Limited by Guarantee – Company No. 6273538, Registered Charity No. 1143510

WIEGO Secretariat

Harvard Kennedy School
79 John F. Kennedy Street
Cambridge, MA 02138, USA
www.wiego.org

WIEGO Limited

521 Royal Exchange
Manchester, M2 7EN
United Kingdom

Copyright © WIEGO. This report can be replicated for educational, organizing and policy purposes as long as the source is acknowledged.

This annotated bibliography has been produced as part of WIEGO's Child Care Initiative (CCI). The CCI seeks to shift child care from the periphery of global social policy to the centre, so that it is seen as a core set of social services and as a core part of social security. There are two important caveats to this stated aim. The first is that the initiative is focused particularly on Africa, Latin America and Asia, the three regions in which WIEGO works most intensively, where levels of informal employment are high and where the provision of state-based services/allowances for working women with children has generally been considered less of a priority by governments than other development goals (Espen, 2009). The second is that the major concern for WIEGO within the wider debate on child care provision is the relationship between child care provision and the ability of women, particularly poorer women, to engage in income-earning work and to improve their economic position.

The references within this document are not intended to be a comprehensive list of readings on the issue of child care and women's employment. Rather they are intended to be a guide to key debates and ideas which characterize child care as a policy issue, with an emphasis on the aspects that relate to WIEGO's concerns described above. In keeping with this, the references have been divided into sub-sections which reflect different aspects of the policy issues in which WIEGO is interested. The annotations themselves are also not a comprehensive summary of each reading. Rather, they are intended to highlight the aspects of each reading which have relevance to the CCI.

1. History of Care as a Concern for Development

Razavi, S. 2011. "Rethinking Care in a Development Context: An Introduction" in *Development and Change*, 42 (4): 873-903.

Razavi's paper, which is described as a review of literature, provides an excellent history and theoretical overview of care as a concern for development, and should be seen as a starting point for any piece of work which seeks to grapple with this issue. She looks at developments in feminist economics, particularly the efforts to develop tools to measure and "make visible" the economic contribution that women make through the care work, as well as the losses they incur to their income earning work. Razavi also looks at care as it has been positioned as a social policy issue within development discourses. In both cases the author very skillfully shows how the framing of these debates has changed over time, and analyses the political and economic forces which have driven them.

2. Evidence on the Link Between Women's Earnings and Unpaid Care Work

Budlender, D. 2007. "A Critical Review of Selected Time use surveys." *Gender and Development Programme Paper No. 2*. Geneva: UNRISD.

Time-use surveys have been an important tool in the measurement of unpaid care work in developing countries. In this UNRISD Working Paper, Budlender provides an analysis of existing time-use survey data in Asia (Bangladesh, India, and the Republic of Korea), Africa (Chad, Mali, Tanzania, and South Africa) and Latin America (Argentina, Brazil, Mexico and Nicaragua). Her analysis of the existing time-use survey data in each country focuses on the following: i) the design of the survey, ii) delineating the scope of the survey and the information it contains, iii) assessing the quality of the data obtained with a specific focus on data on unpaid care work, and iv) identifying weaknesses in the data and survey design, especially with respect to unpaid care work. Budlender also provides recommendations for further research work and on the design of future time-use surveys.

Aside from the specific country analyses, this is a useful document for those wishing to understand more in general about the technical details of time-use surveys and the methodological considerations that have to be taken into account when designing and/or analyzing such surveys. These include issues such as the type of survey chosen (stylized or diary-based), the period of time covered, simultaneous activities, contextual variables, the classification of activities, issues to do with the reporting of time use, and administrative considerations. The paper also provides a good overview of concepts and terminology related to the measurement of unpaid care work.

Budlender, D. 2008. "The Statistical Evidence on Care and Non-Care Work across Six Countries." Geneva: UNRISD.

In this paper Budlender analyses time-use data from six countries (Argentina, Nicaragua, India, the Republic of Korea, South Africa, and Tanzania), with a specific focus on unpaid care work provided by individuals in households. In addition to the data analysis there are sections on concepts and terminology and background information on each of the country surveys. The analysis of the data is divided into six further sections: i) basic gender patterns, which describe the differences between male and female engagement in unpaid care work; ii) the distribution of time spent on care by women and men; iii) Tobit estimations which determine the main factors which influence the amount of time spent on unpaid care work; iv) gender combined with other factors looks at the way in which gender interacts with the factors determined through the Tobit estimations to influence the amount of time spent on unpaid care work; v) the care dependency ratio, which was proposed by the UNRISD project on unpaid care work as an indicator of care demand; and vi) the monetary value of unpaid care work, which summarizes different approaches to assigning monetary values to unpaid care work and then compares these to a range of macroeconomic indicators for each country.

The paper contains a number of findings that are of relevance to this project. Across the six countries, the time spent by women on unpaid care work was shown to be twice that spent by men, who spent more time on activities falling within the production boundary of the System of National Accounts (SNA). When SNA work and unpaid care work were combined, it was found that women do "noticeably" more work than men – in South Africa men do 74 per cent of the work done by women, while in India they do 94 per cent of the work done by women. There is also the surprising finding that relatively little time was spent by either men or women on the direct care of persons. Nevertheless, Budlender qualifies this by showing that the averages hide a high degree of variability for women, with a significant number spending a lot of time on care of persons, particularly when there was a

young child in the house and the woman was married. The same degree of variability was not present for men. The paper also shows that the value of unpaid care work as a percentage of GDP in five of the countries is significant, as high as 63 per cent in India, 63 per cent in Tanzania, 54 per cent in Nicaragua, 30 per cent in South Africa, and 12 per cent in Argentina. There is the caution, however, that the high figures for India and Tanzania may be misleading in that many people in these countries do work which falls within the SNA production boundary, but is also unpaid, so that the GDP is lower than it should be. This is despite the fact that, in theory, a relative value for unpaid work should be added to GDP – in practice, however, this has not been done in either India or Tanzania.

Charmes, J. 2006. "A Review of Empirical Evidence of Time Use in Africa from UN Sponsored Surveys" in C. M. Blackden and Q. Wodon, *Gender, Time Use, and Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa*. World Bank Working Paper No. 73. Washinton DC: The World Bank.

A useful complementary reading to that from Budlender, this paper analyses several national time-use surveys from sub-Saharan African countries, including Benin, Ghana, Madagascar, Mauritius, and South Africa. In addition to the analytical work, the paper also provides background information on the 1993 revision of the System of National Accounts, detailing the types of work that fall within and without the production boundary. The analysis itself is a gendered assessment of time use with regard to domestic work, the care economy and non-economic activity. Significant for this project are the findings that women spend thirteen times more time on child care than men in South Africa, seven times more in Benin, six times more in Madagascar, three times more in Mauritius and nearly double the time in Ghana. The author also finds that women spend significantly more time in other "core unpaid domestic duties" (washing, ironing, preparing meals, and washing up) than men across all countries (ranging from double the time in Ghana, to thirteen times in Madagascar, Benin, and Mauritius). An important piece of information for future work is that all of the TUSs analysed in this paper were either done as part of, or in parallel with, either household or living standards surveys, and therefore could be further analysed to look at links between time-use patterns and other development indicators, such as labour market participation.

Cook, S. and X. Dong.-y. 2011. "Harsh Choices: Chinese Women's Paid Work and Unpaid Care Responsibilities under Economic Reform" in *Development and Change*, 42 (4): 947-965.

Aggregating several pieces of research that were previously only available in Chinese, this article looks at the impact of China's liberal economic reforms on the care economy in that country. This paper is relevant to the CCI because of the clear, quantitative links it draws between child care and women's employment, linking the reform of child care provision to the increased informalization of women's labour, and an increasing gender wage gap in the country. As Cook and Dong argue, many of the studies which have attempted to provide an explanation for these trends have focused solely on the paid economy and therefore fail "to pay attention to changes in the reproductive economy and tensions between women's dual role of care giver and income earner."

The Chinese state reduced state support for child care as part of its three-decade long reform package, which began in 1978. Prior to the reforms, child care was provided through the commune and brigade administrative structures and was widely available in urban areas. In rural areas provision of child care facilities was less widespread and available only in wealthier communes and brigades, but nevertheless existed on a broader scale than at present. As part of this reform state-subsidized child care was cut back, and remaining

subsidies were used to emphasize Early Childhood Development (ECD) programmes, aimed at children from three years and up. This has meant that women with children younger than three years are less able to access subsidized child care. There has also been a growth in privatized child care services, which are often unregulated and provide care of questionable quality.

Some of the important findings from the study include the fact that, alongside the child care reforms, there has been a decrease in labour force participation among women with children in the under-six-years-of-age group. There is a class difference here - women with higher education or a husband with higher education are 11 per cent more likely to enroll their child in a child care facility. Those with lower educational status or with a child under six are more likely to withdraw from the labour market. Poorer, migrant workers often have to rely on poor quality privatized services, and many are not willing to leave their children in care if they can afford to. Instead they leave the labour market, and/or move into more irregular, lower paid forms of employment. In the rural areas of China, an analysis of survey data derived from a sample of 592 rural households by Wang and Dong (2010) showed that women with children under six years of age were less likely to engage in better paid income-earning activities. Their regressions show that for each additional child under six, women's participation rate in agricultural activities increased by 1.9 per cent and decreased in off-farm self-employment by 1.2 per cent and in wage employment by 0.7 per cent. Women with a child younger than six were also found to work half an hour less per day in waged labour than other women. Cook and Dong (2011: 957) argue that "these findings...provide strong evidence that care for young children constitutes a barrier to women's access to more lucrative off-farm employment and wage work."

Esquivel, V. 2011. "Sixteen Years after Beijing: What are the New Policy Agendas for Time-Use Data Collection" in *Feminist Economics*, 17 (4): 215-238.

The 1995 Beijing Platform for Action on women's empowerment promoted the use of Time Use Surveys (TUS's) among national governments in order to quantify women's unpaid care work. This paper by Esquivel looks at what has happened to TUSs since then, with a particular focus on the relationship between time-use data collection and policymaking. Esquivel argues that time-use data has so far not lived up to its potential for policy influence, largely because the UN SNA has focused on producing very aggregate and crude time-use estimates, which are not detailed enough and are not easily relatable to other developmental indicators so that their policy use is limited. She singles out, as an example, the issue of child care. She argues that time-use data could be used to show the difference that access to child care facilities makes to the daily routines of women and children. However, most TUSs have been unable to produce this level of detail in the data. Esquivel argues that more attention should be paid to the design of TUSs, which should have specific policy goals in mind.

Heymann, J. 2006. *Forgotten Families: Ending the Growing Crisis Confronting Children and Working Parents in the Global Economy*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Evidence collected through surveys on women's employment and its relationship to child care does exist, although it is sparse. One of the more comprehensive studies that has been carried out is that by Jodie Heymann and her team of researchers at Harvard University on the Project on Global Working Families, the findings of which have been published in this book. Data is derived from quantitative and qualitative studies on work and family life carried out in eight countries: Botswana, Brazil, Honduras, Mexico, Russia, South Africa, the United States of America, and Vietnam. Survey data from nationally representative samples

was analyzed for all countries. In addition to this the project ran its own nationally representative “Special Topic Large-Scale Surveys” in Botswana, Mexico, and the United States, and conducted in-depth interviews with over 1,000 parents of both sexes in Botswana, Honduras, Mexico, Russia, and Vietnam. The informal economy features strongly in this publication, and it emphasized the link between women’s employment and the life chances of their children, arguing for improved support to allow women to more easily access stable employment. It also includes sections which detail successful examples of child care schemes in developing countries which have helped families.

The book makes some striking claims with regard to the link between women’s employment and child care. That carers often end up in employment that is less lucrative, and often more unstable, is confirmed in Heymann’s study, which reveals the difficulties involved in holding onto stable employment when caring for children. Forty per cent of the parents surveyed in her study reported that they had lost pay when they had missed work to care for a sick child (21 per cent in Botswana, 45 per cent in Mexico, and 62 per cent in Vietnam), 11 per cent reported missing out on job promotions or “had difficulty retaining their job” because of the need to care for a sick child (28 per cent in Botswana, 48 per cent in Mexico, and 62 per cent in Vietnam). Many low-income parents (earning less than \$10/day) also reported that they often had to take their children to work. This was especially so for informal workers, half of whom reported taking their children to work regularly. As would be expected, the burden of the conflict between care giving and income earning work falls disproportionately on women. The analysis shows that women are one and a half times more likely than their male counterparts to lose pay in order to care for a sick child and six times more likely than men to lose job promotions because of this.

Heymann also cautions that the widely accepted idea that poorer women from countries where extended families are the norm, are able to rely on their family members to provide care. Heymann states that this is something that is context specific and cannot be assumed. Across the seven countries surveyed in her study, she states that only one third of poor parents reported being able to rely on extended family to provide child care without assistance. At the same time, more parents (one half of low-income parents surveyed) reported that they were in fact further burdened with care responsibilities by their ill or elderly family members.

Todd, P. 2013. “How to Improve Women's Employability and Quality of Work in Developing and Transition Economies.” *Women's Economic Empowerment: A Roadmap*. UN Foundation and ExxonMobil.

Researched and written as part of the ExxonMobil and UN Foundation’s *Roadmap for Promoting Women’s Economic Empowerment*, this report focuses specifically on women in wage employment. It sits alongside other commissioned reports for the Roadmap, which focused on entrepreneurship, farming, and young women’s employment. Unpaid care work as a barrier to women’s economic empowerment came up only as an issue in the work of the Wage Employment research commission.

To this end there is a useful summary of studies which have been done, particularly in Latin America (Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, and Guatemala), which have produced quantitative evidence on the links between child care provision and women’s employment. Although the studies summarized in this report differ greatly in methodology and content, they do provide evidence that provision of subsidized child care improves women’s labour market participation.

3. Care as a Social Policy Issue

Lister, R. 1997. *Citizenship: Feminist Perspectives*. London: MacMillan Press.

Lister's book explores the concept and practice of citizenship from a feminist perspective. The book is rooted in the British social policy tradition, meaning that there are limits to its relevance to different country contexts. Nevertheless, it provides an important overview of key feminist critiques of citizenship, and is good background reading for those wishing to explore the ways in which care has interacted with social policy debates.

It focuses particularly on an elaboration of what has come to be known as the equality / difference debate. In essence this is a debate about whether women's inclusion into citizenship should be based on equal status with men, or whether women have a different role to play in society, and it is the definition of citizenship that needs to change in order to become more inclusive of this role. "Equality" feminists, for example, argue that women should be able to "participate as equals in the public sphere" and that care should therefore be removed from the responsibility of women either through the provision of socialized care facilities, or the encouragement of men's greater participation in care work. On the other hand "difference" or "maternalist" feminists argue that citizenship as it is currently framed is a patriarchal, individualized product of liberal, western society, and argue that a different vision of citizenship, one which valorizes care and interconnectedness – is more desirable than one which sees women and men as equals, yet devalues caring and the sphere of non-market values. Lister ultimately argues that this binary is a false one that is easily undermined or blurred in reality, and she emphasizes the need for flexibility in the making of policy which gives women the ability to balance their income earning and caring roles.

Bedford, K. 2010. "Harmonizing Global Care Policy: Care and the Commission on the Status of Women." *Gender and Development Programme Paper No. 7*. Geneva: UNRISD.

Established in 1946, the Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) is the United Nation's principal norm-setting and policymaking body on gender equality. It also promotes and monitors the implementation of agreements that are made within its structures. This paper is a policy analysis of the 53rd session of CSW held in 2009, which centred on three interrelated themes: equal sharing of family responsibility between men and women, care, and HIV and AIDS.

The paper argues that a broad consensus on care was able to emerge during the 2009 CSW, uniting both conservative faith-based actors and leftwing feminists. This was possible when care was framed in terms of a shared responsibility between men and women. Bedford argues that this framing enabled unity because it both valorized care, which attracted gender activists, and did nothing to threaten the privatized nuclear family model held up as an ideal by conservatives. However, when the primacy of the privatized nuclear family as a model for care provision was questioned, and the issue of care within different kinship arrangements, or socialized care, arose, this consensus quickly fell apart. Bedford argues that although this meant the silencing of alternative voices, the framing of care as a matter of equal sharing did achieve a consensus which had the potential to place care more centrally as an issue within the UN system.

Orloff, A.S. 1993. "Gender and the Social Rights of Citizenship: The Comparative Analysis of Gender Relations and Welfare States" in *American Sociological Review*, 58 (3): 303-328.

In this paper, Orloff uses a gendered perspective to critique Esping-Andersen's framework for classifying welfare regimes, and is a key reading in social policy analysis. In his influential book, the *Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*, Esping-Andersen used data collected over many years to classify the European welfare states into three types: liberal, corporatist-statist and social democratic. These three classifications were built on what Esping-Andersen argued were the three "dimensions" of welfare states: the relative power of the state versus the market; stratification (the extent to which social policies break down or reinforce class divisions in society); and de-commodification (the extent to which welfare provisions free people from a reliance on the labour market and allow them to participate in other areas of life).

As Orloff argues, Esping-Andersen's work was gender-blind, failing to ask the central question of whether the welfare state could alter gender relations as much as class relations. Orloff goes on to "gender" Esping-Andersen's three dimensions, arguing that, in order to produce a gender sensitive analysis of welfare states, the state-market dimension should also include the "division of labour between states, markets, and families" in the provision of welfare; that the stratification dimension should include an analysis of how state policies reinforce or break down existing gender relations; and that the de-commodification dimension should include a new analytic of "the extent to which states guarantee women access to paid employment and services that enable them to balance home and work responsibilities." This final addition in particular also has relevance for developing countries. Instead of asking how state policies free people from the labour market, it asks how state policies can facilitate better access to the labour market – a question that is of great relevance in countries with low levels of formal employment and/or high levels of informal employment, and where women's access to income can be centrally important to the family income.

Vandenbroeck, M. 2006. "Globalisation and privatisation: The impact on childcare policy and practice." *Working Papers in Early Childhood Development*. The Hague: Bernard van Leer Foundation.

This paper looks at the impact of globalization, and particularly neo-liberal shifts in economic and social thought, and the impact these have had on child care policy. Its focus is on Western Europe, specifically concentrating on Belgium. However, it holds important insights into global trends, which affect developing countries as well and should not, therefore, only be seen as having relevance in the European context. The paper starts with a history of child care provision in Western Europe, arguing that the present needs to be understood against the backdrop of history. A main focus of the present day discussion is the way in which developmental psychology, neo-liberalism, and discourses around the "professional mother" have intersected to justify cuts in state spending on child care provision, as well as increasing the acceptability of privatized child care services, often of lower quality than those originally provided by the state.

Williams, J. 2000. *Unbending Gender: Why Family and Work Conflict and What to Do About It*. London: Oxford University Press.

In this book, Williams addresses some of the key binaries which have characterized care policy debates in the USA. She looks in particular at how feminism in the US has, through these rigid binaries, alienated many women – young women, working class women, black women. Of particular interest to this study is the way in which she highlights the need to break down the binary between women’s economic rights on one hand, and children’s rights to adequate care and nutrition on the other. These two sets of rights can come into conflict with one another when, for example, women need to leave young children in the care of others in order to work. However, Williams claims that this binary, which parallels that of the equality / difference debate, is a false one. She argues that the welfare of women and the welfare of children are in fact deeply intertwined and that “children suffer in a system that first allocates children’s care to women and then marginalizes the women who do it, thereby undercutting their power to stand up for children’s needs.”

After laying out her main argument, Williams proceeds to develop an agenda for a “new feminism” which seeks to create workplaces that are focused on the needs of families, so that women do not have to choose between income and care work, and makes a number of practical recommendations about how this can be achieved. These recommendations are specific to a labour market context with high levels of formal employment, and are not therefore necessarily directly relevant to the needs of informal women workers. Nevertheless this book provides necessary background reading on care and social policy.

4. Policy Framing: Development Policies, Women's Employment and Care

Bibler, S. and Zuckerman, E. 2013. "The care connection: The World Bank and women's unpaid care work in select sub-Saharan African countries." *WIDER Working Paper No. 2013/131*. Helsinki: UNU-WIDER.

A "cornerstone" of the World Bank's 2006 Gender Action Plan is to increase women's participation in formal labour markets. In this paper, Bibler and Zuckerman look at 36 World Bank economic empowerment projects in sub-Saharan Africa to determine the extent to which they account for women's unpaid care work as a factor limiting women's economic empowerment. The projects analyzed were funded between 2008 and 2012 through the Bank's International Development Association and were located in three countries: Malawi, Mali, and Niger. The authors find that 92 per cent of the funded projects did not take into account unpaid care work in their design and execution, with only 3 out of the 36 projects showing an awareness of this dimension of women's work. The authors argue that this blindness to women's unpaid care work both limits the effectiveness of World Bank projects and further excludes poorer women from economic growth.

Buvinic, M., Furst-Nichols, R. and Courey Pryor, E. 2013. "A Roadmap for Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment." UN Foundation and ExxonMobil.

This report was produced through a collaboration between the ExxonMobil Foundation and the UN Foundation as a contribution to the global development debate on Women's Economic Empowerment (WEE). The report draws from a number of contributing reports, which explored barriers to women's economic advancement in different work statuses. The work statuses explored included women as entrepreneurs, women as farmers, and women as wage employees. A report was also commissioned on Young Women's Employment as a cross cutting theme. Unpaid care work came up only as an issue in the Wage Employment Research Commission, the report of which is the Todd (2013) paper summarized above.

As a consequence of the fact that care work only came up in this commission, the Roadmap sees care work as important only in relation to waged employees. Among other sources, the report draws support for this conclusion from the paper by Quisumbing *et al* (2003), which compared a mother's earnings and job choices in Guatemala City (where there are relatively high levels of waged employment in maquiladoras) to those of women in Accra (where women are largely self-employed own-account workers). Their analysis concludes that the provision of accessible child care services affects the labour market entry decisions only of the wage employed women in Guatemala and has no effect on the decisions of self-employed women in Accra. The conclusion is that the provision of child care services is likely to have greater impact in environments where there are large numbers of women waged employees.

Chen, M., Vanek, J., Lund, F., Heintz, J., Jhabvala, R. and Bonner, C. 2005. "Progress of the World's Women: Women, Work & Poverty." New York: UNIFEM.

This report argues that women's economic security should be seen as central to development, poverty reduction, and efforts to promote gender equality. In making this case, it highlights the central role of women's employment, arguing that improving working conditions, particularly in the informal economy, is an important aspect in terms of improving women's economic security. It provides global data to show that the proportion of women working in the informal economy is higher than men, and that women are concentrated in forms of employment which are more precarious and where earnings are

lower. The relevance of this report to the WIEGO Child Care Initiative is in the detail it provides on women's employment in the Global South. Chapter 3 is titled "The Totality of Women's Work" and argues that women's employment needs to be seen and measured as a combination of both income earning work and unpaid care work. It highlights the ways in which the unpaid care work of poor women workers constrains their access to income earning opportunities, and provides a number of short case studies which illustrate the dynamics of this relationship. The chapter is also critical of development programmes which seek to place further care burdens on women by involving them in unpaid or poorly paid community work.

Esplen, E. 2009. "Gender and Care: Overview Report." *Bridge Cutting Edge Pack*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.

In this paper, Esplen argues that care work should have greater prominence in development policies. She argues that care has been neglected for two main reasons: firstly, that it is perceived to be less important than other pressing development needs, such as income generation, and secondly, that care is considered as very specific to local cultures, and therefore as something in which international development agencies should not get involved. This is an untenable position, according to Esplen, who contends that mainstream development policies which seek to empower women, but neglect the issue of care, will ultimately limit their successes. She goes on to say that care work is becoming an increasingly urgent development issue as women globally move into the labour force, populations age, HIV and AIDS continues to debilitate great numbers of people, and as the global market for care grows. The paper provides a comprehensive list of possible policy interventions to address paid and unpaid care work in the Global South, and for this reason is a useful guide to the practical side of the care debate. Policy interventions discussed include those that promote more equal sharing of responsibility for care between men and women, measure the economic contribution of care work, and provide support for carers. There is also a section on labour rights and the protection of domestic workers, particularly migrants.

Fagan, C., Lyonette, C., Smith, M. and Saldana-Tejeda, A. 2011. "The influence of working time arrangements on work-life integration or 'balance': A review of the international evidence." *Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 32*. Geneva: ILO.

This report from the International Labour Organisation focuses on working time and its impact on what has come to be known as Work/Life Balance (WLB). This term is used in reference to the need to balance out time spent at work with life outside of the workplace, including family responsibilities, and has increasingly become part of the care policy landscape in the Global North. WLB policies often include measures such as job sharing, flexi-time and generous care leave policies. This report, which accompanies a 2011 ILO Governing Body Discussion on WLB, reviews international evidence on the relationship between working time and WLB, ultimately concluding that more precarious forms of employment are less conducive to WLB. Although the report is largely focused on the Global North, it does acknowledge the particular situation of informal workers in the Global South, where WLB policies relying on an employment relationship may be less relevant. Both this report and the ILO discussion document argue that WLB does have relevance to informal workers as long as it is defined more widely. The ILO has chosen, for example, to define a "package" of work-family reconciliation policies which go further than those commonly thought of as WLB policies. These include a combination of leave policies, social security measures, the provision of socialized care facilities, and infrastructure development

that reduces the time spent on unpaid care work (such as improved access to basic services). In this report Fagan *et al* (2011) also argue that WLB policies can protect women in the Global South from having to leave formal employment for informal work arrangements because of their care responsibilities.

Fultz, E. and Francis, J. 2013. "Cash transfer programmes, poverty reduction and empowerment of women: A comparative analysis. Experiences from Brazil, Chile, India, Mexico and South Africa." *Gender, Equality and Diversity Branch Working Paper 4/2013. Geneva: International Labour Office.*

Since the late 1990s cash transfer programmes, which provide cash benefits to defined groups (usually means tested), have become an important element of social protection in the Global South. A significant amount of controversy has arisen in relation to their gendered impact, particularly where grants are conditional on children being enrolled in school, that they are receiving nutritional supplements, and are regularly visiting health-care facilities. Molyneux (2006; 2007) has argued that these conditions, which generally put the onus on mothers to provide the additional unpaid care work involved, may circumscribe their "economic autonomy" and further "discipline" them into predominantly domestic roles. However, this report from Fultz and Francis reviews evidence from cash transfer programmes in Brazil, Chile, India, Mexico, and South Africa, and find that cash transfers can also have a positive effect on women's economic and social position.

Evidence reviewed from South Africa shows that both the Old Age Pension and the Child Support Grant have had a positive effect on women's employment. These are both unconditional transfers, and as the authors point out, it is the unconditional transfers that have the strongest effect on women's employment. In the South African case, the effect is particularly strong for households where the Old Age Pension is received by a woman. These households have a greater likelihood of younger women with young children in the pensioner's household leaving to look for a job because the pension allows for the financing of a job search as well as child care. The Child Support Grant is associated with a 7-14 per cent increase in women's labour market participation, "with the largest impact for women with limited education living in informal settlements." In Brazil the evidence reviewed reveals that participants in Bolsa Familia were 3 per cent more likely to be employed and 6 per cent less likely to leave their jobs than non-participants. A review of the evidence on Chile's Solidario programme found that married women who were participants in the programme were more likely to be employed than married women who did not participate in the programme.

Fultz and Francis do, however, acknowledge the fact that within the cash transfer policy discourse, there has been little discussion about the provision of child care facilities as a means by which to free women up for the labour market. This means that even when women are using grants to buy in child care, they are likely to be relying on their own private networks and resources. Fultz and Francis do report that this has started to change. Governments in Brazil, Chile, and Mexico have begun to create and/or strengthen initiatives which promote women's employment, including the provision of child care facilities as part of a package of services operating alongside the cash transfers.

Kabeer, N. 2012. "Women's economic empowerment and inclusive growth: labour markets and enterprise development." *SIG Working Paper 2012/1*. DFID & IDRC.

In this paper, Kabeer provides a review of "women's economic empowerment" as it has been conceptualized and operationalized in international development policy. Particularly useful for this project is the review of the position of various important development actors such as the World Bank, the Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA), and the OECD. The review shows that there are a number of different approaches to women's economic empowerment, but that it is predominantly conceptualized as an issue of market forces and improving women's competitiveness, with a focus on agency, choice and decision-making (the World Bank approach). There are exceptions to this – for example SIDA's insistence that structural constraints such as women's unpaid care work needs to be considered as part of women's economic empowerment.

Staab, S. and Gerhard, R. 2010. "Childcare Service Expansion in Chile and Mexico: For Women or Children or Both?" *Gender and Development Programme Paper No. 10*. Geneva: UNRISD.

A line of contention that runs through care policy debates is that between the rights of children to receive adequate care when they are very young, and the right of women to access economic opportunities. Here, those who assume a gendered perspective on the issue of care and who argue that women's care burden should be relieved through socialized care so that they may better access income-earning opportunities can come into conflict with scientific understandings of what children need when they are very young, perspectives which come predominantly from the health sciences (particularly child nutrition) and the field of development psychology, and which emphasize the importance of the child's close contact with the primary caregiver and early childhood education (ECD).

As this paper by Staab and Gerhard makes clear, this division has begun to be blurred by programmes in Latin America which, although placing their emphasis differently, do make an attempt to relieve women of care responsibilities, but also provide children with a certain standard of care. The authors concentrate on two programmes, one in Chile and the other in Mexico, and provide useful information on Crece Contigo (Chile), which was launched in 2006 and which is primarily aimed at the education of young children, and Estancias Infantiles (Mexico) launched in 2007, which is primarily aimed at relieving women of their child care responsibilities. They examine the design of these programmes – which differ markedly from one another – and also analyse the social and political dynamics which have informed these designs. In doing so they show how the differences in orientation, alongside institutional legacies, and the public/private mix, affects the social outcomes of the programmes.

Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing is a global network focused on securing livelihoods for the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy. We believe all workers should have equal economic opportunities and rights. WIEGO creates change by building capacity among informal worker organizations, expanding the knowledge base about the informal economy and influencing local, national and international policies. Visit www.wiego.org.

