Bolivian domestic workers, like most domestic workers around the world, have historically suffered from the lack of protection of their labour rights and frequent violations of their human rights. These workers are particularly vulnerable because the large majority of them are poor, indigenous women of rural origin. In Bolivia, the history of legal discrimination of domestic workers dates back to the Spanish colonial domination. In 2003, the Bolivian Parliament passed the 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work, which attributed to domestic workers similar rights to those of the rest of Bolivian workers. While it was a significant milestone, the Law did not improve working conditions overnight.

In 2005, indigenous union leader Evo Morales was elected president and his left-leaning party Movement Towards Socialism (MAS, in Spanish) obtained a large parliamentary majority. This political upheaval brought high hopes to the movement of domestic workers, as MAS had decisively supported 2450/2003 in Parliament. It fell to this government to implement the Law.

Ten years later, MAS’s policy record on domestic workers’ rights is ambivalent. On the one hand, the government has made multiple gestures aimed at improving the social prestige of domestic workers, such as the official recognition of the National Day of Domestic Workers. On the other hand, important sections of the 2450/2003 Law have not been implemented yet, including, significantly, the article of the Law that grants domestic workers access to the public health system.

This Policy Brief explores the main symbolic and substantive policies that Morales’ government applied to domestic workers’ rights, as well as the unfulfilled policy demands of the social movement of domestic workers. In this brief, symbolic describes policies that aim to improve the social image of domestic workers, while substantive...
policies are those that address the material demands of domestic workers, particularly regarding social rights. Following the synthesis and analysis of the current situation of the Bolivian policies on domestic workers’ rights, reflections are provided that could be useful for the struggle of domestic workers in other countries.

A Long History of Legal Discrimination

The history of domestic work in Bolivia is intertwined with the history of the Spanish colonial domination of the country, which lasted from 1526 to 1825. In colonial times, indigenous women were forced to work as domestic servants without any pay for a certain period every year at the houses of Spanish landlords, a system called mita (Peredo Beltrán 2015: 33; Rivera Cusicanqui and Arnold 1996: 47). At that time, the state did not intervene in any way in the disputes among masters and servants, and the former exerted an absolute power over the latter (Graham 1992).

The first organization of Bolivian domestic workers was created in the 1930s: the Union of Cooks. Even though the Union of Cooks represented an important experience in the organization and mobilization of domestic workers, it did not have any direct policy outcome. Bolivia, like many Latin American countries in the mid-twentieth century, developed an advanced labour code due to the intensity of workers’ mobilizations; however, domestic workers were excluded from its regulations (Blofield 2013). The 1942 General Labour Act—which introduced important improvements in the legal situation of most workers—established a discriminatory legal regime for the so-called “domestics” by excluding them from the regulations that applied to other workers. While an eight-hour workday was established as the general rule in this Act, the timing was inverted for domestic workers: they had the right to eight hours of rest per day—which implied the possibility of a 16-hour workday (1942 General Labour Act, article 39).

It would be six decades before this major legal discrimination against domestic workers was addressed. In 1993, the National Federation of Bolivian Household Workers (Fenatrahob) (Federación Nacional de Trabajadoras Asalariadas del Hogar de Bolivia) was founded. Fenatrahob campaigned vocally, and gained broad social and political support. They were instrumental in the 2003 approval by the Bolivian Parliament of the 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work.

The 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work

The 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work conferred on Bolivian domestic workers almost whole legal equality with the rest of the country’s labour force. The Law recognized the right of domestic workers to the legal minimum salary, yearly holidays, weekly free time from work, access to education, health insurance coverage and disability and retirement pensions. The only difference in relation to the rights of all workers was that the domestic workers who live in their employers’ homes (live-in workers) have a 10-hour working day (two hours longer than the general regime); this was justified by citing the need for these workers to “pay back” employers for giving them shelter (Fenatrahob/TAHIPAMU/Fundación Solón 1998).

This Law is one of the most progressive laws on domestic workers’ rights in Latin America (Blofield 2013). However, while the rights to fair wages and free time from work were immediately enforceable once the Law passed, the rights to health coverage and pensions required a Supreme Decree to become effective.

Peredo Beltrán (2015) has highlighted several specific elements of the Law that indicate the will of the legislature to overcome the patriarchal, colonial traditions related to domestic work. These include the use of the term “domestic workers” instead of “domestics”, the explicit

METHODS

Information in this Policy Brief was derived from semi-structured interviews, conducted with activists of the Bolivian social movement of domestic workers in La Paz in 2016, and an analysis of documents:

- *Equity and Justice* (in Spanish: *Equidad y Justicia*), an informative bulletin where the National Federation of Bolivian Household Workers (Fenatrahob) sets out its policy priorities;
- *Decolonization and Depatriarchalization from the Perspective of Paid Household Workers: A Public Policy Proposal* (in Spanish: *Descolonización y despatriarcalización desde la perspectiva de las trabajadoras asalariadas del hogar: una propuesta de política pública*), published by Fenatrahob (2014a);
- Bolivian government documents (the laws and regulations on domestic workers’ rights approved or promoted by the government, and communiqués of the Ministry of Labour).

Literature on domestic work, domestic workers’ rights and the Bolivian political context augmented this research.

3 *The Mobilization of Bolivian Domestic Workers* (WIEGO Organizing Brief No.10) by Pablo Castaño offers more details on Fenatrahob and this process.
interdiction of the retention of domestic workers’ belongings by employers (which used to be a common practice in Bolivia), and the need to respect the domestic workers’ cultural identity. The latter attempted to counteract the racism that many indigenous domestic workers experienced at the hands of mixed-race and white employers.

When Morales was elected president in 2005 and his party, MAS, won a large majority in Parliament, his government had the task of implementing the 2450/2003 Law. One of the first decisions President Morales made was to appoint Casimira Rodríguez, former Executive Secretary of Fenatrahob, as Minister of Justice.

Morales’ government has applied both symbolic and substantive policies to address domestic workers’ rights, although enforcement and implementation have been limited, as discussed in the next section. In addition, many unfulfilled policy demands of the movement of domestic workers remain.


Symbolic policies, as described in this paper, are significant in recognizing and legitimizing the important role of domestic workers, in strengthening their movement, and in heightening awareness of their rights as workers—all of which helps to secure the gains made in protecting their labour rights and human rights. The main symbolic policies on domestic workers’ rights, approved by Morales’ government between 2006 and 2017, are: the official recognition of the National Day of Domestic Workers; the Constitutional recognition of domestic work, including recognition of its economic value and the specification of a wide range of sources of discrimination; and the ratification of the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention on Decent Work for Domestic Workers (C189).

The National Day of Domestic Workers

On March 30, 1988, organizations of domestic workers from 11 Latin American countries created the Latin American and Caribbean Confederation of Household Workers (CONLACTRAHO) (Confederación Latinoamericana y del Caribe de Trabajadoras del Hogar, in Spanish). In the following years, March 30 became a day of mobilization and reaffirmation of their rights for Bolivian domestic workers. The celebration of annual demonstrations, educative fairs and other street events on the same day every year has allowed Fenatrahob to attract media attention to their demands at least once a year, as shown by the peak of news relating to domestic workers’ rights around that date (Abi y Correo del Sur 2016; ANF 2017; Bustillos Zamorano 2014; Zapan 2015).

The National Day of Domestic Workers was officially established in Bolivia by the 28655/2006 Supreme Decree, issued by President Morales on March 26, 2006, only a few months after the inauguration of his first term in government. The Decree positions the recognition of this National Day as compensation for the legal and social discrimination traditionally suffered by domestic workers, “a sector which is essentially formed by migrant women from the countryside, indigenous and of humble origins”.

Insofar as a Supreme Decree is an executive order directly issued by the president that can be annulled by another Supreme Decree, Fenatrahob feared that a change in government would lead to the revocation of the 28655/2006 Supreme Decree. Therefore, they campaigned for the passing of a Law on the same issue. On October 25, 2011, the Bolivian parliament passed the 181/2011 Law, which confirmed the official recognition of the National Day of Domestic Workers and a one-day paid holiday for domestic workers every March 30.

The Constitutional Recognition of Domestic Work

A new Political Constitution of the State was approved in 2009 by a Constituent Assembly, in which MAS held the majority. Two articles of the new fundamental norm are

4 Author’s interview with Prima Ocsa, former Executive Secretary and current Secretary of Relations, Fenatrahob, La Paz, April 1, 2016.
particularly important for domestic workers’ rights: Article 14, which establishes the principle of non-discrimination; and Article 338, which recognizes the economic importance of domestic work.

The formulation of the principle of equality in the Bolivian Constitution is extremely detailed and includes several forms of discrimination that are particularly relevant for domestic workers: Article 14 forbids discrimination based on sex, colour, culture, language, social or economic condition, kind of professional occupation, degree of education and pregnancy. The latter is important for domestic workers, as Fenatrahob has denounced the fact that many employers do not respect the maternity leave that labour legislation grants to all workers (Fenatrahob 2015).

Article 338 of the 2009 Political Constitution of the State is also of major significance for domestic workers. It reads:

The state recognizes the economic value of household work as a source of wealth and it will be quantified in the public accounts.

As Peredo Beltrán (2015) has pointed out, the recognition of the economic value of domestic work counters the argument that household work is not productive, and therefore the rights of domestic workers do not need to be equal to other workers. This argument has also been rejected by Basilia Catari, former Executive Secretary of Fenatrahob (Catari Torres 2000). However, Article 338 has not been implemented yet.

The Ratification of ILO Convention C189

On November 20, 2012, President Morales sanctioned the 309/2012 Law, through which the Bolivian State ratified the ILO Convention on Decent Work for Domestic Workers (C189), which had been adopted on June 16, 2011, at the 100th International Labour Conference of the ILO. Article 2 of the 309/2012 Law allocates to the Ministry of Labour the responsibility for its implementation “according to the existing constitutional and legal dispositions”. The Law includes the Convention, whose main contents are synthesized below.

C189 calls for “fair terms of employment as well as decent working conditions” for domestic workers, and lays out basic rights: freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining, elimination of discrimination, and elimination of compulsory labour and child labour (Article 3). It establishes that domestic workers are entitled to the same rights as other workers regarding minimum wage coverage (Article 11), limitation of the proportion of the total remuneration that can be paid in kind (a usual practice in countries such as Bolivia) (Article 12), occupational safety (Article 13), social security and protection of maternity (Article 14), and effective access to courts and dispute resolution mechanisms (Article 16).

In the Bolivian context, the ratification of C189 can be argued to be a symbolic policy because the Convention does not confer any new rights on Bolivian domestic workers; the existing 2450/2003 Law was more advanced in the rights it offered. Further, C189’s ratification did not have any immediate impact on working and living conditions. However, the ratification has heightened legitimacy for the demands of the Bolivian domestic workers’ movement, strengthening the position of Fenatrahob in further negotiations about both the implementation of the 2450/2003 Law and the inclusion of domestic workers’ rights in the future General Labour Act.

In the future, the ratification of C189 could also prove to have substantive effects, since an international framework can help secure domestic workers’ rights regardless of shifts in governments in Bolivia. Also, ILO Conventions incorporate a reporting mechanism two years after na-
tional adoption and, thereafter, every five years. Workers’ associations and unions can use this mechanism as a tool to enhance their demands for implementation of the labour rights and social protections.

**Substantive Policies on Domestic Workers’ Rights (2006-2017)**

The Bolivian government approved two substantive policies on domestic workers’ rights between 2006 and 2017: the 218/2014 Ministerial Resolution on the written contract and the “salaries book”; and the creation of a specific program to promote the access of domestic workers to secondary education. At this writing, the government seems to have the intention of including domestic workers’ rights in the future General Labour Act, which would imply an improvement of the legal situation of these workers.

**The 218/2014 Ministerial Resolution**

The 2450/2003 Law made written contracts compulsory between domestic workers and employers only if the employment arrangement would last more than one year, while the rest of contracts could be either written or verbal (Article 2). Insofar as Article 2 was not implemented in the years that followed the 2450/2003 Law, almost all contracts remained oral, which made it very difficult for domestic workers to defend their rights.

On April 1, 2014, the Ministry of Labour issued the 218/2014 Ministerial Resolution, which established the mandatory nature of a written contract and a “salaries book” for all domestic workers (Fenatrahob 2014b) regardless of length of contract. The approval of the Resolution was followed by a local campaign in La Paz, organized by the Ministry of Labour, to improve public knowledge of the new norm (Ministerio de Trabajo de Bolivia 2015).

Although the passing of the 218/2014 Ministerial Resolution was welcomed as a key achievement by Fenatrahob, its implementation has been deficient. A year after approval of the Resolution, the representative of the Bolivian Ombudsman in La Paz Department, Teofila Guarachi, stated that the new requirement “is not being applied in the country, but the worst thing is that the administration is not implementing the norm that they approved themselves” (Erbol 2015). Only 50 contracts were registered during the first two years of validity of the 218/2014 Ministerial Resolution, according to the Ministry of Labour (Zapana 2016).

**The Secondary Education Program**

In May 2014, Fenatrahob reported the creation of a government program of secondary education for domestic workers (Fenatrahob 2014b). The program, which came about through a collaboration between Fenatrahob and the government, allows domestic workers to attend secondary education on a part-time basis and obtain their degrees in a short time by attending classes on Sundays instead of Monday to Friday. This adapts the availability of the educational system to the scheduled time-off-work of most domestic workers, as explained by Fenatrahob (2014b) in an *Equity and Justice* bulletin. In presenting the program, Vice-Minister of Alternative Education, Noel Aguirre, asserted that it “would allow them [domestic workers] to access university with equal opportunities”. In December 2016, the Ministry of Education reported that only 14 domestic workers had completed second-
ary education through the program, making them eligible to go on to university and professional education, while another 34 were enrolled in the program (Ministerio de Educación 2016). These figures suggest the reach of the program has been extremely limited so far.

**The Introduction of Domestic Workers’ Rights in the General Labour Act**

Discussions on the future reform of the General Labour Act began in Bolivia as early as 2006, when the first National Development Plan approved by Morales’ government announced the “recuperation of the capacity of the state to correct the asymmetries in labour relations” (Gobierno de Bolivia 2006: 107), which suggested a possible reform of labour legislation. The current General Labour Act—which dates back to 1942—has been complemented or amended by thousands of laws and regulations ever since, but no global reform has been approved yet.

In 2010, Fenatrahob began advocating for the inclusion of the rights of domestic workers in the General Labour Act (Wanderley 2014). In two of its information bulletins, Fenatrahob reported that it had succeeded in introducing domestic workers’ labour rights in the draft General Labour Act (Fenatrahob 2011; 2010); this would seem to suggest the intention of the government to carry out that legal change. In principle, this change would introduce the eight-hour working day for all domestic workers and would reinforce the legal consideration of domestic work as a job on its own. However, the mentioned changes cannot be taken for granted, as the draft new General Labour Act may undergo further modifications before receiving final approval in Parliament.

**Unfulfilled Policy Demands of the Movement of Domestic Workers**

Despite the symbolic and substantive policies approved by Morales’ and MAS’ government between 2006 and 2017 related to domestic workers’ rights, some key demands of the Bolivian social movement of domestic workers remain partially fulfilled or completely unfulfilled.

**Fair Wages and Free Time from Work**

Securing the legal minimum wage, an eight-hour workday, a six-day working week and enjoying the same holidays as the rest of Bolivia’s workers are central demands for the National Federation of Bolivian Household Workers (Fenatrahob), insofar as these rights are often violated by employers, as denounced in several Equity and Justice bulletins published by Fenatrahob (Fenatrahob, 2015, 2014b, 2008, 2005).

Even though employers bear the immediate responsibility for respecting the legal limits of working times and the minimum wage, Fenatrahob has called on the government to implement enforcement of these rights. In its 2014 Decolonization and Depatriarchalization policy proposal (Fenatrahob 2014a), the Federation directly addresses the Ministry of Labour, demanding the approval and implementation of “the necessary administrative regulation to allow the labour inspection to supervise the working conditions of domestic workers”; further, it asks for the government to publish a guide that explains to workers how to legally claim their rights. These measures have not been carried out so far.
Health Insurance Coverage

Article 8 of the 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work guarantees the right of domestic workers to health coverage through “affiliation to the National Health Insurance”. Article 24 of the Law specifies that the government has the obligation to approve a Supreme Decree to implement the provision regarding the integration of domestic workers into the National Health Insurance system.

The first negotiations between Fenatrahob and the Bolivian government on this topic took place in 2007 (Fenatrahob 2007). A decade later, Bolivian domestic workers have not been included in the National Health Insurance system yet, and no specific system of health insurance for domestic workers has been created. There are only local policies, such as the agreement between La Paz domestic workers’ union “Max Paredes” and the local government, to guarantee that domestic workers can receive medical attention at the health centres of the capital city by paying only 5 bolivianos per medical appointment.

As a consequence of the lack of action of the government on this topic, in 2014 only 5 per cent of Bolivian domestic workers had health insurance, according to data provided by Prima Ocsa, who was at that time the Executive Secretary of Fenatrahob (Zapana 2014).

Access to Pensions

In a similar vein to the right to health coverage, the right to pension coverage was recognized by the 2450/2003 Law but the implementation of this right was conditional on a Decree. In 2010, the Bolivian Parliament passed the 65/2010 Pensions Act, which was implemented by Supreme Decrees 778 and 822. In a public communiqué, the Ministry of Economy reiterated that domestic workers are included in the scope of the 65/2010 Act, as it covers all workers (Ministerio de Economía y Finanzas Públicas de Bolivia 2011). According to data from the research centre CENAC, in 2010 only 10 per cent of Bolivian domestic workers had access to the pensions system (CENAC-Bolivia 2010).

The 65/2010 Act and its Decrees did not guarantee the access of domestic workers to the pensions system, and this demand has occupied a growing place in Fenatrahob’s platform. In a short documentary on the situation of Bolivian domestic workers produced by ILO in 2013, a member of Fenatrahob highlighted that many domestic workers are dismissed by their employers when they get old and do not get any revenue, after having worked in many cases for 30 or 35 years (ILO 2013). The claim on pensions coverage gained importance in 2016, when representatives of domestic workers’ organizations gathered in La Paz to celebrate the International Meeting on Social Security (Fenatrahob 2016). However, no policy on these topics has been approved by the government so far.

Non-Discrimination and Protection Against Violence

The discrimination suffered by domestic workers is identified by Fenatrahob as the common source of all the violations of their rights—including acts of violence they suffer. This is explained in the Decolonization and De-patriarchalization policy proposal (Fenatrahob, 2014a):

*All the problems identified [in the document] have a common root, which is discrimination. It is discrimination that prevents us domestic workers from exerting our labour rights, accessing education and technical training, [it is discrimination] which creates precarious working and living conditions and provokes unacceptable situations of violence.*

Violence against domestic workers is legitimized by the colonial reminiscences of domestic work in Bolivia, as well as the gender- and ethnic-based discrimination suffered by many domestic workers because they are indigenous women (Gill 1997; Rivera Cusianqui 2007). In this vein, Fenatrahob’s policy proposal (2014a) states that violence against domestic workers “is naturalized, it is part of the patriarchal and colonial criteria that state that we do not have any other aim in our lives than serving and looking after others” and “in the case of domestic workers, [violence] has an additional load of racism and discrimination.”

Fenatrahob has demanded the improvement of the response of the authorities to the claim of aggressions and the implementation of “massive campaigns of communication with […] transformative criteria on the culture of discrimination, oriented towards employers, workers and authorities” (Fenatrahob 2014a). Tackling discrimination and prejudice against domestic workers is seen by Fenatrahob as a key element of the struggle against the violence that many of them suffer.

The previously mentioned symbolic policies may have had the indirect effect of reducing violence against domestic workers, as they challenge the neo-colonial and racist beliefs on which that violence is based. However, there is no empirical data on this and the government has not promoted any specific policy to address violence against domestic workers so far.

---

5 bolivianos is equivalent to 0.72 USD, according to conversion at the mid-market rate on www.xe.com on December 6, 2017.

Author’s interview with Eliana Mariaca, Executive Secretary of La Paz “Max Paredes” domestic workers’ union, La Paz, April 1, 2016.

Author’s interview with Elizabeth Peredo Beltrán, researcher and activist of the social movement of domestic workers via Skype, June 2, 2017.
Conclusion

The record of Evo Morales’ MAS government regarding policies on domestic workers’ rights between 2006 and 2017 is ambivalent. On the one hand, the government has performed significant symbolic gestures towards domestic workers—such as the appointment of union leader Casimira Rodríguez as Minister of Justice—and has approved important policies oriented towards the improvement of the social image of domestic workers, tackling the discrimination that they have traditionally suffered. On the other hand, this government has approved a very limited number of policies leading to true implementation of the 2450/2003 Law that Regulates Paid Household Work.

Lack of political will is one of the main causes of the limited action of the Bolivian government regarding domestic workers’ rights. However, insufficient political will alone cannot explain the systematic violation of the labour rights and human rights of domestic workers. Enforcing laws on domestic workers’ rights is a challenging task for any government, due to factors such as the legal difficulty of carrying out labour inspections in private homes, as Blofield has pointed out in her research on domestic work in Latin America (Blofield 2013). In addition, the Bolivian state has a weak structure for the implementation of labour laws in general (lack of labour inspectors, limited resources of the labour authorities and an insufficiently functional justice system are some of the most serious problems).

The analysis of the Bolivian policies on domestic workers’ rights provides guidance for some reflections that could be useful for domestic workers in other countries:

1. The importance of symbolic policies: Domestic workers face discrimination for a number of reasons. First, the traditional capitalist and patriarchal economic system disregards domestic work, which is often viewed as less valuable than other kinds of work. Second, the overwhelming majority of domestic workers are women and many of them belong to disadvantaged ethnic groups. Because this multi-pronged discrimination constitutes the root of the frequent violations of the domestic workers’ human and labour rights, symbolic policies are important to raise the awareness of the public regarding the social value of domestic work. Symbolic policies will never replace substantive ones, but they could have a long-term, indirect positive effect on the living and working conditions of domestic workers.

2. The limited effect of enacting laws: Legal equality between domestic workers and the rest of workers is important, but not sufficient in itself. In Bolivia, domestic workers have enjoyed almost complete legal equality with the rest of workers since 2003, yet this has not created a significant improvement of their living and working conditions. The National Federation of Bolivian Household Workers (Fenatrahob) is currently focusing its efforts on the enforcement and implementation of existing legislation (such as the legal right to health coverage) rather than in getting further legal improvements. This could be an example for other movements.

3. The risks of a specific law on domestic workers’ rights: The passage of the 2450/2003 Law constituted a great success for the Bolivian movement of domestic workers. While a separate law can allow space for addressing the particular challenges—for example, the difficulty of enforcing labour inspections in private homes—a law that distinguishes domestic workers from the rest of Bolivian workers may have a negative effect as well. It can inadvertently reinforce the idea that domestic work is not a job like all other jobs, thus increasing resistance to further improvements of the working and living conditions of domestic workers. This may, in part, be driving the lack of implementation of health and pension coverage. Greater gains might have been possible if domestic workers’ rights had been included in the Bolivian labour code governing all other types of employment, complemented by specific regulations designed to tackle the particular challenges of ensuring domestic workers’ rights. However, the approval of the 2450/2003 Law was a concession obtained by Bolivian social movements from Gonzalo Sánchez de Lozada’s government in a very specific context of strong social mobilizations against neoliberalism; wider reform of the labour code to introduce domestic workers’ rights was unthinkable at that time.

References

“Trabajadoras del hogar celebran su día y exigen seguro de salud.” Abi y Correo Sur [Sucre, Bolivia], March 30, 2016.

“Las trabajadoras del hogar esperan seguro de salud hace 14 años.” Página Siete [La Paz, Bolivia], April 16, 2017.


Ministerio de Trabajo de Bolivia. 2015. Ministerio de Trabajo promueve campaña sobre los derechos laborales de las trabajadoras del hogar. [Bolivia].


Wanderley, Fernanda. 2014. El estado de situación del trabajo asalariado del hogar en Bolivia. La Paz, Bolivia: CIDES-UMSA.


WIEGO POLICY BRIEFS offer information on policies and organizational practices that affect the informal economy. This series supports advocacy processes and disseminates better practices and ideas, contributing to a worker- and livelihood-centered approach to development.

ABOUT WIEGO: Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing is a global research-policy-action network that seeks to improve the status of the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy. WIEGO draws its membership from membership-based organizations of informal workers, researchers and statisticians working on the informal economy and practitioners from development agencies (intergovernmental, governmental, non-governmental) working on related issues. For more information see www.wiego.org.